

**PAKISTAN FOREIGN POLICY SHIFT FROM GEO-  
POLITICS TO GEO-ECONOMICS**



**Supervised By: Doctor Saeed Rid**

**Submitted By: Sharif Ullah Khan**

**NATIONAL INSTITUTE OF PAKISTAN STUDIES  
QUAID-I-AZAM, UNIVERSITY,  
ISLAMABAD**

**2024**

## **Plagiarism Undertaking**

I, Sharifullah, solemnly declare that the present research work presented in thesis format entitled “Pakistan Foreign Policy Shift from Geo-Politics to Geo-Economics” is my research work with no major contribution from any other person. However, small contributions or help taken during the study have been dually acknowledged, and I have personally written the thesis.

I understand the zero-tolerance policy of the Higher Education Commission and Quaid-e-Azam University towards plagiarism. Therefore, as an author of the present thesis, I also declare that no portion of it has been plagiarized. All the sources have been cited properly.

I dually understand that if I am found guilty of any formal plagiarism in the above-titled thesis even after the award of my M. Phil degree, in that case, HEC and the Quaid-e-Azam reserve the right to revoke/withdraw my degree. I also understand that in case of plagiarism, HEC, and the university have the right to publish my name on the HEC/University website among the names of those students who have submitted plagiarized theses.

## **Author's Declaration**

I, Sharif Ullah, hereby declare that my M. Phil's thesis titled 'Pakistan Foreign Policy Shift from Geopolitics to Geo-Economics' is my work. I have not submitted it previously for taking my degree from Quaid-i-Azam University or anywhere else in the country/world.

If my statement has been found incorrect/misleading at any time, even after the completion of my graduation, the University has the right to cancel/withdraw my M. Phil degree.



Sharif Ullah Khan

NATIONAL INSTITUTE OF PAKISTAN STUDIES  
QUAID-I-AZAM UNIVERSITY  
ISLAMABAD

CERTIFICATE

I hereby recommend that the thesis prepared under my supervision by

MR. SHARIF ULLAH KHAN entitled:

“PAKISTAN FOREIGN POLICY SHIFT FROM GEO-POLITICS  
TO GEO-ECONOMICS”

is accepted in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the degree  
of Masters of Philosophy in Pakistan Studies.

  
DR. SAEED AHMED RID  
SUPERVISOR

**NATIONAL INSTITUTE OF PAKISTAN STUDIES  
QUAID-I-AZAM UNIVERSITY  
ISLAMABAD**

**CERTIFICATE**

This dissertation submitted by **MR. SHARIF ULLAH KHAN** entitled:

**“PAKISTAN FOREIGN POLICY SHIFT FROM GEO-POLITICS  
TO GEO-ECONOMICS”**

is accepted in this present form by National Institute of Pakistan Studies,  
Quaid-i-Azam University, Islamabad for the Degree of Master of Philosophy  
in Pakistan Studies.

**SUPERVISOR:** \_\_\_\_\_




Dr. Saeed Ahmed Rid

**EXTERNAL EXAMINER:** \_\_\_\_\_



Dr. Noor Fatima

**DIRECTOR:** \_\_\_\_\_



Dr. Muhammad Hanif Khalil

## **Dedication**

"In heartfelt gratitude, I dedicate my M.Phil. thesis to my unwavering pillars of support – my parents, whose boundless encouragement and sacrifices have shaped my journey, and my brother, whose unwavering belief in my abilities has been a constant source of inspiration. This achievement is as much yours as it is mine."

## ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

Writing a thesis has always been a task requiring time and the support of people and institutions. Therefore, after completion of this cherished task, it is always a matter of pleasure to acknowledge those people and institutions who have provided support during the process.

First of all, I am very much thankful to the National Institute of Pakistan Studies which provided this great opportunity to learn. I am also thankful to my supervisor Dr. Saeed Ahmad Rid for his continued support and encouragement throughout my studies. He has always helped me in solving the theoretical as well as methodological ambiguities in the present research project. His guidance and support helped me a lot in improving the quality of my research project.

I am also thankful to my university fellows especially, Shah Sawar Khan and Tousif Ullah Marwat for providing me with support and encouragement during the writing of the present thesis. I am thankful to the administrative staff members of the National Institute of Pakistan Studies, particularly to Mr. Zahid Bakhtiar Khattak and Mr. Irfan Ullah Khan.

Last but not least, I am thankful to my family members who have always been a source of inspiration for my studies. I am also thankful to my parents. Special thanks to my brothers Fatih Ullah Khan, Hayat Ullah Khan, and Arshad Ullah Khan, as they provided me with guidance and encouraged me to pursue higher studies.

## **List of Abbreviations:**

SEATO: Southeast Asian Treaty organization

CENTO: Central Treaty Organization

CEPC: China-Pakistan Economic Corridor

FDI: Foreign Direct Investment

ETIM: East Turkestan Islamic Movement

GDP: Gross Domestic Product

PPP: Purchasing Power Parity

ASEAN: Association for Southeast Asian Nations

RCEP: Regional Comprehensive Economic Partnership

SEZs: Special Economic Zones

APT: ASEAN Plus Three

ASEAN: Association for Southeast Asian Nations

AEC: ASEAN Economic Community

AFTA: ASEAN Free Trade Area

SAARC: South Asian Association for Regional Cooperation

APEC: Asia Pacific Cooperation

TSMC: Taiwan Semiconductor and Electronic Manufacturing

BRI: Belt and Road Initiative

OIC: Organization of Islamic countries



PPP: Pakistan People’s Party

TTP: Tehreek-e-Taliban Pakistan

SCO: Shanghai Cooperation Organization

PTI: Pakistan Tehreek-e-Insaaf

TIFA: Trade and Investment Framework Agreement

PTA: Preferential Trade Agreement

ECO: Economic Cooperation Organization

NLC: National Logistic Cell

IMF: International Monetary Fund

WB: World Bank

Conference of Parties: CoP

NSP: National Security Policy

WTO: World Trade Organization

BIMSTEC: The Bay of Bengal Initiative for Multi-Sectoral Technical and Economic Cooperation

FATF: Financial Action Task Force

RAW: Research and Analysis Wing

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

<b>ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS .....</b>	<b>iv</b>
<b>ABSTRACT.....</b>	<b>xi</b>
<b>CHAPTER:1.....</b>	<b>1</b>
1. Introduction.....	1
1.2 Statement of the Problem.....	3
1.3 Theoretical Perspective.....	4
1.3.1 Realism and Geopolitics .....	7
1.3.2. Geo-economics .....	8
1.3.3. Traditional and Non-Traditional Security Paradigms.....	9
1.3.4. Human Security Paradigm .....	10
1.3.5. Theoretical Application .....	11
1.4.1 Literature on Realism.....	12
1.4.2 Literature on Liberalism .....	12
1.4.3 Literature on Constructivism .....	12
1.4.4. Literature on Humanitarianism .....	13
1.5. Literature Relevant to Pakistan’s Foreign Policy .....	14
1.5.1. Realism and Geopolitics .....	14
1.5.3 Indian Threat and Regional Conflicts .....	17
1.5.4 Geo-Economics and Humanitarian Perspective.....	18
1.5.5 Contribution of Current Study to Available Literature.....	20
1.6. Research Questions .....	21
1.6.1. Main Research Question .....	21
1.6.2 Supplementary Research Questions.....	21
1.7. Research Methodology .....	22

1.7.1. Data Collection: .....	22
1.7.2. Primary Source.....	23
1.8. Aims and Objectives of the Research.....	23
1.9 Scope and Significance of the Study/Benefits of the Present Study.....	24
1.10 Organization of Study .....	26
<b>CHAPTER 2.....</b>	<b>29</b>
<b>TRADITIONAL AND NON-TRADITIONAL SECURITY PARADIGM IN FOREIGN POLICY OF ASIA: A THEORETICAL DEBATE.....</b>	<b>29</b>
2.1. Introduction .....	29
2.2. Traditional Security Paradigm in Foreign Policy of Asia .....	32
2.3. Non-Traditional Security Paradigms in Foreign Policy of Asia .....	34
2.4. Determinants of Non-Traditional Security Paradigm and Economic Rise of Asia .....	34
2.4.1. Demographic Dividend .....	35
2.4.2 Market Reforms and Liberalization .....	37
2.4.3 Government Policies and Reforms.....	40
2.4.4 Regional Integration .....	42
2.4.5 Technological Advancement and Innovation.....	45
2.4.6 Foreign Direct Investment (FDI).....	47
2.5. Impacts of Non-Traditional Security Paradigm .....	50
Conclusion .....	55
<b>CHAPTER 3.....</b>	<b>57</b>
<b>TRADITIONAL SECURITY PARADIGM IN PAKISTAN’S FOREIGN POLICY: HISTORICAL ANALYSIS.....</b>	<b>57</b>
3.1. Introduction .....	57
3.2. Quaid-e-Azam Muhammad Ali Jinnah’s View about Pakistan’s Foreign Policy.... .....	59
3.3. Determinants of Pakistan’s Traditional Foreign Policy .....	61

3.3.1 Geostrategic Location: .....	62
3.3.2. Security Concerns.....	63
3.3.3 Strategic Alliances.....	64
3.3.4. Building Nuclear Deterrence.....	67
3.3.5 Internal Security Challenges .....	69
3.3.7 Regional Stability and Concerns of Pakistan .....	72
3.3.8 Economic Security and Non-Alignment: Pak-China Relationship.....	73
Conclusion .....	74
<b>CHAPTER 4.....</b>	<b>75</b>
<b>SHIFTING STRATEGIC DYNAMICS FROM GEOPOLITICS TO GEO-</b>	
<b>ECONOMICS .....</b>	<b>75</b>
4.1. Introduction.....	75
4.2. Strategic Dynamics of Foreign Policy.....	77
4.3. Analysing Shift in Strategic Dynamics from Geo-Politics to Geo-Economics.	79
4.3.1 Agreements of Trade and Finding Opportunities of Investment.....	79
4.3.2 Regional Connectivity .....	81
4.3.3. Connectivity with Global Economic Institutions .....	84
3.3.4. Resolving Conflicts through Economic Cooperation.....	85
4.3.5. Focusing Sustainability of Environment .....	86
4.3.6. Preference to Technology and Innovation.....	88
3.3.7. Islamabad Security Dialogue and Foreign Policy of Pakistan .....	89
3.3.8. Convergence of Geo-Economics vs Geopolitics in Pakistan’s Foreign Policy.	91
Conclusion .....	92
<b>CHAPTER:5.....</b>	<b>94</b>
<b>FROM GEOPOLITICS TO GEO-ECONOMICS: PROSPECTS AND</b>	
<b>CHALLENGES.....</b>	<b>94</b>
5.1 Introduction .....	94
5.2. Prospects of Pakistan Foreign Policy Based on Geo-economics.....	95

5.2.1 Economic Diplomacy through Geo-Economics .....	95
5.2.2 Expansion and Diversification of Trade .....	96
5.2.3. Energy security and investment Promotion .....	98
5.2.4. Balancing the trade: .....	100
5.2.5. Managing Terrorism and Extremism: .....	101
5.3 Domestic challenges: .....	103
5.3.1 Role of Military establishment: .....	103
5.3.2 Economic woes of Pakistan: .....	105
5.3.3 Crisis of Governance.....	106
5.4 External Challenges: .....	107
5.4.1 India .....	107
5.4.2 Afghanistan: .....	109
5.4.3 Saudi-Iran Proxy Wars:.....	111
<b>Conclusions.....</b>	<b>113</b>
<b>CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATIONS.....</b>	<b>119</b>
<b>Recommendations .....</b>	<b>114</b>
<b>REFERENCE .....</b>	<b>125</b>

## **ABSTRACT**

The present study investigates the foreign policy shift of Pakistan from geopolitics to geo-economics. Under the principles of realism and due to various security concerns from regional and international perspectives, the Foreign Policy of Pakistan has been shaped by its geopolitics since its inception. However, in the past few years, Pakistan has started seriously thinking about bringing some sort of modification to its traditional security-dominated approach to foreign policy. In this regard, Pakistan has provided space for geo-economic dynamics in its foreign policy. However, after investigation, the present thesis finds that a complete shift has not occurred, and still traditional security paradigm still dominates the foreign policy of Pakistan. The present study seems significant as it investigates not only the genesis of Pakistan's foreign policy but rather it highlights the challenges and prospects for Pakistan if it completely moves towards a shift from geopolitics to geo-economics. The study is also significant because the shift of Pakistan from geopolitics to geo-economics can lead to overall national development in the long run. As the present research is qualitative in nature, therefore, non-numerical data has been analyzed to understand concepts, opinions, and experiences. Although, primary sources have been cited the research mostly relies on secondary sources.

**Key Words:** Foreign Policy, Realism, Traditional Security, Non- Traditional Security, Human Security

## CHAPTER:1

### 1. Introduction

The shift of Pakistan's foreign policy from geopolitics to geo-economics is a vital subject that needs academic investigation. The foreign policy of Pakistan has mostly been influenced by geopolitics because of its geostrategic location in the region of South Asia. It is surrounded by India from the East, Afghanistan, and Iran in the West, China to its North, and the Arabian Sea to its South. According to Soherwardi (2020), The above strategic position of Pakistan had profound impacts on its foreign policy throughout its history since its independence. More importantly, the above strategic location, immediately after independence, led Pakistan towards building a foreign policy shaped by security concerns. Javaid (2020). argues that the inherited borders at the time of independence compelled it to structure its foreign policy deeply influenced and shaped by security dynamics.

