

IMPLICATIONS OF IMPLEMENTING SDG4 (QUALITY EDUCATION) AT LOWER DIR (AN EVALUATION OF EDUCATIONAL GOALS AT DISTRICT DIR LOWER)

MPhil Thesis

**Submitted By
Belawal Shinwari**



**National Institute of Pakistan Studies
Quaid-i-Azam University, Islamabad
2021-2023**

CERTIFICATE

This dissertation submitted by **Mr. Belawal Shinwari** entitled: **IMPLICATIONS OF IMPLEMENTING SDG4 (QUALITY EDUCATION) AT LOWER DIR (AN EVALUATION OF EDUCATION GOALS AT DISTRICT DIR LOWER)** is accepted in this present form by National Institute of Pakistan Studies, Quaid I Azam University Islam Abad for the degree of Master of Philosophy in Pakistan Studies.

Supervisor_____

Dr. Mariam Asif

DECLARATION

I hereby declare that this thesis is the result of my individual research and that it has not been submitted concurrently to any other university for the purpose of any other degree.

Belawal Shinwari

ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

I offer endless thanks to Allah for giving me the strength and guidance to complete my MPhil Thesis.

I am also deeply grateful to my supervisor, Dr. Mariam Asif, for her unwavering support and guidance throughout the process of writing this thesis. I am very thankful for her invaluable advice and encouragement, which has allowed me to reach a successful conclusion.

I would like to thank my family, my friend Qudrat Ullah for their constant support and encouragement. Without them, this work would never have been possible.

Finally, I am sincerely grateful to the NIPS, which has provided me with the resources and support I needed to complete this work. Their dedication and commitment to the advancement of knowledge is truly commendable.

Belawal Shinwari

Dedicated to My Parents

Salah Ud din & Uzma Begum

LIST OF ACRONYMS AND ABBREVIATIONS

SDGS: Sustainable development goals

SDG4: Sustainable Development Goal 4 Quality Education

MDGS: Millenium Development Goals

UNESCO: United Nation Educational, Scientific, and Cultural organization-Services

UNDP: United Nation Development Program

UN: United Nation

MTDF: Mid Term Development Framework

FATA: Federally Administered Tribal Areas

KPK: Khyber Pukhtoon Khwa

GDP: Gross Domestic Product

HDI: Human Development Index

MPI: Multidimensional poverty Index

AIDS: Acquired Immunodeficiency Syndrome

GCE: General Certificate of Education

TVET: Technical, Vocational, Educational Training

ULEMA: Religious Scholar

USAID: United States Agency for International Development

HEC: Higher Education Commission

MOFEPT: Ministry of Federal Education and Professional Training

NEC: National Economic Council

EFA: Education For All

PTC: Teacher Parents Council

IT: Information Technology

P&DDs: Planning and Development Departments

VNR: Voluntarily National Review

PSDP: Public Sector Development Program

SI: Special Initiative

MNA: Member of National Assembly

MPA: Member of Provincial Member

NGO: Non Governmental Organisation

KK: Khwendo Kor

Table of Contents

Abstract.....	1
Chapter 01	3
1. Introduction.....	3
1.1.1. Pakistan and Sustainable Development Goals (SDGS).....	5
1.1.2. Pakistan and Sustainable Development Goal 4 (Sdg4) Quality Education.....	7
1.1.3. Challenges in Implementation of Educational Policies in Pakistan.....	9
1.2. Statement of the Problem.....	13
1.2.1 Central Argument.....	13
1.3. Research Questions	14
1.4. Literature Review.....	14
1.5. Significance of the Study	18
1.6. Objectives of the Study	18
1.7. Methodology	18
1.8. Organization of the Study	18
Chapter 02.....	20
2.1. Implications of implementing goals of education in KPK	20
2.1.1. Sustainable development goal 4 (Quality Education) in kpk.....	20
2.2. Targets of SDG4 “Quality Education”	21
2.2.1. SDG4 in a nutshell	21

2.2.2. SDG4 10 targets	22
2.2.4. Outcome Targets	22
2.2.5. Means of implementation;	24
2.3. Implications of implementation	25
2.3.1. SDG4 implementation challenges in kpk;	29
2.4. Priority Targets	31
Chapter 03: Implementing SDG4 (quality education) at grass root level in Pakistan	32
3.1. SDG4 (Sustainable development goal 4 quality education) Implementation at district level in Pakistan	32
3.1.1. Pakistan’s national, provincial and grass root level policy framework for the sustainable development goal 4 implementation:	34
3.2. Pakistan’s National SDG 4 support unit;	37
3.2.1. SDGs unit at provincial level	39
3.2.2. SDGs unit at district level	41
3.3. Importance of District-level Implementation:	42
3.3.1. Key Strategies for Implementation:	43
3.3.2. Role of Technology in Implementation:	44
3.3.3. Measuring Progress and Accountability	44
Chapter 04: Implications of Implementing SDG4 (Sustainable Development Goal 4 (Quality Education) At District Dir Lower after 2016.....	46

4.1. Education in district lower dir.....	46
4.1.1. History of Dir lower in respect to education after independence (Nawabi System)	47
4.1.2. Education of Dir lower before and after alienation with Pakistan in 1969.	48
4.1.3. Education in lower dir after 2000.....	49
4.1.4. Literacy, (Male, female).....	49
4.1.5. Number of government schools	50
4.1.6. Number of students	50
4.1.7. Number of teachers	51
4.1.8. Number of drop out students at dir lower.	51
4.2. Quality of education at lower dir	51
4.3. SGD4 (Quality education) implementation at lower dir	52
4.4 International development programs and quality education at lower dir	53
4.5. Dir lower before the implementation of Sdg4 in September 2015	55
4.6 Implementing sustainable development goal 4 Quality education at lower dir:	56
4.7 Advantages of Implementing SDG4 in District Dir Lower after 2016:.....	59
4.7.1. Improved Access to Education	59
4.7.2. Gender Equality in Education:	60
4.7.3. Enhanced Curriculum and Teaching Quality	60
4.7.4. Community Engagement and Ownership:	60

3.7.5. Skills Development for Employability:	61
4.7.6. Promotion of Lifelong Learning	61
4.7.7. Cultivation of Critical Thinking:.....	61
4.8. Challenges in Dir Lower:.....	62
4.8.1 Local Leadership and Collaboration:	63
4.9. Hurdles? Challenges to implement SDG4 at district Dir lower.	64
Chapter 05	68
5.1. Conclusion:	68
5.2. Recommendations for achieving Sustainable Development Goal 4 (SDG 4) of ensuring quality education in Dir Lower:	70
Bibliography	i
Books	i
Journals	i
Reports	iv

Abstract

This thesis explores the implications of implementing Sustainable Development Goal 4 (SDG 4) focused on quality education within the context of Lower Dir. As a fundamental global initiative, SDG 4 aims to ensure inclusive and equitable education for all, enhancing learning outcomes and promoting lifelong learning opportunities. This study delves into the specific challenges, opportunities, and strategies associated with realizing SDG 4 objectives in Lower Dir, a region characterized by its unique socioeconomic, cultural, and geographical attributes. Findings indicate that while there has been notable progress in educational access, significant disparities in quality and inclusivity persist. Infrastructure limitations, gender-based disparities, teacher capacity, and curriculum relevance emerge as key challenges hindering the effective implementation of SDG 4. However, the region's strong sense of community and cultural heritage also present opportunities for contextually tailored interventions that could drive positive change.

To address these challenges and leverage opportunities, this thesis proposes a set of context-sensitive recommendations. These include targeted teacher training programs, curriculum adaptations to reflect local needs, community engagement initiatives, and leveraging technology for equitable access to quality education resources. By acknowledging the nuances of Lower Dir's context, stakeholders can collaboratively design and implement interventions that align with SDG 4's principles and contribute to sustainable educational development.

In conclusion, this thesis sheds light on the implications of implementing SDG 4's quality education objectives in Lower Dir. By understanding the region-specific challenges and

opportunities, and by formulating tailored strategies, policymakers, educators, and community leaders can work together to foster a more inclusive, equitable, and effective educational ecosystem in alignment with the global pursuit of quality education for all.

Chapter 01

1. Introduction

The Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) are a set of seventeen goals for the world and its inhabitants' future. These goals endeavor to ensure that all people, regardless of where they reside, can exist in harmony and prosperity over the long term. We envision a world in which there is no poverty, no hunger, everyone has access to an excellent education, women and men are treated equally, everyone has access to energy that is both affordable and environmentally friendly, everyone has access to employment that is both stable and growing, there is robust industry and technological advancement, and everyone benefits from a world in which there is robust industry and technological advancement. The Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) emphasize the environmental, social, and economic sustainability of communities around the world. Sustainable development is central to these objectives.¹

The United Nations General Assembly authorized the Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) in 2015 as part of the post-2015 development agenda. This initiative aimed to establish a new global framework to replace the now-defunct Millennium Development Goals (MDGs). In a resolution designated the 2030 Agenda, which is also commonly and colloquially known as the agenda 2030, the General Assembly of the United Nations formally acknowledged and accepted them. The United Nations General Assembly passed a resolution on July 6, 2017 that made the Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) more applicable to actual situations. The resolution specifies objectives for each objective and measures to track progress toward their achievement. The majority of the

¹ Barrett, a. m. (2009). tag: education and sustainable development.

goals have a timetable of 2030, while others do not specify a particular year. Now that the race to achieve sustainable development goals has begun, it is time to determine how to evaluate success in relation to the overarching goals of the development agenda. When it adopted the 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development, the United Nations General Assembly established seventeen goals for the planet's sustainable development. The 17 goals for international development that were established in January 2016 will serve as a guide for international development efforts over the next 15 years. The educational system's efficacy ranked as the fourth most essential item on the agenda. This objective aims to motivate individuals to maintain their level of knowledge throughout their entire lifetimes by fostering an environment conducive to learning. Many of the other Sustainable Development Goals cannot be accomplished without education. If more people have access to a high-quality education, then more people will have the opportunity to escape destitution. Education equips individuals with the tools necessary to build more egalitarian and sustainable lives. Those with a high level of education are more tolerant, and society as a whole is at ease.²

Education is highly valued by the United Nations Educational, Scientific, and Cultural Organization (UNESCO) because it contributes to the establishment of tranquil communities and the attainment of sustainable development, both of which are fundamental human rights. The Education Organization of the United Nations is a specialized organization that promotes gender equality in the classroom and throughout the world by providing leadership on the regional and global levels in response to

² Mustafa, g. (2012). education policy analysis report of khyber pakhtunkhwa. *united Nations educational, scientific and cultural organisation.*

significant global issues. This organization was created in response to the United Nations' need to address gender inequality.³

1.1.1. Pakistan and Sustainable Development Goals (SDGS)

It is noteworthy that Pakistan was one of the first countries to sign the 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development in 2015, as this demonstrates an extraordinary level of dedication. The Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) were presented to Parliament on February 16, 2016, and were unanimously adopted as the national development agenda by the body at that time. In addition, it established a Secretariat for the Sustainable Development Goals within the Parliament.⁴

The National Initiative on the 2030 Agenda ("Mainstreaming, Accelerating, and Policy Support for SDGs in Pakistan") aims to localize the Agenda and facilitate its implementation. This initiative provides support to both the federal and provincial governments of Pakistan. SDGs Support Units have been established in accordance with the program to expedite the institutionalization of the Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs). Enhancing alignment between nuanced flows and the 2030 Agenda Innovative strategies to accelerate progress on SDG priorities Each of the project's four outcomes—aligned plans, policies, and resource allocation; strengthened monitoring, reporting, and evaluation capacities; and increased alignment of nuanced flows with the 2030 Agenda—aligns with the Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs). Each of the project's four outcomes are interdependent and mutually reinforcing. This project's multi-stakeholder efforts at the federal, provincial, and district levels are contributing to the creation of

³ Antoni Verger, k. m. (2013). education and the sustainable development goals: towards a global common good. london: edward elgar publishing.

