

**INDIA & ISRAEL RELATIONS: IMPLICATIONS FOR  
PAKISTAN**



**By**  
**SHROUQ TARIQ**

**DEPARTMENT OF DEFENCE & STRATEGIC STUDIES**

**QUAID-I-AZAM UNIVERSITY**

**ISLAMABAD**

**2023**

**INDIA & ISRAEL RELATIONS: IMPLICATIONS FOR  
PAKISTAN**



**Thesis submitted in partial fulfilment for the award of the degree of**

**MASTER OF PHILOSOPHY**

**In**

**DEFENCE & STRATEGIC STUDIES**

**By**

**SHROUQ TARIQ**

**SUPERVISED BY**

**DR. SALMA MALIK**

**DEPARTMENT OF DEFENCE & STRATEGIC STUDIES**

**QUAID-I-AZAM UNIVERSITY**

**ISLAMABAD**

**2023**

## ABSTRACT

*The changing dynamics of International Relations have led to Israel being recognised as a significant player in the Middle East, despite initial opposition. Similarly, India, a key state in South Asia, has acknowledged Israel as a state and established cooperation in defence, economy, space, and strategic domains. The ties between India and Israel was further strengthened during the Balakot attacks and aerial clashes with the Pakistan Air Force in 2019, with India strategically planning to acquire additional AWACS from Israel. This collaboration benefits Israel by tapping into India's large market for weapons and technology. However, the deepening ties between India and Israel affect the entire South Asian region, including Pakistan. While Pakistan has attempted to foster relations with Israel, its stronger affinity with the Palestinian cause, connected to the Kashmir issue, presents hindrance to cooperation. As these nations continue to forge closer ties, the security and equilibrium ramifications for the region cannot be overlooked. On the other hand, recognising Israel could offer Pakistan potential access to Israel's technological and military capabilities and balance the security dilemma and balance of power in the region. However, such a decision would require careful navigation of its historical and geopolitical complexities.*

## **LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS**

AWACS	Airborne Warning & Control System
BJP	Bhartiya Janata Party
FDI	Foreign Direct Investment
FTA	Free Trade Agreement
GDP	Gross Domestic Product
GCC	Gulf Cooperation Council
IDF	Israel Defence Forces
IR	International Relations
IT	Information Technology
R&D	Israel Research and Development
LoC	Line of Control
LEO	Low Earth Orbit
PLO	Palestine Liberation Organization
PM	Prime Minister
PLI	Postal Life Insurance
RAW	Research and Analysis Wing
SAR	Synthetic Aperture Radar
UAE	United Arab Emirates
UAVs	Unmanned Aerial Vehicles
UN	United Nations
USA	United States of America
US\$	United States dollars

## Table of Contents

<b>Abstract.....</b>	<b>i</b>
<b>List of Abbreviations .....</b>	<b>i</b>
<b>Introduction.....</b>	<b>1</b>
Statement of the Problem .....	3
Hypothesis .....	4
The dynamics of the South Asian region have been significantly shaped by the economic, strategic, technical, and defense ties between India and Israel. ....	4
Research Questions .....	5
Objectives of the Study .....	5
Significance of the Research .....	5
Research Methodology .....	5
Theoretical Framework .....	6
Literature Review .....	8
Literature Gaps .....	12
Organisation of the Research.....	12
<b>Chapter 1 .....</b>	<b>15</b>
<b>Policies Shaping Dynamics of Indo Israel Relations.....</b>	<b>15</b>
1.1 India and Israel’s Economic Interests.....	17
1.2 Indian Investment in Israel .....	18
1.3 Israel’s Investment in India .....	19
1.4 Military Ties Between Israel and India .....	20
1.5 Indo Israel Military Cooperation in the 1990s .....	22
1.6 Indo Israeli Military Cooperation During the 21 <sup>st</sup> Century .....	23
1.7 Arms Purchases .....	24
1.8 Space Cooperation.....	24

Conclusion.....	25
<b>Chapter 2 .....</b>	<b>28</b>
<b>Israel India Relations, Implications for Pakistan .....</b>	<b>28</b>
Introduction .....	28
2.1 India Israel Cooperation and its Implications on Pakistan .....	29
2.2 The National Security Factor.....	31
2.3 India and Israel Relations Pose a Threat to Pakistan’s Nuclear Weapons .....	33
Conclusion.....	34
<b>Chapter 3 .....</b>	<b>36</b>
<b>Pakistan Israel Relations.....</b>	<b>36</b>
Introduction .....	36
3.1 Pakistan and Israel Ties .....	39
3.2 The Abraham Accords and Pakistan .....	39
3.3 A Shift towards Normalisation of Relations with Israel .....	41
3.4 Hurdles in Pakistan to Recognize Israel.....	44
3.5 A Shift towards Normalisation with Israel.....	45
Conclusion.....	47
<b>Conclusion .....</b>	<b>50</b>
<b>Bibliography .....</b>	<b>55</b>

## INTRODUCTION

The initial stages of India-Israel relations were characterised by instability; however, the two countries have cultivated a profound and dynamic bond, despite their geographical distance, by maintaining consistent connections over time. The genesis of this relationship can be traced back to India's historical opposition to Israel's establishment and government, as expressed directly by Mahatma Gandhi.<sup>1</sup> Gandhi felt that the Jews should return to the countries from which they emigrated and that the Arabs were the legitimate residents of Palestine.<sup>2</sup> India voted against Israel's admission to the UN in 1949 and opposed the 1947 proposal to divide Palestine. But there was a contradiction between Indian leaders on recognising Israel at that time as various advocates of the creation of Israel, and the Jews were supported by Hindu nationalism, which also sympathised with them. Many Hindu leaders defended Israel's existence on moral and political grounds and denounced India for its UN vote against Israel.<sup>3</sup> However, the ties between India and Israel gradually changed through decades.

The strategic cooperation between India and Israel is a longstanding phenomenon characterised by joint efforts in various domains, including conventional missiles, drones, counterterrorism, cyber, and space capabilities. These shared endeavours have demonstrated a recurring pattern of collaboration, indicating a deepening alliance between the two nations. However, the implications of this cooperation on Pakistan and its direct and indirect effects on the security imbalance in South Asia raise concerns about the regional stability of the area. This historical context, patterns, and consequences of the Indo-Israel nexus will affect the regional

---

<sup>1</sup> Arthur G. Rubinoff, "Normalization of India-Israel Relations: Stillborn for Forty Years," *Asian Survey* 35, no. 5 (May 1995): 487–505, <https://doi.org/10.2307/2645750>.

<sup>2</sup> Ibid

<sup>3</sup> Sumantra Bose. "Why India's Hindu Nationalists Worship Israel's Nation-State Model." *The Conversation*, February 14, 2019. <https://theconversation.com/why-indias-hindu-nationalists-worship-israels-nation-state-model-111450>.

security dynamics in South Asia, focusing on the potential challenges and risks it poses to Pakistan's interests and the overall stability of the region.<sup>4</sup>

Israel's significant role as India's third-largest arms supplier raises concerns about its impact on South Asian stability.<sup>5</sup> Reports indicate that Israel has supported India's alleged surgical strikes against Pakistan.<sup>6</sup> Israeli Prime Minister Benjamin Netanyahu's statement, "You fight terrorism by fighting it," during an interview, further emphasised their backing of India. This cooperation between Israel and India in the defence sector and their alignment on security matters pose a severe challenge to regional stability in South Asia.<sup>7</sup>

Over the years, the diplomatic ties between India and Israel have grown more robust, with Israel effectively influencing India to alter its stance on the Israeli-Palestinian conflict and refrain from voting against Israel at the UN. A pivotal and momentous change occurred when the BJP government abandoned its previously ostensibly neutral foreign policy concerning Israel and Palestine. This marked a historic and significant diplomatic shift, reflecting the deepening engagement and mutual interests between India and Israel.

India is also interested in buying the Israeli Iron Dome, a missile interceptor with a 4–70 km range. India and Israel have already agreed to a two-billion-dollar deal to develop the Iron Dome in India. In the event of a future conflict, it implies that the Iron Dome can be deployed along Pakistan's border, which is of great concern to Pakistan.<sup>8</sup> As a result, the Indo-Israeli defence tie disturbs the regional peace in South Asia while also boosting the Indian military.

---

<sup>4</sup> Mahvish Malik. "Implications of Indo-Israel Defence Nexus in South Asia," Daily Times, October 9, 2018, <https://dailytimes.com.pk/308405/implications-of-indo-israel-defence-nexus-in-south-asia/>.

<sup>5</sup> Ibid

<sup>6</sup> Ibid

<sup>7</sup> Al arabiya, "Exclusive - the Netanyahu Doctrine: An In-Depth Regional Policy Interview," December 15, 2022, <https://english.alarabiya.net/News/middle-east/2022/12/15/Exclusive-The-Netanyahu-Doctrine-an-in-depth-regional-policy-interview>.

<sup>8</sup> Mahvish Malik. "Implications of Indo-Israel Defence Nexus in South Asia," Daily Times, October 9, 2018, <https://dailytimes.com.pk/308405/implications-of-indo-israel-defence-nexus-in-south-asia/>.



Pakistan and Israel, on the other hand, have no diplomatic ties. Pakistan does not plan to recognise Israel as a state for various reasons, including the religious clergy not wanting to accept a Jewish state. This is because they believe that the Jews and Muslims are destined to stay enemies as they were according to Islamic history 1400 years ago. Another reason is that Pakistan feels strongly for the Palestinian people because they relate the problem to the issue of Indian occupied Kashmir. Even though there had been back-channel meetings between Pakistani and Israeli officials, the common public is not ready to accept Israel as a state.

The strategic cooperation between India and Israel has had an impact on Pakistan's security and diplomatic standing in the region. With closer alignment on regional and global issues, India and Israel may form a unified front that contrasts with Pakistan's position. Moreover, Israel's role as a major defence equipment supplier to India could potentially influence the military balance in South Asia, prompting Pakistan to reevaluate its security strategies.

As Israel deepens its ties with India, Pakistan might feel the need to seek alternative partnerships to maintain a balance of power in the region. Additionally, Pakistan's traditional support for the Palestinian cause and the rights of Kashmiri people may face challenges as India and Israel's relationship strengthens.

While Pakistan may face diplomatic isolation or tensions in certain international forums where India and Israel collaborate, there could be potential economic and technological benefits for Pakistan through increased engagement with Israel. However, political constraints and limited relations may hinder direct access to these opportunities.

The establishment of bilateral ties between Pakistan and Israel is a complex concept due to emotional, religious, and political ties that Pakistan shares with other Muslim countries. Despite recent developments and initiatives, any steps towards normalisation would require delicate diplomacy, considering regional sensitivities and potential implications for Pakistan's international standing and alliances.

Recognising and establishing diplomatic relations with Israel remains challenging for Pakistan, given its historical support for the Palestinian cause and the

prevailing sentiments towards Israel. Any potential shift in this regard would need to navigate complex geopolitical factors and consider Pakistan's connections with other Muslim-majority countries.

In conclusion, the growing partnership between India and Israel has far-reaching implications for Pakistan's security, regional standing, and foreign policy. While establishing formal diplomatic ties with Israel may not be on the immediate horizon, Pakistan may explore unofficial connections to gain strategic advantages and protect its interests in the evolving geopolitical landscape. Careful consideration of historical examples and regional complexities will be crucial for Pakistan in approaching its relationship with Israel.

### **Statement of the Problem**

The strategic, diplomatic, and military cooperation between India and Israel is witnessing substantial growth, leading to stronger ties between the two nations. However, this burgeoning alliance may have far-reaching repercussions for Pakistan and the entire South Asia region. As both India and Pakistan possess nuclear capabilities, the intensifying collaboration between Israel and India raises concerns for Pakistan's security dynamics. Moreover, this growing partnership undermines the cause of Palestine and has implications for the Kashmir issue, as India is bolstering its arsenals with Israel's assistance. The study addresses the less-discussed issue of the region's unstable balance of power, which could potentially jeopardise Pakistan and India's stance on Kashmir. By analysing the evolving relationship between Israel and India, this research sheds light on its impact on Pakistan and the broader implications for regional stability in South Asia, adding to why Pakistan should or should not recognise Israel as a state.

### **Hypothesis**

The dynamics of the South Asian and the Middle Eastern region have been significantly shaped by the economic, strategic, and defence ties between India and Israel.

## **Research Questions**

- a. How economic, military and strategic ties between India and Israel is going to affect Pakistan?
- b. Why does Pakistan recognise India and not Israel, despite Kashmir being closer to home?
- c. What factors are driving the growth of India and Israel's ties on multiple levels?
- d. Should Pakistan recognise Israel as a state and how will it benefit Pakistan?

## **Objectives of the Study**

Objectives behind carrying out this research were:

- To concisely analyse the economic, strategic and military relationship between Israel and India.
- Israel and India's developing relationship and the affects it is going to have on Pakistan.
- India and Israel's growing bilateral ties and how they are going to shift the dynamics of the South Asian region.
- Examining the advantages and disadvantages of Pakistan's recognition of Israel.

## **Significance of the Research**

Limited research exists regarding Pakistan's stance towards the state of Israel and the potential consequences if Pakistan were to recognise Israel. The topic is considered religiously sensitive in Pakistan, and officials are reluctant to discuss it openly. This study aims to delve into the possibility of Pakistan recognising Israel and assess its potential impact on regional peace, as well as the political and economic gains that could be achieved. This paper will also explicitly outline the roles of India and Israel in their mutual relations, the policies of India and Israel towards each other and their implications for Pakistan and the broader South Asian region.

## **Research Methodology**

This research employs descriptive, explanatory, and analytical tools to comprehensively explore the policies between India and Israel and their implications for Pakistan. The study primarily adopts a qualitative approach, relying on secondary sources such as journal articles, books, internet articles, and policy papers. These sources offer valuable insights into India and Israel's policies towards each other.

To enhance understanding, data analysis employs explanatory tools, delving into discourse analysis of meetings and telephonic conversations between officials from both countries. Moreover, this study examines the interactions of Israeli foreign policy officials with relevant stakeholders concerning the Palestine situation. It also investigates the Indian government's policies towards Israel in Palestine and gathers perspectives from interviews with Indian and Israeli foreign policy officials from various news sources.

To provide a broader perspective, the research incorporates books from Western, Indian, Arabic, and Israeli writers about the conflict. Additionally, a wide range of newspaper and magazine articles is analysed to ensure objectivity. These articles are selected from Israeli, Pakistani, Indian, Arabic, and international publications for a comprehensive and well-rounded analysis.