According to the available literature, Pakistan adopted the approach of realism while formulating its foreign policy in its early decades. According to Ahmed (2010), Pakistan acted upon the principles of realism, focused on the interests of the state, and gave preferences to its security concerns and challenges in the region. Ahmed argues that there had been the factor of fear from the dominant neighbouring states in the form of India and insecurity from the side of Afghanistan and even Iran. Ali and Ahmed (2019), Pakistan's unfriendly relationship with India, its war with India over the issue of Kashmir, insecurity from the side of Afghanistan and Iran, and internal ethnic division and diffusion of inter and intra-ethnic clashes compelled Pakistan to build its foreign policy with countries which could enhance its defense and security capabilities. Leading Pakistani academicians argue that initial agreements of Pakistan with Western allies in the form of South East Asian Treaty Organization (SEATO)

and Central Treaty Organization (CENTO) are the result of the geopolitical dimension of Pakistan's foreign policy Jabeen (2011), Pakistan signed these agreements under the dynamics of realistic principles of foreign policy and with the intension to make itself capable in terms of its security Vis a Vis India, Iran and Afghanistan.

The above pattern and principles articulated by geopolitics have been followed by Pakistan throughout its history. However, recent developments in the region in the form of focusing on economic development and different internal compulsions of Pakistan particularly after the last military regime in 2007 compelled the state of Pakistan to shift its foreign policy from geopolitics to geo-economics. However, the initiative to achieve economic growth and sustainable development became more evident during PML (N) last government from 2013 to 2018 with the signing of different trade agreements with regional players. Similarly, to Tarin (2022), after coming into power, the PTI government adopted an 'inclusive growth' strategy. According to Tareen, the strategy was focused on labour-intensive construction, export industry, SMEs, tourism, and agriculture which proved to be a tremendous shift for Pakistan in terms of its economic preferences.

While commenting on the shift of Pakistan's foreign policy from geopolitics to geo-economics, Burki (2018) contends that economic challenges, global economic trends, the China-Pakistan Economic Corridor (CPEC), and Regional dynamics crucial elements while analyzing the shift in the foreign policy of Pakistan from geopolitics to geo-economics. Similarly, Hussain (2018) thinks that analyzing how these elements impact the balance of the region's power and how it interacts with the objectives of other nations like the USA and India is necessary for understanding its geopolitical ramifications. Pakistan's economic concerns, such as an expanding trade imbalance, growing poverty, and a large debt burden, have prompted the government



to prioritize financial development and growth. As a result, the government has worked to build financial relationships with other nations to improve trade, investment, and market access.

With the rise of developing nations and the growing significance of economic collaboration and integration, the international economy has transformed in recent years. Pakistan has recognized the significance of these trends and has attempted to position itself as a regional economic integration centre. The shifting dynamics of the area, especially China's expanding influence, and China-India competition, have additionally had an integral part in Pakistan's transition towards geo-economics. Malik (2019) thinks that Pakistan has attempted to improve commercial connections with China as well as other nations in the region by leveraging its advantageous geographical position and natural resources. Construction, power, and transport expenditures made as part are anticipated to drastically alter the Pakistani economy. Analyzing the possible advantages and disadvantages of the initiative, in addition to how it connects to wider economic patterns in the area and worldwide, is necessary when examining the financial implications.

Looking at the above facts regarding Pakistan's foreign policy, it seems pertinent to investigate the nature and dynamics involved in the foreign policy shift of Pakistan and to answer the questions of how this shift occurred, what importance this shift carries, and how it will affect the economic profile of Pakistan in general and the lives of people in particular?

## **1.2 Statement of the Problem**

Pakistan's foreign policy has been shaped by geopolitical variables since its inception. Pakistan has signed different international security and military agreements to achieve defense and security capabilities. However, since a decade ago, the foreign

policy of Pakistan has shifted significantly from an emphasis on geopolitics to a concentration on geo-economics. A variety of financial, political, and strategic variables have contributed to this transition, including Pakistan's mounting economic woes, shifting worldwide financial patterns, and changing regional trends. While the transition to geo-economics indicates an awareness of the significance of economic expansion and growth in tackling Pakistan's acute economic issues, it has also prompted concerns about the consequences for Pakistan's strategic partnerships and regional security. Some observers are concerned about Pakistan's rising economic reliance on China, as well as the potential hazards and problems involved therewith. Others wondered about the effect of the geo-economics change on Pakistan's conventional strategic alliances, such as its relationship with the US and its position in the region's security factors. The transition to geo-economics reflects a substantial shift in Pakistan's international relations direction, raising significant issues about the nation's long-term financial and geopolitical destiny.

The above change in strategy from geopolitics to geo-economics in the foreign policy of Pakistan needs investigation through the lens of research-oriented study. The question that why this shift occurred and what impacts would it have on the future course of Pakistan's foreign policy and national development in a larger context shall be addressed through the present study. No doubt, the role and response of traditional powerful allies of Pakistan in the form of the USA will be highlighted in the course of conducting the present research project.

### **1.3 Theoretical Perspective**

Theory refers to a supposition or a system of ideas that provides a roadmap for a researcher to explain something. It also refers to a set of ideas which are tested and verified. In research, theory helps a researcher in explaining a particular phenomenon

and ultimately reaching a plausible conclusion. Theory keeps a researcher on track while reaching facts and conclusions. On similar grounds, a theoretical framework has been adopted in this study to keep the research on track and to test the theory to see whether it was applicable here or not. The research also aims to see that if the theory is applicable then the second purpose of the study here is to evaluate why and how a particular theoretical framework is applicable in the present research project.

The field of foreign policy or international relations has been one of the most widely investigated and debated fields among experts. The phenomenon of international relations amongst the states and the very nature of state behaviour in international relations has been approached through different theoretical perspectives. So far as the foreign policy of Pakistan is concerned, it has been through a process of evaluation which shows the application of different theoretical perspectives. The foreign policy of Pakistan has a rich history, traditionally grounded in the principles of realism and geopolitics. However, a significant shift has occurred in the past decade, with Pakistan transitioning from a primarily geopolitics-driven foreign policy to one increasingly influenced by geo-economics. This transformation has implications for the broader theoretical debate within international relations, including realist paradigms, peace studies, traditional security, non-traditional security, and human security perspectives. This theoretical framework will consider and integrate these diverse paradigms to investigate the complexities of Pakistan's evolving foreign policy. Some of the prominent theoretical perspectives and their application in Pakistan's foreign policy are as under.

### **1.3.1. The State-Craft Theory**

The State-Craft Theory, especially as presented by Samuel P. Huntington, can provide insight into Pakistan's transition from geopolitics to geo-economics.

The notion of statecraft was introduced by eminent political scientist Samuel P. Huntington in his 1981 book "American Politics: The Promise of Disharmony" (Huntington 1981). Statecraft theory emphasizes the strategic decision-making processes of states and focuses on the art and practice of governance and diplomacy.

Applying statecraft theory to the Pakistani government's changing priorities and strategies can help us understand how the country is moving from geopolitics to geoeconomics. The predominant framework for examining international relations historically has been geopolitics, which emphasizes military might, territorial disputes, and strategic alliances. However, geo-economics—which emphasizes economic factors like trade, investment, and development as crucial determinants of foreign policy and national security—has become more and more important in Pakistan in recent years. Numerous factors, such as globalization, economic interdependence, and the growing significance of economic diplomacy in a world that is changing quickly, can be attributed to this shift. It's possible that Pakistan's leaders realized the limitations of using only military means to maintain security and tried to expand their toolkit for foreign policy to include economic ones.

Furthermore, Pakistan has come to understand that to improve its security and prosperity, it must make the most of its economic potential and interact with regional and international economic dynamics as a developing nation facing formidable economic obstacles. Statecraft theory, to put it simply, clarifies how nations like Pakistan strategically decide on matters of national security and foreign policy. We can observe how Pakistan is adjusting its diplomatic and strategic priorities to navigate a shifting international landscape and pursue its interests in a more complex

and interconnected world by examining the country's transition from geopolitics to geo-economics.

### **1.3.1 Realism and Geopolitics**

Realism has been one of the dominant theoretical approaches in international relations. According to different academicians, the work of Niccolo Machiavelli in the form of his well-known book 'the Prince first provided grounds for the latter development of a realist theoretical framework. The field was later enriched and developed by Hans Morgenthau and Kenneth Waltz respectively. This approach was further divided into classical realism, neorealism, and neo-classical realism (Sayer 1992). This theory takes states as major actors in international relations and argues that states seek to achieve self-interests in international relations. According to this theory, the pursuit of power and security are the primary concerns of states while formulating foreign policy and constructing international relations. Proponents of realism argue that anarchy is one of the dominant features of international politics. No powerful and dominant authority can enforce its rules for the establishment of international peace. Therefore, every state strives to maximize its role, power, and chances of survival Shaffer (2015).

Historically, Pakistan's foreign policy has been characterized by the above realist principles. Under the same realist perspective, the state's interests, national security, and power politics played a central role in Pakistan's foreign policy. Geo-political considerations, often rooted in regional dynamics and great power politics, have driven Pakistan's international interactions. Looking at the above facts and dynamics of realism, this study will draw on the realist tradition to provide insights into Pakistan's foreign policy choices in the past and the transition towards geo-economics.

### **1.3.2. Geo-Economics**

Geo-economic paradigm in international came under discussion in the 1990s after Edward Luttwak produced important literature about it. Luttwak argued that after the end of the Cold War, there would be no need for the state to maximize its military power. Rather, according to him, the states shall be in a position to focus on enhancing their economic capabilities in terms of greater economic engagements (Luttwak 2003). This theoretical perspective gives greater preference to economic interests in shaping the foreign policy of nations in the world. According to the proponents of this theoretical perspective, increasing economic power through trade and international cooperation plays an important role in building and modifying the foreign policy framework of states. Nations seek to increase their international influence through engaging in maximum international trade and cooperation (Shaffer 2015). However, the fundamental idea of geo-economics can be linked to the old Chinese strategy that it had applied during Sun-Tzu's reign to achieve its objectives on international fronts. According to Scott (2006), the Chinese adopted this policy under the principle that the greatest excellence lies in the defeating enemy's army without fighting it at all. China believed that military wars are costly not only economically, but they are costly in terms of human loss. Fingleton (2004) argues that China believed that instead of the occupation of one's resources, it is more feasible to work with him and even make him capable that he works for you. Nobody shall beat you if he is not angry. More importantly, China believes that building capabilities in terms of economic growth is the real power in the modern age of globalization. Therefore, China introduced reforms in its policy and changed it from geo-politics to geo-economics.

Many observers like Soilen (2010) argue that Chinese' shift in its policy from geopolitics to geo-economics led the country toward economic growth. On the other hand, many Western countries are still sticking to their colonial policy of geopolitics. This policy has made Western nations redundant as compared to China. In terms of economic growth, many Western nations are dependent upon the economy of China. To achieve the higher target of economic growth and sustainability, the writer argues that Western nations shall follow the strategy of China where the country has shifted its foreign policy outlook from geopolitics to geo-economics.

So far as Pakistan is concerned, its contemporary foreign policy is marked by a significant shift towards geo-economics. Beyond the traditional realist framework, the study will incorporate the theoretical perspective of geo-economics. This paradigm emphasizes economic interdependence, trade, investment, and cooperation as essential elements of statecraft. It will highlight what dynamics compelled Pakistan to change its foreign policy's pattern and attention from geopolitics to geo-economics. The history of Pakistan's foreign policy shall be analyzed according to the same perspectives of realism and geo-economics. Moreover, under the same approach, the prospects, and challenges that Pakistan can face shall also be analyzed logically and analytically. By integrating geo-economics, this research aims to comprehensively analyze Pakistan's evolving foreign policy orientation and its implications for international relations.

### **1.3.3. Traditional and Non-Traditional Security Paradigms**

Traditional and non-traditional security paradigms are playing an important role in the foreign policy of many modern states. This paradigm has evolved around the gradually changing landscape of threat and insecurity. According to this perspective, the security of individuals, assets, and information of the state is important to be

secured from different types of threats faced by modern states. Security of the state has been prominent right from Greek philosopher Thucydides to Machiavelli and from Thomas Hobbes to modern experts of international relations like George Frost Kennan, Stephen Krasner, and Hans Morgenthau (Jespal 2013). Therefore, the security paradigm plays an influencing role in the states while formulating their foreign policy and dealing with their international relations.

In recent years, Pakistan has faced considerable challenges to its traditional security paradigm. While the conventional emphasis on military strength and deterrence remains, there is a growing recognition of the significance of non-traditional security threats, such as terrorism, cyber threats, and environmental concerns. This study will delve into the changing landscape of security paradigms and their influence on Pakistan's foreign policy decisions.

#### **1.3.4. Human Security Paradigm**

The notion of human security, which places individuals and their well-being at the core of security concerns, has gained prominence globally. Human security is an approach in international relations and foreign policy that seeks to focus on the development and well-being of people behind foreign policy and international relations. This approach was introduced in response to the security paradigm which had given too much importance to the security of the state over the security of people (Newman 2010). According to this theoretical perspective, while formulating foreign policy states are now seeking to secure people from fear, provide them freedom from want, give them health security, and personal security, and to ensure environmental security (Owens 2012). Looking at the ground realities of Pakistan, it is very much evident that Pakistan has grappled with human security issues particularly after 2013 which have led to a re-evaluation of its foreign policy priorities. This research will



explore how the shift from geopolitics to geo-economics occurred and what types of impacts the human security paradigm will have on socioeconomic development and the welfare of its citizens.