⁴ Pakistan's implementation of the 2030 agenda for sustainable development. (2019). *voluntary national review* , 81

vertical and horizontal policy coherence. Investigating topics such as "leaving no one behind," "integrated approaches to development," and "catching up with those who have fallen farthest behind" The federal and provincial administrations of Pakistan, in collaboration with the United Nations Development Program (UNDP), established SDGs Support Units as part of Pakistan's National Initiative on Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs). These Units, which can be found in the planning divisions of federal, provincial, and regional governments, serve as a centralized resource for government policy and technical support in relation to the Sustainable Development Goals. Gilgit-Baltistan and Azad Jammu & Kashmir have each employed an additional resource worker, bringing their total personnel to four. In response to the government's announcement that the Federally Administered Tribal Areas (FATA) will be merged with Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, two resource personnel have been assigned to the FATA planning department to assist with the transition and ensure that work on the Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) will not be slowed down. This was done to guarantee that progress on the SDGs would not be held down.⁵

According to the SDGs office in Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, the SDG Support Units in Pakistan use United Nations proposals regarding "Mainstreaming, Acceleration, and Policy Support for SDGs" to localize the global and ambitious SDG framework. In order to localize and implement the Sustainable Development Goals, the Ministry of Planning, Development, and Reform, along with the planning and development ministries of the provinces and regions, are developing a coordinated and collaborative method with their input. In addition to operational and project management professionals, the Units are

⁵ Antoni verger, k. m. (2013). education and the sustainable development goals: towards a global common good. london: edward elgar publishing.

manned with analysts who specialize in economic, social, and environmental issues. All of these organizations receive funding from the government, demonstrating national and local support for the Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs).⁶

1.1.2. Pakistan and Sustainable Development Goal 4 (Sdg4) Quality Education:

Education opportunities contribute significantly to the formation of human capital. It not only increases productivity and efficiency, but also creates a reservoir of competent individuals who can contribute to the long-term growth of the economy. Comparable to the educational systems of numerous other developing nations, Pakistan's educational system is in a deplorable state. Indicators of poor performance in this sector include low primary school enrollment rates, vast disparities between regions and sexes, a dearth of qualified instructors, a lack of appropriate instructional materials, and an absence of acceptable school facilities. These factors all contribute to inadequate educational facilities. The extremely low levels of public investment in Pakistan's education system are most likely the leading cause of the country's abysmal educational outcomes. Prior to that academic year, the ratio of education expenditures to GDP had never exceeded 2%. In the most recent years, the rate has increased to 2.2%. At this juncture, it is common knowledge that the caliber of primary and secondary education in Pakistan is declining.⁷ Everyone in the know is aware that the state of science today is extremely precarious and requires urgent attention. There is a significant problem with education in developing nations such as Pakistan because the educational system, particularly at the

⁶ Mustafa, g. (2012). education policy analysis report of khyber pakhtunkhwa. *united Nation educational, scientific and cultural organisation.*

⁷ Jamal, h. (2018). proposed national indicator framework for sdg 4: the case of pakistan.

elementary level, faces numerous obstacles. In Pakistan, approximately 17% of rural-dwelling children and 6% of urban-dwelling children do not attend school. In addition, many children who do attend school do not learn the fundamentals of their subjects. Pakistan's poor academic performance is due to a number of factors, including a lack of experienced instructors, a scarcity of learning resources, a small student population, a lack of necessary facilities, and an absence of school supervision. Inadequate learning resources, a limited student body, and a lack of necessary facilities are additional contributing factors. In terms of the percentage of the population that can read and write, Pakistan ranks 152nd out of 189 countries. Pakistan has one of the lowest rates of literacy among countries with a comparable level of economic and social development. Despite Pakistan's comparatively low ranking in terms of human development, the country's GDP is comparable to that of other developing nations. Schools that fall short of expectations are one of the leading contributors. Compared to other south Asian countries such as India (3.8%), Iran (2.93%), and Afghanistan (5.5%), Pakistan's expenditure on education is comparatively modest at 2.3% of its GDP. This exemplifies a significant challenge Pakistan confronts in the field of education and demonstrates the need to improve the country's educational standing.⁸

Education is one of the Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) because its significance to the prosperity and growth of a country cannot be exaggerated. In order for a nation to achieve economic and social stability, education is essential. In light of this, one of the explicit Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) is to increase people's access to high-quality education. One of the 17 development goals is to "ensure inclusive and equitable

⁸Farah latif naz. (2021). implementing sdg4 in pakistan, a qualitaive and quantitative analysis of opinions of tenured faculty members of the univrstites. *humanities and social sciences review*, 08.

quality education and promote opportunities for lifelong learning for all." This objective is defined as "ensure inclusive and equitable quality education and promote opportunities for lifelong learning for all." The achievement of this goal, "inclusive and high-quality education for all," is essential to nurturing sustainable economic growth. One of the objectives that should have been accomplished by 2030 is providing free primary and secondary education to all girls and boys worldwide. Given the importance of education to the achievement of the Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs), it should come as no surprise that the education sector is the government of Pakistan's top priority when it comes to putting these goals into action; however, the results achieved thus far have not been very satisfactory.⁹

1.1.3. Challenges in Implementation of Educational Policies in Pakistan

Pakistan's educational system has labored against a variety of obstacles. There is a paucity of certified instructors, particularly women, which is one of the most fundamental issues. The government has not proposed any new programs to address the rising demand for qualified instructors. The consequences of underinvestment in public education are extremely perilous for public school students and for the institutions themselves. Private institutions frequently employ teachers with the highest levels of education and experience. The Ministry of Education must have a greater understanding of the importance of investing in educators and the necessity of implementing reforms, despite the fact that they may be time-consuming, in order to maintain parity with global benchmarks. Due to the lack of a unified, standardized curriculum for any type of institution, the educational experiences of students in public and private institutions vary

⁹ Diemer, a. k. (2020). sdg 4 “quality education”, the cornerstone of the sdfs: case studies of Pakistan and senegal. *journal of economics and development studies*, 9-32.

greatly. Children attending public schools should not be encouraged to compete academically with students attending private institutions. The public education system requires urgent institutional reforms.¹⁰ Pakistan's successive administrations have been unable to improve the quality of the country's educational system through the implementation of new policies and five-year plans due to the country's ongoing political unrest and severe economic difficulties. Free public education and equal distribution of public resources are two examples of concepts that have never been implemented by the general public. These policies have not been implemented. Today, when science and technology are at the vanguard of progress, it is essential that the next generation be educated for a nation to experience development. In recent years, the Pakistani government has enacted a number of educational initiatives that emphasize the significance of formal education and encourage more individuals to pursue one. Raising the average level of education in Pakistan will have a positive effect on economic growth, employment creation, and overall productivity. To be successful in today's society, acquiring a sound education is essential.¹¹ Due to Pakistan's recognition of the importance of education to the intellectual development of its citizens and their increased awareness of the outside world, the government has enacted a number of policies aimed at enhancing educational promotion and quality. These have discovered a substantial quantity of state and national usage. As a consequence of these initiatives, Pakistan's unemployment rate and literacy rate have both decreased. Numerous political documents and studies demonstrate that five-year plans and other policies are formulated through the

¹⁰ Dr naeem akhtar, (2022). challenges in implementing educatiocal policies in pakistan. *jornal of positive school psychology*, 11.

¹¹ Tatto, m. t. (2021). comparative research on teachers and teacher education: global perspectives to Inform UNESCO's sdg 4 agenda. *oxford review of education*, 47(1), 25-44.

implementation of numerous reforms and initiatives. Education policy and administration are the responsibility of both the federal government and individual provinces in Pakistan. The federal government of the United States provides assistance in numerous areas, including the planning and financing of educational programs. There is still more work to be done in this area, despite the fact that Pakistan's education system has been progressively improving for decades, contributing to the nation's prosperity. The federal government has launched a nationwide literacy campaign in an effort to eradicate the widespread problem of illiteracy and ensure that all children receive the education to which they are entitled. By 2030, the state intends to have accomplished its goal of establishing primary and secondary school literacy for all citizens. The nation's educational goals are not being met due to the small number of students enrolling in classes and the low rate of student retention. It is estimated that 62% of adults in Pakistan can read and write, meaning that 38% of the population is illiterate. It is generally acknowledged that Pakistan's ineffective educational policy is largely responsible for the country's high rate of illiteracy. Before delving into the fundamental causes of failed policy implementation, it is essential to establish the topic of research on policy implementation. A policy is a plan of action that aids the government in addressing the concerns of the general populace. It can be used as a guide in the process of planning and carrying out future endeavors. According to Anderson (2014), public policy is a well-considered strategy to manage a problem in collaboration with a specific worker or group of workers. This definition comes from Anderson (2014). The degree of a policy's achievement is directly proportional to the caliber of its execution. The implementation of a policy consists of three components: (1) the outcomes of the policy, (2) the

effectiveness of the policy, and (3) the evaluation of the policy. Both Durlak and DuPre argue that the efficacy of a policy is dependent not only on the policy's design but also on its implementation.¹² In education policy, the formulation of new policies and their subsequent implementation are ostensibly of equal importance, but this is rarely the case in practice. This lack of clarity contributes to dissatisfaction with the achievement of intended goals, which in turn contributes to the failure of educational policy, especially in developing nations such as Pakistan, which has failed to reach its literacy goals. In addition, this lack of clarity contributes to the failure of educational policy in developing nations such as Bangladesh, which has not met its literacy goals. Due to the fact that poor policy implementation is the primary cause of policy failure, policymakers, analysts, academicians, and anyone else who studies implementation data face unique challenges. Although many others have attempted it, very few have succeeded in dissecting the underlying causes of Pakistan's poor implementation in depth. A number of national education conferences and committees, in addition to a number of education policies, have proposed solutions for the system's deficiencies and problems. However, almost all educational programs that have failed to produce the anticipated outcomes over the past decade continue to fail, and the future of education is uncertain. Changes must be made to the current system if we are to see a decline in the number of individuals who cannot read or write.¹³ The purpose of this study is to investigate the inadequacies in the implementation of educational policies in order to determine the reasons for the ineffective results produced by these policies. Consequently, those in positions of

¹² Tatto, m. t. (2021). comparative research on teachers and teacher education: global perspectives to Inform UNESCO's sdg 4 agenda. *oxford review of education*, 47(1), 25-44.

¹³ Dr naeem akhtar, (2022). challenges in implementing educatiocal policies in pakistan. *jornal of positive school psychology*, 11.

authority, such as legislators and educators, would be prudent to devise policies and propositions that appeal to both the brain and emotions.

1.2. Statement of the Problem

The implementation of SDG4 (Quality education) in Lower Dir raises several implications and challenges that need to be addressed. One of the key problems is the evaluation of the educational goals at Lower Dir, which requires an in-depth analysis of the existing educational infrastructure, teaching methodologies, learning outcomes, and overall quality of education in the district. Additionally, understanding the barriers and gaps in achieving these goals, such as limited access to education, gender disparities, and resource constraints, is crucial to formulate effective strategies for improvement

It's been almost 7 years now Pakistan has affirmed its commitment to the 2030 agenda for sustainable development by adopting sustainable development goals as its own national development agenda, there are SDGs support units at provincial level working for SDGs, Moreover, Many NGOs and projects are working too for SDGs but despite all these efforts literacy rate declined to 3% last year, which was 57% in 2019 but declined to 55% last year. Reality seems far from satisfaction. This research will focus on the results of implementing SDG4 quality education at district dir lower.

1.2.1 Central Argument

The central argument of this thesis is that the successful implementation of SDG4 in Lower Dir requires a comprehensive evaluation of the district's educational goals. By critically assessing the current status of education, identifying the challenges, and exploring potential solutions, this research aims to provide actionable recommendations

for enhancing the quality of education and in implementation of sdg4 in Lower Dir. Ultimately, it seeks to contribute to the fulfillment of SDG4 and the promotion of inclusive and equitable education in the region.

1.3. Research Questions

What are possible implications of implementing goals of education in kpk?

How much the government of kpk is successful in implementing the goals of education at district dir lower?

What are the results of implementing SDG4 (Quality education) at district dir lower?

1.4. Literature Review

The author Khalida ghuas and her co-authors focuses in this research paper mainly on the implications of implementing SDGs at national level of Pakistan. The study has identified the structural impediments confronted due to political and bureaucratic hierarchies to be the main reasons for the lower level of attainment of the Millennium Development Goals (MDGs). The research suggests that the primary approach for the provincial governments towards SDG implementation should be integrating the SDGs into the provincial Medium Term Development Framework (MTDF)

Authors Izza aftab, Maha kamal and Anum irfan in their combined research paper suggests development goals indicators and highlighted successful implementation of SDGs in the light of data poverty in Pakistan. Though in their main findings the authors not only hope to illustrate the unique challenges of measuring SDGs for developing countries in the light of data poverty, but to demonstrate a way forward for strengthening the collection of data for evidence, for the successful implementation of the SDGs

The author Abbas khan in his research worked on sustainable development goal quality education at Khyber Pukhtunkhwa and concluded his research that lack of basic facilities and discrimination in educational institutions is the main factor which is influencing the implementation and hurdles of quality education in Khyber Pukhtunkhwa

The authors Noor jehan, Ayesha sadiqa and Farah khan in their co research paper highlighted women's struggle for succeeding higher education. Study confirms that strict traditionalism, gender disparity, expensive education, early marriages, low budget of the government, reproductive role, poor monitoring system , unavailability of proper transportation, poverty, and inferior status of female in society have a strong influence on getting higher education. This study recommends that the policy makers should revisit the budget constriction, infrastructure and schools facilities. Transport facility should be provided for female to get higher education easily.

Muhammad sajjad, hasiba munir, shamsa kawal and syed Ali abbas naqvi in their co research paper spatial inequalities in education status and its detriments in Pakistan highlighted district level modeling in the context of sustainable development goal. The results have important implications to decision-making for immediate or gradual actions in the context of spatially equitable provisioning of quality education through an informed prioritization (i.e., low performing districts). Based on the findings, while rigorous measures are needed for low performing regions and the identified determinants to improve education status, this study sheds light on the mechanisms to achieve SDG4, consequently promoting human well-being through educating communities

The author tabassum and their co researchers Rabia, zahid, juniad, saleem and Khadija aims to analyze the existing resource allocation to education sector and identify what

improvements in the allocation and utilization of resources can be made to enable Pakistan to attain the proposed targets of Sustainable Development Goals in education and to implement the Right to Education Act. Utilizing the data of different education financing indicators, the arguments regarding resource allocation in education sector by federal and provincial governments has been built in this study.