## **Theoretical Framework**

The Security Dilemma theory and the Defensive Neorealism theory are used in the paper. Security theory in International Relations (IR) explains the actions taken by the states to increase their security because they do not know what the other state is planning and are in a dilemma regarding the other state's security. This anarchy in the international system creates conditions that lead states to increase their power and security. Thus, in a self-help situation of the global system, states are bound to

improve their security and survive by augmenting their power.<sup>9</sup>

Most defensive realism theories of foreign policy and IR are concerned with the idea of security in the international or global system, where states are obligated to increase their security and survive by enhancing their power. According to Robert Jervis, the security dilemma is a situation where a state's efforts to improve its security result in a reduction in the security of others. The intentions of other states may never be known with certainty by the other state. Anarchy fosters self-help in states, as was previously stated. In their interactions with potential enemies, states pursue policies that promote security.

On the other hand, adversaries respond when their level of relative security is threatened. They take action to improve their security, which reduces the first state's security requirements. In Charles Glaser's opinion, making rivals may be counterproductive and worse for the state than the initial action.

Security-seeking policies can set in motion a process that lowers the state's own military capabilities. An adversary may purchase or produce additional weapons in order to recover its military capability.<sup>10</sup> This action-reaction cycle, however, may not leave both states worse off because it adjusts the offense-defence balance. If each side deploys a new weapon system that favours aggressive military activities in response to the other, both sides will be less able to defend themselves and hence would become less safe.

The theory of Defensive Neorealism is also applied to the research paper. According to defensive realism, states' propensity to follow the balance of power theory is disrupted by aggressive expansion, which is supported by offensive realists. This, they claim, undermines the state's main objective, which is maintaining its security.<sup>11</sup> Although incentives for state expansion exist and there is interstate

---

<sup>9</sup> Elizabeth Roche, "How India, Israel Diplomatic Ties Came to Fruition." *Livemint.com*, January 15, 2018. <https://www.livemint.com/Politics/0pe5Cc2BoZ24xWX3t90iaP/How-India-Israel-diplomatic-ties-came-to-fruition.html>. (accessed January 11, 2023).

<sup>10</sup> Peter Liberman, "Does Conquest Pay? The Exploitation of Occupied Industrial Societies," *Princeton University Press*, 1996. <https://www.jstor.org/stable/j.ctt7t7jh> (accessed February 4, 2023).

<sup>11</sup> Saddam Sultana. "India-Israel Defence Cooperation: Security Implications for Pakistan."

conflict, defensive realism asserts that these incentives are incidental rather than endemic.<sup>12</sup> Defensive neorealism is a structural theory in IR which evolved from the neorealism school.<sup>13</sup> The thesis is based on Kenneth Waltz's Theory of International Politics, which contends that in order to achieve national security, governments are compelled to pursue moderate and wary policies as a result of the anarchic nature of the international system.<sup>14</sup>

In order to establish security through hegemony and dominance, belligerent realism on the one hand seeks power and influence.<sup>15</sup> Defensive realism, on the other hand, argues that the anarchic nature of the international system forces states to pursue cautious and moderate actions in order to achieve security.<sup>16</sup> Defensive realism argues that offensive realists' support for aggressive expansion disrupts states' propensity to adhere to the balance of power theory, undermining the state's primary objective, which they assert is maintaining its security.

### Literature Review

In the start, the India Israel relations were not like they are today. The relations between both India and Israel built gradually and steadily through the past few decades. The ride in the beginning was bumpy but later became strong. According to Obed Eran's article in the Institute for National Security Studies titled *India and Israel: A Strategic Alliance*, Israel's international Relations environment underwent significant changes in the second decade of the twenty-first century, resulting in a new set of formal and informal relationships.<sup>17</sup> The Indian Prime Minister Narendra

---

*Journal of Security & Strategic Analyses* VII, Issue no 1 (2021).

<https://doi.org/10.57169/jssa.007.01.0131>.

<sup>12</sup> Adler and Barnett, "*Security Communities*," Cambridge University Press.

1998. <https://doi.org/10.1017/CBO9780511598661>. (accessed December 11, 2022).

<sup>13</sup> Steven Lobell, "Structural Realism/Offensive and Defensive Realism," *Oxford Research Encyclopedia of International Studies*, March (2010).

<https://doi.org/10.1093/acrefore/9780190846626.013.304>.

<sup>14</sup> Ibid.

<sup>15</sup> Ibid.

<sup>16</sup> Ashley Tellis, "The U.S.-India Global Partnership: How Significant for American Interests?" *Carnegie Endowment for International Peace*. November 17, 2005.

<https://carnegieendowment.org/2005/11/17/u.s.-india-global-partnership-how-significant-for-american-interests-pub-17693> (accessed January 12, 2023).

<sup>17</sup> Oded Eran, "India and Israel: A Strategic Alliance?" *Institute for National Security Studies*,

Modi's trip to Israel from July 4 to July 6 in 2017 can be seen as a turning point in this process. Significant changes in Israel's international relations environment led to the emergence of a new set of formal and informal relationships.

India and Israel have built their relations economically, militarily and strategically. In her article *India-Israel Defence Cooperation* Sadaf Sultana writes that over the last two decades, India-Israel defense cooperation has grown at an exponential rate.<sup>18</sup> As the two countries have shown reciprocal interest in expanding their influence in South Asia and the Middle East region, many agreements for buying or jointly developing military systems have been made, boosting their strategic and defense cooperation. The most prominent example is collaboration in the sphere of Air and Ballistic Missile Defense, as well as a wide spectrum of other military systems, which has led to the well-established and modernised Israeli technical competence filling important gaps in the Indian defense industry. This collaboration has become more formalised, with deeper ties between government officials, defense organisations, and the private sector.

In the article *The Evolving Indo-Israel Partnership* M. Zulfiqar Khan Niazi explains how India and Israel's ties have converged over time. Israel and India are unusual examples of states that have pursued hegemonic policies in an effort to revive their former realms.<sup>19</sup> Both intend to carve regions and control resources from their neighbors, as well as to redraw their borders in accordance with the pattern of what benefits them. Both have been extremely harsh to their minorities and neighbors, and both have failed to comply with a number of UNO resolutions mandating the withdrawal of occupied regions since 1948. Both, India and Israel have a history of inciting wars against their neighbors while working together with super powers like the United States (US) and the Soviet Union. This has happened in almost every decade of their existence. Both have a past of disregarding international law and

---

Vol. 1, Issue no. 4 (2017). <https://www.inss.org.il/publication/india-israel-strategic-alliance/> (accessed February 2023).

<sup>18</sup> Saddaf Sultana. "India-Israel Defence Cooperation: Security Implications for Pakistan." *Journal of Security & Strategic Analyses* VII, Issue no 1 (2021). <https://doi.org/10.57169/jssa.007.01.0131>.

<sup>19</sup> Arthur Robinoff, "Normalization of India-Israel Relations: Stillborn for Forty Year," *Asian Survey* 35, no. 5 (May 1995). <https://doi.org/10.2307/2645750>.

violating the human rights of their minority, and using excessive and inhumane force against independence strugglers in occupied regions. The most noticeable similarity is their shared understanding of Islam as a mutual adversary. Their unifying goal is to profit from the illicit acquisition of Muslim world's resources. Both are under the tutelage of the United States, which is pursuing a similar strategy in order to realise its worldwide imperialism.

Many in Pakistan do not want to talk about the relations between Pakistan and Israel.<sup>20</sup> But, Feroz Khan and Shlomo Brom wrote about it in their article *Pakistan and Israel*. Pakistan's foreign policy initially placed a strong emphasis on its interactions with the West, particularly the United States. However, in the early 1970s, Pakistan's foreign policy continued to support moderate Arabs while adopting a more Islamic stance. Pakistan's disappointment in the West following the rise of Arab dominance and rising Islamic sentiments among Pakistan's populace, were the driving forces behind this. This is what this article talks about, why Pakistan is not willing to accept the state of Israel and what drives the decision behind this stance regarding Israel.

*Indo-Israel Relations: Implications for Pakistan*, by Dr. Ghulam Mustafa, Dr. Muhammad Nawaz Bhatti, and Liaqat Hussain focuses on Pakistan's application in an effort to shed light on Indo-Israeli relations. The theory in the account of Indo-Israeli relations asserts that both countries urgently needed to fortify their ties after the Cold War between the United States of America and the Soviet Union ended. Trade, cultural exchanges, water management, urban and agricultural development, and defence cooperation are all areas of bilateral relations between the two states. In the future, Pakistan will have to deal with many repercussions from the growing ties between India and Israel.

---

<sup>20</sup> Ishaan Tharoor, "The Pakistani Origins of the Israeli State." *Washington Post*, December 3, 2014. <https://www.washingtonpost.com/news/worldviews/wp/2014/12/03/the-pakistani-origins-of-the-israeli-state/>. (accessed January 8, 2023).



*Israel and Pakistan: Public Rhetoric Versus Political Pragmatism* discusses Pakistan's attitude towards the Jewish state.<sup>21</sup> It takes note of Pakistan's support for the Palestinian cause. However, Pakistan was compelled to take a reasonable posture toward Israel due to its proximity to conservative Middle Eastern governments and opposition to Nasser's brand of Arab Nationalism. This long-standing anti-Israel sentiment has limited the understanding of pursuing contacts with Israel.

Pakistan and Israel do not seem to be allies this has been discussed in *The Pakistani origins of the Israeli state*.<sup>22</sup> The two nations do not have any formal diplomatic ties because Pakistan, like many other states with a majority of Muslims, does not acknowledge Israel's existence. Israel, meantime, has been having closer ties with India.

In the article *Pakistan and the Arab-Israeli Conflict* by P. R. Kumaraswamy Pakistan's interests and involvement in Israel predate the partition of Palestine and can be traced to the days of the Balfour Declaration of 1917 were explained.<sup>23</sup> Within a few weeks of General Allenby's conquest of Jerusalem and Lord Balfour's announcement of British support for a Jewish national home in Palestine, the Muslim League, which was in charge of the fight for Pakistan, voiced its concern for the safety and sanctity of holy places. Despite the fact that Indian nationalists, like Mahatma Gandhi, had taken a pro-Arab stance on the matter, there was one key distinction: The League's strident criticisms of the fight for a Jewish state had their roots firmly in Islam. Palestine was a component of the Jazirat al-Arab and therefore could not be governed by non-Muslims or even given to them. The Muslim League leaders' most outspoken stance remained their opposition to non-Muslim control over Islamic territories.

---

<sup>21</sup> Kumaraswamy Prakash, "Israel and Pakistan: Public Rhetoric versus Political Pragmatism." *Israel Affairs*, vol. 12, no. 1, 2006, pp. 123–135, [www.tandfonline.com/doi/abs/10.1080/13537120500381943?journalCode=fisa20](http://www.tandfonline.com/doi/abs/10.1080/13537120500381943?journalCode=fisa20).

<sup>22</sup> Ishaan Tharoor, "The Pakistani Origins of the Israeli State," *Washington Post*, October 3, 2014, <https://www.washingtonpost.com/news/worldviews/wp/2014/12/03/the-pakistani-origins-of-the-israeli-state/>. (accessed January 8, 2023).

<sup>23</sup> Chirayu Thakkar, "India and Israel Mean Business, in Many New Sectors," *The Economic Times*, February 13, 2022. <https://economictimes.indiatimes.com/news/economy/foreign-trade/view-india-and-israel-mean-business-in-many-new-sectors/articleshow/89540411.cms?from=mdr>.

## **Literature Gaps**

Numerous articles have explored the India-Israel relationship, but they often overlook its significant impact on the Middle East and the South Asian region. A noticeable gap in Pakistani literature is the need for more guidance on how Pakistan should approach its ties with Israel, considering the strengthening relationship between Israel and India, which directly affects Pakistan. Previous works also need to address the potential benefits Pakistan could gain from such a relationship, especially considering Israel's status as a solid ally to the USA and its influence in the Middle East.

While acknowledging the importance of Pakistan's commitment to the cause of Palestine, the current reality necessitates careful consideration of economic challenges and the growing defence collaboration between India and Israel. To thrive in the region, Pakistan may need to adopt a pragmatic approach of understanding potential adversaries for its benefit. As the dynamics in the area continue to evolve, a deeper analysis of Pakistan's options in building relationships with Israel becomes imperative.

## **Organisation of the Research**

International Relations results from states cooperating and maintaining a status quo among the continents, the regions and between states. Sometimes the status quo maintains, and sometimes, it gets disrupted. For either of the two, states interact with one another on strategic, economic and military levels, and this interaction between India and Israel would be studied under the theories of defensive realism and security dilemma.

This has not only raised alarm bells in Pakistan but also in the entire Muslim World. India and Israel have come together intending to weaken the cause of Palestine and Kashmir. The European countries and the US have looked the other way. This chapter will also discuss how Pakistan is seen as an obstacle in its plans to extend its regional hegemony and how Israel's and India's cooperation is a step towards that.

The first chapter will analyse how and why Israel and India are cooperating at the economic frontline, signing agreements which enhance the trade between the two countries. Besides that, India, the largest military importer of Israeli military equipment, makes India even more robust since it is cooperating with all the more extensive and powerful states in the world and is obtaining equipment from all the power states.

The second chapter is going to discuss India-Israel relations and how this relationship is going to impact Pakistan. India and Israel have bilateral cultural, trade, development, military, and economic ties. These bilateral relations, particularly military relations, affect Pakistan as India significantly impacts Pakistan. On the other hand, Pakistan does not recognise Israel as a state. This impacts the cause of Pakistan and its fight for Kashmir. This chapter will analyse the dynamics of the balance of power in the South Asian region.

Chapter three will discuss how Pakistan officially endorses the two-state solution to the Israeli-Palestinian conflict. For Palestine, Pakistan has always had a position of non-recognition of Israel until the cause of a Palestinian state does not get resolved as per UN resolutions. Recently, a series of agreements have been going on by the Arabs, which has mounted pressure on Pakistan to recognise Israel. Two eminent states, India in South Asia and Israel in West Asia and the Middle East, have closely bonded. These states have had a strategic, military, and economic relationship. This kind of relationship changes the balance of power in the region, particularly in Pakistan.

The concluding chapter is going to rewind all the discussions of the paper. India and Israel's cooperation and how the security dynamics of India are strengthening after the military assistance by Jerusalem. India and Israel's general partnership and how it has affected South Asia. India buying military equipment heavily from Israel is an alarming sign for Pakistan. Both India and Israel are also cooperating diplomatically to boost trade. Israel and vis versa are buying many Israeli companies.

The last chapter will also discuss whether Pakistan should or should not recognise Israel as a state. The concluding chapter also discusses the pros and cons of

Pakistan recognising Israel. Pakistan, even though it has been having meetings with Israeli officials unofficially. However, Pakistan is hesitant to recognise Israel as a state because of its close ties and heartfelt feeling for Palestine because it is similar to Kashmir's cause. Another reason for Pakistan not to recognise Israel as a state is the religious pressure from the religious clerks in Pakistan. Many in Pakistan think otherwise and want to recognise Israel as a state because they believe that, just like India, Pakistan could benefit from a strong state like Israel on many levels.