### **1.3.5. Theoretical Application**

The theoretical framework of this study will actively engage in the broader debate between realists and proponents of peace studies, traditional and non-traditional security, and human security paradigms. By considering these diverse perspectives, the research aims to provide an understanding of Pakistan's evolving foreign policy, offering insights into the complexities and implications of its recent shift towards geo-economics. This theoretical debate will guide the analysis of Pakistan's historical foreign policy decisions, as well as the prospects and challenges that lie ahead in an increasingly interconnected world.

### **1.4. Literature Review**

Foreign policy is a complex and dynamic field that responds to a wide range of domestic, regional, and global influences. Scholars have consistently emphasized the importance of understanding the theoretical underpinnings and historical factors that shape a nation's foreign policy choices (Smith, Hadfield, & Dunne, 2016). These choices are often framed within the context of international relations theories, such as realism, liberalism, and constructivism. A vast body of literature by eminent experts and academicians has been produced circulating the genesis of the nature of the attitude of states while constructing their international relations. The produced literature provides valuable frameworks for understanding a country's foreign policy decisions and interactions on the global stage.

#### **1.4.1 Literature on Realism**

A vast body of literature has been produced about realism and its role in the formation of foreign policy. Realism, a foundational concept in international relations, posits that states prioritize their security and survival in an anarchic world. This perspective suggests that a nation's foreign policy choices are primarily driven by the pursuit of its interests and the protection of its sovereignty. In this realist view, the international system is characterized by competition and a constant struggle for power among states (Smith, 1986). This perspective helps explain the enduring influence of military considerations, alliances, and balance of power dynamics in shaping foreign policy decisions.

#### **1.4.2 Literature on Liberalism**

On the other hand, several scholars have produced a vast body of literature about liberalism as a dominant force behind the formation of foreign policy and dealing with international relations by the states. Liberalism offers a different lens through which to analyze foreign policy. Liberal international relations theory emphasizes cooperation, interdependence, and the role of international institutions in shaping state behaviour. According to this perspective, states can achieve their objectives through diplomacy, economic cooperation, and participation in international organizations (Hellmann & Stark Urrestarazu, 2013). Liberalism highlights the importance of trade, diplomacy, and global governance as essential elements of foreign policy.

#### **1.4.3 Literature on Constructivism**

Similarly, attention has been paid to constructivism in international relations. Constructivism is another valuable theoretical framework that emphasizes the role of ideas, beliefs, and norms in shaping foreign policy. This perspective suggests that the way states perceive the world and their role in it can have a significant impact on their foreign policy choices. Constructivism highlights the importance of cultural, social,

and ideological factors in understanding a nation's foreign policy behaviour (Hellmann & Stark Urrestarazu, 2013).

Moreover, different academicians and foreign policy experts have produced literature about different factors affecting the process of international engagement by the states. In this regard, many scholars argue that foreign policy choices are also influenced by historical events, national identity, leadership, and public opinion. Historical experiences, such as conflicts, alliances, and colonial legacies, can leave lasting imprints on a nation's foreign policy orientation. National identity and the way a country sees itself in the world can also shape its foreign policy goals and strategies. Leadership plays a critical role in decision-making, as leaders bring their own beliefs and preferences to the table. Public opinion and the media can exert significant pressure on foreign policy decisions, particularly in democratic societies (Smith, Hadfield, & Dunne, 2016).

#### **1.4.4. Literature on Humanitarianism**

Along with it, a new approach to the study of international relations was introduced in the form of Humanitarianism or human security after the end of the Cold War era. Hazel Smith, T.V. Zonova, E. J. Clements, E. Rousseau, and A. Pende are considered among the first scholars who worked on the humanitarian aspects of foreign policy (Bogatyreva 2023). The humanitarian approach to the study of international relations considers people as an important subject. Emphasis has been given to amelioration of the problems related to the common people at large. Having the purpose of the development of common people at its core, the humanitarian approach gives priority to maximum international cooperation, international trade agreements, and mutual adjustment and support in the field of economic development. This approach has

brought greater changes in the traditional approach to geopolitics in the field of international relations (Khakee 2018).

### **1.5. Literature Relevant to Pakistan's Foreign Policy**

So far as foreign policy is concerned, there has been a vast body of knowledge that has been produced around the genesis of Pakistan's foreign policy. Relevant to the present research, the following are the theories and concepts we will be discussing in detail pertinent to the question of Pakistan.

#### **1.5.1. Realism and Geopolitics**

A significant body of scholarly work has delved deeply into the complex interplay between the realist paradigm and geopolitics in the context of Pakistan's foreign policy. Scholars such as Z. Hussain (2017), Ali (2022), and Siddiqui (2008) have conducted comprehensive analyses that reveal the profound influence of Pakistan's unique geographical location on the shaping of its foreign policy orientation. At the core of this perspective lies the realist tradition, a foundational concept in international relations theory. Realism posits that states are primarily driven by the pursuit of their security and survival in a world characterized by anarchy and self-help.

For Pakistan, its geographical realities have indeed been challenging. Situated in a region surrounded by powerful yet often adversarial neighbours, Pakistan's foreign policy choices have been profoundly influenced by these geographic considerations. The recurrent threat of aggression from neighbouring states, most notably India and Afghanistan, has catalyzed Pakistan to prioritize military strength and national security. These threats, whether real or perceived, have significantly contributed to shaping Pakistan's overall perception of insecurity. Consequently, Pakistan has adopted a foreign policy framework that is firmly rooted in geopolitical

considerations, with a primary focus on safeguarding its territorial integrity and national sovereignty.

This realist perspective finds its roots in the historical context of Pakistan's formation. The nation emerged in 1947 as a response to the partition of British India, a process that was fraught with violence and communal tensions. Pakistan's founding fathers, notably Muhammad Ali Jinnah, were acutely aware of the challenges and threats facing the newly formed state. Geopolitically, Pakistan found itself in a precarious position, with India to the east and Afghanistan to the west. The looming Cold War rivalry between the United States and the Soviet Union added another layer of complexity to the region.

The scholarly works of Z. Hussain (2017), Ali (2022), and Siddiqui (2008) underscore the enduring influence of this geopolitical outlook on Pakistan's foreign policy. The nation's geostrategic importance has been both a blessing and a curse. While it has allowed Pakistan to leverage its location for strategic advantages, it has also entailed a constant state of vigilance and a focus on defense.

### **1.5.2 The Cold War Perspective**

Another vital dimension of the extensive literature surrounding Pakistan's foreign policy landscape revolves around the impact of the Cold War rivalry between the United States and the Soviet Union. Scholars such as Waheed (2017), Kundi (2020), Sattar (2010), and Pant (2012) have meticulously examined how superpower interventions in the South Asian region profoundly constrained Pakistan's autonomy in shaping an independent foreign policy.

The Cold War era, characterized by ideological and geopolitical strife, cast its extensive shadow on Pakistan's foreign policy choices. The Soviet Union's presence in neighbouring Afghanistan not only magnified Pakistan's sense of insecurity but also heightened concerns about potential Soviet interference. This perspective underscores the precarious geopolitical position of Pakistan, caught in the crossfire of the superpower competition. Scholars argue that Pakistan perceived a direct and imminent threat from the USSR, which further accentuated the urgency of building formidable defense capabilities.

Furthermore, the literature contends that India's burgeoning regional influence, facilitated by its close ties with the USSR, significantly amplified Pakistan's security concerns. These concerns were deeply rooted in the apprehension that any escalation of the superpower conflict could spill over into the South Asian region, potentially jeopardizing Pakistan's sovereignty. These factors, combined with the overarching context of the Cold War, played an instrumental role in shaping Pakistan's foreign policy, which primarily revolved around defense, containment, and regional stability.

The 1979 Soviet invasion of Afghanistan served as a defining moment in this Cold War context. Pakistan, under the leadership of General Zia-ul-Haq, became a frontline state in the U.S.-led efforts to support the Afghan mujahedeen and oppose Soviet expansion. The literature produced by Waheed (2017), Kundi (2020), Sattar (2010), and Pant (2012) delves into how this conflict further cemented Pakistan's alignment with the United States and its focus on defense and containment. The multifaceted nature of Pakistan's security challenges, influenced by both superpower dynamics and regional conflicts, underscores the complexity of its foreign policy decisions during the Cold War period.

### **1.5.3 Indian Threat and Regional Conflicts**

A substantial portion of the literature scrutinizes India's perceived threats to Pakistan's security. Scholars like Z. S. Ahmed (2007) and A. S. Khan (2006) offer a nuanced examination of how the wars over Kashmir in 1948, 1965, and 1971, as well as the Kargil conflict, were pivotal events that deeply influenced Pakistan's foreign policy orientation.

These conflicts, most notably the fear of future aggression from India and India's relentless pursuit of regional dominance, cast a long and enduring shadow on Pakistan's foreign policy choices. The literature underscores how these conflicts, whether open or simmering, contributed significantly to shaping Pakistan's foreign policy.

The wars over Kashmir, coupled with territorial disputes and deeply entrenched security concerns, heightened Pakistan's determination to build formidable military capabilities as a potent deterrent against potential incursions. The prospect of regional conflicts and their implications on Pakistan's foreign policy remains a recurring theme within this category of literature.

The first war over Kashmir in 1947-48 set the tone for Pakistan's preoccupation with security. The conflict erupted immediately after the partition of British India, and it revolved around the princely state of Jammu and Kashmir. This conflict not only sowed the seeds of enduring hostility between India and Pakistan but also solidified their respective foreign policy orientations. The unresolved issue of Kashmir became a focal point for future conflicts and a central factor in Pakistan's national security strategy.

The war of 1965 and the subsequent Tashkent Agreement in 1966 did little to ease tensions. Despite international mediation, the dispute over Kashmir persisted, and the spectre of conflict loomed large. Pakistan's determination to protect its territorial integrity and assert its claims over Kashmir remained a driving force in its foreign policy.

The conflict of 1971, leading to the separation of East Pakistan (now Bangladesh), was a severe blow to Pakistan's territorial integrity. It not only resulted in the loss of territory but also had profound implications for Pakistan's foreign policy. The emergence of Bangladesh as an independent state reshaped the region's political landscape and redefined Pakistan's foreign policy priorities.

The Kargil conflict in 1999 was yet another episode in the ongoing India-Pakistan rivalry. It once again underscored the volatile nature of the region and the challenges that Pakistan faced in maintaining a defensive posture. The conflict ended with a return to the status quo, but it left a lasting impact on the security dynamics of South Asia.

The literature produced by Z. S. Ahmed (2007) and A. S. Khan (2006) highlights how these conflicts, fuelled by territorial disputes and security concerns, were instrumental in shaping Pakistan's foreign policy. These experiences solidified Pakistan's commitment to maintaining a credible defense capability and its determination to protect its national sovereignty.

#### **1.5.4 Geo-Economics and Humanitarian Perspective**

An emerging and transformative perspective in the literature centres on the humanitarian and geo-economic dimensions of Pakistan's foreign policy. In March 2021, the Pakistani government held the Islamabad Security Dialogue which was



focused on moving Pakistan from its traditional security paradigm to the economic security of the country. The government of Pakistan disclosed in the dialogue that it wants to ensure its geopolitical security and its deterrence in the region through economic security. It was therefore determined that Pakistan shall focus on building ties with international partners to boost the economic condition of the country. More importantly, it was agreed in the dialogue that Pakistan shall focus investments of the economic gains on the development of common people. The policy framers in the dialogue argued that economic security is key to all other types of security including the defense security of the country. Therefore, it was determined that Pakistan should think outside of the box and prioritize its economic security by building structural relationships with different international partners (National Security Division 2021).

Similarly, scholars such as Shabnam Gul (2021), Faisal (2018), Masood (2022), and Khan (2022) have meticulously explored Pakistan's paradigm shift from geopolitics to geo-economics, with a specific focus on its burgeoning relationship with China and the ambitious China-Pakistan Economic Corridor (CPEC) project. This perspective accentuates Pakistan's recognition of the pivotal importance of economic development and regional economic integration in an evolving global landscape. It contends that Pakistan has strategically forged robust economic ties with China in response to shifting regional dynamics and the mounting economic challenges faced by its populace. This perspective highlights Pakistan's changing dynamics, emphasizing economic development, and close cooperation with China as central pillars of its evolving foreign policy.

The China-Pakistan Economic Corridor (CPEC) is a ground-breaking initiative that epitomizes Pakistan's commitment to geo-economics. This multibillion-dollar project aims to connect Gwadar Port in southwestern Pakistan to China's north-western

region of Xinjiang, enhancing connectivity, trade, and economic development. CPEC has the potential to transform Pakistan's economic landscape, stimulate trade, and create significant infrastructural advancements.

The literature, as represented by the works of Gul (2021), Faisal (2018), Masood (2022), and Khan (2022), underscores the strategic shift in Pakistan's foreign policy orientation. It recognizes the imperative of addressing economic challenges and capitalizing on growth opportunities. The emergence of CPEC symbolizes a departure from the traditional security-centric paradigm, signalling a more diversified and economically focused approach to foreign policy.

#### **1.5.5 Contribution of Current Study to Available Literature**

While the existing literature provides invaluable insights into different facets of Pakistan's foreign policy, it is not without limitations. Most notably, it often concentrates on either the traditional geopolitics aspect or, more recently, on Pakistan's relationship with China and the CPEC project. This approach, while informative, frequently overlooks Pakistan's broader engagement with economically powerful regional and international actors aimed at achieving economic stability.

The produced available literature, in many instances, does not fully address the comprehensive shift in Pakistan's foreign policy from a geo-strategic to a geo-economic framework, particularly under a humanitarian dimension. Very little attention has been paid to the present shift of Pakistan's foreign policy from its traditional security paradigm to economic security indicated during the Islamabad Security Dialogue in 2022. This gap in the scholarly discourse leaves room for further exploration and understanding.