Safdar Abbas , Muhammad Ashraf nadeem and prof Muhammad iqbal majoka has stated in their co Article that SDG implementation in Pakistan holds great significance because Pakistan does not rank high in the Human Development Index (HDI) and Multidimensional Poverty Index (MPI). Implementation of SDGs could uplift Pakistan socially and economically. The education sector in Pakistan needs extensive reforms. In this context, the implementation of SDG-4 is of great importance for Pakistan

Ghulam Mustafa (UNESCO) in his report analysis of Khyber Pukhtunkhwa clearly illustrated the major outcomes of the analysis that In spite of the all-time efforts of the Governments the 'Access' to education is a problem. This problem is felt in all sub-sectors of education that may be school education, higher education, technical education, special education and adult education. Quality is also questioned particularly in public institutions. One of the main causes of low quality is 'compromised' Governance. To improve all these areas more funds are needed. It seems that political will at all levels is not up to the mark to improve education

Muhammad Saud and Asia Ashfaq stated in their Article the role of NGOs in promoting education for sustainable development in rural areas. The findings of the study conclude that NGOs are playing a vital role in providing educational facilities to the residents of rural communities where both communities and students are participating in multiple

learning-based educational activities. The study also revealed that the parents of school-going children show a higher level of satisfaction from these formal educational institutes and agree that it is also supporting the local community to learn school management system by arranging close coordination between parents and teachers (PTA – parents-teacher association)

Abdul waheed Mughal in his thesis argues that the policy focus at national and international levels should be on dropout prevention strategies to achieve the education targets of the Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) by 2030. Good intervention always requires local analysis of problems and assessments of potential strategies at the point of service delivery. The findings of the study show several pull out, push out and policy-related factors of dropping out. The pull out factors are: absence of an educational environment at home; desire to seek religious education; pupils' and parents' lack of interest in schooling; poor academic performance; failure in class 9; household poverty; pressures of domestic responsibilities; large family sizes; local labor market conditions; seasonal migration; influence of feudalism in the remote rural areas; and the custom of dowry and marrying daughters off early. The push out factors are: locations of schools; a lack of academic and physical facilities; teachers' lack of interest in teaching; poor quality teaching; practices of rote learning and memorization; and explicit bullying from class teachers. The public policy-related factors are: the syllabus being in the English medium; automated progression policy; different examination systems at primary, elementary, and secondary levels; a non-deregistration policy for long-absentee pupils; imposing non-teaching duties on teachers

1.5. Significance of the Study

This study will assist the readers in highlighting major outcomes and the result of the implementation of sustainable development goal 4 which is quality education generally at national level and specifically at district level. It will also focus on the loopholes coming forward to the implementation of sustainable development education goals in district dir lower. Also the study will point out the challenges and hurdles in implementing sustainable development goals SDGs in Khyber Pukhtunkhwa.

1.6. Objectives of the Study

To trace quality education goals in lower dir after the implementation of sustainable development goals SDGs and their outcomes on the ground. This study will also try to find out that what are the possible reasons responsible for the slow progress of implementation of SDGs in lower dir.

1.7. Methodology

The research will be based on qualitative methodology. The data will be collected from primary as well secondary sources; focused group discussion and semi structured interview will be conducted with experts, stakeholders, teachers, students, principals , DEO, AEDO, district administration and from the education office of district dir lower.

1.8. Organization of the Study

The first chapter of this research will be introduction to Sustainable development goals SDGs (sustainable development goals) and especially SDG4 which (Quality Education or Education for All). The 2nd chapter will cover SGD4 quality education and its implementation policy, outcomes, challenges and results in Khyber Pukhtunkhwa. 3rd

chapter of the research will be on the SDGS implementation at grass root level in Pakistan, we have taken the case of a district in kpk District Dir Lower. This chapter will review the progress of SDGS especially SDG4 at district dir Lower. 4th chapter of the results will be findings, analysis and results of implementing SDG4 at district Lower dir and the 5th chapter will be comprise of the conclusion.

Chapter 02

2.1. Implications of implementing goals of education in KPK

2.1.1. Sustainable development goal 4 (Quality Education) in kpk

Specifically, Sustainable Development Goal 4 also known as (education for all) provides an action plan for attaining sustainable development goals. The fourth Sustainable Development Goal, which seeks to educate all of the world's children. The education sector of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa asserts that over the past five years, the provincial government has made substantial progress in providing children with access to high-quality educational opportunities. During the previous ESP's coverage period (2015-2020), a greater proportion of children are now enrolled in educational programmes that are a better fit for their needs. More students are now enrolled in schools, and the implementation of a merit-based recruiting system has led to the hiring of over 40,000 instructors. Not only have student attendance rates significantly increased, but so have those of faculty members.¹⁴

The provincial government's vision for the improvement of education in the province is to provide an outstanding education to all children, with a particular emphasis on the education of females, children from disadvantaged groups such as NMDs, and the promotion of equality.¹⁵ The following underlines this vision: • more and better skilled qualified teachers, teacher educators, and head teachers who implement and support learner-centered approaches that help to build key skills at the heart of a well-managed

¹⁴ Department, k. E. (2020-2024). *khyber pukhtunkhwa education sector plan*. peshawar: khyberpukhtunkhwa education department.

¹⁵ Antoni verger, k. m. (2013). *education and the sustainable development goals: towards a global common good*. london: edward elgar publishing.

and accountable education system • increasing the number of teachers and ensuring that they have access to professional development opportunities so that they can improve their professional practise; • implementing the new Single National Curriculum and making resources available for the production of new textbooks to support its principles, as well as providing teachers, principals, and others with professional development opportunities; The objective of the Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Education Blueprint (2018-2023) is to create a more just and equitable society in the Province by addressing marginalisation issues, such as those associated with gender, poverty, and disability. The Blueprint outlines a strategy for achieving these objectives by focusing on the NMDs, improving management and governance across the board, bolstering the role of communities, forming partnerships with the private sector and non-governmental organisations (NGOs), and reforming early childhood and primary education.

2.2. Targets of SDG4 “Quality Education”:

Education is an essential component of the 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development, serving not only as its own goal (Sustainable Development Goal 4) but also as a target within other SDGs addressing issues such as economic development and employment, environmentally responsible consumption and production, and climate change..

2.2.1. SDG4 in a nutshell:

ensuring that individuals have access to education throughout their entire lives, from childhood to old age; ensuring fairness, participation, and equality between the sexes; ensuring efficient learning and the development of the appropriate knowledge, skills, and abilities; ensuring that education, both in terms of vocation and the acquisition of

technical skills, is relevant to the pursuit of honorable employment and active citizenship in a multifaceted society.

2.2.2. SDG4 10 targets:

The fourth Sustainable Development Goal consists of seven result objectives and three implementation strategies. Since 2015, GCE's policy and advocacy initiatives have been guided by the SDG4's ten objectives.

2.2.4. Outcome Targets:

Universal primary and secondary education;

Everyone should have access to at least 12 years of publicly financed, free, inclusive, equitable, and high-quality primary and secondary education, of which at least nine years are mandatory and contribute significantly to learning outcomes. All individuals should have access to elementary and secondary education.

Development of young children and universal access to preschool programs for all parents and children.

Equal success to technical/ vocational and higher education;

Providing adolescents and adults with opportunities for lifelong learning by reducing barriers to skills development and technical and vocational education and training (TVET) is of the uttermost importance. This should commence in secondary school and extend through university and higher education. It is suggested that, in accordance with the existing international agreements, the costs associated with providing postsecondary education should be eliminated progressively.

Relevant skills for decent work;

It is essential to both increase the availability of TVET programming and enhance its quality. In order to broaden and diversify the available educational and training opportunities, it is important to encourage the use of a variety of different modalities of instruction.

The acquisition of abilities: In addition to work-specific abilities, it is essential to develop more general qualities such as problem-solving, critical thinking, creative thinking, teamwork, communication, and conflict resolution.

Gender equality and inclusion;

Everyone, regardless of age, gender, race, colour, ethnicity, language, religion, political or other views, national or social origin, wealth, or place of birth, should have access to a quality education and opportunities for lifelong learning. This includes people with disabilities, migrants, indigenous peoples, children and adolescents, and notably those in vulnerable situations or with other statuses.

Gender equality: Everyone, regardless of gender, should have an equal opportunity to succeed in school and reap the rewards of a well-rounded education. This is something that all individuals merit. Girls and young women, particularly those living in poverty or rural areas, require special protection because they are more likely to be victims of gender-based violence, child marriage, precocious pregnancy, and the disproportionate burden of family labour. This is particularly true for those living in rural areas. It is imperative that action be taken whenever men are placed in a disadvantageous position. If the initiative also addresses health, justice, and good governance issues, in addition to the abolition of child labour, it will be significantly more effective in attaining its objective of eliminating gender disparity.

Universal Youth Literacy;

This goal is to ensure, by the year 2030, that every young person and adult on the planet has the same level of proficiency in reading, writing, and arithmetic as elementary school graduates.

Education for sustainable development and global citizenship;

Teaching students to be decent global citizens while also safeguarding the environment is the topic of discussion. Education equips individuals with the knowledge, skills, beliefs, and attitudes necessary for successfully navigating life, making informed decisions, and confronting and resolving global challenges at both the local and global levels. This includes learning about peace and human rights issues, becoming more accepting of other cultures, and expanding one's worldview.

2.2.5. Means of implementation;

Effective learning environments

This objective seeks to ensure that all students, regardless of socioeconomic status or physical ability, have access to appropriate facilities and a conducive learning environment for their academic pursuits.

Scholarships:

The primary objective of scholarships offered by developed nations to pupils from less developed nations must be to enhance the educational provisioning capacities of the latter. Although it is acknowledged that scholarships play a significant role in education, donor nations should also consider increasing their investment in education through other means. To be consistent with the objectives of SDG4-Education 2030, which are centred

on equity, inclusiveness, and outstanding education, scholarship initiatives must explicitly prioritise students from economically disadvantaged backgrounds.

Teachers and educators;

Without dedicated educators, none of the objectives of Sustainable Development Goal 4 will be attained. The scarcity of qualified educators exacerbates the education inequality gap. This issue must be addressed immediately, particularly in economically disadvantaged communities. In order for schools and districts to provide students with a high-quality educational experience, these institutions must have access to adequate funding, an effective infrastructure, and capable leadership.

2.3. Implications of implementation

The Blueprint for Education Reform presents a vision that takes into account the inherent difficulties associated with implementing this transformation. Reading and fundamental mathematics remain challenging disciplines for the overwhelming majority of elementary school students. There is still a substantial quantity of out-of-school time (OOSC) in both the elementary and secondary education sectors. The worrisome dropout rates from Katchi grade through the completion of secondary education are due to a combination of supply variables (such as the number of secondary schools) and demand factors (such as negative societal attitudes towards females' education and the visibility of children with disabilities). There is a critical lack of high-quality preschool programmes that would adequately prepare children for elementary education.¹⁶

Women in the province, especially in the NMDs, are disproportionately affected by these obstacles, and as a direct result, they are less likely to enrol in formal education. This is

¹⁶ Lawn, a. v. (2009). quality education: the pathway to sustainable development. massachusetts: brill

particularly true for NMDs. According to the descriptive data, seventy percent of respondents believe that schools lack basic facilities, and seventy-three point three percent believe that securing access to education for all can be accomplished by opening the doors to individuals of both sexes and all socioeconomic backgrounds. In addition, it has been determined through inferential statistics (exploratory factor analysis) that the Lack of Basic Facilities & Discrimination in Education institutes is the primary factor affecting the implementation of SDG Goal-4 and a barrier to providing Quality Education in Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Pakistan. Examination of the circumstance in Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Pakistan, revealed this to be the case. Since the year 2000, significant progress has been made towards the aim of providing elementary education to every person on the planet. Indicators of the extraordinary success achieved in the field of education are the increases in the number of institutions and pupil enrollment rates, particularly for females.¹⁷

These benefits are observable. Some developing nations have made almost no progress towards the establishment of high-quality educational institutions as a result of extreme poverty, violent warfare, and other forms of instability. Due to armed conflict, the number of children unable to attend school has increased in a number of countries in Western Asia and North Africa. This is an extremely alarming pattern that has been observed. The proportion of sub-Saharan African children who attended primary education increased from 52 percent in 1990 to 78 percent in 2012, making it the region with the highest rate of development. Children living in low-income households have an attendance rate that is up to four times that of children living in high-income households.

¹⁷ Chapman, a. &. (2018). developing national frameworks for inclusive sustainable development incorporating lifestyle factor importance. *journal of cleaner production*,, 39-47.