## CHAPTER 1

### POLICIES SHAPING DYNAMICS OF INDO ISRAEL RELATIONS

The foreign policy of any state cannot be complete without keeping in mind the economic factors and ties between the states involved. Before the second world war, the military might was the primary indicator to measure how strong a state is. But during the current century, military might has gone down in the list of calculating how powerful a state is, and what has appeared ahead in line are indicators of economic progress. Economy has become an essential indicator in the modern globalised world. States use the economy to flaunt and exert their power in international relations today.

In the modern international arena, economy is the main component of soft power that states use to exert their influence and flaunt their power. Similarly, the foreign policy alignments of many countries are moulded by either the domestic economic situation of a nation or the external economic interests' states seek in other states. Considering the case of the Indian and Israeli foreign policies, it can be visibly seen and analysed that the economy played a huge role in shaping the politics of both these nations towards each other.

In the case of states like India, they are not only focusing on their military might but now focusing more on their economy because states now tend to focus more on strengthening means that focus on soft power rather than hard power because the focus of the international world is more on the soft means of power gain.<sup>24</sup> To strengthen their economy, they signed agreements and treaties with states like the USA and Israel to strengthen their economy. Simultaneously, Delhi is authorising new agreements to maintain its security and military, and supporting new organisations and business specialists to lead future recreation endeavours with Israeli

---

<sup>24</sup> Oded Eran, "India and Israel: A Strategic Alliance?" *Institute for National Security Studies*, Vol. 1, Issue no. 4 (2017). <https://www.inss.org.il/publication/india-israel-strategic-alliance/> (accessed February 2023).

firms. In this chapter, we will discuss what economic factors convinced India and Israel to develop their foreign policies keeping into consideration the economic factors and how they would affect Pakistan.

India's economy is heavily dependent on services, especially information technology (IT), which accounts for nearly 60% of Gross Domestic Product (GDP).<sup>25</sup> Agriculture accounts for even less of the industry's base than that, despite being the area with the highest employment. Israel could offer assistance in water management, consumption, and crop growth if India aims to build a more stable economy. An enormous portion of India's population will live in higher quality thanks to Israel's cutting-edge technology, particularly in arid regions. The \$40 million India-Israel Research and Development (R&D) and Innovation Fund was established as a result of an agreement between Modi and Netanyahu.<sup>26</sup> The two nations began collaborating in the fields of atomic energy, Low Earth Orbit (LEO) optical connections, sciences, and medicine.

In June 2022, Israeli Defence Minister Benjamin Gantz concluded a significant visit to India, during which both nations reaffirmed their commitment to enhancing defence cooperation. A comprehensive 10-year roadmap titled the 'India-Israel Vision on Defence Cooperation' was signed by Gantz and his Indian counterpart, then Defence Minister Rajnath Singh, outlining their intentions to explore new areas of collaboration.

India has a history of relying on Israeli equipment and technology, particularly in counterterrorism and border security. Over the past decade, India has become Israel's main military ally in West Asia, surpassing the United States as the largest purchaser of Israeli weapons. This partnership has granted Israel's defense industry valuable access to a substantial market. Since Israel faced restrictions on arms sales to

---

<sup>25</sup> Somesh K Mathur, "Indian Information Technology Industry: Past, Present and Future & a Tool for National Development." *Washington Education*, August 22, 2020. <https://faculty.washington.edu/karyiu/confer/GJ06/papers/mathur>. (accessed December 22, 2022).

<sup>26</sup> Surabhi Agarwal, "Narendra Modi: PM Narendra Modi's 3-Day Visit: India, Israel May Create \$40-Million Innovation Fund," *The Economic Times*, 2017, <https://economictimes.indiatimes.com/news/economy/policy/pm-narendra-modis-3-day-visit-india-israel-may-create-40-million-innovation-fund/articleshow/59431889.cms?from=mdr>.

China due to concerns about upgrading Chinese military capabilities, India's entry into the market has become even more crucial for Israel's defense industry.

Beyond the typical challenges, there exists a genuine opportunity for New Delhi and Tel Aviv to further advance cooperation. The agreement to strengthen collaboration in cutting-edge defence technologies marks a positive step forward. Apart from well-known areas like artificial intelligence, block chain, and robotics, both countries can explore joint ventures in additive manufacturing, advanced battery technology, and power sources, benefiting from Israel's strong emphasis on research and development.

### **1.1 India and Israel's Economic Interests**

In 2014, India's reluctance towards Israel waned due to a series of significant stopovers at high-level meetings. During the historic visit of Prime Minister Modi, the first-ever by an Indian leader, the two nations signed multiple agreements that delved into unexplored areas and strengthened their strategic alliance.<sup>27</sup> India has emerged as Israel's seventh-largest global business partner and the third-most prominent partner in Asia. Over the recent years, there has been a notable surge in trade of various goods, including communication systems, medical apparatus, electronic machinery, and other high-tech items between the two nations.<sup>28</sup>

Both parties endorsed and negotiated seven Memorandums of Understanding (MoUs) on cooperation in the areas of innovation, technology, water, agriculture, and space & science during the Prime Minister of India's visit to Israel in July 2017. Additionally, a 40 million dollar India-Israel Industrial R&D and Technological Innovation Fund for collaborative projects was established.<sup>29</sup>

The two states inked nine agreements in January 2018 in a range of industries, including cyber security, oil and gas, solar energy, space science, air transportation,

---

<sup>27</sup> Chirayu Thakkar, "India and Israel Mean Business, in Many New Sectors," *The Economic Times*, February 13, 2022. <https://economictimes.indiatimes.com/news/economy/foreign-trade/view-india-and-israel-mean-business-in-many-new-sectors/articleshow/89540411.cms?from=mdr>.

<sup>28</sup> Ibid.

<sup>29</sup> Ibid

pharmaceuticals, and film production.<sup>30</sup> The Israeli government's increased trade endeavours continue to centre on India. With the goal of concluding the Free Trade Agreement (FTA) by the middle of 2022, India and Israel have reopened negotiations.<sup>31</sup> Pearls, valuable stones, chemicals, mineral products, machinery, electrical equipment, base metals, machinery, and transit equipment are among Israel's top exports to India.

## 1.2 Indian Investment in Israel

By establishing branch offices for various businesses in Israel, Indian corporations are demonstrating their presence there. State Bank of India established a branch in Tel Aviv in 2000, and TCS opened a branch in Israel in 2005. In addition, Jain Irrigation completely acquired NaanDan, an Israeli manufacturer of irrigation equipment, in 2012. In Israel's Taro Pharmaceutical Industries, Sun Pharma owns a 66.7% share. During the years 2015 and 2016, notable investments in Israel were made by other leading Indian firms, including Infosys, Tech Mahindra, and Wipro Infrastructure Engineering.<sup>32</sup> The Lohia Group of India acquired an Israeli military company in January 2019.<sup>33</sup>

Significant Indian businesses are also finding a place in Israel's ecosystem. In 2016, Tatas merged with a number of well-known international companies to launch a brand-new technology incubator called Equity Partners i3, which focuses on creating next-generation technologies. In November 2017, L&T Technology Services established an R&D facility in Jerusalem and a sales office in Tel Aviv.

Anthill Ventures, a company headquartered in Hyderabad, launched a start-up in Tel Aviv and partnered with the Holon Institute of Technology to invest in Israeli

---

<sup>30</sup> Ibid

<sup>31</sup> Surabhi Agarwal, "Narendra Modi: PM Narendra Modi's 3-Day Visit: India, Israel May Create \$40-Million Innovation Fund," *The Economic Times*, 2017, <https://economictimes.indiatimes.com/news/economy/policy/pm-narendra-modis-3-day-visit-india-israel-may-create-40-million-innovation-fund/articleshow/59431889.cms?from=mdr>.

<sup>32</sup> Ibid.

<sup>33</sup> Shoshnna Soloman, "India's Lohia group buys Israeli maker of aerospace components", February 12, 2019. <https://www.timesofisrael.com/indias-lohia-group-buys-israeli-maker-of-aerospace-components/> (accessed December 18, 2022).



start-ups' and help them gain access to markets in South East Asia and India.<sup>34</sup> In March 2021, Indian Oil Corporation Limited announced a joint venture with Israeli start-up, Phinergy to manufacture aluminium-air batteries in India and promote green transportation by advancing fuel cells and home grown hydrogen storage technologies.

### 1.3 Israel's Investment in India

Israel made US\$ 263.82 million in direct investments into India from April 2000 to December 2021.<sup>35</sup> Israel has made more than 300 investments in India, the majority of which are in the high-tech and agricultural sectors. Israeli businesses are increasingly needed in sectors like clean energy, water technologies, national security, real estate, agriculture, chemicals, etc. In 2017, more than \$25 million was spent in India by Israeli firms including Teva Pharmaceuticals, Ecoppia, Naa'n Dan Jain, Aqwise, Polemix, Rivulis, Alumayer, Plasson, Huliot, Metzterplas, Avgol, IDE, and Netafim. Dan Hotels is another notable Israeli company with 490 Indian crores in assets in India. NeoLync, an Israeli company, combined with Neolync in India in 2019 and received approval for the PLI Scheme in Large-Scale Electronics Manufacturing.<sup>36</sup>

The Indian government is likely to approve a scheme worth INR 25,000 crore to boost semiconductor manufacturing.<sup>37</sup> This additional funding will complement the

---

<sup>34</sup> Amir Rosenbaum, "India's Anthhill ventures opens Tel Aviv accelerator" March 3, 2019. <https://www.calcalistech.com/ctech/articles/0,7340,L-3758701,00.html>. (accessed December 18, 2022).

<sup>35</sup> Sameer Patil, "The Deepening of India-Israel Defence Ties," *Observational Research Foundation*, June 7, 2022. <https://www.orfonline.org/expert-speak/the-deepening-of-india-israel-defence-ties>. (accessed December 18, 2022).

<sup>36</sup> The Economic Times, "Israel Aligned with PM Modi's 'Aatmanirbhar Bharat', 'Make in India' Vision: Israeli Envoy." 2017, <https://economictimes.indiatimes.com/news/politics-and-nation/israel-aligned-with-pm-modis-aatmanirbhar-bharat-make-in-india-vision-israeli-envoy/articleshow/78657554.cms>. (accessed February 2023).

<sup>37</sup> Shourya Gori, "Israel's Silicon Wadi: A promising semiconductor partner for India" *Observer research foundation*, July 20, 2023, <https://www.orfonline.org/expert-speak/israels-silicon-wadi/> (accessed July 2023).

existing INR 76,000 crore production-linked incentive (PLI) scheme and aims to make India a prominent semiconductor manufacturing hub. The new funding will support various commercial entities involved in different aspects of semiconductor production, including fabs, display fabs, compound semiconductors/silicon photonics/sensors fabs, semiconductor packaging, and designing. India seeks to mobilize support from like-minded partners as it expands its ambitions in this strategic sector.<sup>38</sup>

Israel, with its technical expertise and culture of innovation, is a potential key partner for India in this endeavour. Tel Aviv's reputation as a 'Start up Nation' and the Silicon Valley or Silicon Wadi (valley in Hebrew) of West Asia has been built on its technological determinism and conducive start up environment. Although Israel's role in the foundry segment of the semiconductor supply chain is limited, the country has made significant strides in chip research and design, establishing its growing importance in the global semiconductor industry.

#### **1.4 Military Ties Between Israel and India**

After four decades of not having any diplomatic ties with one another, India and Israel established full diplomatic ties with each other in 1992. Though it is said that it was late for the two states. However, there were many constraints that made this progress slow. The first being the support of congress for the Palestinian people and second being the non-alignment movement. On November 29, 1947, during the UN General Assembly, this hostility was sown against the creation of Israel. India did, however, give Israel the de jure status later in 1950.

The bilateral collaboration in terms of security has been about buying and selling of military equipment towards practicality of the military related agreements. Both Israel and India are looking for solutions relying on the innovations happening in Israel and India. These innovations happening are regarding the development of

---

weapons. Security concerns and the fight against terrorism, which pose a danger to both states, are another area of cooperation between Israel and India. Methodology and equipment are two such areas.<sup>39</sup>

Defence relations between India and Israel have emerged, changed throughout these years regardless of all the stakes and odds attached. Israel has become India's second-largest arms supplier after Russia, with a two-way arms trade believed to have reached \$10 billion over the past ten years.<sup>40</sup>

When it came to India-Israel defence cooperation in 2013, significant changes were seen, mostly regarding arms trade and joint projects.<sup>41</sup> There were some restrictions as well, but none of them restricted connections. Relations were further strengthened by Air Marshal N. A. K. Browne's tour to India in January 2013. Military leaders from both nations improved their coordination, particularly in the area of drones. India expressed a wish to acquire Israeli air-to-air missiles as well as other precision-guided weapons during this visit. India was interested in purchasing Israel's Iron Dome mobile all-weather air defence system and David's Sling missile defence system, formerly known as Magic Wand and integrated into an Israel Defence Forces (IDF) combat system in mid-2013.<sup>42</sup> And then they started working on the iron dome, on which they were hesitant to work on at first, but later committed to it.<sup>43</sup>

The Iron Dome system uses advanced radar to detect incoming threats and calculates their trajectories. When it identifies a high-probability threat to populated areas, it launches interceptor missiles to intercept and destroy the incoming rockets or projectiles.

---

<sup>39</sup> Oded Eran, "India and Israel: A Strategic Alliance?" *Institute for National Security Studies*, Vol. 1, Issue no. 4 (2017). <https://www.inss.org.il/publication/india-israel-strategic-alliance/> (accessed February 2023).

<sup>40</sup> Sameer Patil, "The Deepening of India–Israel Defence Ties," ORF, accessed January 12, 2023, <https://www.orfonline.org/expert-speak/the-deepening-of-india-israel-defence-ties/>.

<sup>41</sup> Ibid

<sup>42</sup> Indrani Bagchi, "India Eyes Israel's Iron Dome to Counter Pak, Puppets," *The Times of India*, March 13, 2012, <https://timesofindia.indiatimes.com/india/india-eyes-israels-iron-dome-to-counter-pak-puppets/articleshow/17329499.cms>

<sup>43</sup> Ibid

As for collaboration between India and Israel regarding the Iron Dome, there were discussions about the possibility of India purchasing the Iron Dome system to bolster its own defence capabilities against incoming missile threats. India has faced security challenges, including missile threats from neighbouring regions, and the Iron Dome system's effectiveness has drawn attention from various countries seeking advanced defence solutions. However, it is important to note that the details of any potential collaboration or purchase might have evolved or changed after my last update in September 2021.