This research project aims to fill this void by offering a holistic analysis of Pakistan's evolving foreign policy. It transcends the boundaries of traditional geopolitics, delving into a broader spectrum of dimensions, encompassing not only geopolitics to geo-economics but also transitioning from traditional security paradigms to more inclusive humanitarian perspectives. The research seeks to make a valuable and substantial contribution to the existing literature by offering a more comprehensive understanding of the complexities and implications of Pakistan's evolving foreign policy in an interconnected world.

## **1.6. Research Questions**

While conducting the present research, an effort shall be made to address the following major questions.

### **1.6.1. Main Research Question**

1. What has compelled Pakistan to shift its foreign policy from a traditional security paradigm based on geopolitics to a non-traditional security paradigm based on the principles of geo-economics and human security?

### **1.6.2 Supplementary Research Questions**

1. Why traditional security paradigm based on geopolitics has been the fundamental driver behind Pakistan's foreign policy since its inception?
2. What has compelled Pakistan to change the nature and direction of Pakistan's foreign policy from a traditional geopolitics paradigm to a non-traditional security paradigm based on geo-economics?
3. What are the drivers and motivations behind Pakistan's shift in foreign policy from a focus on geo-politics to geo-economics?
4. What are the opportunities and challenges for Pakistan in pursuing a geo-economic foreign policy?

5. How can Pakistan maximize the benefits of the foreign policy shift while minimizing potential risks?

### **1.7. Research Methodology**

The present research project is going to be qualitative in nature. The qualitative method has been selected while keeping in mind the research questions of ‘why’ and ‘how’ in the present study that have to be answered in the process of unfolding the problem. According to Mack (2005), the qualitative research method is useful as it answers efficiently the questions of ‘how’ and ‘why’. Moreover, this method allows the researcher to explain and evaluate freely the observed phenomenon. Similarly, the present research is related to human experience in form of devising and modifying the foreign policy of Pakistan, the application of the qualitative research method seems pertinent as according to Cleland (2017) qualitative research allows the researcher to better understand and explain the human experience.

#### **1.7.1. Data Collection:**

While investigating the problem, efforts shall be made to collect the primary data. However, along with primary data, secondary sources with a focus on dealing with facts and positioning in the foreign policy shift of Pakistan are the main sources used in this study. However, looking at the question of why did Pakistan follow a traditional geopolitical approach in its foreign policy after independence and why the shift occur in Pakistan’s foreign policy from traditional geopolitics to geo-economics based on humanitarian principles, the present research seems to be explanatory as according to Strydom (2013), explanatory research explains in a better way that why a particular phenomenon works in a particular way. Thus, the data collected about the problem of investigation shall be collected and then it shall be explained and interpreted. Most of the research is based on secondary sources like articles, journals,

records, documentaries, books, accounts and some other materials like thesis and data of M. Phil. as well as Ph.D. There are different questions which have been dealt with the help of existing accessible primary and secondary sources. The researcher, while conducting his research, has consulted the sources which have been written and compiled by numerous writers who have written about the topic including the authors of Pakistan, India, and other global writers.

### **1.7.2. Primary Source:**

So far as the primary data are concerned, the researcher has tried to obtain material from the interviews and opinions available on YouTube channel. The academicians in the University of Quaid-e-Azam shall also be consulted through a debate in this regard. Efforts shall be made to reach to the conclusion while keeping in mind the research questions raised in the study.

### **1.8. Aims and Objectives of the Research**

The study's goal is to uncover the important drivers and variables that have contributed to Pakistan's move from geopolitics to geo-economics. The research provides a complete knowledge of the factors underpinning this change, as well as the consequences for Pakistan's long-term financial and geopolitical direction, by analysing financial, political, and strategic concerns. The study contributes to increasing awareness of geo-economics significance in defining foreign policy approaches and objectives. The study gives insight into the challenges and possibilities associated with a transition towards geo-economics, as well as the possible ramifications for regional safety and the governance of the global economy, by evaluating Pakistan's experience. The study can shed light on the shifting nature of Pakistan's strategic partnerships, especially those with China, the US, and regional powers. The study can provide crucial insights into the shifting patterns of the

region's security dynamics and Pakistan's expanding position in regional and global affairs by evaluating the influence of its move towards geo-economics on these linkages. The research on Pakistan's diplomatic move from geopolitics to geo-economics is important because it can help us better comprehend the intricate and variable interactions of financial, political, and strategic aspects in affecting foreign policy choices and objectives. Some other aims and objectives include:

- a. To look at the foreign policy shift of Pakistan from geo-politics to geo-economics.
- b. To draw attention to the actions and stances taken by Pakistan during the shift from geo-politics to geo-economics.
- c. To describe and analyse the pros, cons, consequences, and future recommendations and contributions regarding the reconstruction of Pakistan's foreign policy's geo-politics and geo-economics.

### **1.9. Scope and Significance of the Study/Benefits of the Present Study**

The present study is going to be beneficial for the country in large and for the people in particular. It is going to explore not only the causes and issues in the foreign policy shift of Pakistan from geopolitics to geo-economics, rather it would also address the impacts of this changing policy shift on the overall economic development of the country. Moreover, this research is relevant in several ways. There are numerous debates and policies available on the economic links between China and Pakistan. The current study looks at the foreign policy shift of Pakistan from geo-politics to geo-economics. Pakistan's alliance in the war on terror brought a conflict to Pakistan that was not its own. Many militants in Afghanistan were forced to flee the nation and sought refuge in Pakistan's tribal territories. Terrorists began assaulting schools, infrastructure, citizens, military and paramilitary personnel around the country,

negatively impacting Pakistan's economy and Foreign Direct Investment (FDI). Pakistan was isolated because many of its neighbours blamed it for funding terrorist activity in their own nations.

Furthermore, considering the regional setup and Pakistan's connections with other regional countries, particularly Afghanistan and India, the current study emphasizes the importance of economic and trade relations with China. Pakistan has been confronted with numerous issues because of continued insurgency and the terrorism phenomenon. There is a danger that it will lose China's political assistance, as the latter is dealing with issues posed by the East Turkestan Islamic Movement (ETIM) in Western China. As a result, in this scenario, it is important that both economic and political relationships are interdependent, and Pakistan is shifting and rethinking its policies.

As a result, research aids in the exploration of ways in which Pakistan might balance its trade with China, as equitable commerce between the two is critical for a win-win situation for both. The study also looks at China's massive market and the demand that may be met by Pakistani exports, as China is an ideal destination for a range of Pakistani goods. The thesis also includes a thorough examination of several areas of Pakistani trade in general.

The expected outcomes of the study are as follows:

1. Pakistan secured a suitable position in trade with China to take advantage of the latter's rapid economic growth:
2. Pakistan maximized the benefits of China's huge market by making it the right destination for Pakistani exports:
3. Pakistan became able to achieve the desired outcomes in trade and economic policy by exploring and analysing the weaknesses and flaws in its trade and economic policies.

The current research helps the readers to find out the unexplored facts about the foreign policy shift of Pakistan. All the explored evidence is interpreted and analyzed thoroughly. As there is no in-depth research conducted on the present topic, it is a valuable addition to the contemporary study about foreign policy shift of Pakistan and it bridges the gap which is lacking. It provides a significant amount of knowledge about the comparative analysis of foreign policy shift of Pakistan to the students, researchers, academicians, etc. It also helps readers in tracing the roots of the changes and role in the foreign policy shift of Pakistan.

### **1.10 Organization of the Study**

The thesis has been divided into the following chapters.

#### **Chapter 1. Introduction**

First chapter of the present research project begins with ‘introduction’. In this chapter, an attempt has been made to present the problem and an issue of investigation in detail. Proper attention has been paid to highlighting the fundamental objectives and significance of the problem. Moreover, theoretical perspective of the study has been discussed. Similarly, an attempt has been made to highlight the available literature related to the problem under investigation. A research gap has been identified.

#### **Chapter 2. Traditional and Non-Traditional Security Paradigm in Foreign Policy of Asia: A Theoretical Debate**

The second chapter of the study argues that major economies of Asia drifted towards geo-economics foreign policy from traditional geopolitical security paradigm. That shift of Asian economies resulted in economic development of many nations. In fact, the economic rise of Asia proved to be the point of influence and lesson for



Pakistan. Looking to the growing economic rise of Asia, Pakistan also ultimately brought some sorts of reforms in its foreign policy outlook. This chapter discusses the factors behind the economic rise of the Asian countries such as Japan, Malaysia, Singapore, China, and India, etc. Moreover, it also covers all the relevant factors that have and continue to contribute to the economic rise and sustenance of the Asian countries. This chapter also analyses the shifting patterns from geopolitics to geo-economics in Asia.

### **Chapter 3. The Traditional Security Paradigm in Pakistan's Foreign Policy: Historical Analysis**

The historical background of Pakistan's foreign policy is based on analyzing the factors of geo-politics and geo-economics in Pakistan through historical perspective. It also throws light on Pak-China relations and numerous deals and projects in the historical perspective. The chapter argues that historically Pakistan's foreign policy has been driven by the principles of security from different fronts. Security issues have been remained more important for Pakistan than its economic growth.

### **Chapter 4. Shifting Strategic Dynamics from Geopolitics to Geo-Economics**

This chapter deals with the core aspect of this study. In this portion, an attempt has been made to study in detail the shifting dynamics from geopolitics to geo-economics in Pakistan. In this chapter, an attempt has been made to critically discuss the factor that became responsible for changing the very outlook of Pakistan's foreign policy from geopolitics to geo-economics.

## **Chapter 5. From Geopolitics to Geo-economics: Prospects and Challenges.**

This chapter argues that the shifting strategy of Pakistan from geopolitics to geo-economics presents several advantages to the country. In this regard, impacts of Pakistan's changing foreign policy have been highlighted. However, there are still hurdles in ensuring the smooth working of Pakistan's foreign policy shift. The challenges have been discussed in detail.

## CHAPTER 2

### TRADITIONAL AND NON-TRADITIONAL SECURITY PARADIGM IN FOREIGN POLICY OF ASIA: A THEORETICAL DEBATE

#### 2.1. Introduction

The present chapter argues that Asian nations had been under the dominance of geopolitics in framing their foreign policies. They had preferred building their security prior to focusing the problems of common people through engaging in economic relationship. Instead of structuring relationship with economically powerful nations, the Asian nations have preferred to build up their relationship with those states which could build their defence security. In the process, the economies of various Asian nations have shirked. However, prior to Pakistan, many Asian nations shifted their attention from geopolitics to geo-economics. In fact, the shift from geopolitics to geo-economics by the Asian nations has been a new phenomenon in recent decades. Many of the Asian nations shifted their attention from mere increasing military power to increasing their economic base and development. This trend and shift in policy led many Asian nations to economic rise. More importantly, the new wave of economic rise of Asia has become a source of inspiration for other developing nations. In fact, due to the recent policy shift of Asian nation towards economic growth has changed the perception and policy orientation of many states of the region particularly that of Pakistan. The economic rise of Asia refers to the economic growth and development in the countries of Asia. The economic rise of Asia has now become a significant global phenomenon that has been unfolding from the past few decades. In fact, different countries of Asia have remained successful in meeting the targets of economic growth and prosperity.

According to Jorgenson (2011), the rise of Asia in the field of economic growth has become a global fact and because of rapid and continuous economic growth, Asia has become a major player in the field of global economic sector. According to the author, different countries in Asia particularly China and India have successfully witnessed the waves of rapid economic growth. This growth, according to the author, became possible because of rapid industrialization, urbanization, focusing investment on the field of infrastructure, advancement in technology and more importantly because of their shift towards market-based policies. While focusing the nature of economic growth in Southeast Asian states, Brown (2007) argues that in most of the Asian states, the expanding middle class has played an important role in the economic development. The writer gives example of China and contends that China has become the second largest global economy because of its focus on increasing foreign investment and exports. Further, the country witnessed economic growth because it has given priority to manufacturing, technology, and innovation.

Lee and Hong (2010) has prepared a report under the guidance of Asian Development Bank. According to the authors, developing economies of different Asian countries like China, Hong Kong, India, Indonesia, Korea; Malaysia, Philippines, Singapore, Thailand; and Viet Nam have witnessed impressive economic growth over the past three decades. According to the report, the region successfully increased in Gross Domestic Product (GDP) in terms of purchasing power parity (PPP). The region raised from 3.3 trillion dollars in 1980 to 24.5 trillion dollars in 2009. This rapid growth in terms of GDP and PPP helped in ameliorating the poor section of society which are millions in number. The report argues that this economic positive performance also helped in increasing the global economic influence of Asia.

According to Ahn (2010), regional integration has played an important role in the economic rise of many Asian states. The writer gives examples of Association for Southeast Asian Nations (ASEAN) and Regional Comprehensive Economic Partnership (RCEP) along with different bilateral trade agreements among the Asian countries in this regard.

Luis (2015) is of the opinion that the thirst in the field of technological advancement and innovation in various technological-related fields has led Asia toward the desired goal of economic growth. The writer in this regard gives examples of South Korea and Japan in particular. In fact, these countries have established themselves as leading competitors in various sectors like automobiles, electronics and telecommunication. Morrison (2014) argues that the services of China's Alibaba and Tencent have been very productive for the economic rise of China in particular. The writer is of the opinion that these innovations had positive transformative impacts on the digital economy of China. The writer further argues that due to its positive economic outlook and policies, many Asian countries have invested in the field of infrastructural development. Transportation networks, energy sector and urban development have become hallmark of various Asian countries. Investment in this sector has helped in broadening and improving connectivity. It has helped in improving and boosting trade and inviting the foreign direct investment.