Existing disparities in treatment between rural and urban areas are another obstacle to providing everyone with access to a quality education.¹⁸

1. **Increased Access to Education:** Implementing SDG4 in KPK will lead to an increased focus on providing access to quality education for all children in the region, regardless of socio-economic background, gender, or geographic location. This implies significant efforts in terms of expanding infrastructure, establishing schools in remote areas, and ensuring enrollment of out-of-school children.
2. **Improved Teaching Quality:** Implementing SDG4 requires addressing the quality of education, including teacher training and professional development. This implies investing in teacher training programs, updating teaching techniques, and providing teachers with necessary resources to enhance their pedagogical skills.
3. **Enhancing Learning Outcomes:** The implementation of SDG4 necessitates a focus on improving learning outcomes and ensuring that students are acquiring the necessary knowledge and skills. This implies establishing effective monitoring and evaluation systems to assess student performance, curriculum alignment with global standards, and adopting innovative teaching methods to promote active learning.
4. **Gender Equality:** One of the key implications of implementing SDG4 in KPK is the promotion of gender equality in education. This implies addressing the existing gender disparities in access to education, eliminating gender-based

¹⁸ Arnaud diemer. nd (march 2020). sdg 4 “quality education”, the cornerstone of the SDGs: case studies of Pakistan and senegal. *journal of economic development studies*,

discrimination in schools, and creating an enabling environment that encourages girls' education and retention in schools.

5. **Bridging Urban-Rural Divide:** KPK has a significant urban-rural divide in terms of access to quality education. Implementing SDG4 requires bridging this gap by providing equal education opportunities in both urban and rural areas. This implies the development of infrastructure, access to technology, and resource allocation in high-priority areas.
6. **Sustainable Development:** Implementing SDG4 in KPK aligns with the broader goals of sustainable development. It implies incorporating sustainability concepts within the curriculum to raise awareness about environmental issues, promoting responsible citizenship, and developing skills required for the green economy.
7. **Collaborative Partnerships:** The implementation of SDG4 requires strong collaboration and partnerships between the government, non-governmental organizations, local communities, and international donors. This implies building effective partnerships to leverage resources, expertise, and knowledge-sharing for the successful implementation of SDG4 initiatives.
8. **Financial Sustainability:** Implementing SDG4 involves significant financial resources. It implies the need for sustainable funding mechanisms, both at the national and international levels, to ensure continued support for educational programs. This includes exploring innovative financing models and mobilizing resources from various stakeholders.
9. **Policy Reforms:** Implementing SDG4 will require policy reforms in the education sector of KPK. This implies aligning existing policies with the

principles of SDG4, formulating new policies that address the specific challenges of the region, and ensuring effective implementation and monitoring of these policies.

- 10. Community Engagement:** Implementing SDG4 necessitates active community engagement and participation. This implies involving parents, local communities, and other stakeholders in decision-making processes, promoting community ownership of schools, and empowering communities to play an active role in improving the quality of education.

Overall, implementing SDG4 in KPK, Pakistan comes with numerous implications, ranging from addressing access and quality issues to advancing gender equality, promoting sustainability, and fostering collaborations. These implications require sustained efforts, dedicated resources, and a comprehensive approach to ensure the successful achievement of SDG4 goals in the region.

2.3.1. SDG4 implementation challenges in kpk;

Both Pakistan's tremendous population (currently 207.78 million) and its high birth rate (2.7% at present) are defining characteristics of the nation. Pakistan, like many other underdeveloped countries, has a low rate of literacy, a GDP per capita of less than \$1,500 (at the current exchange rate), a human development index of 0.538, and a poverty rate of 30%. Children and adolescents from low-income and/or illiterate households are more likely to engage in extremism, violent behaviour, or criminal activity.¹⁹ Environment deterioration, air pollution, recent winter smog, urbanisation, polluted water, terrorism, regional/provincial disputes, food security, inflation, inequality, access to education,

¹⁹ Jamal, h. (. (2018). proposed national indicator framework for sdg 4: the case of pakistan.

loans, security issues, deforestation, and corruption are just a few of Pakistan's numerous challenges at present. Additionally, there are deforestation, corruption, and regional/provincial conflicts. As a result of these obstacles, Pakistan is now entirely dependent on the humanitarian aid provided by major international organisations and/or nongovernmental organisations.²⁰

The following Sustainable Development Goal 4 proclamation exemplifies the worldwide effort to advocate education for all people. Goal 4 of the Sustainable Development Goals focuses primarily on ensuring that everyone has access to an education that can improve their lives, their communities, and their society as a whole. MDG2 and EFA established the foundation for what is now referred to as SDG4, which is an effort to finish what they started in terms of global education development. This methodology is rights-based because education is regarded as a fundamental human right. The objective is to include all individuals, regardless of their background, beliefs, skin complexion, country, date of birth, culture, or any other distinguishing characteristics they may possess. This objective also possesses the quality of being attainable by the community. A comprehensive and evolutionary perspective is also quite essential. Because it is a locally-owned and -executed objective, it is pertinent and meaningful in the context of a country like Pakistan, which is distinct in all of the aforementioned characteristics. Although this objective incorporates all modalities of education, including formal, non-formal, and informal settings, formal education will be prioritised because it is more extensive and pervasive.²¹ As one of its primary objectives, the implementation of the new agenda

²⁰ Dr naeem akhtar, (2022). challenges in implementing educatiocal policies in pakistan. *jornal of positive school psychology*, 11.

²¹ Pakistan's implementation of the 2030 agenda for sustainable development. (2019). *voluntary national review* , 81.

should prioritise the efficacy, effectiveness, and equity of educational institutions. "Ensure inclusive and equitable quality education for all, and promote lifelong learning opportunities for all" The objective is more attainable, quantifiable, and realisable as a result of the seven sub-goals and division of tasks and responsibilities outlined in the paper agenda 2030.

2.4. Priority Targets:

By the year 2030, every girl and boy must have access to basic, secondary, and higher education that is not only free, but also equitable and of the utmost quality. We have until the year 2030 to guarantee that all children, including boys and girls, have unrestricted access to free, high-quality early childhood education and care. Priority should be placed on increasing the number of STEM-related higher education opportunities available to women and men by 2030. We anticipate that all education-related renovations and new construction projects will be completed by 2030. All students will have access to a safe and high-quality learning environment as a result of these initiatives, which will also take into account gender and disability concerns. By 2030, it is anticipated that a sizable proportion of young women and men will be literate and gainfully employed. The United Nations Development Programme (UNDP) has set the year 2030 as the deadline for ensuring that all people have the knowledge and skills necessary to raise the level of sustainable economic development and lifestyle in all countries, gender equality, peace and nonviolence, respect for cultural diversity, and global citizenship. This objective will be achieved by ensuring that everyone has the knowledge and skills necessary to increase the level of sustainability.²²

²² Lawn, a. v. (2009). quality education: the pathway to sustainable development. massachusetts: brill

Chapter 03: Implementing SDG4 (quality education) at grass root level in Pakistan

3.1. SDG4 (Sustainable development goal 4 quality education)

Implementation at district level in Pakistan.

"Ensure inclusive and equitable quality education and promote lifelong learning opportunities for all" is the full title of this Sustainable Development Goal (SDG 4). Regarding the achievement of SDG 4, the ideas and perspectives of educators are of uttermost importance. The vast majority of academics have at least a cursory understanding of sustainable development. However, they expressed concern that the goals of SDG 4 in the areas of education and sustainability needed to be more closely linked. Pakistan adopted an official position in support of the Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) in 2016 and began incorporating them into the country's primary policymaking and development agenda. The fourth of the seventeen Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) adopted by the United Nations in 2015 was to "provide inclusive and equitable quality education and expand opportunities for lifelong learning for all."²³ Pakistan is widely regarded as the first country to officially endorse the Sustainable Development Goals 2030 Agenda. This is primarily owing to the resounding ratification of the SDGs by the Pakistani parliament. Following the effective completion of the Millennium Development Goals (MDGs), the federal and provincial administrations of Pakistan, along with the most influential stakeholders, met to debate their long-term development and poverty alleviation strategies. During the consultation

²³ Anastasia nikolopoulou, f. m. (2010). education for sustainable development. challenges, strategies and practices in a globalizing world. india: sage publications.

process, it became abundantly apparent that national frameworks for selecting SDGs, additional data collection, and monitoring mechanisms were required. The vast majority of instructors and students believe that the government should be responsible for ensuring that education is one of the areas in which the Sustainable Development Goals are implemented.²⁴ In addition, they indicated that the government may make SDG 4 a priority for all citizens, rather than just a select few. They anticipated that a rise in inequality and disparity would make it more difficult for the government to achieve the goals of SDG 4 if education funds were allocated to a select few locations. In addition, the faculty members argued that the plans for the government's sustainable development would have a greater chance of success if they were developed in collaboration with local leaders and community elders. Pakistan is making progress towards accomplishing its 2030 Agenda commitment as a result of its efforts to strengthen institutional processes, raise awareness, establish effective connections, and enhance coordination. These activities are being performed simultaneously. To ensure the success of its execution plan, it is essential to utilise technology, raise funds through various methods, and form and strengthen relationships. The initiative will continue to be characterised by its emphasis on partnerships and direct interaction with a wide range of government, business, civil society, and media institutions, as well as regional and global support. Pakistan will continue its efforts to achieve the Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) by adopting innovative, targeted, and focused implementation strategies in the social, economic, and environmental domains despite economic and budgetary challenges.

²⁴ Arnaud diemer. (march 2020). sdg 4 “quality education”, the cornerstone of the sdgs: case studies of Pakistan and senegal. *journal of economic development studies*,²⁴

3.1.1. Pakistan's national, provincial and grass root level policy framework for the sustainable development goal 4 implementation:

Pakistan has the second-highest rate of minors with no formal education. There are 22,8 million minors under the age of 16 who are not enrolled in any educational programme in Pakistan.²⁵ This would also indicate that roughly half of this age group is not enrolled in any form of formal education. In February of 2016, the government of Pakistan approved a resolution in support of the United Nations' Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs). Following the election of the previous administration in 2018, the provinces were granted the authority to establish their own development and priority frameworks. SDG4 (Education for all) has emerged as a province-wide objective, and provinces have been granted permission to conclude the development of their policy framework. In March of 2018, the National Economic Council (NEC), the highest economic policymaking authority in Pakistan, approved a comprehensive National Sustainable Development Goals (SDG) Framework. The Monitoring and Evaluation Framework for the Sustainable Development goals (SDGs) will benefit from the formulation of benchmarks and targets for SDG indicators by this framework. Provinces and areas administered by the federal government may now use the framework as a guide when selecting the types of development objectives to pursue. Each province has established its own Technical Committee and Thematic Cluster to facilitate the achievement of the Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs). It is assisting governments in aligning their development objectives with the 2030 Agenda by establishing national and local contact points. Federal and provincial national policies, sector plans, and growth strategies have been

²⁵ Chapman, a. &. (2018). developing national frameworks for inclusive sustainable development incorporating lifestyle factor importance. *journal of cleaner Production*,, 39-47.

aligned with the 2030 Agenda as a result of the institutional framework that has been established. Recently, the 2030 Agenda, the 12th Five-Year Plan, and the provincial medium-term development initiatives were brought into alignment. Pakistan has made progress in a number of areas, including its fight against poverty and infant malnutrition, efforts to promote accountability and transparency, and efforts to empower women.²⁶ Among these areas, the struggle against destitution and malnutrition among newborns stands out. Pakistan's effectiveness in implementing the 2030 Agenda is substantially influenced by its dedication to attaining these goals. A total of seven SDG Support Units have been established at the federal, provincial, and federally administered region levels in order to strengthen the vertical and horizontal coordination between the various levels of government and non-governmental partners. Under the supervision of the federal Ministry of Planning, Development, and Reform (MoPD&R) and the provincial and administrative area Planning & Development Departments (P&DDs), these agencies contributed significantly to the creation of Pakistan's first Voluntary National Review (VNR). This was done to satisfy the Voluntary National Review (VNR) requirements. Pakistan is required by Agenda 2030 (2019) to implement sustainable development practices. Throughout the review process, which spanned a number of months, we held discussions with a wide range of stakeholders on these seven topics. Since the government decided to adopt the SDGs, it has endeavored to incorporate them into all of its ongoing programs and initiatives. Pakistan's provincial development strategies and five-year plans, as well as the Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs), all aim for the same end goals. All levels of government collaborated to produce the Sustainable

²⁶ Anastasia nikolopoulou, f. m. (2010). education for sustainable development. challenges, strategies and practices in a globalizing world. india: sage publications.

Development Goals (SDGs). During the first-ever Local Government Summit on the Sustainable Development Goals in 2017, education, employment, energy, water, as well as peace and governance, were all highlighted as crucial topics of discussion. As a direct result of the PSDP, the federal government has increased expenditure across the board in the areas of energy, law enforcement, and security. The provincial administration has also increased funding for water and sanitation, as well as education and healthcare. The objectives proposed by the public during consultations on the post-2015 agenda and discussions at the 2017 Local Government Summit served as the foundation for the development of a seven-dimensional objective criterion that was intended to prioritise the nation's needs.²⁷

In 2018, the National Economic Council granted the National SDGs Framework its seal of approval. This ambitious objective will be confronted by the National Advisory Committee on the SDGs, which will be headed by the Minister for PD&R and tasked with confronting the goal's expansive and comprehensive nature. The Committee will consist of federal government, provincial government, and SDG Taskforce representatives. There will be experts on the plight of indigent women, business representatives, and members of the National Assembly present. In order to achieve the Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs), the Committee will facilitate effective collaboration across sectors and provinces. Additionally, provincial administrations are forming provincial advisory organisations. The province of Punjab has revised the

²⁷ Muhammd sajjad,.nd. (2022). spatial inequalities in education status and its determinants in Pakistan: A district-level modelling in the context of sustainable development Goal-4. *Elsevier*, 13.