### **1.5 Indo Israel Military Cooperation in the 1990s**

Military ties played a significant role in the establishment of diplomatic links between India and Israel in 1992, making India Israel's largest arms importer.<sup>44</sup> Israel and India's relations improved in 1998 after the Hindu-oriented Bhartiya Janata Party (BJP), took office. This development brought the two countries closer together.<sup>45</sup> On the other hand, Israel feels a threat from their enemy, Iran, because of Iran building up its nuclear arsenals.

Israel's air force chief went to India in March 1994. High-level official visits were also made in exchange, beginning with Israeli President Ezer Weizmann's visit to India in December 1996. In 1996, India bought an air combat system from Israel and later in the same year both signed a \$10million deal for supporting the Indian navy. Relations between India and Israel were strengthened during the 1999 Kargil conflict between Pakistan and India because Israel voluntarily provided weapons like Unmanned Aerial Vehicles (UAVs) to India and showed support. Israel's effort to upgrade the outdated Soviet weapons systems was appreciated by new Delhi.

Even though India claims to have support for the Palestinians on international forums like the United Nations, but still it did not want that to have a negative effect on its relations with Israel. Furthermore, Kashmir cause and the nuclear program built

---

<sup>44</sup> Efraim Inbar, "Indo-Israeli Defense Cooperation in the Twenty-First Century." *Mideast Security and Policy Studies* No. 93. February 2015. <https://besacenter.org/wp-content/uploads/2012/01/MSPS93>.

<sup>45</sup>Ibid

by Pakistan in the 90s was also a concern for India which brought India and Israel even closer together.

## 1.6 Indo Israeli Military Cooperation During the 21<sup>st</sup> Century

Defence cooperation played a significant role in sustaining Israel and India's bilateral relations after both countries established diplomatic ties in 1992, with India emerging as one of Israel's primary customers for weapons sales.<sup>46</sup> The mutual relation grew with the India's political party BJP taking over government since 1998 because of the political party's policies and the fact that it had a different stance regarding Palestine than the other political party, Congress.

Similar to how Israel views Iran as a security danger due to Iran's nuclear capability and its connections to terrorist organizations like Hamas and Hezbollah, India also seems to view Pakistan and its nuclear assets as an undeniable threat because of multiple reason one being the geopolitical factor. As neighbouring countries with strategic locations in South Asia, India and Pakistan compete for influence and regional dominance. This rivalry extends beyond their immediate borders and involves interactions with other countries in the region and on the international stage.

Additionally, we observe that the USA has loosened its sanctions against India following the nuclear tests in 1998 and that India has strengthened its bilateral relations with Israel<sup>47</sup>. Also, after the terror attack on Twin Towers in 9/11, the political environment has eased the ways of mutual cooperation in their defence area. On the other hand, India feels threatened from its neighbour Pakistan and Pakistan's nuclear plan and assets. USA eased the sanctions on India imposed after the 1998 Pokhran nuclear test. After 9/11 the hostile environment brought India and Israel even closer together. The first time India and Israel had closer ties were only for security ties after the post 9/11 threat of terrorism they faced.

---

<sup>46</sup> Ibid.

<sup>47</sup> Efraim Inbar, "Indo-Israeli Defense Cooperation in the Twenty-First Century." *Mideast Security and Policy Studies* No. 93. February 2015. <https://besacenter.org/wp-content/uploads/2012/01/MSPS93>.

## **1.7 Arms Purchases**

The arms trade between India and Israel has become a crucial element of their expanding strategic partnership. This collaboration is driven by common security interests, technological advancements, and the desire to diversify their sources of military equipment. India has acquired state-of-the-art defence systems and technologies from Israel through this cooperation. While this partnership has significant implications for regional security and geopolitical dynamics, it also presents opportunities for both countries to strengthen their defence capabilities and establish a mutually advantageous long-term alliance. As the collaboration continues to evolve, all parties involved must thoroughly analyse its consequences and adeptly manage the complexities of regional and global politics.

Now, defence cooperation between the two countries i.e. Israel and India become more intact, with arms trade as rising high. The total value of their arms related trade reaches to approximately US\$ 10 Billion. With the delivery of the AWACS system, which is based on Russian-made Ilyushin II-76s, in response to an arrangement for these weaponry systems made in March 2004 at a cost of \$1.1 billion, Israel has over the past ten years become the largest exporter of arms to India.

Israel knowingly cancelled a deal with China in 2000 under strong US duress because it was concerned that China might use similar ammunition in the event of a military clash in the Taiwan Straits. Similar deals were allegedly eliminated due to rising tensions between India and Pakistan, but after Israeli Prime Minister Ariel Sharon's 2003 visit to India and ultimate US approval, Indo-Israeli relations hit new heights.

As of today, arm trades between India and Israel are still ongoing, and their collaboration shows no signs of halting in the near future.

## **1.8 Space Cooperation**

Defence cooperation between India and Israel stretches into space in addition to traditional weapon transfers, equipment upgrades, and co-production. In the early 1960s, India launched its first satellite into orbit. Since then, it has developed, built,

and launched its own satellites.<sup>48</sup> Israeli President Ezer Weizmann visited India in 1996 to discuss enhancing relations between the two countries' space programs because of India's increasing excellence in science and technology.

TechSAR, an Israeli surveillance satellite also known as Polaris that is believed to be able to provide details on Iranian strategic sites, was launched by India in January 2008.<sup>49</sup> The development of satellites with Synthetic Aperture Radar (SAR) platforms that can monitor large ground targets and ballistic missiles through cloud cover, as well as at all hours of the day and night, is of interest to Indian defence experts at the moment.<sup>50</sup> Israel has this capability already, which is significant.

### **Conclusion**

Israel and India have established a robust and growing strategic partnership, which includes significant arms purchases. The defence collaboration between the two nations has evolved over the years, driven by shared security concerns and technological advancements in the defence sector.

The defence cooperation between Israel and India dates back to the 1960s, but it gained significant momentum in the 1990s with the establishment of formal diplomatic relations between the two countries. Israel's advanced military technologies, particularly in areas such as missiles, unmanned aerial vehicles (UAVs), radars, and electronic warfare systems, appealed to India's defence requirements.

India's defence procurement strategy emphasises diversification of arms suppliers to reduce dependence on any single nation. Israel's willingness to transfer technology and engage in joint research and development projects has appealed to India's quest for self-reliance in defence production.

Over the years, India has signed several significant defence deals with Israel. Some notable examples include, Barak Missiles which India acquired Barak surface-

---

<sup>48</sup> Ibid

<sup>49</sup> Efraim Inbar, "Indo-Israeli Defense Cooperation in the Twenty-First Century." *Mideast Security and Policy Studies* No. 93. February 2015. <https://besacenter.org/wp-content/uploads/2012/01/MSPS93>.

<sup>50</sup> Ibid.

to-air missiles, jointly developed by Israel and India, to bolster its naval air defence capabilities. Heron UAVs which India purchased Heron UAVs from Israel, enhancing its surveillance and reconnaissance capabilities. Spike Anti-Tank Guided Missiles, Phalcon Airborne Early Warning and Control Systems

The defence collaboration between Israel and India is likely to continue expanding in the future. Both nations have expressed their commitment to strengthening ties in the defence sector, with an emphasis on joint research and development and technology transfer. India's "Make in India" initiative and Israel's willingness to share technology can pave the way for more significant defence deals and co-production ventures.

Arms purchases between Israel and India have emerged as a critical aspect of their growing strategic partnership. Driven by shared security concerns, technological advancements, and the quest for diversifying arms suppliers, this collaboration has seen the acquisition of cutting-edge defence equipment and technologies by India from Israel. While this partnership has implications for regional security and geopolitical dynamics, it also offers opportunities for both nations to enhance their defence capabilities and build a mutually beneficial long-term alliance. As the collaboration continues to evolve, it will be essential for all stakeholders to carefully assess its implications and navigate the complexities of regional and global politics.

Benjamin Gantz, the Israeli Defence Minister, returned from a protracted trip to India in June 2022. During his visit, the two nations decided to concentrate on developing their defence cooperation. The 'India-Israel Vision on Defence Cooperation', signed by Gantz, a member of the Israeli Knesset and his Indian counterpart Rajnath Singh, the then defence minister of India, lays out a detailed 10-year roadmap for finding new areas of cooperation.

India has a history of relying more on Israeli equipment and technology for counterterrorism and border security. India has now surpassed the United States, as Israel's main military ally in West Asia and has also purchased the most Israeli weapons over the past ten years. India's acquisition of weapons has given Israel's defence industry steady and highly desired access to a sizable market. Since the



United States had vetoed Israeli arms sales to China in the late 1990s and early 2000s due to concerns over the qualitative upgrade of Chinese military capabilities, this entry into the Indian market is even more significant for Israel's defence industry.

However, there is a genuine opportunity for New Delhi and Tel Aviv to advance cooperation beyond these typical obstacles. The agreement to strengthen collaboration in cutting-edge defence technologies is a step in the right direction. In addition to the usual flagships like artificial intelligence, block chain, and robotics, both sides can collaborate on technologies like additive manufacturing, advanced battery technology, and power sources because Israel places a strong emphasis on research and development.

The increasing defence ties between Israel and India could have implications for Pakistan's security calculus. Pakistan may perceive this partnership as a security challenge, potentially leading to an arms race in the region. The strengthening defence cooperation between Israel and India adds another layer to the geopolitical dynamics in the Middle East and South Asia. It may impact regional alliances and partnerships, influencing countries' alignments in response to this evolving strategic partnership.

## CHAPTER 2

### ISRAEL INDIA RELATIONS, IMPLICATIONS FOR PAKISTAN

#### Introduction

Since 1947, when South Asia gained independence from British colonial authority, there have been conflicts between Pakistan and India.<sup>51</sup> India, being a populous nation and one of the oldest civilizations in history, has long aspired to play a comparable role in world events and to be a force to be reckoned with in the area.<sup>52</sup> However, despite these factors mentioned above, India's strategists assess India's national goals and accuse Pakistan of posing a barrier.<sup>53</sup>

India, changed its foreign policy with time to reflect the evolving global environment.<sup>54</sup> Israel and India's shared vision of Islam as their mutual adversary and their shared objective of exploiting the Muslim world are their most apparent similarities.<sup>55</sup> Defense cooperation between the US and India has expanded to unprecedented heights previously reserved for close US allies and friends, including joint military drills in Alaska, the selling of military equipment, and the sharing of nuclear reactors, fuel, and expertise.<sup>56</sup> The American position in and around the Gulf, Indian hegemony over the Indian Ocean, and Israeli abilities to regulate entry and exit

---

<sup>51</sup> Mariam Mufti, "Stephen Cohen, *The Idea of Pakistan*," *South Asia Multidisciplinary Academic Journal Online*. April 8, 2009. <https://doi.org/10.4000/214> (accessed December 11, 2023).

<sup>52</sup> Harsh Pant, "India-Israel Partnership: Convergence and Constraints," *Middle East Review of International Affairs* Vol 8 (2004). [https://middle-east-review-of-international-affairs-publications/indiaisraeli-partnership-convergence-and-constraints\(9302e443-58f2-45d5-bec7-803b6165b127\)/export.html](https://middle-east-review-of-international-affairs-publications/indiaisraeli-partnership-convergence-and-constraints(9302e443-58f2-45d5-bec7-803b6165b127)/export.html).

<sup>53</sup> Indrani Bagchi, "India Eyes Israel's Iron Dome to Counter Pak, Puppets," *The Times of India*, March 13, 2012, <https://timesofindia.indiatimes.com/india/india-eyes-israels-iron-dome-to-counter-pak-puppets/articleshow/17329499.cms>

<sup>54</sup> Ibid.

<sup>55</sup> Sharma Ashok, "India-Israel Relations: The Evolving Partnership," *Taylor & Francis* Vol 21, Issue no 4 (2015). <https://doi.org/10.1080/13537121.2015.1076189>

<sup>56</sup> Ashley Tellis, "The U.S.-India Global Partnership: How Significant for American Interests?" *Carnegie Endowment for International Peace*. November 17, 2005. <https://carnegieendowment.org/2005/11/17/u.s.-india-global-partnership-how-significant-for-american-interests-pub-17693> (accessed January 12, 2023).

from and into the Red Sea all point to a future in which the Muslim worlds of South-Central and West Asia will be under siege.<sup>57</sup>

Most of these variables appear to be realising their future shapes in the coming scenario. Sociocultural, militarily, economically the United States, India, and Israel are finding a natural aim to cooperate with one another.<sup>58</sup> Their economic collaboration is proving to be mutually advantageous. A relationship in the defense and security areas is growing. It is crucial that Pakistani policymakers shed their delusions and see that the trio is becoming into a clear collective security concern for the Muslim World in general and Pakistan in particular. The Indo-Israeli-US strategic alliance has evolved to rely on joint military exercises and other joint enterprises in defense and security, and if they were to continue, it would give their partnership more strategic depth.

## **2.1 India Israel Cooperation and its Implications on Pakistan**

The relationship between India and Israel directly and indirectly affects Pakistan. When India increases its defense spending, Pakistan feels the need to respond in kind to maintain a balance of power and address its security concerns. This situation creates a security dilemma for Pakistan, as it believes that matching India's defense capabilities is necessary to ensure regional stability.<sup>59</sup> As India and Israel strengthen their defense cooperation over time, the dynamics of Pakistan and South Asia are directly and indirectly influenced. The acceptance and normalization of relations between India and Israel have led to various forms of defense cooperation, such as counterterrorism initiatives, military collaborations, intelligence information sharing, and joint training programs between the two nations.<sup>60</sup>

---

<sup>57</sup> Ibid.

<sup>58</sup> Robert John, "A Grand Strategy for America." Cornell University Press. November 4, 2021. <https://www.cornellpress.cornell.edu/book/9780801468438/a-grand-strategy-for-america>. (accessed January 30, 2023).

<sup>59</sup> Ghulam Mustafa, "Indo-Israel Relations: Implications for Pakistan." *Pakistan Social Sciences Review* Vol 3, Issue 1 (2016). (<https://pssr.org.pk/issues/v3/1/indo-israel-relations-implications-for-pakistan>).

<sup>60</sup> Ibid.

Experts have observed the Israeli and Indian defence cooperation throughout the years.<sup>61</sup> Before normalization and the establishment of bilateral diplomatic contacts, the two governments had informal defense links. These connections were kept a secret from the general public since Muslims in India would become angry about the secret meeting between India and Israel. Various types of literature suggest that Israel provided support to India during its wars with Pakistan in 1965, 1971, and 1999.

In contrast, Pakistan is directly affected by the Indian-Israeli connections in terms of territory, sovereignty, defence, economics, and security issues for Pakistan's present and future generations. Below the backdrop is a discussion of some key consequences for Pakistan, either directly or indirectly.