The above discussion clearly shows that the economic rise of Asia is going to reshape the international and global economic order. Most of the countries are now playing an important role in international trade, in the field of innovation and investment in general. More importantly, this continued growth and expansion in the field of economy is expecting to have far reaching impacts internationally in the future to come. If the same pace has been continued, in fact, Asia seems to be the

region having deep and far-reaching impacts on international economy and many other sectors in the years to come.

## **2.2. Traditional Security Paradigm in Foreign Policy of Asia**

According to Kulnazarov (2015), the foreign policy of Asian nations had been under the influence of traditional security paradigm for long. Different nations faced security issues because of their mutual tussle in the regional context. On one side there was China which had militarily strained relationship with India. In fact, there had been war between the two nations on the issue of border. Both these nations remained engaged in building up their security lethal and powerful. According to the author, both these nations had focused upon damaging one another through military encroachment and warfare. Similarly, in his leading work Beeson (2009) argues that India has adopted similar approach of traditionalism in its foreign policy because of strained relationship with Pakistan. According to the author, although India had tried to adopt the principles of non-alignment in its foreign policy, but overall focus of India had been on curtailing both China and Pakistan. Similarly, India had focused upon making its deep root in the soil of Afghanistan and other Central Asian nations.

While giving his thought on traditional security paradigm in foreign policy of Asia Anderson (2006) argues that the region had been under strong dominance of traditional security objectives because of Vietnam War which erupted in 1954. Both South and North Vietnam fought for and against communist influence in the region. This war had prevailed a wave of insecurity not only in these two divided territories, but it rather engulfed the entire region of Asia in the perception of insecurity. According to the author, the process and focus on building security by Vietnam due to frequent military tension seriously damaged the economic profile of both these divided territories. At the same time, issues in Afghanistan in form of Soviet Union

interference also increased threat perception in the region particularly in Pakistan. According to many foreign policy experts and independent observers, the communist interference in Afghanistan spread a wave of insecurity in the Asian region. Pakistan felt threatened because of the Soviet encroachment and subsequent spread in the region. Therefore, Pakistan felt it necessary to build its security more lethal and to respond to any uneven happening. For that reason, the country not only supported US in war against communism but it rather made traditional security paradigm one of its important foreign policy drivers throughout the years (Afridi 2022).

According to different foreign policy experts, the region of Asia had been under mutual military tussle for quite a long time. Most of states like China, Pakistan, India, Afghanistan, Vietnam and even Japan considered security as a prime objective in their foreign policy determinants. According to Anwar (2020), the mutual tussle between communism and capitalism followed by Soviet Union and US respectively increases the existing threat perception in the region. Pakistan had already strained relations with Afghanistan and India. The Soviet interference furthermore increased the perception of insecurity. On one hand, Afghanistan was not ready to accept the Durand Line while on the other hand, India had occupied Kashmir unilaterally. The country had fought war over the issue of Kashmir. In that situation, Soviet intervention in the region furthermore increased the tension and compelled Pakistan to give priority to its traditional security paradigms. However, the situation did not remain the same. There had been drift and shift in foreign policy direction of many Asian nations. No doubt, they focused building security but the nature and direction of foreign policy of many Asian nations witnessed change from geopolitics to geo-economics.

### **2.3. Non-Traditional Security Paradigms in Foreign Policy of Asia**

The fact cannot be denied that Asian nations had been under wars and insecurity perception for a long time. They however brought some sort of modifications in their foreign objectives and directions. According to different foreign policy experts, China, Japan, India, Indonesia, Malaysia, and Vietnam thought over their traditional security paradigm and found it unfit for the development of common people. Therefore, these nations were the first which changed their perception from traditional security to non-traditional security paradigm. This non-traditional security paradigm is not based only on defence, rather it also focuses the improvement of economies and improving the life standard of common people. It gives preference to constructing economic relationship (Athukorala 2009). Due to this changed perception and objectives from traditional to non-traditional security paradigm in foreign policy, there has been connectivity now among the different states of Asia within the region and even at international fronts.

### **2.4. Determinants of Non-Traditional Security Paradigm and Economic Rise of Asia**

The above change from traditional security to non-traditional security paradigm in foreign policy and the subsequent growth and rise of Asia in the field of economy has become possible due to different determinants. Asia has not reached to its present position of influence and positive economic indicators. There had been different variables playing an important role in the development of the region. In fact, each determinant has played its own important role in making Asia competitive region. However, to make the phenomenon of economic rise of Asia more clearly, it is pertinent to discuss each and every factor in detail under a research-oriented approach.



### **2.4.1. Demographic Dividend**

Demographic dividend is a term which refers to economic growth which is basically brought by a change in the structure of a country's population. The change in fertility and decline in mortality rate is a typical example of demographic dividend. Cuaresma (2014) is of the opinion that no doubt demographic dividend is positive indicator for economic growth, it needs conducive policy environment, investment in education, healthcare, and infrastructure for continuation. The writers further argues that the economic growth achieved through demographic dividend needs to be equitably distribute among the various sections of population to achieve the targets of real economic development. In fact, equitable distribution is also important for inclusive social development.

Ian (2007) argues that most of the developing nations in Asia has witnessed positive indicators in the child survival while birth rates has been remained high in these countries. These Asian states has enjoyed economic growth because of this demographic dividend. Sen (2016) has conducted research under the guidance and supervision of Asian Development Bank. The writer investigates that China and India has particularly utilized its demographic dividend in their favour in form of achieving economic growth. The demographic dividend has resulted in increasing workforce in these countries. It has also resulted in supplying a huge labour force to the market within the country and even in form of sending these workforces abroad which has brought tremendous increase in remittances to them. According to the report, the increased labour force has also increased productivity in China and India.

Mason and Kinugasa (2008) argues that many countries in Southeast Asia have experienced demographic dividend in recent years. These writers have spicifically focused the cases of Vietnam, Indonesia and Philipines. Due to young

population in these countries, they have made real improvement in terms of economic growth. Apart from their demographic dividend, these countries are successfully engaged in creating employment opportunities, improvement of education and giving skilled labour to their population. However, the writer argues, these nations need to make their economic policies more inclusive in nature and direction. Stephen(2019) has researched the demographic dividend, its reason and challenges specifically in South Korea. The writer argues that South Korea is amongst the states which has already experienced the phase of demographic dividend. The region witnessed a rapid economic boom between 1960s and 1990s because of its demographic changes. However, the region could not maintain its demographic dividend and now it is facing the issue of aging population and a decline in birth rates. To cope with the situation, the government is now implementing different policies focused upon addressing the issue of demographic dividend in South Korea.

Mason and Kanigusa (2008) while giving the examples of Japan argue that Japan had already gone through the stage of demographic dividend. The demographic dividend has played an important role in the economic boom of Japan. However, in another leading article Mason (A. a. Mason 2016) is of the opinion that after enjoying economic growth because of demographic dividend, the nation of Japan is now facing the problem known as 'demographic time bomb' or 'aging population'. The crux of the issue is that the ratio of aging people in the overall population of Japan is increasing while its youth workforce is declining day by day. According to the authors, the aging population has exposed Japan to different economic issues. The aging population is increasing pressure on public finance in particular as expenses related to health care and pension are increasing. More importantly, the tax revenue is also decreasing because of aging population. No doubt, Japan has introduced different policies to

overcome the issue, like increasing the age of retirement, increasing women workforce participation and attracting foreign skilled labor to its market but still there is a need of more concerted efforts to mitigate the side effects of aging population in Japan. Similarly, Williamson (2013) has focused the case of demographic dividend in Malaysia and argued that the country has successfully managed to get the economic benefits from its demographic dividend. In 1980s and 1990s, Malaysia witnessed speedy increase in its child birth which latter benefited the country on economic fronts. The country also remained successful in providing skilled and quality education to its young population which ultimately helped in achieving the economic targets.

What is evident from the above discussion is that demographic dividend is playing an important role in the economic performance of any nation. So far the countries of Asia are concerned, they have benefited from their demographic dividend. Thus demographic dividend has been one of the most viable determinants of economic rise of Asia.

#### **2.4.2 Market Reforms and Liberalization**

Introduction of market-oriented reforms and policies of liberalization lead to economic development. In this regard, many Asian states including China, India, Indonesia, Japan, Malaysia, Korea and many others have introduced market-oriented reforms and policies of liberalization. Among many, these reforms involve opening of their economies, reducing barriers in the way of trade, attracting foreign direct investment (FDI) and promoting entrepreneurship at large. By capturing the attention of foreign markets and international investment, many Asian nations have achieved their targets of economic growth. The attraction of foreign investment along with the introduction of liberal policies at home, different nations in Asia has successfully

expanded their economies which has ultimately led to social development. In fact, market reforms and liberalization have been one of the major drives towards and stimulator of economic growth in many Asian states.

Ang (2010) has conducted research on the economic sector of South Korea. He argues that in 1980s and 1990s South Korea introduced and implemented market oriented and liberal reforms in the economic sector. This policy led Korea from an agrarian economy to industrial powerhouse. The government of South Korea focused upon introducing and promoting export-oriented industrialization. It provided financial incentives to private enterprises to different international investors, particularly to private investors and above all the government encouraged technological innovation. All these policies paved ways and new avenues for the economic growth of South Korea. In particular, the rapid industrialization and emergence of South Korea as major player in the fields of electronics, automobile and shipbuilding is due to market oriented and liberalization economic policies. Similarly, Nguyen (2020) takes the example of Vietnam's economic sector and argues that market-oriented reforms and liberalization policies are some of the most important determinants responsible for the economic rise of Vietnam. The writer argues that Vietnam introduced economic and market-oriented reforms in 1980s and 1990s under the policy of *Doi Moi* which were aimed at changing its economic structure from centralized planned economy to socialist oriented market economy. To achieve the target of highly economic growth, Vietnam opened its economic sector and liberalized its trade-oriented policies. Similarly, it also encouraged foreign investment and private sectors. It led to high economic growth of Vietnam and increased its export competitiveness.

So far, the economic sector of Indonesia is concerned, Kis Katos (2015) contends that Indonesian economic sector focused upon introducing market oriented and liberalization reforms particularly after the Asian Financial Crisis in 1997. Through market oriented and liberal reforms, Indonesia successfully attracted foreign investment and international trade boom. Similarly, the government took steps for reducing trade barriers and improving the investment climate. These reforms helped Indonesia to achieve competitiveness in sectors like mining, manufacturing, and services. Hicken (2014) explain the causes behind the economic development of Thailand and argues that export led growth and attracting foreign investment under market oriented and liberalization policy are the main determinants of Thai economic boom. The government remained successful in implementing policies which were focused upon liberalization of trade, de-regularization of industries and promoting private sector investment. Such types of liberal reforms helped Thailand to achieve high economic targets in the field and sector of agriculture, tourism, and manufacturing. These results ultimately positively influenced the lives of lower class in the long run. Similar policies related to liberalization were taken by China and India. Wignaraja (2011) is of the opinion that liberalization of economy in form of encouraging foreign investment, opening trade policies, and inviting private sectors' participation both in China and India helped in boosting their economies. Having sufficient manual power capacity in form of huge population, both these countries achieved high targets and improved sectors like industries, manufacturing, banking, mining, shipping, and many other sectors playing important role in economic development.

### **2.4.3 Government Policies and Reforms**

The direction of government policies and reforms play an important role in changing the economic direction of any nation. So far, the Asian nations and their governments are concerned, governments of different Asian nations have introduced proactive policies which really contributed to the economic rise of Asia. Hong (2012) argues that one of the most important determinants responsible for the growth of Asian nations is the export-oriented industrialization. This policy and government reform is evident in the countries which are called 'Asian Tigers'. These include South Korea, Singapore, Hong Kong and Taiwan. Along with them, China, India, Malaysia, Japan and Indonesia have also introduced such types of policies and reforms which have encouraged the process of export-oriented industrialization. These nations have focused upon developing manufacturing industries that could be more productive to produce goods. Such types of export-oriented policies of government, they have become major players in the global trade competition.

While giving the outlook of Special Economic Zones (SEZs) in Asia and their contribution to economic development, Wahyuni (2013) argues that the creation of SEZs in Asia have paved the way for incentives and for the attraction of domestic and foreign direct investment. These zones, among others, provide and offer tax benefits, they streamline bureaucracy and provide support for infrastructure development. While giving example of Shenzhen Special Economic Zone build by China in 1980, the writer contends that this zone has played an important role in transforming the economic landscape of China. Through the zone, China promoted export-oriented industrialization with rise in electronics and manufacturing industries. More importantly, as Chou (2015) argues, the building of Pudong New Area, Shanghai China has made China a hub of global commercialism. It has invited foreign investment in

form of attracting multi-national corporations. Apart from it, the government of China shifted the attention of their policies towards creating a business-friendly environment which made the overall project a successful adventure. Zeng (2017) has highlighted the case of Singapore and the role of economic zones in its economic progress. According to the writer, Jurong Island in Singapore is the petrochemical and energy hub in Singapore. The Zone offers specialized industrial ecosystem and world's most top-class infrastructure to support the petrochemical industry. The zone remained successful in leading Singapore towards development because the government has offered skilled labour, efficient logistic and friendly environment where business could flourish.