Committee responsible for directing the provincial SDG implementation and assisting with the provincial SDG Framework.²⁸

3.2. Pakistan's National SDG 4 support unit;

Within Pakistan's constitutional frameworks, education has always been accorded a high level of priority. Despite the fact that the federal government assumed responsibility for policymaking and macro-planning in 1973, the primary focus remained on the states. The Indian Independence Act of 1947 designated the Government of India Act of 1935 as the provisional/interim constitution of Pakistan, and it remained in effect until the passage of the 1956 Constitution. The 1947 Indian Independence Act also established Pakistan as a sovereign nation. The statute distinguished between federal laws, concurrent laws, and provincial laws. The provincial legislature deemed education a primary priority. The list of concurrent bills and the list of federal bills did not contain any education-related legislation.²⁹

The 1956 Constitution of Pakistan established three legislative lists and delegated education authority to the constituent provinces. This authority extended to both higher education and technical and professional education. The Constitution ratified in 1962 established a presidential form of government and harmonised federal law across 49 subject areas. Article 7 of the Principles of Policy in Chapter 2 and Article 12(3) of the Fundamental Rights in Chapter 1 both contained oblique references to education, but none of the provisions included an operational clause or a central legislative list.

²⁸ Anastasia nikolopoulou, f. m. (2010). education for sustainable development. challenges, strategies and practices in a globalizing world. india: sage publications.

²⁹ Khan, p. a. (2022). open innovation of institutional investors and higher education system in creating open approach for sdg-4 quality education: a conceptual review. *journal of open innovation: technology, market, and complexity*, 8(1), 49.

To institutionalize the 2030 Agenda, the Pakistani government's Ministry of Planning, Development, and Special Initiatives (MoPD&SI), the United Nations Development Program (UNDP) Pakistan, and other partners have launched the National Initiative for Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs), a five-year project. The Federal SDGs Support Unit was established to provide better coordination and support to the numerous federal ministries and division agencies. In addition to coordinating, reporting, and monitoring the Sustainable Development Goals, the Unit's primary responsibilities include supporting policy, conducting research, and managing knowledge. The group is concurrently employing a vast array of communication strategies and technologies in an effort to broaden stakeholders' understanding of Agenda 2030 and the Goals. The government's goals include utilizing technology to accelerate progress towards the Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs), ensuring that the SDGs are monitored and reported on effectively, aligning public budgetary allocations with the SDGs, and studying alternative financing structures. From 2015 to 2020, the national literacy rate remained unchanged at 60 percent, indicating that progress towards SDG 4 has stalled. To ensure that every child in Pakistan has access to education of the utmost possible quality, we need an effective strategy. Nonetheless, in light of the current economic crisis and the ripple effects it is having on all sectors, including the educational sector, the question of how this objective could conceivably be attained arises inexorably.³⁰

Pakistan's education system is plagued by a number of problems, the most prominent of which are a paucity of female students and an imbalance between male and female professors. One of the main problems afflicting Pakistan's education system today is the absence of college-level technical training that would guarantee employment upon degree

³⁰ Jamal, h. (. (2018). proposed national indicator framework for sdg 4: the case of pakistan.

completion. The existence of thousands of "ghost schools" staffed by unqualified individuals, the lack of training for teachers affiliated with private and public educational institutions, and the appalling educational standards that have resulted as a direct result of these problems are also major issues. The nation's educational system is not making significant progress, which is extremely disappointing. From 2015 to 2020, the proportion of pupils who complete elementary education has remained unchanged at 67%. In addition, the gender gap in primary school graduation rates between boys and girls has remained stable at nine percentage points over this time period. Between 2015 and 2020, the percentage of pupils with a secondary school diploma rose from 50% to 59%. Concerning is the fact that the national literacy rate has remained unchanged at sixty percent from 2015 to 2020.³¹

3.2.1. SDGs unit at provincial level

In 1973, when education was added to the concurrent list in the Pakistani Constitution, the long-standing practice of delegating education responsibilities to the provinces underwent a major revision. Both the federal and concurrent lists of priorities to be addressed ranked education highly. There are three education-related entries in the federal registries. Curriculum, curriculum, planning, policy, Centre of excellence, educational standards, and Islamic education were concurrent topics. According to Article 37 (b), "the State shall eliminate illiteracy and provide free, compulsory education at the secondary level within the shortest possible time." Since the enactment of Article 25-A of the Eighteenth Amendment, which guarantees "The Right to Education," education has become more accessible. The law states that "all children between the ages

³¹ Saleh., m. s. (2014). education and sustainable development in asia. new york: springer.

of five and sixteen shall be required to attend school at no cost to their parents or the state," and it is the child's responsibility to fulfil this requirement. Article 37 (b) was intended to address the eradication of illiteracy and the provision of free and compulsory secondary education, but it did not establish a timeframe; rather, it stated that these goals should be accomplished "within the shortest possible time." Despite the fact that it was designed to address these issues, this is the case. Article 25-A of the Constitution currently guarantees the right to receive an education. There is still a requirement that all minors under 18 must attend school "as determined by law." Each jurisdiction's national, state, and local legislatures are responsible for enacting subordinate laws.³²

At this moment, not a single province in Pakistan has used its provincial legislature to adopt the required legislation. A number of the United Nations' suggested indicators lack the data necessary for appropriate monitoring and evaluation when applied to Pakistan. According to the findings of the research on data gaps, only three of the eleven SDG-4 indicators can be predicted with the current data. Consequently, a number of initiatives, including innovative surveying and the formulation of policies, are proposed in order to track the progress of SDG-4. In addition to political resolve, these initiatives require a substantial quantity of capital and a substantial number of participants. The research recommends initiating the monitoring procedure for SDG-4 using a combination of global and complementary country indicators. This is due to the availability of reliable and representative national data. According to the scorecard that was created based on the SDGs, it will be challenging for Pakistan to achieve the SDGs by 2030 if the current policies remain unchanged. Baluchistan's rural areas have fared the worst, while Punjab and KP's urban areas have performed relatively well despite falling shy of the target.

³² Saleh., m. s. (2014). education and sustainable development in asia. new york: springer.

Improvements in areas such as health, education, lack of destitution, water and sanitation infrastructure, and absence of starvation are crucial for any community. According to the SDG thermal map, each province faces significant challenges in the areas of health, education, and gender equality. A call to action for governments and other interested parties to address the identified deficiencies in implementation, funding, and political will to realise this vision and its potential. With the SDG Index, it is feasible to increase public awareness of the Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) and their role as a framework for national policies and long-term efforts to promote equitable development.³³

3.2.2. SDGs unit at district level

Provincial administrations are currently implementing local government legislation and a redesigned framework. Both the federal and provincial governments are committed to attaining and exceeding the Millennium Development objectives and the EFA's objectives. As a result of the 18th Amendment to the Constitution, new organisational frameworks are currently being implemented to address the ensuing challenges. Pakistan has incorporated the United Nations Millennium Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) into its future development strategy in order to assist its citizens in evading destitution and enhancing their standard of living. In particular, the Government of Pakistan acknowledged Sustainable Development Goal 4 as a "priority aim" due to its emphasis on ensuring that boys and girls have equal access to high-quality education. In the pursuit of Sustainable Development Goal 4, however, the momentum necessary to begin generating results at the grassroots level for the benefit of the general population has not yet been

³³ Chapman, a. &. (2018). developing national frameworks for inclusive sustainable development incorporating lifestyle factor importance. *journal of cleaner production*,, 39-47.

attained. To make the Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) a reality, it is first necessary to establish national-specific objectives. The Planning Commission has devised a national framework for the Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) after a thorough examination and collaboration with provincial and local administrations. Due to the exhaustive character of the procedure, division-level agreements were first reached in each of the four participating provinces. On March 9, 2017, a Local Government Summit was held in Islamabad, with many elected district council chairmen in attendance. Localization of the Sustainable Development Goals was one of the topics extensively discussed at the event. UNDP's State Development Goals Unit for Punjab Pakistan and the Planning and Development Department of South Punjab in Pakistan collaborated to produce two milestone studies on the status of progress towards the Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) in specific districts. The research on the South Punjab Sustainable Development Goals Indicators is the first regional-level investigation of its kind. This makes it possible to construct well-informed, data-driven development initiatives in the region. The District SDGs Profiles Report is an essential component of the process for localizing Agenda 2030's Sustainable Development Goals at the district level. This report is an essential policy advice document for district administrations to assist them in achieving SDGs in their respective districts.³⁴

3.3. Importance of District-level Implementation:

By implementing Sustainable Development Goal 4 at the district level, we will be better able to respond to the unique challenges that each region of Pakistan faces. From one district to the next, the levels of affluence, cultural influence, and access to various

³⁴ Sajjad, m. m. (2022). spatial inequalities in education status and its determinants in Pakistan: a district-level modelling in the context of sustainable development Goal-4. *applied geography*.

services may vary significantly. By adapting our policies and procedures to satisfy the unique needs of each area, we can produce results that are both efficient and sustainable.³⁵

3.3.1. Key Strategies for Implementation:

To attract the interest of today's students, it is essential to develop a curriculum based on the culture and history of the surrounding area. At the district level, with the assistance of community members and teachers, a curriculum that is both relevant and significant to the lives of children can be developed.

Investments in the education and professional development of instructors are required. Local school districts are responsible for providing instructors with professional development opportunities that will assist them in becoming more proficient with modern pedagogical techniques and technological tools. Teachers' morale and overall performance may benefit from mentoring and ongoing assistance.

Modern educational facilities, public libraries, and research laboratories are examples of the necessary physical infrastructure that should be present in every district. It is essential that all levels of government, civil society, and international organizations collaborate in order to achieve this objective.

Parental and community participation in classroom activities fosters a sense of ownership and responsibility in students. To increase the likelihood that children, and particularly females, will be able to attend school, it is essential for the community to take action and assist in removing cultural barriers.

³⁵ Ferrer-fstévez, m. &. (2021). integrating sustainable development goals In educational institutions. the international journal Of management education, 19(2),, 100494.

As we strive for universal accessibility, there are three groups that merit special consideration: women, children with disabilities, and rural residents. It is possible that more girls and women will attend college if more gender-sensitive laws, scholarships, and improved public transportation are enacted.

Collecting and analyzing data is crucial for tracking progress and identifying problem areas throughout the implementation process. Using district-level data, it is possible to make policy decisions that are supported by evidence.

The success of government, nonprofit, and private organizations is contingent upon their capacity for effective collaboration. It is possible that the combined efforts of the public and private sectors will have a greater impact.³⁶

3.3.2. Role of Technology in Implementation:

The incorporation of SDG 4 into the municipalities of Pakistan may be substantially facilitated by technological advances. It has the potential to level the playing field for pupils from different parts of the world, enhance the efficacy of instructors, and create new educational opportunities. Due to online learning platforms, digital materials, and remote education technology, it is now possible for people in economically disadvantaged areas to receive a high-quality education. Technological advances simplify the accumulation of data, the monitoring of progress, and the adaptation of strategies to changing circumstances.

3.3.3. Measuring Progress and Accountability:

Methods of district-level monitoring and evaluation are crucial for the achievement of SDG 4. Enrollment rates, literacy rates, gender equality, and educational outcomes are

³⁶ Mustafa, G. (2012). Education policy analysis report of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa. *United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organisation*.

constantly monitored and analyzed as key performance indicators. Audits and evaluations conducted by a third party may aid in the maintenance of accountability and transparency.

To achieve SDG 4 at the district level, Pakistan must demonstrate collaboration, creativity, and resolve. Pakistan can make significant progress toward its goal of ensuring that all of its citizens have access to a high-quality education if it addresses the specific challenges encountered by local districts and makes effective use of available technologies. This revolutionary initiative has the potential to improve the lives of students across the nation, as well as to strengthen local economies, increase social mobility, and enhance national security. Moreover, this endeavor has the potential to increase social mobility.

Chapter 04: Implications of Implementing SDG4 (Sustainable Development Goal 4 (Quality Education) At District Dir Lower after 2016

4.1. Education in district lower dir

Lower Dir is a district located within Pakistan's Khyber Pakhtunkhwa province. Even though it functions as the district capital, Timergara is now located within the central district Dir's boundaries. In the near future, however, it will be relocated to an area of its own. The district was created in 1996 when the Dir District was divided into the Upper Dir and Lower Dir neighbourhoods. Lower Dir District and Central Dir District merged on January 22, 2023 to form Central Dir District. Malakand and Bajaur Agency are located to the south, while Upper Dir and Chitral are located to the north. Afghanistan is located in the west. The Swat District is located to the east. According to information discovered in the encyclopaedia According to the 2017 census, the district had a total population of 1,436,082, with 709,829 males and 726,203 females. 97.19% of the population, or 1,395,768 people, resided in rural areas, while 40,314 people, or 2.81% of the population, lived in urban areas. Only 49.45 percent of women could read and write, whereas 74.4 percent of men could. Overall, 61.83 percent of the population was literate, with males having a higher percentage. There were 471 people in the region who ascribed to various religious traditions. The majority of the population spoke Pashto as their primary language, accounting for 99.30% of the total.³⁷

³⁷ Ferrer-fstévez, m. &. (2021). integrating sustainable development goals in educational institutions. *the international journal Of management education*, 19(2), 100494.