The growing strategic partnership between Israel and India, characterized by increased defense cooperation, joint military exercises, and intelligence sharing, has implications that Pakistan closely monitors. India's quest for advanced military technology and weapons systems from Israel, as well as technological collaborations in various sectors, may impact the regional balance of power and raise concerns for Pakistan's security dynamics. Furthermore, the alignment between India and Israel in international forums could influence decisions that may affect Pakistan's interests. Additionally, Pakistan may be sensitive to any perceived support for India's stance on the Kashmir issue, and any potential cooperation in nuclear and missile capabilities between India and Israel could also be a source of concern.

Moreover, the deepening India-Israel relations might prompt Pakistan to reassess its own diplomatic strategy and seek alternative partnerships in the international arena. Pakistan may further strengthen its alliances with countries sharing similar concerns and interests, and it might also explore avenues for enhanced defense and technology cooperation with other nations. This could lead to a potential shift in regional dynamics, potentially impacting broader geopolitical scenarios.

Furthermore, the strengthening ties between India and Israel may also have economic implications for Pakistan. As India and Israel engage in closer trade and

---

<sup>61</sup> Ibid.

investment cooperation, Pakistan might face competition in certain sectors and markets, and it may need to adapt its economic policies accordingly.

Given the historical context and conflicts between Pakistan and India, the evolving relations between India and Israel could add complexity to the already delicate regional situation. It is important for all parties involved to engage in constructive dialogue and diplomacy to address concerns and maintain stability in the region. Additionally, the international community plays a crucial role in promoting peace, encouraging cooperation, and finding solutions to long-standing disputes to ensure a peaceful and secure South Asian region.

## 2.2 The National Security Factor

Indian military space program's recently launched TecSAR-1 which is an Israeli reconnaissance satellite, equipped with a synthetic-aperture radar developed by Elta Systems (an Israeli provider of defence products and services specializing in radar, Electronic Warfare, Communication, Autonomous Ground Systems, Intelligence and Cyber products) is a warning sign for Pakistan's national security which will have negative implicative insinuations for the strategic stability of South Asia.<sup>62</sup> With the assistance of Israeli professionals, this new cutting-edge technology helped India develop, and it also provided the tools and equipment needed to finish India's new space project.<sup>63</sup> After this brand-new, cutting-edge satellite system was completed, India's defence capability caught up to other nations in terms of current technology.

The border of Kashmir between India and its bitter adversary Pakistan may benefit from the latest space satellite system technology.<sup>64</sup> The Israeli spy agencies

---

<sup>62</sup> Zohaib Altaf, "India's Privately Launched Rocket: A Threat to Pakistan's National Security?," *Global Village Space*, November 21, 2022, <https://www.globalvillagespace.com/indias-privately-launched-rocket-a-threat-to-pakistans-national-security/>. (accessed January 16, 2023).

<sup>63</sup> Mahvish Malik, "Implications of Indo-Israel Defence Nexus in South Asia." *Daily Times*, October 9, 2018. <https://dailytimes.com.pk/308405/implications-of-indo-israel-defence-nexus-in-south-asia/>.

<sup>64</sup> Sameer Patil, "The Deepening of India-Israel Defence Ties." *Observational Research Foundation*. June 7, 2022. <https://www.orfonline.org/expert-speak/the-deepening-of-india-israel-defence-ties>. (accessed December 18, 2022).

invaded the occupied Kashmir region and began their menacing operations.<sup>65</sup> Israeli intelligence agents were sent into occupied Kashmir with the intent to stir up trouble and make matters difficult for Pakistan.

Due to the realisation of Pakistan's vital role in expanding influence, fostering cooperation, and fostering unity among Muslim nations specifically the Arab ones.<sup>66</sup> As a result, Mossad has been working in occupied Kashmir to rout Kashmiri freedom fighters and instruct Indian forces stationed along Pakistan's western border.

The other serious menace to Pakistan's national security comes from the two nations' intelligence services, Research and Analysis Wing (RAW) in India and Mossad in Israel, which work together in the Middle East and in Pakistan as well.<sup>67</sup> Both nations viewed Pakistan as the first Islamic nuclear power and dubbed it the "Islamic bomb". Another is that Pakistan has not yet established diplomatic ties with Israel or recognized it as a sovereign state.

A decade ago, Janes information outfit, a prominent international source on intelligence information, reported that Indian spy agency RAW and its Israeli counterpart had established four new agencies with the aim of infiltrating Pakistan. These intelligence agencies allegedly planned to target significant religious and military figures, journalists, judges, lawyers, and bureaucrats. They also purportedly intended to carry out bomb attacks on major railway stations, train stations, bridges, bus stations, cinemas, mosques, and hotels, as well as incite sectarian riots within Pakistan.

A well-known statement by Israel's first Prime Minister, David Ben Gurion, expressed a desire to strike and crush Pakistan, considering it an enemy of Jews and Zionism, through covert and secret plans. This statement highlights Israel's perspective and intentions regarding Pakistan.

---

<sup>65</sup> Tariq Saeedi, "Mossad And India's Spy Agency Team Up, Target Pakistan," *Arab News*, June 2, 2002, <https://www.arabnews.com/node/221349> (accessed January 16, 2023).

<sup>66</sup> Ibid.

<sup>67</sup> Ibid.

Despite having no diplomatic relations since their independence, Pakistan and Israel view each other as rival states. Additionally, India also sees Pakistan as an arch-rival. However, over time, India and Israel have strengthened their cooperation, not only in trade, culture, and technology but also in counter-terrorism, intelligence activities, and defense collaborations. This growing partnership poses a potential threat to Asia in general and Pakistan in particular. The increasing closeness between India and Israel raises concerns about regional stability and security dynamics.

### **2.3 A Threat to Pakistan's Nuclear Weapons**

It is hardly surprising that India and Israel have shared interests and have grown closer since initiating bilateral diplomatic missions. At the moment, both countries are moving together.<sup>68</sup> India and Israel are drafting a policy to obstruct and constrain Pakistan because Israel is hostile to Pakistan's nuclear assets and is attempting to eliminate its nuclear capability. Pakistan's nuclear power is on one side, while all western countries, including India, are opposed to Pakistan's nuclear power. Both India and Israel were opposed to Pakistan acquiring nuclear weapons.

Israel, in particular, views Pakistan's nuclear program as a threat and perceives it as an 'Islamic bomb,' further fueling opposition to its nuclear capabilities. In the past, both India and Israel actively opposed Pakistan's nuclear ambitions and devised various conspiracies to thwart its nuclear program. However, their attempts did not succeed in achieving their desired outcomes. For instance, in 1983, Israel offered India a plan to destroy Pakistan's Kahuta nuclear power plant, but Pakistan was alerted to this malicious plot by its strategic partnership with the United States, which had informed the Pakistani authorities.

The deepening Indo-Israeli ties are viewed with concern from Pakistan's national security perspective, particularly regarding its nuclear power plant.

---

<sup>68</sup> Elizabeth Roche, "How India, Israel Diplomatic Ties Came to Fruition." *Mint.com*, January 15, 2018. <https://www.livemint.com/Politics/0pe5Cc2BoZ24xWX3t90iaP/How-India-Israel-diplomatic-ties-came-to-fruition.html>. (accessed January 20, 2023).

Statements made during high-level visits, such as the CIA chief's visit to Israel and Israeli Prime Minister Benjamin Netanyahu's visit to India, along with the Indian army chief's comments on Pakistan's nuclear capabilities, add to the apprehensions. The expressed remarks, though carefully worded, may have implications for Asian stability and peace, especially concerning Pakistan.

### **Conclusion**

At the beginning of India's independence in 1947, India's government and its people were hostile towards the idea of the state of Israel and were supportive of the Palestinian cause. However, over the years, India's stance towards Israel gradually changed, leading to a shift from hostility to cooperation in various fields.

In the current century, India and Israel have developed strong bilateral ties encompassing trade, military cooperation, space technology, agriculture, and business. This growing relationship between the two nations has been influenced by multiple factors, including the absence of previous animosity and shared interests in various domains.

One significant factor contributing to the closer ties between India and Israel is their perceived common threat from Pakistan. As a nuclear state, Pakistan poses a security challenge to both India in the South Asian region and Israel in the Middle Eastern region. This shared concern has fostered military cooperation between India and Israel, which, in turn, raises questions about the balance of power in South Asia.

India's attempts to isolate Pakistan from the international community have become more pronounced, especially after Israeli Prime Minister Benjamin Netanyahu's visit to India. India is actively collaborating with certain regional and international countries to formulate a policy aimed at isolating Pakistan on the global stage. The specific details and strategies of this policy are being worked out in coordination with these countries, and India seeks to garner support for a resolution to further isolate Pakistan in international conferences.



This diplomatic approach reflects India's efforts to address its security concerns and assert its regional influence by rallying international support against Pakistan. However, such developments can have implications for regional stability and may further strain the already complex dynamics in South Asia. It remains essential for all involved parties to engage in constructive dialogue and cooperation to maintain peace and stability in the region.

## CHAPTER 3

### PROSPECTS OF PAKISTAN ISRAEL RELATIONS

#### Introduction

"Pakistan is like Israel, an ideological state," said formerly Pakistani President Zia ul-Haq in 1981. "Take out Judaism from Israel and it will fall like a house of cards. Take Islam out of Pakistan and make it a secular state; it would collapse." This statement by Zia ul Haq explains both the state of Israel and Pakistan. Since both Pakistan and Israel attained independence founded on their respective religions, they are both regarded as ideological states.<sup>69</sup> But neither had diplomatic contacts with the other, and neither had a direct war. One of the key grounds for refusing to recognise Israel as a state is the support and stand for Palestinian Muslims. Israel and Pakistan attempted to establish relations but were unsuccessful.

On the other hand, Israel and India have had a close relationship for 25 years, and this relationship has had a big effect on Pakistan. Muslims' belief that we should not recognise Israel is another justification for not doing so. But if Israel and Pakistan become allies, Pakistan will gain from Israel in a number of ways and Israel would get an ally in the Middle Eastern region. However, there are many constraints when it comes to recognising Israel. Many of which is Pakistan being for the Palestinian people. Pakistan believes, that recognising Israel would mean harming the cause of Palestine and which would eventually affect the cause of Kashmir as well. Many times in the history of Pakistan, Pakistan and Israel did have official and unofficial visits and meetings with Israel, but they did not turn into official terms. Even if there were any visits by the Pakistani people, they were later denied by the leadership or the

---

<sup>69</sup> Ishaan Tharoor, "The Pakistani Origins of the Israeli State," *Washington Post*, October 3, 2014, <https://www.washingtonpost.com/news/worldviews/wp/2014/12/03/the-pakistani-origins-of-the-israeli-state/>. (accessed January 8, 2023).

then government. The problem between Israel and India is historical. Pakistan relates the issues of Palestine with the issue of Kashmir.<sup>70</sup>

As early as 1947, Pakistan took a firm stance on the issue of the Jewish state, as demonstrated by its representative's opposition to the plan of partitioning Palestine at the United Nations. During Israel's War of Independence, Pakistan reportedly sought to offer military support to the Arab forces combating Israel, procuring 250,000 rifles from Czechoslovakia and acquiring three aircraft from Italy.<sup>71</sup> Pakistan's policy towards Israel was motivated not only by its solidarity with the Arab and Muslim communities in the region but also by its perception of the Arab-Jewish territorial conflict as analogous to its own dispute with India over the state of Jammu and Kashmir in the Himalayas. The historical conflict over Jammu and Kashmir erupted after the British plan to partition India in 1947, resulting in a war between the two countries until July 1949.<sup>72</sup> In Pakistan's view, both these events represented the struggles of Islam for sovereignty.

The historical relationship between Pakistan and Israel has been marked by tension and non-recognition, with no diplomatic ties between the two countries. Pakistan has consistently shown support for an independent Palestinian state, further adding to the animosity between the two nations. However, recent geopolitical changes in the Middle East, with some Arab countries establishing diplomatic relations with Israel, have sparked a potential shift in Pakistan's stance.

Normalization with Israel could bring economic and technological cooperation opportunities. Both countries possess skilled human resources and advanced technologies in various sectors like agriculture, water management, and defense.

---

<sup>70</sup> BBC News. "Kashmir: Why India and Pakistan Fight over It." *BBC News*, August 8, 2019. <https://www.bbc.com/news/10537286>. (accessed January 9, 2023).

<sup>71</sup> Gadi Raz, "Pakistan Israel relations: A chance for normalization?", *The institute for national security studies*, March 2023, [https://www.inss.org.il/strategic\\_assessment/pakistan-israel/](https://www.inss.org.il/strategic_assessment/pakistan-israel/) (accessed March 8, 2023)

<sup>72</sup> Ibid

Collaborating on joint ventures could lead to knowledge exchange, innovation, and economic growth, providing a compelling incentive for Pakistan to explore diplomatic engagement with Israel.

Despite the historical hostilities, unofficial and official engagements between Pakistan and Israel have occurred over the years. These engagements included intelligence cooperation during the Soviet-Afghan War, military training assistance to PLO soldiers, and recent secret visits by Pakistani officials to Israel. Such interactions hint at a potential thaw in relations.

Strengthening ties with Israel could also enhance Pakistan's capabilities in counterterrorism and intelligence sharing. Both countries face similar security challenges, such as terrorism and extremism, making cooperation in these areas mutually beneficial.

Furthermore, the normalization of relations with Israel might allow Pakistan to play a more constructive role in promoting regional stability. Acting as a mediator between Iran and Arab nations and fostering dialogue between Israel and Palestine could contribute to peace efforts in the Middle East, aligning with Pakistan's support for a two-state solution.

However, this potential shift in Pakistan's stance also poses challenges. Domestically, there may be resistance from segments of the population that strongly support the Palestinian cause. Pakistan must strike a delicate balance in maintaining its solidarity with Palestine while exploring improved ties with Israel. Additionally, managing relations with other Muslim-majority countries, especially those that have not yet normalized relations with Israel, requires careful diplomacy and sensitivity to their concerns.

In conclusion, Pakistan's potential move towards normalization with Israel signifies a significant departure from its historical stance. While there are potential economic, technological, and security benefits, there are also challenges in terms of domestic and regional dynamics. Navigating this path will demand cautious

diplomacy, pragmatism, and a clear understanding of the implications for Pakistan's national interests and its position in the broader Middle East region.

### **3.1 Pakistan and Israel Ties**

Pakistan's involvement and interests in Israel stretch back to the 1917 Balfour Declaration and predate partition. Even if they didn't, secular leaders like Mohammed Ali Jinnah, the creator and architect of Pakistan, used Islam as justification for their opposition to the Jewish homeland. In the name of Muslims worldwide, not just in India, Jinnah fiercely opposed the infamous Balfour Declaration. Any positive development in Israel's relations with the Muslim world reignites discussion in Pakistan's mainstream political circles given that country's ideological affinity for the Arab world.