Similarly, different other economic zones in various Asian regions have successfully contributed to the economic rise of Asia. The government policies have changed their attention from mere geopolitics to geo-economics which has made the overall adventure in different Asian nations successful. Wahyuni (2013) argues that Incheon Free Economic Zone in South Korea build in 2003 and Iskandar Malaysia Economic Zone in Malaysia have provided opportunities of growth and development to these nations. These zones have attracted foreign investment particularly in the field of education, healthcare, manufacturing, and tourism. Likewise, (2015) highlights the economic zones located in Sri Lanka and Vietnam. According to the author, the Colombo Port City in Sri Lanka and Da Hang Hi-Tech Park in Vietnam have played an important role in the fields of information technology, electronics, and telecommunication. These zones have provided tax incentives and supportive ecosystem for the promotion of research, innovation, and transfer of technology. Thus, through changing policies of government, many Asian states have achieved higher targets in the field of economic development. Particularly, the policy shift from

geostrategic to geo-economics has paved new avenues of progress and growth for these nations.

#### **2.4.4 Regional Integration**

Regional integration is a term which refers to a process in which various countries coming close to one another with the purpose of fostering closer and integrated economic, political, and social cooperation. According to Huh (2018), the process to integration involves the formation and establishment of frameworks, agreements, and the construction of institutions that that can promote coordination and collaboration among the member states. More importantly, the process of regional integration may involve different strategies and mechanism to promote economic efficiency of the member states. Its forms may include custom unions, common markets, trade facilitation, market access and expansion and policy coordination etc. The efforts of regional integration are overall focused upon all those bilateral agreements or multi-literal agreements which could result in making the economies of member states vibrant. So far as the regional connectivity in Asia is concerned, it has been chased through various efforts and initiatives amongst the different states.

Pangestu (2016) highlights the role and importance of Association of Southeast Asian Nations in the economic development of Asia. The association has ten member states including Brunei, Cambodia, Indonesia, Laos, Malaysia, Myanmar, Philippines, Singapore, Thailand, and Vietnam. According to the author, the association plays an important role in promoting economic integration, regional stability and cultural connectivity and cooperation. The forum has established ASEAN Economic Community (AEC) which aims to facilitate and promote the process of free flow trade, goods, and services. It also tries and plays its role in and promoting investment and skilled labor within the region in general and among the



member states in particular. Similarly, ASEAN Free Trade Area (AFTA) is another important agreement amongst the member states of ASEAN. Different observers like Kien (2005) and many others are of the opinion that AFTA has been formed with the purpose of reducing trade barriers and achieving economic integration amongst the member states of ASEAN. With the passage of time and under the banner of AFTA, member states have successfully reduced barriers from different trading goods which has gradually helped the region to achieve economic growth through the process of continuous integration.

In a similar way, as Terada (2012) argues, ASEAN Plus Three (APT) has also played an important role in the regional integration and economic rise of Asia. The organization was formed by the member states of ASEAN plus three East Asian countries which includes China, Japan and South Korea. The organization is playing an important role in enhancing economic collaboration, monetary stability, and cultural interchange among the member states. The role of another important organization in form of Regional Comprehensive Economic Partnership (RCEP) has always been important. It is a trade agreement among fifteen countries of the Asia Pacific Region including China, Japan, South Korea, New Zealand and Australia. The organization, according to many experts and as Lu (2019) argues, aims to integrate the region in the fields of intellectual property and e-commerce. In fact, the organization has played an important role not only in integrating the member states, but it has also played a positive and leading role in providing opportunities of economic growth to the member states.

The role of South Asian Association for Regional Cooperation (SAARC) and Asia Pacific Economic Cooperation (APEC) is not negligible in the field of economic growth and particularly in the field of economic integration of the region. According

to Saez (2012), both the organizations have played an important role in taking different steps towards economic growth and integration. The member states have brought reshuffles in their economic policies and many member states have brought liberalization in their trade and exports policies. The role of these organizations particularly in the field of trade, agriculture and social development is spectacular indeed. Their role in the field of creating a framework and environment for dialogue, negotiation and collaboration among the member states has been very much important. These organizations play an important role in the overall stability, growth, and shared prosperity not only among the member states but even in the entire region of Asia. In fact, the formation of different regional organization proved to be a positive step towards achieving the prospects of regional integration. It is of course because of these regional organizations that the region of Asia has witnessed a new wave of regional integration and attachment. The process of integration has ultimately opened up new avenues for growth and development. Above all, the policy shift towards regional integration has brought economic prosperity to the member nations. Although, there are challenges, but the very process of regional integration proved to be a good omen.

Besides, one prominent example of Pakistan's transition in foreign policy from geopolitics to geo-economics is the country's participation in the China-Pakistan Economic Corridor (CPEC), which is essential to regional integration (Wolf 2019). A network of roads, trains, and pipelines called the China-Pakistan Economic Corridor (CPEC) aims to link China's western region with Pakistan's Gwadar port. It is a flagship project of China's Belt and Road Initiative (BRI) (Wolf 2019). In addition to improving connectivity between China and Pakistan, this large-scale infrastructure project also makes it easier for the region to integrate economically. CPEC has the

power to drastically alter South Asia's and other regions' economic environments by fostering trade, investment, and energy cooperation. Pakistan's involvement in the CPEC is indicative of its strategic realignment towards the prioritisation of geo-economic factors (Minhas Majeed Khan 2016). The country has come to realise the significance of economic development and connectivity in promoting stability and prosperity in the region. This reevaluation of foreign policy highlights Pakistan's awareness of the changing nature of international politics and its proactive approach to taking advantage of economic opportunities to further its interests as a nation in a world growing more interconnected by the day.

#### **2.4.5 Technological Advancement and Innovation**

Technological advancement and innovation have also played an important and leading role in making the region of Asia economically stable and rise. As the recent literature argues, Asia is in the forefront in the field of technological advancement and innovation from the past couple of years. While analysing the technological advancement and innovation in China, Ismail (2013) comments that China has proved itself as a leading and global leader in the field of technological advancement. China has, according to the author, made advancement in particular in the fields of artificial intelligence, ecommerce, telecommunication and above all electric vehicles. Similarly, in the field of technological advancement and innovation, Chinese companies like Alibaba, Tencent Huawei have made great contributions. These companies have successfully achieved international recognition for their role which they have played in the field of technological advancement and innovation. Similarly, Japan is another country playing leading role in the field of technological advancement. Odagiri (2006) argues that has achieved great success in the field of robotics technology, electronics and automotive technology. In particular, the role

some Japanese companies like Toyota, Sony and Panasonic is spectacular and very important in the field of technology. The introduction of all these technological innovations led Japan towards a stable economy.

The technological advancement and innovation in South Korea and India is also playing a leading role in providing the opportunities of economic growth to these nations. Mannan (2015) have conducted a research in which the authors have highlighted the role of technology and innovation in the economy of India. According to the authors, India has achieved technological advancement in recent years particularly it has successfully developed its workforce in the field of Information Technology and software developments. Similarly, the startups in India has gained prominence and worldwide recognition which has contributed its positive role in the field of economic growth in India. Moreover, India has obtained international recognition in the fields of e-commerce, fintech and above all healthcare technology. Similarly, the role of technology and innovation in South Korea has been very spectacular. According to Lavarello (2023), South Korea has developed its technology particularly in the field of consumer electronic sector. Its companies like Samsung and LG have achieved international recognition particularly in the field of smartphones, television and home appliances. Similarly, the author argues that South Korea is a leader and pioneer in the field of introducing 5G technology. In fact, such types of innovation and advancement in the field of technology has tremendous positive impacts on the economic growth of South Korea.

The role of Singapore and Taiwan is also debatable and has been very important in this regard. In the present age of science and technology, according to Wong (2018) Singapore is known as a hub of global technology. The country has developed a system which is conducive to startups and technological development.

Singapore is known and famous for its progress in the areas like financial technology (fintech), smart cities and biotechnology. The country has achieved global recognition in these areas. Similarly, Taiwan has achieved strong presence and name in the field of technology and innovation. The work of Chang (2016) highlights the role of technological advancement and innovation in the economic progress of Taiwan. According to the author, Taiwan has achieved great progress in the fields of semiconductor and electronic manufacturing. Different companies in Taiwan like Taiwan Semiconductor and Electronic Manufacturing (TSMC) have proved itself as global contestant in the field of producing semiconductor manufacturing. The company is playing a vital role in making Taiwan economically strong and efficient. In fact, such types of technological advancement and innovations have made the region of Asia as a global competitor. The advancement and innovation have introduced the region to a new race of economic development.

#### **2.4.6 Foreign Direct Investment (FDI)**

Foreign direct investment has also played a significant role in making the region of Asia economically rise and developed. In fact, in recent decades, many Asian nations has attracted foreign direct investment which has played positive role in making different Asian countries economically advanced. According to Hong (2010), the Asian nations have successfully invited foreign direct investment which has resulted in making the region efficient in capital, technology and managerial expertise. It has provided access to Asian nations to global markets and has provided opportunities of creating jobs and stimulating economic growth in general. The author argues that Asia has been one of the major recipients of FDI from the past decades. Notable among the recipient of FDI has been China, India and the member states of ASEAN. Athukorala (2009) argues that China, India and many other member states of

ASEAN have provided an environment which proved conducive and an attractive destination for foreign direct investment. Foreign direct investment remained spectacular in the fields of manufacturing services, finance, infrastructure and information technology among others important sectors. In fact, the author argues, China has been one of the leading countries which has attracted foreign direct investment. The rapid increase of China in technology, its vast consumer market, cost-effective labour force and above all its trade friendly policies have contributed a lot in making China as the global number one foreign direct investment recipient.

Thorbecke (2013) contends that the platform of ASEAN has proved itself as a leading platform for attracting the foreign direct investment. In this regard, the case of Singapore, Vietnam, Thailand and Indonesia can be put as an example where these nations have introduced different reforms which provided conducive ground for foreign direct investment. In fact, the strategic important location of ASEAN member states, favourable demographic situation and above all its conducive policies towards economic integration have made the region one of the leading recipients of foreign direct investment. There has been a series of research produced by eminent scholars who have highlighted the role of technology and innovation in the process of attraction of foreign direct investment. According to Intarakumnerd (2016), the transformation of Asia into a hub of technological advancement and innovation has helped the region in making it one of the leading recipients of foreign direct investment which has in return led the region towards economic rise. In fact, the tremendous advancement of China, India, South Korea, Taiwan and Singapore have developed a vibrant ecosystem for technological driven industries which has attracted the attention of foreign direct investors. These investors focused the region because they wanted to seek and utilize talent, market above all the innovation. In a similar

way, as discussed above, the integration of region into various organizations and agreement have really contributed to making different states of Asia economically vibrant and open to foreign direct investment.

Similarly, the role of new initiative of Asia towards infrastructure development cannot be overlooked here. The scholarly work of Bhattacharyya (2016) scholarly highlights the role of new infrastructure development and its impacts on foreign direct investment in Asian countries. The writer argues that rapid urbanization and economic growth have invited investment in infrastructure development. Particularly, investment in infrastructure, transportation, energy, and telecommunication have been spectacular. The new wave of urban development in Asia has successfully attracted foreign direct investment through the mechanism of public-private partnership. This process has further facilitated the process and wave of urban development in different Asian states. The process has deepening impacts on other sectors and particularly on the standard of lives of people in society. In fact, the very increase in the foreign direct investment has led to the increase of global GDP of Asian nations. More importantly, the area of investment on human capital cannot be ignored. Qamruzzaman (2021) argues that due to economic rise of Asia, many countries have increased their spending on education and skill development which has in return led to the production of skilled workforce. More importantly, the skilled labour then contributed to different sectors and helped in leading these nations towards technological advancement and efficient productivity in growth.

The above discussion clearly indicates that different determinants have played their role in leading the region of Asia towards economic rise and development. In return, the economic rise has profound impacts on different walks of life. In fact, due to economic rise, many Asian states are enjoying a status of more prominence among

the international comity of nations. So far as the impacts of this economic rise of Asia is concerned, it can be seen in different walks of life and on different sectors of economy and social life. In the lines bellow, the impacts of economic rise of Asia in different sectors have been discussed.

### **2.5. Impacts of Non-Traditional Security Paradigm**

So far as the impacts of non-traditional security paradigm are concerned, it can directly be seen in the field of economic rise of Asia are concerned, they are indeed profound and exemplary. The economic rise of Asia as Yeung (2016) argues, has reshaped the very nature and direction of global economic order. Due to different determinants playing their positive roles, Asia has achieved global prominence and has become global engine of growth. It is now contributing magnificently to the global GDP and international trade. This process has resulted in balancing the economy and economic power structure from traditional Western economies to newly emerging economies of Asia. In a similar way, according to the study of European Parliament (AMIGHINI 2016), the policy shift of many Asian countries towards opening of trade and investment opportunities has opened new avenues of growth and development for the region. Due to trade friendly policies, the region has now become a global and major market for different kinds of services and trading commodities. The region has attracted international and multinational corporations in form of investors who are seeking to utilize the global consumer demands. Similarly, the expansion of trade networks by region the process of regional integration has further promote the process of trade liberalization and cooperation. The process indeed led to opening of vast trade opportunities for the region.

Giving example of the same opportunities, Ratnawati (2020) has highlighted the impacts of financial growth of Asia on poverty reduction and the expansion of



middle class. The author argues that the economic rise has resulted in lifting millions of people from poverty and destitution. Countries like India, China, Singapore, Malaysia etc have witnessed decrease in the number of poor people. These nations have embraced the targets of reduction in poverty, providing employment opportunities and improving the living standard of millions of people. More importantly, the process has increased the proportion of middle class which has in return supported the creation of consumer markets. The expansion of consumer markets due to middle class has ultimately led to increase in domestic consumption which has increased the process of economic growth in the Asian region. While commenting on the shift in global supply chains because of Asian growth, Neilson (2014) argues that the successful economic development and rise of Asia has brought about changes and shift in the global supply chains. According to the author, a number of multinational companies and corporation have shifted their attention towards the region. They have built their industrial bases in Asia because of lower cost labour force and feasible trading and producing environment which the region has provided. This international investment has made the region capable to acquire specialization in different field and areas of production. Similarly, the regional connectivity among the Asian states have provided more and more opportunities to international investors for investment and circulation of their products among the Asian nations.