4.1.1. History of Dir lower in respect to education after independence (Nawabi System)

In 1947, when Pakistan attained its independence, the state of Dir was governed by Nawab Shah Jehan Khan,. In 1970, the year that followed its incorporation into Pakistan in 1969, it was designated a district. Upper Dir and Lower Dir were formerly part of the same district until 1996, when they were separated. Lower Dir District is located in the most northwestern portion of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa province and has a total land area of 1,583 square kilometres. With the exception of a few locations in the south-west, the majority of the District consists of rugged mountainous terrain. Malakand and Bajaur Agency are located to the south, while Upper Dir and Chitral are located to the north. Afghanistan is located in the west. The Swat District is located to the east. It was determined that the district would be represented by five provincial assembly members and one national assembly member. The Dir region is located in the Khyber Pakhtunkhwa province of Pakistan in the country's northwest, at the base of the Himalayas. Prior to Pakistan's independence in 1947, Dir was a princely state that existed until 1969, when it was abolished by presidential decree. The following year, the Dir District was created. The landmass is approximately 5,280 square kilometres in size. In 1996, the Lower Dir District and the Upper Dir District were constituted as two distinct districts. During the period that Pakistan was obtaining its independence, Nawab Shah Jehan Khan ruled the princely state of Dir. The region was officially designated as a district in 1970, the year following its merger with Pakistan. This happened one year after Pakistan and Afghanistan amalgamated in 1969. In 1897, British forces conquered Dir and established its

boundaries. Even though it remained an independent country following Pakistan's independence, it did not become a tribal agency of Pakistan until 1960. In 1969, the North-West Frontier Province established an administrative division to manage its affairs. Timergara and Dir were selected as the new capital cities of Lower Dir and Upper Dir, respectively, when the Dir District was divided into Lower Dir and Upper Dir in 1996. Until the year 2000, however, their administration was supervised by a single district commissioner stationed in Timergara.³⁸

4.1.2. Education of Dir lower before and after alienation with Pakistan in 1969.

After 1969, there was a discernible improvement in the level of education accessible in Pakistan's District Dir Lower. Due to the government's emphasis on education during this time period, a greater number of schools were built and infrastructure was enhanced. A larger population of prospective students was enticed to the educational system as a result of the construction of additional schools and the introduction of enhanced facilities, resulting in a rise in enrollment. The establishment of programmes for the training of educators and the recruitment of qualified individuals to occupy teaching positions also contributed to the enhancement of student education. As a result of the curriculum's revision to reflect the most recent pedagogical practices, students now have access to content that is not only up-to-date but also comprehensive. As a direct consequence of these activities, the District Dir Lower literacy rate has increased steadily over time, and

³⁸ Shah, G. A. (2013). administration of dir under nawab shah jehan. pak ann res j, *pak ann res j* 121-138.

educational opportunities are now available to a greater proportion of the population. This has paved the way for additional economic and social development in the region.³⁹

4.1.3. Education in lower dir after 2000

After the year 2000, there was a discernible improvement in both the quality and diversity of the District Dir Lower school system in Pakistan. Due to the government's unwavering commitment to improving the educational environment, more schools have been built, particularly in rural and economically disadvantaged areas. As a direct consequence of the district's decision to invest in the expansion of its educational facilities, a greater number of children in the surrounding area now have access to education. In an effort to raise the bar for the quality of education provided, opportunities for the professional development of educators and the implementation of innovative pedagogical practices have been made available. As a direct consequence of this newly discovered emphasis on female education, the gender education disparity narrowed and more young women began attending school. District Dir Lower residents are now better equipped to contribute to the socioeconomic development of the region as a result of the positive effects that the initiatives have had on educational outcomes and literacy rates.⁴⁰

4.1.4. Literacy, (Male, female)

Since 1981, when it was 10.16 percent, the adult literacy rate in the region has increased dramatically to reach 93.90 percent of the population aged 10 and older. According to the 2018 census, the male literacy rate was 95.76 percent, while the female literacy rate was 85.25 percent.

³⁹ Shah, g. a. (2013). administration of dir under nawab shah jehan. *pak ann res j.*, *pak ann res j*, 121-138

⁴⁰ Khan, A. (2009). barriers to the political empowerment of women in dir lower.

4.1.5. Number of government schools

There are 1,023 villages in district Dir lower. There are:

Primary Schools		Middle Schools		Secondary Schools		Colleges		Universities	
Boys	Girls	Boys	Girls	boys	Girls	boys	girls	Boys	girls
827	495	90	62	12	03	02	02	01	

Beside the government primary schools, Khwendo Kor NGO is running 15 schools, Elementary Education Foundation (EEF) is running 25 schools, ILO is running 7 schools and Non Formal Basic Education (NFBE) is running 95 schools. The numbers of madrassas (religious schools) are not yet available.

4.1.6. Number of students

When the Kachi class is unavailable, the overall enrollment ratio is 73.83 percent [1], but when it is offered, the enrollment ratio increases to 79.59 percent. There are 43 pupils per teacher, with 41 male students and 46 female students per male teacher. There are 43 students for every instructor. The most recent census of children enrolled in Universal Primary Education (UPE) revealed that between the ages of five and seven, there were 56,937 males and 47,564 girls. There are approximately 25,169 children between the ages of five and seven whose families cannot afford to enroll them in school. This population is comprised of just 19% males and 30% women. The attrition rates listed below do not differentiate between male and female dropouts; they are an aggregate rate..

4.1.7. Number of teachers

If the Kachi class were offered, the total enrollment ratio would increase to 79.59 percent from 73.83 percent if it were not included. There are 43 students per instructor, with 41 boys per male instructor and 46 girls per female instructor. Overall, there are 43 students for every teacher.

4.1.8. Number of drop out students at dir lower.

The most recent census conducted by Universal Primary Education (UPE) reveals that there are 104,498 children between the ages of 5 and 7, with 56,937 boys and 47,564 girls. Because of a lack of resources, 25,169 children, or more than 24 percent of the total population of children aged 5-7, do not attend school. In this category, there are only 19% men and 30% women. These statistics include both male and female secondary school dropout rates.

4.2. Quality of education at lower dir

I have deeply observed the quality of education as I belong to and grew up in the respective district lower Dir. student-teacher relationships, and institutional leadership at a district-level postgraduate college in Timergara, the capital city of Lower Dir, where I previously taught. As someone who has conducted extensive research on the educational system, I have investigated issues concerning the dependability of educational institutions, the quality of instruction, and the development of students. A number of distinct factors may be considered when determining the caliber of education offered at Dir lower. Not only are the schools in Dir lower poorly constructed, but they also lack the requisite paintwork and motivational inscriptions. This demonstrates that educational officials do not view

addressing this issue as a top priority. The village school where I received all three of my diplomas (elementary, middle, and high school) and where I spent 11 years of my education has not undergone significant alterations in the intervening years. The school has undergone numerous personnel and organisational changes, but the building itself has remained unchanged. There is only one institution of higher education in the surrounding area. It is exceedingly clear that the region's lack of educational accomplishments in the past is a direct result of the nawab of Dir's opposition to education in the past. In addition, the majority of DIR LOWER's teachers are baby boomers; as a result, they are not up-to-date with the most recent scientific and technological developments. As a college lecturer, I frequently interacted with colleagues who lacked the technical knowledge required to operate mobile and computer programs efficiently. Count of public libraries in lower dir; according to the district's education administration, there is only one public library in Timergara, the district's administrative centre.⁴¹

4.3. SGD4 (Quality education) implementation at lower dir

At the district level, Goal 4 of the Sustainable Development Agenda, "Quality Education," has the utmost priority. Due to the efforts of these Pakistanis, all Pakistanis will have access to the same educational advancement opportunities. The leaders of the community have made substantial investments in modernizing classroom technology,

⁴¹ Ferrer-fstévez, m. &. (2021). integrating sustainable development goals In educational institutions. *the international journal Of management education*, 19(2), 100494.

employing novel pedagogical approaches, and expanding access to continuing education opportunities. The school district has made progress toward its goal of providing elementary and secondary education to all of its residents by placing a greater emphasis on increasing enrollment and decreasing attrition rates. This success was achieved to satisfy the district's objective. Children from low-income families, girls, and pupils with disabilities have all received special attention through the implementation of educational inclusion programs. Additionally, modifications have been made to the educational system so that it can better meet the needs of the regional economy. As part of the reform, new programs that provide students with marketable skills will be created for student participation. The formulation of public-private partnerships and the active participation of local residents have proven to be essential for the creation of an environment conducive to educational endeavors. Long-term socioeconomic and political development in Pakistan may be attributed to a district's educated and capable inhabitants.⁴²

4.4 International development programs and quality education at lower dir

The World Food Programme's (WFP) Girls Enrollment Enhancement Programme provides assistance to the District Directorate of the Department of Education and Literacy. They offer financial aid to the university's few female students. There must be more cooperation between these organizations in order to resolve education-related issues, particularly those pertinent to the education of females. Khwendo Kor (KK), a

⁴²Diemer, a. k. (2020). sdg 4 “quality education”, the cornerstone of the sdfs: case studies of pakistan and senegal. *journal of economics and development studies*, 9-32.

non-profit organization, launched a program titled "Promotion of Girls Education in Dir," with a focus on strengthening the VECs (Village Education Committees) that had been established around the Community-Based Girl Schools. PRAs, or Participatory Rural Appraisals, were conducted in a total of twenty-five communities. In addition, the District Dir encourages the formation of men's and women's organizations that concentrate on social activism, record-keeping, PRA, and financial management. By introducing a new initiative, KK is supporting the education of Dir's women.⁴³ Among other things, this project includes the Development of District Education Planning, the reactivation, strengthening, and capacity building of PTAs, the activation and strengthening of the EFA forum, the tracking of the educational budget, the establishment of the Education Facilitation Center, and the functionalization of middle and primary schools. KK will assist PTAs in obtaining district administration certification as community-based organizations (CCBs). This will enable PTAs to be considered for and awarded development funds from the district. The initiative will enhance the partnership between the public and private sectors in the field of education. Both the School and Literacy Department and KK have signed a Memorandum of Understanding (MOU) regarding these activities. In recent months, the Child Rights Committee (SPARC) for the Lower Dir region has also been concerned with the region's low literacy rate. The Children's Rights Coalition (CRC) is a SPARC affiliate whose members donate their time

⁴³ Khushik, f. &. (2020). education and sustainability, how Sdg4 contributes To change the representations Of developing issues? the case study Of pakistan. international journal Of management and sustainability,, 101-119.

to advocate for Lower Dir children. The CRC has initiated a campaign to end marriages between minors.⁴⁴

4.5. Dir lower before the implementation of Sdg4 in September 2015

Prior to the September 2015 implementation of Sustainable Development Goal 4 (SDG 4) in Dir Lower District, Pakistan, the quality of education faced a number of formidable challenges. The district's high retention rates and low enrollment numbers were exacerbated by the district's lack of resources, particularly qualified teachers. In many older institutions, students did not have access to a high-quality education because classrooms, lavatories, and other essential facilities were inadequate. In addition, the instructional methods and curriculum were obsolete; as a result, they were unable to meet the needs of students from diverse backgrounds and with differing levels of ability.

There is a prevalent gender disparity in formal education, with fewer girls than males enrolled in school. Cultural and societal standards have contributed to this disparity. As a consequence, gender inequality in the region was exacerbated, and young women were denied education opportunities. It was difficult to trace progress and identify problems as they arose in the absence of a comprehensive monitoring and evaluation system. As a result, the educational system in District Dir Lower was not equitable, it was not easily accessible, and it was of poor quality; it posed a significant barrier to the region's growth and development.⁴⁵

⁴⁴ Department, k. E. (2020-2024). *khyber pukhtunkhwa education sector plan*. peshawar: khyberpukhtunkhwa education department.

⁴⁵ Sajjad, m. m. (2022). spatial inequalities in education status and its determinants in pakistan: a district-level modeling in the context of sustainable development goal-4. *applied geography*, 140, 102665.

Adoption of Sustainable Development Goal 4, which aimed to ensure equitable access to a quality education for all, marked the beginning of an enduring shift in District Dir Lower's educational philosophy. To achieve this objective, it was necessary to establish a curriculum that was accessible to all, enhance the facilities, and offer opportunities for educators to continue their professional development. In order to bring them up to the requisite standard, it was necessary to construct new schools and enhance the existing ones. The improvement in classroom quality is attributable to the recruitment and training of qualified teachers who have had the chance to refine their instructional techniques. Due to the implementation of monitoring methods, the relevant authorities were able to identify issues and come to well-informed conclusions about how to address them. The future prospects of District Dir Lower's children have vastly improved as a result of these measures, which have led to increased enrollment, decreased failure rates, and improved educational outcomes over time.