During the recent developments, Imran Khan, the Prime Minister of Pakistan, made it crystal clear that his country would not recognize Israel until there was a Palestinian state when the United Arab Emirates (UAE) and Bahrain became the first two Gulf Arab nations to normalize ties with Israel in August 2020 and September 2020, respectively. However, during Khan's regime, there were unofficial meetings happening with Israel.<sup>73</sup>

### **3.2 The Abraham Accords and Pakistan**

Pakistan has resisted establishing formal ties with Israel since 1948. Pakistan's policy was unaffected by the agreements that Israel made with Egypt in 1978, the Palestine Liberation Organization in 1993, and Jordan in 1994. Islamabad's reluctance to recognize Israel is primarily motivated by:

1. Support for the Palestinian people in their religion
2. Concern over unfavorable responses from different groups in the nation; and

---

<sup>73</sup> Gadi Raz, "Pakistan Israel relations: A chance for normalization?", *The institute for national security studies*, March 2023, [https://www.inss.org.il/strategic\\_assessment/pakistan-israel/](https://www.inss.org.il/strategic_assessment/pakistan-israel/) (accessed March 8, 2023)

3. Apprehension that establishing diplomatic ties with Israel would make Pakistan less competitive with India in the Jammu and Kashmir conflict.<sup>74</sup>

Israel had formal ties with nearly all of the nations in Western Europe, North America, South America, and Sub-Saharan Africa by the late 1960s. The Khartoum Resolution, which included three commitments that prohibited recognition, peace, and negotiations with Israel, was released by the eight Arab League members present at the time on September 1 of that year. Between August 29 and September 1, 1967, a significant summit conference took place in Khartoum, attended by eight Arab heads of state.

During this meeting, a consensus was reached, which laid the foundation for the policies adopted by most Arab states in their conflicts with Israel. Among various matters, the resolution emphasized the continuation of their struggle against Israel. By embracing the principles of "no peace with Israel, no recognition of Israel, and no negotiations with Israel," the Arab states seemed to firmly reject any potential path towards peaceful resolution, appearing to close the door on progress towards peace.

By signing the Abraham Peace Accords in Washington in September 2020, the United Arab Emirates, Bahrain, and other countries significantly realigned their diplomatic ties with Israel. There is a visible divide as a result of this normalization; other countries with a majority of Muslims, like Morocco and Sudan, have accepted incentives to normalize relations with Israel, and Pakistan is coming under increasing pressure from its close allies in the Gulf to do the same. Pakistan, which has long-standing cooperative relations with every member of the Gulf Cooperation Council (GCC), now finds itself in a difficult situation because of how it sees Israel in relation to the Palestine issue.

Amidst the rapidly changing regional geopolitical dynamics and Israel's recent successful efforts in improving diplomatic relations with several Muslim nations, rumors have emerged about potential formal links between Israel and Pakistan. Such discussions in Pakistan's mainstream political circles are significant, given the

---

<sup>74</sup> Ibid

country's ideological affinity for the Arab world. Prime Minister Imran Khan has unequivocally stated that Pakistan will not recognize Israel unless there is a Palestinian state. This stance was reinforced when the United Arab Emirates (UAE) and Bahrain became the first two Gulf Arab nations to normalize their ties with Israel in August and September 2020, respectively.

Pakistani authorities and leaders have repeatedly denied having any communications with Israel.<sup>75</sup> They have attempted to argue that Pakistan is not encroaching on Israel because of internal pressures and the sensitive nature of the subject. While praising the Oslo Accords and the mutual recognition of Israel and the Palestine Liberation Organization (PLO) at the time, interim Prime Minister Moin Qureshi reaffirmed that Pakistan had no intentions to recognize Israel.<sup>76</sup> A few months later, Pakistan promptly refuted an Israeli ambassador's claim that officials from both nations had been in touch regarding Pakistan's recognition of Israel in New Delhi.<sup>77</sup>

The Foreign Minister himself had announced the start of an urgent inquiry to ascertain which Pakistani officials had the contacts revealed by the Israelis, the Pakistani media questioned the official line. Pakistan does not recognize Israel, according to N.D. Khan, the country's Parliamentary Secretary for Foreign Affairs, who also stated that there is "absolutely no question whatsoever of establishing diplomatic relations with that country" in a January 1994 address to the legislature.

### **3.3 A Shift Towards Normalisation of Relations with Israel**

The October 1991 Madrid Peace Conference marked a significant breakthrough in the relations between the State of Israel and the Arab world. It was a historic event

---

<sup>75</sup> Ibid.

<sup>76</sup> Faiza Shakeel, "Economic History of Pakistan from 1972 to 2015," *Academia Education*, April 26, 2019. [https://www.academia.edu/30351174/Economic-History\\_of\\_Pakistan\\_From\\_1972\\_to\\_2015](https://www.academia.edu/30351174/Economic-History_of_Pakistan_From_1972_to_2015). (accessed January 12, 2023).

as it facilitated direct face-to-face negotiations between Israel and all its neighboring countries, going beyond its previous peace treaty solely with Egypt in 1979.<sup>78</sup> These talks involved political leaders, a departure from the earlier armistice discussions held in the late 1940s and 1950s.<sup>79</sup> Additionally, the conference initiated a multilateral process that fostered dialogue between Israeli diplomats and representatives from Arab states in North Africa and the Persian Gulf.

The overarching goal of the Madrid process was to consider the aspirations, security needs, and mutual reconciliation of the involved parties, emphasizing the importance of compromise. This framework established regular communication channels between Israel and the Arab states, thereby paving the way for the Middle East peace process and laying the groundwork for potential future understandings.

Although the successes of Madrid have been overshadowed by the collapse of the Oslo process, it is crucial to remember and possibly reinstate its careful approach in the future, taking into account the evolving conditions in the Middle East. Regular lines of communication between nations remain vital for regional stability and to prevent misinterpretations and miscalculations.

Since the start of the Madrid peace process, there has been a discernible change in Pakistan's position, with some of its top leaders voicing a readiness to recognize Israel if certain requirements are met. This strategy is similar to China's declaration, made after Chairman Mao's death, that it was prepared to recognize and normalize relations with the Jewish state under certain conditions. Senior government representatives and ambassadors have frequently called for a rethinking of official policy due to the issue of Israel's recognition and normalization of relations with Pakistan, which is no longer viewed negatively. Those who support Israel's recognition have long been quiet or less vocal, and they are frequently accused of being conspirators or Israeli agents.

---

<sup>78</sup> Eytan Bentsur, "The way to peace emerged at madrid:a decade since the 1991 Madrid conference" 15 February 2002. <https://www.icpa.org/jl/vp472.htm> (January 12, 2022)

<sup>79</sup> Ibid



Prime Ministers of Pakistan, close friends, working ambassadors, retired generals, and most importantly, religious leaders have all supported the action. There is no longer universal agreement that Israel should not be recognized, and an increasing number of people are advocating for a slight shift in position.

There are hints that during his first tenure in office (1990–1993), Prime Minister Nawaz Sharif was eager to reevaluate Pakistan's policy toward Israel and even considered recognition and normalization. It appears that India's choice to open full diplomatic relations in January 1992 served as the driving force behind this. According to rumors, Sharif was dissuaded from moving forward by Egypt. After his reelection in January 1997, his detractors hoped he wouldn't make "similar mistakes." Although his government has demonstrated a desire to normalize relations, he accused his political rivals of being Israeli agents during the election campaign. The church is supporting Sharif in this endeavor.

In August 1997, a group of Pakistani religious leaders was said to have visited Israel for a week, according to Israeli media. They met with representatives of the foreign ministry and decided to promote Islamic travel from Pakistan in addition to touring Islamic holy sites. The Awami Qiyadat Party's leader, Mirza Aslam Beg, stated the following month that Pakistan was a third party to the conflict because there were no clear differences between Pakistan and Israel. We should not be reluctant to recognize Israel because we have no dispute with it.

A top advisor to Prime Minister Sharif, Sadiq ul-Farooq, stated that recognizing the Jewish state would be "harmless" in the same month.<sup>80</sup> Given that the announcement followed Sharif's trip to the US, it is safe to infer that Sharif supported and tacitly approved of such a delicate statement.

The conditions for normalization, however, vary. The demand for Israel to "vacate Jerusalem" is loud and clear, but there are other ideas as well. One scenario states that Pakistan will not recognize Israel or the Palestinians until their differences

---

<sup>80</sup> Faiza Shakeel, "Economic History of Pakistan from 1972 to 2015," *Academia Education*, April 26, 2019. [https://www.academia.edu/30351174/Economic-History\\_of\\_Pakistan\\_From\\_1972\\_to\\_2015](https://www.academia.edu/30351174/Economic-History_of_Pakistan_From_1972_to_2015). (accessed January 12, 2023).

have been fully resolved to the pleasure of the latter. Others contend that Pakistan should persuade other Islamic nations to make Israel's recognition contingent on meeting a number of basic requirements. However, these claims and defenses do not suggest that everyone, including the media and the intelligentsia, is in favor of acceptance and normalization.

### **3.4 Hurdles in Pakistan to Recognize Israel**

Pakistani officials and leaders have repeatedly denied having any communication with Israel.<sup>81</sup> They have attempted to argue that Pakistan is not encroaching on Israel because of internal pressures and the sensitive nature of the subject. Caretaker Prime Minister Moin Qureshi reaffirmed that Pakistan had no intentions to recognize Israel in September 1993, even though he welcomed the Oslo Accords and Israel's and the PLO's mutual recognition.<sup>82</sup> A few months later, Pakistan promptly refuted an Israeli ambassador's claim that officials from both nations had been in touch regarding Pakistan's recognition of Israel in New Delhi.<sup>83</sup>

Because "the Foreign Minister himself had disclosed the launch of an urgent investigation to determine which Pakistani officials made the contacts disclosed by the Israelis," the Pakistani media questioned the official line. Pakistan does not recognize Israel, according to N.D. Khan, the country's Parliamentary Secretary for Foreign Affairs, who also stated that there is "absolutely no question whatsoever of establishing diplomatic relations with that country" in a January 1994 address to the legislature.

People who support the status quo are portrayed as enemies of Pakistan and Islam as well as spies for Israel or India in Pakistan, where the subject continues to generate ardent debate. Non-recognition is frequently portrayed as a moral stance

---

<sup>81</sup> Ibid.

<sup>82</sup> Ibid.

because Pakistan is compelled to adopt "a principled and honest posture." Additionally, recognition has never been a question of government but rather of religion.

Pakistan is unable to support the Palestinians while also recognizing Israel because doing so is viewed as a zero-sum game. The Palestinian problem is thought to be more Islamic in nature than Arab or topographical. Since there are no differences or disputes between Israel and Pakistan, it is rejected that they should become more intimate.

### **3.5 A Shift Towards Normalisation With Israel**

Pakistan's stance has changed noticeably over the past few years, with some of its senior leaders declaring their readiness to recognize Israel if certain requirements are fulfilled.<sup>84</sup> Senior officials and diplomats have frequently urged a rethinking of official policy as the topic of recognition and normalization of relations with Israel is no longer considered taboo in Pakistan.<sup>85</sup> Supporters of Israel's recognition have long been silenced or kept quiet, and they are frequently accused of being conspirators or Israeli operatives.<sup>86</sup>

Those who support conditional acknowledgment have gotten more outspoken and assertive. The backing for such a move has come from Pakistani Prime Ministers, businessmen, active diplomats, retired generals, and most importantly, religious leaders. There is no longer as such a unanimity in favor of not recognising Israel, and a growing number of people are calling for a modest change in stance.

There are hints that during his first tenure in office (1990–1993), Prime Minister Nawaz Sharif was eager to reevaluate Pakistan's policy toward Israel and even considered recognition and normalisation. It appears that India's choice to open full

---

<sup>84</sup> Vinay Kaura, "Prospects of Israel-Pakistan Rapprochement," *Taylor & Francis*, October 6, 2020. <https://www.tandfonline.com/doi/full/10.1080/13537121.2020.1832314>. (accessed January 11, 2023).

<sup>85</sup> Ibid

<sup>86</sup> Kumaraswamy Patil, "Beyond the Veil: Israel-Pakistan Relations," *Jaffee Centre for Strategic Studies*, June 12, 2000. [https://www.files.ethz.ch/isn/94527/2000-03.\\_](https://www.files.ethz.ch/isn/94527/2000-03._) (accessed January 10, 2023).

diplomatic relations in January 1992 served as the driving force behind this. In August 1997, the Israeli media reported that a group of Pakistani religious leaders had visited Israel for one week.<sup>87</sup> They met with representatives of the foreign ministry and decided to promote travel from Pakistan in addition to touring Islamic holy sites.

The conditions for normalisation, however, vary. The demand for Israel to vacate Jerusalem is loud and clear, but there are other ideas as well. One scenario states that Pakistan will not recognise Israel until the Palestinians do not get their right. Others contend that Pakistan should persuade other Islamic nations to make Israel's recognition contingent on meeting a number of basic requirements. However, these claims and defenses do not suggest that everyone, including the media, the institutes, or some members of the government are not in favor of acceptance and normalisation. Leading Imran Khan advisor Sayed Zulfikar Bukhari traveled clandestinely to Israel in November to meet with retired Mossad chief Yossi Cohen.<sup>88</sup>

In the month of April, 2023, some products by a Pakistani businessman were exporter to Israel. This showed that some people in Pakistan are in favor of recognising Israel. Fishel Benkhald, a Pakistani Jew residing in Karachi, the southern port city of Pakistan, gained widespread attention on social media when he tweeted about his inaugural kosher food shipment destined for Israel even though Pakistan and Israel have no diplomatic relations.<sup>89</sup> Benkhald shared a video clip showing his visit to an Israeli market. He walks past stalls with containers of dates, dried fruit and spices with product tags in Hebrew. Pakistan denied having any diplomatic or trade relations with Israel. "There is no change in the policy," Foreign Ministry spokesperson Mumtaz Zahra Baloch told media in response to queries about bilateral trade.

---

<sup>87</sup> Kumaraswamy Patil, "Beyond the Veil: Israel-Pakistan Relations," *Jaffee Centre for Strategic Studies*, June 12, 2000. <https://www.files.ethz.ch/isn/94527/2000-03>. (accessed January 10, 2023).

<sup>88</sup> Ibid.

<sup>89</sup> AP News, "Pakistan Denies Israel Trade After Businessman's Export," April 3, 2023. <https://apnews.com/article/pakistan-israel-trade-7b3f932f8b45e497aafae72e27543d6a>. (accessed April 3, 2023).

Pakistan officially backs a two-state solution to the Israeli–Palestinian conflict and has a longstanding position of non-recognition of Israel until an independent Palestinian state is established within the pre-1967 borders and with East Jerusalem as its capital. Pakistan’s Commerce Ministry said rumours of bilateral trade were “sheer propaganda.” “Neither do we have any trade relations with Israel nor do we intend to develop any,” it said in a statement.