Similarly, the economic rise of Asia has brought about changes in perceptions and related to the geostrategic policies in Asia. In fact, as Nasim (2022) argues, the Asian rise in terms of economy has brought about tremendous geostrategic implications for the region. The Asian economy built themselves stronger which increased the global influence of different Asian nations. In this regard, the economic

growth of China in particular has generated different question and has given it a strong influence in disputes related to Asia-Pacific region. Moreover, the economic rise of different Asian states has become a point of influence for other nations in the region. In fact, the process of growth and development in China, India, Singapore, Taiwan and South Korea etc have compelled other developing nations of Asia to think about their shift in foreign policy from geostrategic to geo-economics. However, Anser (2022) contends that the rapid growth of Asian economies has also brought about great changes in the environmental outlook of the region. The region has been exposed to different environmental challenges. Due to the rapid economic growth, the region is now facing the problems related to increasing pollution, deforestation, and speedy resource consumption. It is because of these environmental challenges that the region is now taking different steps to address the issue. The policy shift of Asian nations towards environment in form of spending in renewable energy, efforts towards conservation and above all the adaptation of green technology are some of the efforts which are proving better towards ensuring better environment in future. These efforts are supposed to minimize the negative impacts of economic growth on the environment.

However, so far as the impacts of economic growth of Asia on developing countries of the same region are concerned, Dinh (2019) argues that these impacts are far reaching. Apart from its positive aspects, the economic growth has also generated economic inequalities and social challenges in the region. In fact, certain segments of the society are benefiting in a more accessible way than the other which has led economic inequalities. In this regard, the developing nations are required to address the issue on emergency footing. The prospects and advantages of the economic growth need to be equally distributed among all the nations of the region. Otherwise,

the regional disparities in form of economic inequalities and social opportunities shall increase which will pose other social perils for the region. In this regard, more and more countries, particularly the developing countries need to be included in the regional organizations which have been established for regional integration.

While commenting on the impacts of economic rise of Asia on Pakistan, Chughtai (2015) argues that the impacts of regional economic development are both positive and negative. So far as the positive aspects of this development are concerned, the writer argues that economic rise of Asia has opened up new avenues and opportunities of trade and investment for Pakistan. The rising middle class and the subsequent increasing demands have led the creation of larger market for the goods of Pakistan. Similarly, the initiative of China in form of Belt and Road Initiative (BRI) has led to the introduction of significant infrastructure projects. More importantly, it has increased the opportunities of foreign direct investment in Pakistan. Similarly, Khadim (2021) argues that the economic rise of Asia has appeared in form of psychological impacts on Pakistan. After seeing the emerging economic growth of Asia, Pakistan ultimately started thinking about its shift in foreign policy from geopolitics to geostrategic. Now, Pakistan is taking advantage of the regional connectivity and has become a major trading partner with China. The Chinese investment in energy, infrastructure and manufacturing sectors are spectacular having multidimensional economic and social impacts. In fact, Chinese investment in Pakistan is going to open up more and more new avenues for economic growth in Pakistan in future. Likewise, Tariq (2020) is of the opinion that the impacts of economic growth of Asia of Pakistan in terms of knowledge and technological exchange are tremendous. Pakistan is taking advantage from various Asian countries in the field of information technology, telecommunication, and manufacturing fields.

Similarly, the process of collaboration with Asian countries is leading Pakistan towards human capital development.

It is important to mention here that in spite of positive economic and growth-related impacts, the economic rise of Asia has also exposed Pakistan to some problems. Yasmeen (2015) argues that the economic growth and regional connectivity has exposed Pakistan to a new phenomenon of competition. Most of the manufacturing powerhouses in Asian countries, particularly China, has made it difficult for Pakistan to compete with their manufactures in regional and international markets. In this regard, the manufacturing bases of Pakistan particularly its textile and garments industries are facing stiff competition in face of the cheaper commodities of various Asian countries. This phenomenon is going to put pressure on employment and the very production of local industries in Pakistan. The solution lies in making the Pakistani industries compatible with the regional industries. More importantly, the development of Asian economies and the regional ties of Pakistan with it, particularly with China, has raised security issues for Pakistan as well. Ali (2014) argues that the projects which are of strategic importance have raised security concerns for Pakistan. In this regard, the development of Gwadar Port in Pakistan and Belt and Road Initiative has prompted the debates around military implication and the future geostrategic and geopolitical interests in the region and particularly in Pakistan. In fact, Pakistan needs to chalk out a vibrant comprehensive policy around the emerging concerns related to economic competition in the region and geostrategic Vis a Vis geo-economics concerns.

Similarly, Jawaid (2017) argues that the rise of economy of many Asian nations have direct impacts on the dynamics of social inequality in Pakistan. According to the authors, the advantages and positive aspects of this economic

development are not always evenly distributed. In this regard, the most favourite spots of development in form of industrialization and infrastructure development have the urban areas. In the process, marginalized community living in rural areas and slums in Pakistan have not been targeted in the process of development. If the situation continues, the gap in terms of economic opportunities and development shall further widened between those who have access to the opportunities and those who do not have this access. Therefore, to reap the fruits of economic growth in real terms, almost all the sections of Pakistani society shall be focused and shall be the priority under the policy of growth and development in Pakistan.

### **Conclusion**

The above discussion clearly indicates that economic development has been the priority of Asian nations. In fact, most of the Asian states have changed their foreign policies from geostrategic to geo-economics which led them towards a new competition in field of economic growth and development. In fact, the change of perception has played an important role in this regard. So far, the determinants responsible for this change in perception and economic oriented approach are concerned, they vary in nature and dimension. Change in their foreign policy orientation, introduction of more liberal and market-based policies, regional integration, technological innovation, demographic dividend and above all the inflow of foreign direct investment have been the major players and determinants. These factors contributed in real terms to the economic rise of Asia in the recent decades. However, the fact cannot be denied that these factors and their intensity vary across countries in Asia.

Similarly, the economic rise of Asia particularly the rise of China, India, Singapore, Malaysia, Vietnam, Japan, and South Korea sparked a wave of similar

development in other developing nations like Pakistan and Bangladesh. Thus, it cannot be wrong or misperception to say that the economic boom of Asia has become a source of inspiration for countries like Pakistan. No doubt, along with its positive aspects, the economic growth of Asia has also generated some concerns for countries like Pakistan. In particular, the competition of Pakistani industries and their products with other leading Asian countries has become a serious challenge. Similarly, the question of equal distribution of the benefits of economic growth needs to be solved. The equal distribution of the positive impacts of economic has becomes a serious concern. If the question has not been addressed, the economic gap and inequalities are expected to increase soon to come. More importantly, the security concerns around some of the projects like Gwadar Project and Belt and Road Initiative must be addressed in a more proper and inclusive way. In a nutshell, the economic rise of Asia has proved a good omen for countries like Pakistan. However, its positive impacts need to be distributed evenly in developing countries particularly in countries like Pakistan.

## CHAPTER 3

### TRADITIONAL SECURITY PARADIGM IN PAKISTAN'S FOREIGN POLICY: HISTORICAL ANALYSIS

#### 3.1. Introduction

Unlike many Asian and western developed countries, the foreign policy of Pakistan has been influenced by the principles of traditional security paradigm. In fact, different internal and external factors and most of the time by the non-elected institutions in form of military and civil bureaucracy had been influenced the direction of Pakistan's foreign policy. Similarly, the role of Islamic political parties and Islamist forces has also been influential in shaping the nature and direction of Pakistan's foreign policy throughout its history. Sattar (2010) argues that foreign policy of Pakistan has little been in the hands of elected representatives or elected democratic institutions like parliament as it has been mostly influenced directly or indirectly by un-elected powerful institutions. Similarly, the dominant role of religion in shaping the foreign policy of Pakistan right from 1947 has been highlighted by many foreign policy experts. As Raashed and Anwar (2020) are of the opinion that religious elites in particular and people having orthodox religious orientation in general have always put their influence in giving a particular direction to Pakistan's foreign policy. In this regard, Rizvi (1983) argues that Islamist political parties have always tried to reshape Pakistan's foreign policy along Islamist ideology and orientation.

Ahmed (2010) is of the opinion that the in-depth involvement and dominance of military establishment in foreign policy have provided very little space to democratic institutions in the process of independent foreign policy formulation. No doubt, the author argues that Pakistan's foreign policy in its early years was security oriented in which the military had dominant role. Thus the security dimension of

Pakistan foreign policy, Rehman (2019) argues, has been directly controlled and manipulated by the powerful military establishment. Thus, to settle the domestic power equation with India and other regional power players have been the dominant objectives of Pakistan's foreign policy throughout its history. No doubt, as Yusufzai (2019) argues that achieving economic progress and growth also had always been included in the core objectives, the principles of geopolitics and geo-strategic had always influenced the nature and direction of Pakistan's foreign policy. Hence, designing foreign policy according to the principles of geo-economics had never been the priority of those who were at the helm of affairs related to the foreign policy of Pakistan. Geopolitics remained dominant over geo-economics in the process of foreign policy formulation and implementation. Similarly, security issues had mostly dominated the sphere of foreign policy. Rubin and Ahmed (Rubin and Ahmed, 2008) argue that threat from India, Afghanistan, Iran and many others regional insecurities had always subsided the role of economy in the process of foreign policy formation in Pakistan.

Similarly, as Yaseen (2018) is of the opinion that the presence of Taliban in various forms and nomenclatures in the region in general and in Pakistan in particular and the dependency of USA on Pakistan had most of the time moulded the foreign policy dimensions of Pakistan from geo-economics to geopolitics. Likewise, the presence of extremist groups have also remained one of major drivers and focus of foreign policy. To deal with these groups, the state of Pakistan had always remained engage in different operations and clearance ventures in different parts of the country. Even some of the writers and experts have posed the presence of terrorists' groups as a big threat to various economic adventures of Pakistan. Ishaq (2017) argue that although, CPEC provides a conducive economic opportunity to Pakistan, the presence



of extremists and terrorists groups in different parts of the country has posed serious threats to economic adventures of Pakistan. In fact, Pakistan's expenditures have a big share in such types of military operations.

The above foreign policy nature and direction of Pakistan represents that it had been influenced by different factors and compulsions. The diplomatic and strategic decisions had been mostly influenced by geographic location and regional dynamics of the country throughout its history. However, the question that what were the factors and determinants that had shaped Pakistan's foreign policy rights from inception need further elaboration.

### **3.2. Quaid-e-Azam Muhammad Ali Jinnah's View about Pakistan's Foreign Policy**

The available literature shows that immediately after independence, the father of the nation gave some of the guiding principles of Pakistan's foreign policy. Shabbir (2022) argues that the guiding principles of Jinnah which he gave after independence regarding foreign policy of Pakistan were based on goodwill and brotherhood towards all the nations of the world. He stressed upon making cordial relationship with almost all the nations irrespective of religion, history geography or ideological differences. Ahmed (2010) argues that Jinnah vision about foreign policy was based on the principles of non-alignment. He very categorically said that Pakistan shall structure friendly relationship with all the nations and shall not join any particular block in future. In fact, Jinnah did not want Pakistan to be indulge in the power struggle between the two superpowers in the Cold War era. Similarly, Shabbir (2022) is of the opinion that Jinnah believed in the respect and honour of international organizations. Jinnah gave particular attention and focus to the principles contained in the United Nation's Charter and International Law. Similarly, Jinnah very categorically said that

Pakistan believes in the support and protection of self-determination of the oppressed people across the world.

There are scholars who argue that Jinnah had provided very viable and far-reaching principles regarding the foreign policy of Pakistan in particular Pakistan's relationship with neighbouring nations. Jafri (2021) argues that Jinnah believed in making cordial relationship with neighbouring countries. According to the writer, Jinnah had realized the importance of friendly relationship with close and neighbour states and had stressed upon making cordial relationship with India, Iran and Afghanistan. Jinnah argued that Pakistan shall take special care towards these nations in making foreign policy. According to Niaz (2016), Jinnah knew about the reality of Pakistan and the dominant role of military establishment. Therefore, he very categorically said that each and every institution in the state shall work according to the rules and regulations enshrined in the constitution of Pakistan. He time and again gave priority to parliament regarding the formulation of Pakistan's foreign policy. He said that formation of foreign policy and the principles of relationship with international community shall be the task of democratic institutions like parliament and political parties.

However, in spite of the fact that Jinnah's vision about foreign policy of Pakistan was very much clear. He favoured the principles of non-alignment and abhorred the very idea of taking sides in the great game of Cold War between the two superpowers i.e. USA and USSR. But even then, Pakistan could not structure its foreign policy on the principles laid down and dictated by the founder of Pakistan. It was immediately after independence that Pakistan made and then moulded its foreign policy amidst some serious concerns. Different factors and determinants played their role in formulating Pakistan's foreign policy. Above all, the state of Pakistan failed to

prioritize economy and economic growth as one of the most important determinants of its foreign policy. In fact, different determinants and factors shaped Pakistan's foreign policy after independence. Some of the factors proved to be so dominant that it overtook even the economic concerns of the newly established state of Pakistan. In the lines bellow, an attempt has been made to discuss the foreign policy of Pakistan through historical perspectives while keeping in view the factors which played their dominant role in moulding foreign policy of Pakistan from inception to the beginning of 21<sup>st</sup> century. The discussion shall prove that geo-economics has never been one of the driving forces behind the formation of Pakistan's foreign policy. In fact, the foreign policy of Pakistan, the chapter shall highlight, has been moulded by geo-politics throughout its history.