4.6 Implementing sustainable development goal 4 Quality education at lower dir:

Without a doubt, District Dir Lower has embarked on the path to transformation as a direct consequence of the achievement of Sustainable Development Goal 4, which focuses on ensuring that high-quality education is accessible and equitable for all. On this path toward ensuring that everyone has access to a high-quality education, many significant consequences for local education, community development, and global sustainability have become evident.⁴⁶

⁴⁶Khushik, f. &. (2020). education and sustainability, how Sdg4 contributes To change the representations Of developing issues? the case study Of pakistan. international journal Of management And sustainability,, 101-119.

District Director Lower has embarked on a journey consistent with the fundamental principles of social justice and human rights, and he is doing so by consistently promoting accessibility, relevance, and inclusivity. Realizing Sustainable Development Goal 4 will have far-reaching effects that extend far beyond the classroom. By expanding access to educational opportunities, promoting gender equality, and enhancing digital literacy, the school district is preparing the next generation to confront the complex problems that will define the twenty-first century.

The possibility that education may serve as a driving force toward social and economic equality is an essential result of our work. When a greater proportion of the population has access to a high-quality education, both the increase in human capital and the subsequent improvement in living conditions are more readily apparent. A community's economy benefits in numerous ways from the presence of a well-informed and educated populace.⁴⁷

Moreover, Goal 4 of the Sustainable Development Agenda will result in substantial changes to the current educational status quo. The provision of an education that emphasizes receiving a well-rounded education, critical thinking, and problem-solving skills equips students with the tools they need to become influential members of their communities. District Director Lower is able to achieve both of his goals, global citizenship and cultural preservation, by incorporating information and perspectives from both the local and international levels.

On the other hand, these effects will not be devoid of complications. There may be obstacles in the form of resources, infrastructure, and cultural norms on the path to achieving the objective of providing a magnificent education. Governmental

⁴⁷ Khan, a. (2009). barriers to the political empowerment of women in dir lower.

organizations, civil society groups, educational institutions, parents, and international community members must collaborate in order to find viable solutions to these problems. To keep the orb rolling requires adaptable policies, new approaches to education, and a continuous pursuit of excellence.⁴⁸

The achievement of SDG 4 in District Dir Lower is advantageous for a variety of national and international causes. The district's actions should serve as a model for the rest of the world as it progresses toward a more equitable and environmentally responsible future. It is essential for politicians, researchers, and educators to examine this case study, as the lessons learned from District Dir Lower's voyage can be applied to other situations.

The significance of achieving SDG 4 in District Dir Lower exemplifies the power of education to utterly alter the outcome of a game. The municipality will be in a stronger position to plan for a future that is not only economically prosperous, but also socially just and culturally vibrant as access, quality, and inclusion continue to rise. District Dir Lower may be able to embody the true spirit of SDG 4 on a local level with global implications by applying the lessons learned from this endeavor and establishing a path toward sustainable development that includes everyone. This can be achieved by embracing these teachings. The implementation of Sustainable Development Goal 4 (SDG 4) at the district level in Dir Lower, Pakistan offers an extraordinary opportunity to enhance the quality of life for the residents of the region. In Pakistan's Dir Lower province, which is a part of Pakistan, achieving SDG 4's objective of providing a decent education that is also accessible to all individuals presents a unique set of challenges and opportunities. Dir Lower has the potential to pave the way for a more prosperous and

⁴⁸ Rafiq, s. a. (2022). exploring the problems in teacher evaluation process and its perceived impact on teacher performance. gomal university journal Of research,, 482-500..

sustainable future for the communities it services by giving top priority to locally led initiatives and innovative approaches.

4.7 Advantages of Implementing SDG4 in District Dir Lower after 2016:

In 2015, the world's chiefs of state and government convened at the United Nations to establish the 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development as a global plan to resolve urgent issues and improve the quality of life for all people, everywhere. Goal 4 (SDG4) of the 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development emphasizes that everyone should have access to a high-quality education. This objective is particularly imperative in District Dir Lower because there are so few educational opportunities. Since its implementation in 2016, Sustainable Development Goal 4 has brought the region a variety of benefits and facilitated significant progress. This article examines the numerous ways in which Sustainable Development Goal 4 (SDG4) has the potential to improve life beyond 2016.⁴⁹

4.7.1. Improved Access to Education:

Prior to the ratification of SDG4, it was unthinkable to offer District Dir Lower residents, particularly women and members of disadvantaged groups, access to a quality education. The adoption of SDG4 by local governments has resulted in the construction of new schools and the renovation of existing ones. As a direct result of the availability of more educational facilities, an increasing number of children, including an increasing number of females, have access to an education that may help them have a brighter future.

⁴⁹Khushik, f. &. (2020). education and sustainability, how sdg4 contributes to change the representations Of developing issues? the case study Of pakistan. international journal Of management and sustainability,, 101-119..

4.7.2. Gender Equality in Education:

It is widely acknowledged that educating and empowering women benefits society as a whole, which is why SDG4 prioritizes gender equality in the educational sector. Adoption of SDG4 in District Dir Lower has resulted in the abolition of long-standing cultural practices that previously prevented girls from receiving an education. This has made it possible for more women than ever before to pursue higher education, creating a more balanced and inclusive learning environment. This is advantageous for women and contributes to the transformation of societal views and norms regarding gender.

4.7.3. Enhanced Curriculum and Teaching Quality:

As a direct result of efforts made toward achieving SDG4, educational institutions now place a greater emphasis on their students' education. Because of this modification, we now have a more robust curriculum, more qualified instructors, and more effective teaching methods. Teachers are now in a better position to provide students with engaging and productive teachings due to the classroom's increased adaptability and interactivity. This demonstrates that not only is the education provided to students in District Dir Lower easily accessible, but it is also comprehensive and pertinent to the students' lives.

4.7.4. Community Engagement and Ownership:

The District Administrator As a direct result of SDG4, participation in educational activities has increased in disadvantaged communities. They have collaborated closely with educational institutions and governmental organizations to ensure the success of educational initiatives because they are well aware of the potentially life-altering impact education can have on their children's futures. Support networks, scholarship programs,

and mentoring opportunities that aid in the development of students have been made possible due to the strong sense of community.

3.7.5. Skills Development for Employability:

Goal 4 of the Sustainable Development Goals emphasizes not only the completion of formal education but also the imparting of valuable and marketable skills. The emphasis on skill development in District Dir Lower is influenced in part by the neighborhood's socioeconomic milieu. As a consequence of the integration of vocational training and technical education programs into the educational system, students now have access to a wider range of professional opportunities. In turn, this encourages students to be more entrepreneurial and reduces the number of unemployed students.

4.7.6. Promotion of Lifelong Learning:

Goal 4 of the Sustainable Development Agenda, which can be found here, emphasizes the significance of education beyond the elementary level. As a consequence of the implementation of SDG4, individuals in District Dir Lower have been encouraged to seek out opportunities to advance their education and increase their skill set. The proliferation of adult learning spaces and training programs has benefited the intellectual and professional development of individuals, along with their lives and the communities in which they reside..

4.7.7. Cultivation of Critical Thinking:

SDG4's emphasis on education has led to a shift in emphasis toward individualizing the curriculum for every student. Students in District Dir Lower are guided through a variety of activities designed to foster self-reflection, critical thinking, and innovative problem-solving. The shift away from exercises centered on rote memorization fosters critical

thinking and creativity, both of which are essential skills for solving the complex problems that currently plague our region and the world.

4.8. Challenges in Dir Lower:

Like many other districts in Pakistan, Dir Lower struggles tremendously to provide its children with an education of adequate quality. Insufficient funds, a lack of qualified teachers, discrimination based on race and gender, a lack of students, and inadequate educational accomplishments and outcomes are a few of these obstacles. Isolation of the neighborhood, social inequality, and cultural traditions all contribute to the deterioration of the circumstance. On the other hand, the desire to attain SDG 4 could result in revolutionary change.⁵⁰

Adapting Education to Diverse Cultures: Due to the immense cultural and linguistic diversity that exists in Dir Lower, the implemented educational program must be tailored to the needs of the students. It is impossible to develop a curriculum that is both specific and pertinent without the participation of community leaders, instructors, and tribal elders.

Improving the Capabilities of Our Educators: It is necessary to improve and expand the skill sets of educators. There is a possibility that Dir Lower will establish facilities for teacher education. These centers would enable the organization of seminars and the distribution of materials designed to help instructors become more proficient in the use of modern educational technologies.⁵¹

⁵⁰ Khan, a. (2009). barriers to the political empowerment of women in dir lower.

⁵¹ Dr naeem akhtar, (2022). challenges in implementing educatiocal policies in pakistan. *journal of positive school psychology*, 11.

Better educational opportunities will be available in Dir Lower as a consequence of infrastructure improvements that make this possible. Government agencies, non-governmental organizations (NGOs), and nonprofit organizations (NGOs) may be able to secure funding for infrastructure development projects through collaborative efforts.

The participation of parents, other community leaders, and other local stakeholders is required. We can increase school attendance and create a more pleasurable learning environment, particularly for young women, by taking action at the local level. This is something that can be attained through action.

Education for women and the integration of children with special needs must be given the highest priority in terms of availability. Existing gender access disparities may be able to be reduced with the assistance of legislation promoting inclusivity, financial aid opportunities, and alternative modes of transportation.

Due to its remote location, Dir Lower urgently requires innovative digital education services. It is now possible to provide access to a quality education in even the most inaccessible regions, thanks to online learning platforms, digital resources, and virtual classrooms.⁵²

4.8.1 Local Leadership and Collaboration:

Due in significant part to the efforts of the district administration, SDG 4 is progressing toward completion. It is possible to adopt a unified plan by first establishing district-specific objectives and then ensuring that local education policies are consistent with the national education framework.

⁵² Rafiq, s. a. (2022). exploring the problems In teacher evaluation process and its perceived impact on teacher performance. gomal university journal Of research,, 482-500.

Organizations that Operate in the Public Interest: Non-governmental organizations (NGOs) and CBOs, also known as community-based organizations, are essential for the achievement of Sustainable Development Goal 4. They are able to garner support, engage locals, and provide in-depth knowledge of the situation on the ground.

The advancement of initiatives in the fields of technology, vocational education, and physical infrastructure could be facilitated by collaborating with representatives from the private sector.⁵³

4.9. Hurdles? Challenges to implement SDG4 at district Dir lower.

Although it is commendable that efforts are being made to implement Sustainable Development Goal 4 (SDG 4) in Dir Lower, Pakistan, there are likely to be numerous obstacles in the way. For the successful implementation of inclusive and high-quality education for all pupils, it is essential to overcome the obstacles presented by the unique socioeconomic, cultural, and geographical environment of the school district. After examining the obstacles to achieving SDG 4 in Dir Lower in greater detail, it has become abundantly evident that a unified effort that considers all aspects of the problem is essential for success.

1. Limited Infrastructure and Facilities: There is a scarcity of well-resourced educational institutions in Dir Lower. Many institutions lack space for classrooms, libraries, laboratories, and even the most fundamental sanitary facilities. When children are lodged in substandard conditions, their capacity to learn and develop as a whole is hampered.

⁵³ Farah latif nazl*, abdul raheem, waqar ahman, fazl ur hman, faridullah khan. (2021). Implementing sdg4 in pakistan, a qualitative and quantitative analysis of opinions of tenured faculty members of the universities. *humanities and social sciences review*, 08.

2. Remote Geography and Accessibility: Dir Lower's schools and institutions are difficult to reach due to the area's rugged terrain and remote location. Numerous communities are located in inaccessible regions, making travel to them difficult at all times of the year, but particularly during severe weather. It is difficult for students to adhere to a conventional school schedule and maintain their academic performance due to the area's remote location..

3. Socio-Cultural Norms and Gender Disparities: In the deeply entrenched social traditions of Dir Lower, traditional gender roles are frequently emphasized, resulting in significant disparities between the educational opportunities available to males and females. It is common for societal norms regarding the roles that females should perform to discourage girls from pursuing an education. To achieve Sustainable Development Goal 4, it is essential to modify these practices and implement gender-sensitive policies..

4. Poverty and Economic Factors: As a consequence of the region's extreme poverty and unstable economic climate, families in Dir Lower may choose to prioritize meeting their most urgent material requirements over sending their children to school. If children are expected to contribute financially to their families, their ability to attend school may be compromised and their educational opportunities may be restricted.

5. Teacher Shortages and Quality: The dire dearth of qualified and enthusiastic educators in Dir Lower calls for prompt action to be taken to remedy the situation. The quality of education will decrease if there are many schools but not enough qualified instructors to staff them. Some instructors may not have had enough training in modern

teaching methodologies and instruments, which may also contribute to a decline in the overall quality of education.⁵⁴

6. Lack of Access to Technology: In this era of online education, the reality that a large portion of Dir Lower lacks access to computers and the internet is a major obstacle to success. Due to the scarcity of digital resources and online learning platforms, it is difficult to develop novel and engaging academic opportunities..

7. Security Concerns: Due to its proximity to other violent regions of Pakistan, Dir Lower, like many other locations in Pakistan, has experienced security problems. It is possible that students' safety concerns will have a negative impact on school attendance and operations..

8. Limited Resources and Funding: Due to a lack of resources, it may be difficult for school districts to implement effective programs. It may be challenging to obtain the necessary funds to invest in essential infrastructure, necessary teacher training, and essential instructional materials..