Benkhald, who is part of a dwindling Jewish community in the Muslim majority-nation of 220 million, had his religion status in his national Pakistani documents corrected from Islam to Judaism in 2017. Although a statement on his Pakistani passport says the document is valid for travel to all countries except Israel, he is the first Pakistani to have officially performed a pilgrimage there with the permission of Islamabad.

### **Conclusion**

Pakistan's relationship with Israel has historically been characterized by tension and non-recognition. The two countries have lacked diplomatic ties, with Pakistan consistently voicing support for an independent Palestinian state. However, recent developments have indicated a shift in Pakistan's stance, hinting at potential moves towards normalization with Israel. This essay explores the factors driving this shift, the potential benefits, and the challenges that lie ahead as Pakistan navigates this delicate diplomatic path.

The Pakistani passports are invalid to travel to Israel because Pakistan is one of the 28 nations that does not recognize Israel and does not have any diplomatic ties with Israel.<sup>90</sup> Israel and Pakistan have both fought indirect wars by facilitating their allies against each other on opposite sides in many conflicts.

One of the primary drivers of Pakistan's potential normalization with Israel is the evolving geopolitical landscape in the Middle East. In recent years, several Arab nations have taken steps to establish diplomatic relations with Israel, notably the

---

<sup>90</sup> Ibid.

United Arab Emirates, Bahrain, and Sudan. This trend reflects a pragmatic approach to regional security and economic cooperation. As neighboring nations forge new alliances, Pakistan may also be reconsidering its position to maintain its relevance in the ever-changing regional dynamics.

Normalization with Israel could open avenues for economic and technological cooperation. Both countries boast skilled human resources and advanced technologies in different sectors, such as agriculture, water management, and defense. Collaborative ventures could lead to knowledge exchange, innovation, and economic growth for both nations, providing a compelling incentive for Pakistan to explore diplomatic engagement with Israel.

Over the past few decades, there have been unofficial and official engagements between both Pakistan and Israel. It began in 1947, shortly after Pakistan was divided when David Ben Gurion, the first Prime Minister of Israel, sent a message to Muhammad Ali Jinnah, which was the catalyst for the event. Israel sought to establish ties with Pakistan at the time, but it was not successful. Then, as Pakistan consistently supported Palestine, the animosity increased over time. Over the years, Pakistan has also helped the Arab nations when they were fighting wars against Israel. Then later, the PLO pact was ratified by both Palestine and Israel. PLO soldiers were given training opportunities by Pakistani military establishments.

When Zia ul Haq asked the ISI to approach the Mossad in the early 1980s, Pakistan and Israel also cooperated on the intelligence front despite these hostilities. Analysts claim that Israel and Pakistan worked together to combat the Soviets in Afghanistan. Top Imran Khan advisor Sayed Zulfikar Bukhari traveled to Israel secretly in November of last year to meet with retired Mossad chief Yossi Cohen.<sup>91</sup> According to a source in Islamabad, Bukhari met with several high-ranking Israeli officials during a brief journey to Israel in November and gave them a message from

---

<sup>91</sup> Vinay Kaura, "Pakistan's Israel Dilemma," *Middle East Institute*, October 6, 2020 <https://www.mei.edu/publications/pakistans-israel-dilemma>. (accessed December 12, 2022).

Pakistani Chief of Staff Qamar Javed Bajwa. It is expected that the two countries will conduct a joint naval exercise in the Black Sea. There are many complexities in the connection between Pakistan and Israel. Even though the previous Imran Khan's administration consistently denied stories of overtures to Israel in order to head off criticism.

Strengthening ties with Israel could offer Pakistan an opportunity to enhance its capabilities in counterterrorism and intelligence sharing. Both countries face common security challenges, including terrorism and extremism. By cooperating in these areas, Pakistan can potentially benefit from Israel's expertise and resources in combating threats to national security.

The normalization of relations with Israel may offer Pakistan an opportunity to play a more constructive role in promoting regional stability. As tensions simmer between Iran and Arab nations, Pakistan could act as a mediator, leveraging its relations with both sides. Additionally, fostering dialogue between Israel and Palestine could contribute to peace efforts in the Middle East, a stance aligned with Pakistan's longstanding support for the two-state solution.

Pakistan's potential shift towards normalization with Israel represents a significant departure from its historical stance. While such a move offers prospects of economic, technological, and security benefits, it also presents challenges in terms of domestic resistance, maintaining support for Palestine, and managing relationships with other Muslim-majority nations. Navigating these complex challenges will require careful diplomacy, pragmatism, and a commitment to regional stability. Ultimately, any steps towards normalization should be approached with caution and a clear understanding of the potential consequences and benefits for Pakistan's national interests.

## CONCLUSION

The bilateral relations between Israel and India have witnessed significant growth and cooperation over the years. Both countries have strengthened ties in various fields, including defense, agriculture, technology, and counterterrorism. While this partnership has brought mutual benefits to Israel and India, it also holds implications for Pakistan and the broader regional dynamics in South Asia and the Middle East. The close ties between Israel and India have altered the geopolitical landscape in the region. It has led to closer alignment on regional and global issues, potentially creating a unified front that contrasts with Pakistan's position.

The defense cooperation between Israel and India has been a central aspect of their relationship. Israel is a significant supplier of defense equipment to India, contributing to India's military capabilities. This development could potentially affect the military balance in South Asia and prompt Pakistan to review its security strategies.

The strengthening of ties between Israel and India may impact the power dynamics in the Middle East and South Asia. As Israel strengthens its partnership with a major regional player like India, Pakistan might feel the need to reassess its alliances and seek alternative partnerships to maintain a balance of power. Pakistan has traditionally supported the Palestinian cause and advocated for the rights of the Kashmiri people. Israel's deepening relations with India could have implications for these long-standing conflicts. Pakistan may face challenges in effectively representing the interests of Palestinians and Kashmiris in the international arena.

Pakistan's strong stance against Israel's policies towards Palestine might lead to diplomatic isolation or tensions in certain international forums where India and Israel collaborate. This isolation could potentially impact Pakistan's ability to advance its foreign policy goals. Israel's expertise in various sectors, such as agriculture and technology, could offer potential economic and technological benefits to Pakistan. However, limited relations and political constraints might hinder Pakistan's direct access to these opportunities.



The deepening ties between Israel and India have implications for Pakistan's security, regional standing, and foreign policy. Pakistan must navigate this evolving geopolitical landscape strategically, striking a balance between its principled support for the Palestinian cause and its need for pragmatic engagement with regional players. It is essential for Pakistan to explore potential partnerships with other nations to maintain its influence and protect its interests in the face of evolving regional dynamics.

The establishment of bilateral ties between Pakistan and Israel holds potential benefits for Pakistan, but the readiness for such a move remains uncertain due to various reasons. As demonstrated in the past, Pakistanis reacted negatively when Donald Trump's actions favored Israel, indicating a strong aversion towards any form of ties with the country. The interactions between close friends, Israel and India, could have implications for Pakistan. While Israel is not categorized as either an ally or enemy, if appropriate measures are taken to improve relations, Israel has the potential to become a valuable ally for Pakistan.

Establishing bilateral relations between Israel, a Jewish state, and any Muslim country, including Pakistan, is a complex and difficult concept to comprehend. Despite several initiatives to foster a partnership between the two nations since their independence, it remains challenging due to emotional, religious, and political ties that Pakistan shares with other Muslim countries.

The support that the United States provides to Israel is often attributed to the influence of the Jewish lobby in America and the U.S.'s position as a dominant global power. This support further complicates the prospect of enduring relations between Pakistan and Israel, as it adds geopolitical complexities to the equation. Given recent events, such as the U.S. recognition of Jerusalem as Israel's capital and the opening of an embassy there, extending any form of goodwill to Israel is a challenging proposition.

Protests against these developments were taking place worldwide, with Muslim and European countries urged the U.S. to reconsider its decision, possibly through diplomatic channels like the United Nations.

The prospect of establishing lasting relations between Pakistan and Israel remains challenging due to religious and geopolitical factors. The recent developments surrounding the U.S.'s position on Israel and the resulting global protests further complicate the issue. Any steps towards normalisation will require delicate diplomacy, consideration of regional sensitivities, and a clear understanding of the potential implications for Pakistan's international standing and alliances.

The primary obstacles to Pakistan recognising and establishing diplomatic relations with Israel are as follows:

1. **Palestinian Solidarity:** Pakistan has traditionally aligned itself with the Palestinian cause and advocates for the rights of the Palestinian people. It considers the establishment of Israel and the subsequent displacement of Palestinians as an injustice and a violation of their rights. This strong empathy for the Palestinian struggle has been a fundamental aspect of Pakistan's foreign policy.
2. **Islamic Solidarity:** Pakistan, being a Muslim-majority country, maintains a strong sense of solidarity with other Muslim nations, especially those in the Arab world. Many Muslim-majority countries have historically opposed the recognition of Israel due to the Israeli-Palestinian conflict and the perceived mistreatment of Palestinians.
3. **Public Opinion:** Pakistan's population, which is predominantly Muslim, generally holds strong adverse sentiments towards Israel due to the ongoing Israeli-Palestinian conflict and perceived human rights violations. Political leaders often take public opinion into account when formulating foreign policy decisions.
4. **Kashmir Issue:** Pakistan also links the issue of Palestine with the Kashmir dispute. Pakistan views Israel's close relationship with India, particularly in defence and technology cooperation, as potentially supporting India's stance on the Kashmir issue, which Pakistan considers an integral part of its national identity.
5. **International Context:** Pakistan has historically been critical of Israel's actions in the region and perceives itself as a supporter of the rights of oppressed nations. It has been vocal in condemning Israeli military actions and settlement policies in the occupied territories.

For more than 50 years, Pakistan has maintained a dual strategy toward the Jewish state. It has publicly voiced strong resistance and positioned itself as an unwavering ally of the Palestinian cause but on the other hand Pakistan was forced to approach Israel with caution because of its pro-Western attitude, closeness to reactionary Middle Eastern governments, that are accepting Israel as a state. Long-standing anti-Israel sentiment hasn't stopped Pakistan from seeking out and keeping in touch with Israel, or from signing small deals. However, it was unable to state a public pro-Israel strategy until lately. Influential Pakistani analysts started urging a modest change in the nation's Israeli policy as soon as the Oslo process got underway.

The Oslo process refers to a series of negotiations and agreements that took place in the early 1990s between Israel and the Palestine Liberation Organization (PLO) with the aim of resolving the Israeli-Palestinian conflict and establishing a framework for peace in the region.

The process was initiated with secret talks that began in Oslo, Norway, in 1993, leading to the signing of the Oslo Accords on September 13, 1993, at the White House in Washington, D.C. The accords were signed by Israeli Prime Minister Yitzhak Rabin and PLO Chairman Yasser Arafat, with U.S. President Bill Clinton serving as a witness. The Oslo process aimed to create a pathway towards a permanent resolution to the Israeli-Palestinian conflict through the negotiation of final status issues, such as borders, Jerusalem, refugees, and settlements. However, the process faced numerous challenges and setbacks, including violence from both sides, the growth of Israeli settlements in the occupied territories, and disagreements over the final status issues.

As a result, the Oslo process did not lead to a final and comprehensive peace agreement between Israel and the Palestinians. Instead, it created a complex and often contentious framework for governing the West Bank and Gaza Strip, with the goal of paving the way for further negotiations towards a permanent peace settlement. Despite its shortcomings, the Oslo process remains a significant part of the history of Israeli-Palestinian relations and the pursuit of peace in the Middle East.

Although formalising official relations between Pakistan and Israel may not be on the immediate horizon, both countries are likely to maintain personal and political connections for tactical purposes through unofficial means. Pakistan stands to benefit

from Israel's recognition in several ways. Firstly, it could enhance Pakistan's ability to represent the interests of Palestinian Muslims and counter any Israeli support for India in containing the independence struggle in occupied Kashmir. Despite tensions with India, Pakistan continues to engage in trade and maintain diplomatic ties with the country, making strategic collaborations with Israel significant for regional dynamics.

Moreover, forging ties with Israel could provide Pakistan with access to Israel's global lobbying influence, potentially bolstering Pakistan's standing in the eyes of the international community. A strong relationship with Israel might also enable Pakistan to leverage Israel's influence in other parts of the world for its diplomatic goals.

Collaboration between Israel and Pakistan could also address the shared threat of terrorist extremism. Cooperation in trade, agriculture, and military sectors could prove beneficial for Pakistan. Israel's expertise in desert farming could assist Pakistan in developing its vast arid regions for agricultural purposes.

Pakistan may engage in certain trade-related activities, offer armed assistance, and demonstrate goodwill to Israel. However, Pakistan must be cautious not to strain its relations with Israel, as it could adversely affect its relations with India, particularly concerning arms sales.

The question of whether Pakistan should recognise Israel as a state or not lacks a clear-cut answer. Historical examples from old Arabia reveal that Muslims traded with Jews despite being rivals, benefiting from each other's strengths. Understanding our religious history may offer some hints in addressing this question.

In conclusion, while formal diplomatic ties between Pakistan and Israel may not materialize in the near future, both nations can explore unofficial connections to gain strategic advantages. Learning from historical examples and carefully navigating geopolitical complexities can guide Pakistan in approaching its relationship with Israel and pursuing its interests in the region.

## BIBLIOGRAPHY

- Agarwal, Surabhi. "Narendra Modi: PM Narendra Modi's 3-Day Visit: India, Israel May Create \$40-Million Innovation Fund." *The Economic Times*, 2017, <https://economictimes.indiatimes.com/news/economy/policy/pm-narendra-modis-3-day-visit-india-israel-may-create-40-million-innovation-fund/articleshow/59431889.cms?from=mdr>.
- Ahmed, Zahid Shahab, and Khurram Abbas. "The Abraham Accords and Pakistan." *Middle East Policy Council* Vol 4, Issue no 4 (2021). <https://mepc.org/journal/abraham-accords-and-pakistan>.
- Altaf, Zohaib. "India's Privately Launched Rocket: A Threat to Pakistan's National Security?" *Global Village Space*. November 21, 2022, <https://www.globalvillagespace.com/indias-privately-launched-rocket-a-threat-to-pakistans-national-security/>. (accessed March 22, 2022).
- Abdollah, Omer. "Exclusive - the Netanyahu Doctrine: An In-Depth Regional Policy Interview." *Al Arabiya News Channel*, December 15, 2022, <https://english.alarabiya.net/News/middle-east/2022/12/15/Exclusive-The-Netanyahu-Doctrine-an-in-depth-regional-policy-interview>. (accessed June 22, 2022).
- Adler, and Barnett M. "Security Communities." *Cambridge University Press*. 1998. <https://doi.org/10.1017/CBO9780511598661>. (accessed December 11, 2022).
- Ashok, Sharma. "India-Israel Relations: The Evolving Partnership." *Taylor & Francis* Vol 21, Issue no 4 (2015). <https://doi.org/10.1080/13537121.2015.1076189>
- Adams K.R. "Attack and Conquer? International Anarchy and the Offense-Defense-Deterrence Model." *International Security* Vol 28, Issue no.3 (2003). <https://www.jstor.org/stable/4137477>.