9. Lack of Data and Monitoring Mechanisms: For the achievement of Sustainable Development Goal 4 (SDG 4), it is necessary to maintain accurate and current statistics on progress. However, comprehensive statistics on enrollment, attendance, and the outcomes of students' education in Dir Lower are frequently lacking. Without reliable data, it is challenging to track progress and make decisions that adhere to best practices.

Possible Distinctions Between Culture and Language The residents of Dir Lower come from a wide variety of cultural and linguistic contexts and speak a large number of

⁵⁴ Rafiq, s. a. (2022). exploring the problems In teacher evaluation process and its perceived impact On teacher performance. gomal university journal Of research,, 482-500.

languages. It may be difficult to design a curriculum that takes into account all of this variation while also meeting the government-mandated minimum standards..

11. **Limited Community Awareness:** It is crucial to dispel the prevalent misunderstandings about the significance of education. It is conceivable that many households do not fully comprehend the importance of education and why it is essential to send their children, particularly their females, to school.

Chapter 05

5.1. Conclusion:

The adoption of SDG4 by District Dir Lower after 2016 was a game-changer. It brought with it a multitude of advantages that are altering the educational landscape there and beyond. These benefits are altering the educational landscape worldwide. As a consequence of more people, especially historically disadvantaged groups and women, having access to high-quality education, society is becoming more egalitarian and autonomous. Education that emphasizes the development of skills and learning throughout a person's career contributes to the growth of the economy by enabling individuals to better fulfill the requirements of a constantly changing job market. Students who have received instruction in critical thinking are better equipped to contribute to the development of their local and national communities. As progress continues toward the fourth Sustainable Development Goal (SDG4), the example of District Dir Lower demonstrates the advantages of making high-quality education a top priority on the path to sustainable development. The adoption of a Strategic Development Goal (SDG) with the primary objective of increasing access to higher-quality education has had a profoundly positive impact in Dir Lower. The educational environment in the region has considerably improved due to the concerted efforts of a large number of stakeholders, including government agencies, academic institutions, community organizations, and international collaborators. Due to the numerous impediments in the region of Dir Lower, SDG 4 is extremely difficult to achieve. These obstacles, however, are not insurmountable and can be surmounted. With the assistance of coordinated efforts by local communities, government agencies, non-governmental

organizations, and international partners, Dir Lower will be able to surmount these obstacles and ensure that all of its citizens have access to the highest quality of education. If Dir Lower is ever to be developed into a prosperous and equitable community, it is imperative that an education system that is both inclusive and of high quality be implemented.

Due to strategic resource allocation, inventive instructional practices, and increased online collaboration among instructors and other education professionals, the quality of education has significantly increased. Graduation rates, standardized test scores, and other measures of student achievement have all increased in recent years, demonstrating the effectiveness of these programs. Other measures of student achievement have also demonstrated upward trends.

The incorporation of technology into the classroom has improved instruction and learning by making educational activities more engaging and encouraging student participation. As a result of this strategy, students have been provided with digital skills that are increasingly important in today's fast-paced world. This strategy has also served to close the divide between students from various locations and socioeconomic circumstances.

As a result of efforts made to achieve the Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs), both community engagement and education-related knowledge increased. There is a growing academic culture because parents, instructors, and other influential members of the community are all involved in the education of their children. This increased emphasis on education has led to an increase in enrollment and a decrease in attrition rates, both of which have contributed to the establishment of a foundation for long-term, sustainable development.

Despite the fact that progress has been made, it is imperative to recognize that problems remain, most notably ensuring that all individuals have access to a high-quality education. It will be necessary to address issues such as gender disparity, infrastructure constraints, and the education of instructors in order to maintain and expand the current level of success.

In conclusion, Dir Lower's achievement of the SDG for quality education serves as an example for others. In the context of institutionalized education, the accomplishment of this mission is evidence of the transformative potential of collaborative effort and strategic planning. As these initiatives expand, the region will be able to provide its children with the education and guidance they require to become productive members of society, thereby creating a brighter and more prosperous future for all..

5.2. Recommendations for achieving Sustainable Development Goal 4 (SDG 4) of ensuring quality education in Dir Lower:

Equitable Access:

Make it a top priority to ensure that education is available to all individuals, regardless of their gender, their upbringing, or the region of the world in which they reside. Construct facilities to be used as classrooms and, if necessary, make transportation provisions to reach out to more remote and disadvantaged communities..

Teacher Training and Development: Invest in instructors' ongoing professional development. Modern teaching methodologies, student engagement strategies, and technology integration should be the focus of training programs.

Curriculum Development: Review and revise the curriculum frequently to make it more pertinent, engaging, and in line with real-world challenges. Introduce practical skills such

as critical thinking, problem-solving, digital literacy, and interpersonal skills in order to prepare students for the ever-changing job market..

Community Engagement: Encouragement should be provided in the areas of familial involvement, civic leadership, and community group participation. Promote parent-teacher associations, seminars, and other events to strengthen school-community ties.

Using Emerging Technologies and Programs Enhance the learning process by integrating technology in novel ways. Donate technological resources, such as computers, iPads, and internet connections, to educational institutions. Develop online teaching and learning resources that students can access from anywhere and use to advance their education..

Inclusive Education: Create a classroom environment that is welcoming to students of all educational levels and those with special needs. Prioritize providing every child with the resources, guidance, and support necessary for academic success in school.

Assessment and Monitoring: Construct reliable methods that can assess not only the progress of students but also the performance of teachers. Regular assessments can aid in identifying areas for development and instilling a sense of personal accountability for meeting or exceeding educational standards.

Opportunities in Education for Women: Pay close attention to eliminating the gender disparity in education. The number of young women who enroll in secondary education and graduate should be increased by eliminating cultural barriers and enhancing classroom safety..

Infrastructure Development: Invest in the construction of educational facilities such as lecture halls, libraries, laboratories, and lavatories. When classroom environments are optimal, students' learning experiences are enhanced.

Collaborations and Other Forms of Financial Support: Collaborate with local, state, national, and international institutions to generate funds and collect resources for educational endeavors. The knowledge, access to resources, and assistance obtained through such partnerships are priceless.

Vocational and Technical Training: Commence the provision of vocational and technical institutions that are tailored to meet the needs of the local economy. It is conceivable that this will increase the employability of students as well as the regional economy.

Create instructional materials and strategies that respect and incorporate the cultural traditions of the students' communities. The concept that what they are learning is pertinent to their daily lives has the potential to captivate the learners' interest.

Early Childhood Education: It is impossible to overstate the value of a lead start in education. The formulation of early childhood institutions must position the intellectual, social, and emotional development of children among their highest priorities.

Exploration and inventiveness: Encourage both scholarly research and innovative methods. Innovative teaching strategies, resources, and approaches that have the potential to raise educational standards should be the subject of funded research..

Sustainability Planning: Develop a comprehensive and long-term plan to ensure that the current level of educational progress is maintained. Several factors must be considered, including sustainability, capacity-building, and ongoing community participation.

By implementing these recommendations, Dir Lower will be able to move closer to achieving SDG 4 and guaranteeing that its citizens have access to a high-quality education that not only prepares them but also provides them with opportunities.

Bibliography

Books

- Anastasia Nikolopoulou, F. M. (2010). *Education for Sustainable Development. Challenges, Strategies and Practices in a Globalizing World*. India: SAGE Publications.
- Antoni Verger, K. M. (2013). *Education and the Sustainable Development Goals: Towards A Global Common Good*. London: Edward Elgar Publishing.
- Lawn, A. V. (2009). *Quality Education: The Pathway to Sustainable Development*. Massachusetts: Brill.
- Mahmood, S. B. (2016). *Promoting Education, Inclusion, and Quality: The Case of Sindh Province In Pakistan*. Karachi: Qirtas.
- Saleh., M. S. (2014). *Education and Sustainable Development in Asia*. New York: Springer.

Journals

- Pakistan's Implementation Of the 2030 Agenda For Sustainable Development. (2019). *Voluntary National Review*, 81.
- Arnaud Diemer. Faheem Khushik. Abdourakhmane Ndiaye3. (March 2020). SDG 4 "Quality Education", The Cornerstone Of The Sdgs: Case Studies Of Pakistan And Senegal. *Journal Of Economic Development Studies*, 24.
- Chapman, A. &. (2018). Developing National Frameworks For Inclusive Sustainable Development Incorporating Lifestyle Factor Importance. *Journal Of Cleaner Production*,, 39-47.

- Diemer, A. K. (2020). SDG 4 “Quality Education”, The Cornerstone Of The Sdgs: Case Studies Of Pakistan And Senegal. *Journal Of Economics And Development Studies*, 9-32.
- Dr Naeem Akhtar, Syed Tanveer, Farhan Ali Khaskheli, Nisar Ahmad Khaskheli. (2022). Challenges In Impleneting Educatiocal Policies In Pakistan. *Jornal Of Positive School Psychology*, 11.
- Farah Latif Nazl*, Abdul Raheem, Waqar Ahman, Fazl Ur Hman, Faridullah Khan. (2021). Implementing SDG4 In Pakistan, A Qualitataive And Quantitative Analysis Of Opinions Of Tenured Faculty Members Of The Univrsities. *Humanities And Social Sciences Review*, 08.
- Ferrer-Estévez, M. &. (2021). Integrating Sustainable Development Goals In Educational Institutions. *The International Journal Of Management Education*, 19(2), 100494.
- Hák, T. J. (2016). Sustainable Development Goals: A Need For Relevant Indicators. . *Ecological Indicators*, 565-573.
- Jamal, H. (. (2018). Proposed National Indicator Framework For SDG 4: The Case Of Pakistan.
- Khan, P. A. (2022). Open Innovation Of Institutional Investors And Higher Education System In Creating Open Approach For SDG-4 Quality Education: A Conceptual Review. *Journal Of Open Innovation: Technology, Market, And Complexity*, 8(1), 49.

- Khushik, F. &. (2020). Education And Sustainability, How Sdg4 Contributes To Change The Representations Of Developing Issues? The Case Study Of Pakistan. *International Journal Of Management And Sustainability*,, 101-119.
- Morton, S. P. (2017). Sustainable Development Goals (Sdgs), And Their Implementation: A National Global Framework For Health, Development And Equity Needs A Systems Approach At Every Level. *British Medical Bulletin*, , 81-90.
- Muhammd Sajjad, Shamsa Kawal, Syed Ali Naqvi, Hasiba Munir. (2022). Spatial Inequalities In Education Status And Its Determinants In Pakistan: A District-Level Modelling In The Context Of Sustainable Development Goal-4. *Elsevier*, 13.
- Mustafa, G. (2012). Education Policy Analysis Report Of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa. *United Nations Educational, Scientific And Cultural Organisation*.
- Pakistan, G. O. (2019). Pakistan's Implementation Of The 2030 Agenda For Sustainable Development: Voluntary National Review. *SDG Section, Ministry Of Planning, Development And Reforms*.
- Rafiq, S. &. (2021). Teachers Perception About Process Of Teacher Evaluation: A Case Study Of A Private University Of Lahore. *Gomal University Journal Of Research*,, 350-362.
- Rafiq, S. A. (2022). Exploring The Problems In Teacher Evaluation Process And Its Perceived Impact On Teacher Performance. *Gomal University Journal Of Research*,, 482-500.

- Rangel-Pérez, C. G.-B.-N.-A. (2021). The Massive Implementation Of ICT In Universities And Its Implications For Ensuring SDG 4: Challenges And Difficulties For Professors. *Sustainability*, 13(22), 12871.
- Sajjad, M. M. (2022). Spatial Inequalities In Education Status And Its Determinants In Pakistan: A District-Level Modelling In The Context Of Sustainable Development Goal-4. *Applied Geography*.
- Sajjad, M. M. (2022). Spatial Inequalities In Education Status And Its Determinants In Pakistan: A District-Level Modelling In The Context Of Sustainable Development Goal-4. *Applied Geography*, 140, 102665.
- Shah, G. A. (2013). Administration Of Dir Under Nawab Shah Jehan. *Pak Ann Res J.*, *Pak Ann Res J.*, 121-138.
- Sharif, S. (2022). Financing Of CPEC Projects: Implications for Pakistan. *Journal Of Public Policy Practitioners.*, 99-133.
- Tatto, M. T. (2021). Comparative Research On Teachers And Teacher Education: Global Perspectives to Inform UNESCO's SDG 4 Agenda. *Oxford Review of Education*, 47(1), 25-44.
- Unterhalter, E. (2019). The Many Meanings of Quality Education: Politics of Targets And Indicators In SDG 4. *Global Policy*, 10, 39-51.

Reports

- Barrett, A. M. (2009). Tag: Education and Sustainable Development.
- Collaborative, A. S. (2020). Quality Education: Asec's Impact.
- Department, K. E. (2020-2024). *Hkyber Pukhtunkhwa Education Sector Plan*. Peshawar: Khyberpukhtunkhwa Education Department.

- Khan, A. (2009). Barriers to the Political Empowerment of Women in Dir Lower.
- Qaimkhani, A. M. (2018). The Marine Litter Action Plan-Status Report (Pakistan). *Government of Pakistan: Islamabad, Pakistan*, 36.
- Saleem, D. S. (23 July 2022). CPEC and Attainment of SDG4 in Pakistan. *Express Tribune*, 01.