- Ayoob, Muhammad. "The Third World in the System of States: Acute Schizophrenia or Growing Pains?" *International Studies Quarterly* Vol 33, no 1 (1989).  
<https://www.jstor.org/stable/i324418>. (accessed January 11, 2023).
- Ashley, Richard K., "The Poverty of Neorealism." *International Organization* 38, no. 2 (1984). <https://doi.org/10.1017/s0020818300026709>.
- AP News. "Pakistan Denies Israel Trade after Businessman's," April 3, 2023. <https://apnews.com/article/pakistan-israel-trade-7b3f932f8b45e497aafae72e27543d6a>. (accessed April 3, 2023).
- Rosenbaum Amir. "India's Anthhill ventures opens Tel Aviv accelerator." *Ctech by Calcaist*, March 3, 2019. <https://www.calcalistech.com/ctech/articles/0,7340,L-3758701,00.html>.
- Bose, Sumantra. "Why India's Hindu Nationalists Worship Israel's Nation-State Model." *The Conversation*, February 14, 2019.  
<https://theconversation.com/why-indias-hindu-nationalists-worship-israels-nation-state-model-111450>.
- Bagchi, Indrani, Josy Joseph. "India Eyes Israel's Iron Dome to Counter Pak, Puppets." *The Times of India*, March 13, 2012,  
<https://timesofindia.indiatimes.com/india/india-eyes-israels-iron-dome-to-counter-pak-puppets/articleshow/17329499.cms>
- .Brooks, Stephen. "Duelling Realisms." *Cambridge Core* Volume 51, Issue no. 3 (1997). <https://doi.org/10.1162/002081897550429>.
- Bagchi, Indrani. "On the Close Relationship between American-Jewish and American-Indian groups." *India Today*. April 10, 2004.  
<https://www.Indiatoday.com/on-close-relationship-between-american-jewish-and-american-indian-groups-1100802110>. (accessed December 21, 2022).
- Brooks, and Wohlforth. "Hard Times for Soft Balancing." *International Security* 30, no. 1 (2005). <https://www.jstor.org/stable/4137459>. (accessed January 6, 2023).

- BBC News. "Kashmir: Why India and Pakistan Fight over It." *BBC News*, August 8, 2019. <https://www.bbc.com/news/10537286>. (accessed January 9, 2023).
- Bentsur Eytan. "The way to peace emerged at Madrid: A decade since the 1991 Madrid conference" *15 February 2002*. <https://www.icpa.org/jl/vp472.htm> (January 12, 2022)
- Cucciniello, Armad. "India and Israel Move Closer Together." *Academia Education*. October 1, 2003. <https://www.academia.edu/24163606>. (accessed January 7, 2023).
- David A, Baldwin. "Neorealism and Neoliberalism: The Contemporary Debate." *New York: Columbia University Press*. December 1993. <https://cup.columbia.edu/book/neorealism-and-neoliberalism/9780231084413>. (accessed October 24 2022).
- Datta, Suresh. "Israel Helped India in 1971 War." *Hindustan Times*, April Friday, 2018, <https://www.hindustantimes.com/india/israel-helped-india-in-1971-war-reveals-book/story/> (accessed December 14, 2022).
- Dipanjan, Roy Chaudhury. "Space and Satellites Could Be Next Frontier of India-Israel Partnership." *The Economic Times*, June 24, 2022. <https://economictimes.indiatimes.com/news/india/space-and-satellites-could-be-next-frontier-of-india-israel-partnership/articleshow/92441935.cms>.
- Eran, Oded. "India and Israel: A Strategic Alliance?" *Institute for National Security Studies*, Vol. 1, Issue no. 4 (2017). <https://www.inss.org.il/publication/india-israel-strategic-alliance/> (accessed February , 2023).
- Faheem, M. "Pakistan-Israel Relations after the Arab World's Geopolitical Gravitation Towards Israel." *Aydın Dergisi Vol 13*, Issue no. 3 (2021). <https://dergipark.org.tr/en/1612685>
- Falk, Joshua. "India's Israel Policy: The Merits of a Pragmatic Approach." *Semantic Scholar*. 2019. <https://www.semanticscholar.org/paper/India-%27-s-Israel-Policy-%3A-The-Merits-of-a-Pragmati>

[Falk/f208d794ca228fe423f09efe37243c63bae9c861](https://doi.org/10.1080/13537121.2020.1832314). (accessed February 2, 2023).

Ghulam, Mustafa. "Indo-Israel Relations: Implications for Pakistan." *Pakistan Social Sciences Review* Vol 3, Issue 1 (2016). (<https://pssr.org.pk/issues/v3/1/indo-israel-relations-implications-for-pakistan>).

Inbar, Efraim. "Indo-Israeli Defense Cooperation in the Twenty-First Century." *Mideast Security and Policy Studies* No. 93. February 2015. <https://besacenter.org/wp-content/uploads/2012/01/MSPS93>.

Jalalzai, Mousa Khan. "India-Israel Conspiracy against Pakistan." *Institute of International Current Affairs*. 2016. [https://books.google.com.pk/books/about/India\\_Israel\\_Conspiracy\\_Against\\_Pakistan.htm](https://books.google.com.pk/books/about/India_Israel_Conspiracy_Against_Pakistan.htm). (accessed January 11, 2023).

John, Robert. "A Grand Strategy for America." Cornell University Press. November 4, 2021. <https://www.cornellpress.cornell.edu/book/9780801468438/a-grand-strategy-for-america>. (accessed January 30, 2023).

Kaura, Vinay. "Pakistan's Israel Dilemma." *Middle East Institute*, October 6, 2020. <https://www.mei.edu/publications/pakistans-israel-dilemma>. (accessed December 12, 2022).

Kumaraswamy, David. "The Friendship with Israel: India Squares the Circle" *Middle East Institute*. June 25, 2009. <https://mei.nus.edu.sg/publication/insight-004-the-friendship-with-israel-india-squares-the-circle/> (accessed January 1, 2023).

Khalid, Muhammad. "The Netanyahu Doctrine: An In-Depth Regional Policy Interview." *Al-Arabiya News*, January 31, 2022. <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=fpfnhvx1AcI>. (accessed December 22, 2022).

Kaura, Vinay. "Prospects of Israel-Pakistan Rapprochement." *Taylor & Francis*. October 2020. <https://www.tandfonline.com/doi/full/10.1080/13537121.2020.1832314>. (accessed January 11, 2023).



- Khan, Z. A. "Development in Indo-Israel Defence Relations Since 9/11: Pakistan's Security Concern and Policy Options." *South Asian Studies* Vol 26, no 1 (2011). <http://journals.pu.edu.pk/journals/index.php/IJSAS/article/view/2816>
- Kumaraswamy, Paul. "Beyond the Veil: Israel-Pakistan Relations." *Jaffee Centre for Strategic Studies*, June 12, 2000. <https://www.files.ethz.ch/isn/94527/2000-03>. (accessed January 10, 2023).
- Khattack, Masood. "Strategic Significance of Indo-Israel Defence collaboration: Implications for Pakistan's Security." *IPRI XVI* No.2 (2016). <http://www.ipripak.org/wp-content/uploads/2016/11/4-Masood-ur-Rehman>. (accessed January 27, 2023).
- Kramer, David. "Space, Nuclear Trade Eyed at US-India Summit." *Physics Today* 67, no. 11 (November 2014). <https://doi.org/10.1063/pt.3.2581>
- .Lieberman, Peter. "Does Conquest Pay? The Exploitation of Occupied Industrial Societies," *Princeton University Press*, 1996. <https://www.jstor.org/stable/j.ctt7t7jh> (accessed February 4, 2023).
- Lobell, Steven E. "Structural Realism/Offensive and Defensive Realism." *Oxford Research Encyclopedia of International Studies*. March 2010. <https://doi.org/10.1093/acrefore/9780190846626.013.304>.
- Lilwani, Saloni. "Evolution of India's Foreign Policy Towards Israel." *The Kootneeti*, August 11, 2022, <https://thekootneeti.in/2022/08/11/evolution-of-indias-foreign-policy-towards-israel/>.
- Mathur, Somesh K. "Indian Information Technology Industry: Past, Present and Future & a Tool for National Development." *Washington Education*, August 22, 2020. <https://faculty.washington.edu/karyiu/confer/GJ06/papers/mathur>. (accessed December 22, 2022).
- Malik, Mahvish. "Implications of Indo-Israel Defence Nexus in South Asia." *Daily Times*, October 9, 2018. <https://dailytimes.com.pk/308405/implications-of-indo-israel-defence-nexus-in-south-asia/>.

- Mohan, Rajan. "India's Strengthening Relations with West Asia," *Middle East Institute*. January 1, 2021, <https://www.mei.edu/publications/indias-relations-west-asia-what-patterns-and-what-future>. (accessed December 14, 2022).
- Mufti, Mariam. "Stephen Cohen, The Idea of Pakistan." *South Asia Multidisciplinary Academic Journal Online*. April 8, 2009. <https://doi.org/10.4000/214> (accessed December 11, 2023).
- Pant, Harsh. "India-Israel Partnership: Convergence and Constraints" *Middle East Review of International Affairs* Vol 8 (2004). [https://middle-east-review-of-international-affairs-publications/indiaisraeli-partnership-convergence-and-constraints\(9302e443-58f2-45d5-bec7-803b6165b127\)/export.html](https://middle-east-review-of-international-affairs-publications/indiaisraeli-partnership-convergence-and-constraints(9302e443-58f2-45d5-bec7-803b6165b127)/export.html).
- Patil, Sameer. "The Deepening of India–Israel Defence Ties." *Observational Research Foundation*. June 7, 2022. <https://www.orfonline.org/expert-speak/the-deepening-of-india-israel-defence-ties>. (accessed December 18, 2022).
- Raz Gadi, "Pakistan Israel relations: A chance for normalization?", *The institute for national security studies*, March 2023, [https://www.inss.org.il/strategic\\_assessment/pakistan-israel/](https://www.inss.org.il/strategic_assessment/pakistan-israel/)
- Roche, Elizabeth. "How India, Israel Diplomatic Ties Came to Fruition." *Mint.com*. January 15, 2018. <https://www.livemint.com/Politics/0pe5Cc2BoZ24xWX3t90iaP/How-India-Israel-diplomatic-ties-came-to-fruition.html>. (accessed January 20, 2023).
- Rubinoff, Arthur G. "Normalization of India-Israel Relations: Stillborn for Forty Years." *Asian Survey* 35, no. 5 (May 1995). <https://doi.org/10.2307/2645750>.
- Rajeev, Sandeep "Israel's Leading Hotel Chain, Dan Hotels to Venture into India." *The Economic Times*, May 1 2016, <https://m.economictimes.com/industry/services/hotels/-/restaurants/israels-leading-hotel-chain-dan-hotels-to-venture-into-india/articleshow/52320223.cms>.

- Saeedi, Tariq, "Mossad And India's Spy Agency Team Up, Target Pakistan," *Arab News*, June 2, 2002, <https://www.arabnews.com/node/221349> (accessed January 16, 2023).
- Stephan, Franz. "India-Israel Defense Cooperation." *The Diplomat*, January 30, 2019. <https://thediplomat.com/tag/india-israel-defense-cooperation/>.
- Sultaana, Saddaf. "India-Israel Defence Cooperation: Security Implications for Pakistan." *Journal of Security & Strategic Analyses* VII, Issue no 1 (2021). <https://doi.org/10.57169/jssa.007.01.0131>.
- Shoshnna Soloman, "India's Lohia Group buys Israeli maker of aerospace components", February 12, 2019. <https://www.timesofisrael.com/indias-lohia-group-buys-israeli-maker-of-aerospace-components/>
- Singh, Manjari. "India and Israel Mean Business, in Many New Sectors." *The Economic Times*, February 13, 2022 <https://economictimes.indiatimes.com/news/economy/foreign-trade/view-india-and-israel-mean-business-in-many-new-sectors/articleshow/89540411.cms?from=mdr>.
- Shakeel, Faiza. "Economic History of Pakistan from 1972 to 2015". *Academia Education*. April 26, 2019. [https://www.academia.edu/30351174/Economic-History\\_of\\_Pakistan\\_From\\_1972\\_to\\_2015](https://www.academia.edu/30351174/Economic-History_of_Pakistan_From_1972_to_2015). (accessed January 12, 2023).
- Shahab, Zahid, Ahmed, and Khurram Abbas, "The Abraham Accords and Pakistan." *Middle East Policy* 28, no. 2 (2021). <https://mepc.org/journal/abraham-accords-and-pakistan>
- Gori Shourya, "Israel's Silicon Wadi: A promising semiconductor partner for India" *Observer research foundation*, July 20, 2023, <https://www.orfonline.org/expert-speak/israels-silicon-wadi/>
- Tellis, Ashley. "The U.S.-India Global Partnership: How Significant for American Interests?" *Carnegie Endowment for International Peace*. November 17, 2005.

<https://carnegieendowment.org/2005/11/17/u.s.-india-global-partnership-how-significant-for-american-interests-pub-17693> (accessed January 12, 2023).

Tharoor, Ishaan. "The Pakistani Origins of the Israeli State." *Washington Post*. December 3 2014

<https://www.washingtonpost.com/news/worldviews/wp/2014/12/03/the-pakistani-origins-of-the-israeli-state/>. (accessed January 8, 2023).

Thakkar, Chirayu. "India and Israel Mean Business, in Many New Sectors." *The Economic Times*, February 13, 2022.

<https://economictimes.indiatimes.com/news/economy/foreign-trade/view-india-and-israel-mean-business-in-many-new-sectors/articleshow/89540411.cms?from=mdr>.

Taylor, Annie. "Senior Advisor to Pakistan PM Imran Khan, Secretly Visited Israel, Met with Mossad Chief." *The Times of India*, June 28, 2021.

<https://timesofindia.indiatimes.com/world/pakistan/senior-advisor-to-pakistan-pm-imran-khan-secretly-visited-israel-met-with-mossad-chief/articleshow/83916592.cms>

Yegar, Moshe. "Pakistan and Isreal." *Jewish Political Studies Review on JSTOR*

Vol. 19, Issue no. 3/4 (2007). <https://www.jstor.org/stable/25834754>. (accessed January 7, 2023).