### **3.3. Determinants of Pakistan's Traditional Foreign Policy**

The foreign policy of Pakistan has been under the influence of traditional security paradigm throughout its history. Located in Asia and among the economic giants of Asia, Pakistan failed to consider the economic model of other Asian countries which had already led them towards economic prosperity. Contrary to other Asian nations, the foreign policy framers of Pakistan have focused upon different factors related to the dynamics of traditional security. In the process, even the guiding principles put forwarded by Jinnah had been ignored. The newly born state of Pakistan soon after the death of Jinnah followed the policy of alignment and became part of the capitalist block led by the United States of America against the socialist block. However, to properly understand the nature and direction of Pakistan's foreign policy throughout its history needs proper debate while keeping in view the major determinant of its foreign policy. In the section below, it has been tried to evaluate the core principles of Pakistan's foreign policy and its impacts on the overall national development.

However, before going to evaluate traditional security paradigm in foreign policy of Pakistan, it is pertinent to have some sort of discussion about the geostrategic location of Pakistan. Analysing geostrategic location is important as it was after the geostrategic location of Pakistan which ultimately had some sorts of impacts on the subsequent foreign policy development of Pakistan.

### **3.3.1 Geostrategic Location:**

The geostrategic location of Pakistan has been one of the major drivers and a major source responsible for its foreign policy formation. According to many observers, Pakistan realized its proximity to great powers in the region in form of USSR, China and India. More importantly, Pakistan knew it very well that Indian rivalry could pose serious threats to the very integrity and security of Pakistan in future. Therefore, Pakistan preferred to adopt precautionary measures to protect its security through building military capabilities (Ghazanfar 2022). During its early phase of foreign policy formation, Pakistan therefore focused upon building relationship with those countries which could help Pakistan in terms of military and defence capabilities. According to many foreign policy experts, Pakistan signed different international security pacts like SEATO and CENTO with the purpose to enhance its security and defence proficiencies in relation to its neighbouring countries (Z. Anwar 2022). Thus, Pakistan in its early phase of its foreign policy compromised on the principles of non-alignment. It aligned with the West which in return invited criticism from quarters. However, geostrategic location compelled Pakistan to think seriously about its security vis a vis its powerful and hostile neighbours in form of India and Afghanistan which even questioned the validity of Durand Line.

### **3.3.2. Security Concerns**

Security concerns was another important factor which had influence on Pakistan's foreign policy in its early stage of formation. So far as the security concerns are concerned, Pakistan faced security threats from two of its neighbouring states i.e. India and Afghanistan. According to Naseem (2010), Indian threat to the very security of Pakistan proved a decisive factor behind its foreign policy formation. Pakistan faced direct threats from the top Indian leadership who questioned the very survival of Pakistan. Moreover, the war over the territory of Kashmir between the two states led foreign policy thinkers of Pakistan towards a thinking surrounded by doubts and perceptions of attack from Indian state. During his visit to United States of America after independence, Nehru very courageously said that Pakistan will not be in position to sustain its independence and integrity as an independent state. He also raised questions over the legal and international status of Durand Line and supported the stance of Afghanistan in this regard (Down,2011).

Similarly, Pakistan felt threats from the side of Afghanistan, one of its neighbouring countries. It was immediately after independence of Pakistan when Afghanistan questioned the legality of Durand Line. Moreover, there had been the news of a plot from the side of Afghanistan trying to inculcate the areas of NWFP (KPK) and Baluchistan to its region. The areas are dominated by Pakhtthoons. The government of Afghanistan warned time and again that it will not recognize the Durand Line and shall try to question its legality at international forums (N. Siddiqui 2017). In fact, along with this possible threat from Afghanistan, Pakistan has always faced threats because of the Talibans' presence in Afghanistan. The country has been a battleground between USA and USSR during the Cold War. The presence of USSR in Afghanistan once again exposed Pakistan to security threats from its neighbour

country. That is the reason that Pakistan has always preferred a stable government in Afghanistan. More importantly, Pakistan has focused building its security efficient Vis a Vis to the security threats posed by Afghanistan after independence and during the era of Cold War (Lodhi 2022).

In fact, the question of insecurity has always been remained one of the dominant factors which has put deep impacts over the direction of Pakistan's foreign policy. Not only India and Afghanistan but the rise of terrorism and extremism after the incident of 9/11 has further exacerbated the security dilemma of Pakistan. The emergence of Al-Qaida and TTP in post Musharraf scenario has further pushed the country into a domain surrounded by both internal and external insecurity. The situation has compelled Pakistan to invest on security as the threats in different forms has made Pakistan a security state.

### **3.3.3 Strategic Alliances**

The above security threats from two of its neighbours compelled Pakistan to structure alliances with powerful nations. In fact, security was one of the major reasons that Pakistan has traditionally maintained strategic alliances with USA and China. The fact cannot be denied that Pakistan had structured these alliances around security and geopolitical considerations and compulsions (Ahmad,N, 2010). According to different foreign policy experts, Pakistan considered USSR and its communist ideology antithetical to Islam. While the Soviet Union also considered Pakistan not a viable and durable option vis a vis India. Moreover, the Soviet Union as well Pakistan did not take the process building relationship on serious and urgent grounds. Particularly, the process of nominating ambassador and follow up from the side of USSR was delayed (Sattar 2010). Consequently, Pakistan relied on and tilted its foreign policy towards West in general and towards United States of America in particular.

To make its security lethal, Pakistan signed different defence agreement with the West. Pakistan signed Mutual Defence Assistance Agreement in 1954 with US. Under this agreement, US pledged that it would provide defence equipment to Pakistan to build and strengthen its internal security. In response, Pakistan agreed that it will not construct any type of relationship with all those states which are threatening the international security. Pakistani Prime Minister Mohammad Ali Bogra not only appreciated the agreement, but he even agreed in principles that Pakistan will not tilt its foreign policy towards the communist bloc (Bukhari 2011). Similarly, Pakistan signed SEATO in 1954 and Baghdad Pact in 1955 respectively. Both these agreements were structured to curtail the rising influence of Soviet Union in the region. However, Pakistan also had the intension to get economic and military support because of these pacts.

The above strategy of making strategic alliances continued with more emphasis particularly during military regimes in Pakistan. During the era of Ayub Khan, emphasis was given to structure durable relationship with USA. However, when Zulfikar Ali Bhutto was given the ministry of Foreign Affairs, he tried his level best to change the unilateral direction of Pakistan foreign policy through constructing relationship with Socialist Block particularly with China. It was also the time when Sino-Pakistan border agreement was signed between the two countries (Bhutto 1964). According to Barnds (1975), it was the time of great expectation as both sides were moving towards structuring durable relationship. However, according to many foreign policy experts, that was an attempt to make the foreign policy of Pakistan bilateral and to give it the direction of non-alignment. Thus, it could not be taken as permanent change in foreign policy of Pakistan from geo-political considerations to geo-economic preferences. It was also the time when the perception of insecurity also

increased because of Pak-India War in 1965. In fact, the war further entrenched the perception of threat *Vis a Vis* India. Furthermore, the war of 1971 with India again the foreign policy framers to construct relationship with those states which could make defence of Pakistan durable and capable enough to counter any offensive move from the side of India (N. Ahmed 2010).

The glimpses of shift in the geopolitical preferences of Pakistan could be seen when Z.A. Bhutto became the Prime Minister of Pakistan. He tried to change the nature and directions of Pakistan's foreign policy. By introducing reforms under the economic policy of socialism, Bhutto preferred to build relationship with Socialist Block particularly with Soviet Union and China. However, according to Amin (2021), Z.A. Bhutto could not succeed in fulfilling his aspirations. The change in the foreign policy priorities from capitalist block to socialist block was severely criticized and countered by the US and its Cold War allies. According to the author, it was this slight change in the foreign policy of Pakistan which led to the removal of Bhutto government and even ultimately resulted in the loss of Bhutto life. However, the slight shift from capitalist block to socialist block was reversed during the military regime of Zia-ul-Haq. The military general after assuming powers made alliance with USA with the agreement to curtail Soviet Union which was present in Afghanistan. Burki and Baxter (1991) are of the opinion that Pakistan again preferred to construct its foreign policy and to build its alliance with US under the threat perception. The foreign policy framers considered the Soviet presence in Afghanistan as threat to its integrity. However, the alliance also brought different defence related advantages to Pakistan. It was a time when Pakistan foreign policy was unilateral and had reliance on capitalist block. The above policy of making strategic alliances continued after martial law was imposed in 1999 by the military general, Pervez Musharraf. Ironically, US again



needed Pakistan in the aftermath of 9/11 incident. To counter terrorism, US requested to Pakistan to join its efforts against the prevailing terrorism. Being neighbour of Afghanistan, the dire need of Pakistan was felt by the United States of America. Musharraf pledged to support US against the militant in Afghanistan. The alliance continued throughout the military regime which brought different military and civil support to Pakistan by the US (Shah 2008).

#### **3.3.4. Building Nuclear Deterrence**

The strategic location of Pakistan and its uncordial relationship with neighbouring countries like Afghanistan and India after independence compelled Pakistan to build its nuclear capability. According to Pattanaik (2003), both India and Pakistan started a race towards building their nuclear capability immediately after the partition. Both the states felt being threatened by one another which ultimately led them towards choosing wrong priorities. The author argues that the war over Kashmir further escalated the existing threat perception inherited by both the states at the time of independence. Moreover, Rizvi (2015) argues that nuclear capability of India had far-reaching impacts on the foreign policy direction of Pakistan. According to the author, Pakistan speeded up the process of achieving nuclear capability after the Indian state detonated its nuclear bomb on May 18, 1974. Surely, it was immediately after Indian explosion when Pakistani Prime Minister Zulfikar Ali Bhutto gave open preference and priority to speed up the process of nuclear bomb capability. The fact had been evident during the 2<sup>nd</sup> Summit of Organization of Islamic Countries (OIC) held in Lahore between 22 February and 24 February 1974. It was after the Indian explosion when Pakistani government reaffirmed that Pakistan shall prepare nuclear bomb at all costs. Looking to the speedy preparation and capabilities of India on nuclear bomb and seeing threats from the side of India, Zulfikar Ali Bhutto had declared that at a

press conference that if the people of Pakistan have to eat grass, we will make nuclear bomb. He had already stated very clearly that the people of Pakistan had no other choice (Rizvi 2015).

Although, according to some scholars, Pakistan's foreign policy experienced a shift but not in terms of economic priorities. The shift in fact occurred when Zulfikar Ali Bhutto came in power. The new Prime Minister introduced reforms by changing the tilt of Pakistan's foreign policy from West to Moscow. Zulfikar Ali Bhutto was the supporter of socialism. Under this new economic model of socialism, Bhutto introduced economic reforms in the internal economic structure of Pakistan. Likewise, he built strong relationship with Soviet Union and minimized its dependency on the Western block led by United States of America (Amin 2021). This was a brief shift in terms of changing Pakistan's alignment from West. In fact, no other structural reforms were introduced during this short period of PPP rule over Pakistan. The priorities remained the same i.e. geopolitical consideration and building defence capabilities.

In fact, the same threat perception modified foreign policy of Pakistan throughout its history. The perception got strength and more attention on each passing day. The war between two countries in 1971 further deepened this thought. During the military regime of Zia Ul Haq, Pakistan again felt threat from the domination of Soviet Union in the region. Similarly, close ties between Soviet Union and India and their influence in Afghanistan had been a source of threat and insecurity for Pakistan. Of course, Pakistan considered Soviet intervention in Afghanistan as direct threat not only to its security but even to the entire region of South Asia (A. J. Siddiqui 2020). Therefore, once again, the security dimension got prominence and Pakistan gave preference to ensure its security while formulating its foreign policy.

### **3.3.5 Internal Security Challenges**

Pakistan has been under the waves of terrorists' activities throughout its history. The issues of terrorism became more dominant after the military government of Zia-ul-Haq in Pakistan decided to support US and to oust Soviet Union from Afghanistan. After the Soviet Union withdrawal, different terrorist organizations like Al-Qaida and TTP started anti state activities in Pakistan. According to many foreign policy observers, the problem to counter terrorism has been one of the major concerns of Pakistan while constructing its foreign policy (Abbas 2021). The problems of terrorism and the subsequent insecurity produced by it became more serious during and after the military regime of General Pervez Musharraf. The military government decided to support US and its war against terrorism in Afghanistan in particular. The US requested Pakistan to facilitate the process initiated by the US. Musharraf agreed in principles that Pakistani government shall support America both morally and in terms of human capital. Throughout the military regime, Pakistan remained under terrorist attacks. Even the problems remained fragile after the military regime came to an end (Ahmed 2010).

The militancy remained one of the most crucial issues to be addressed during the democratic regime of PPP after 2008. The Taliban conducted various terrorist activities across the country in general and in Swat in particular. The government of PPP conducted operation against Taliban in Swat with the purpose to curtail their inhuman activities. Thus, controlling insurgency created by Taliban had been serious concern for the government of PPP. In fact, the operation proved fatal in term of human as well economic loss for the country (Rabbi 2012). The problem of militancy and terrorism took more serious turn when Tehreek-e-Taliban attacked the Army Public School during the democratic regime of PML (N) in December 2014. It was

after this inhuman incident when Pakistan formulated National Action Plan and determined to wipe out terrorism from the country. In fact, the civilian and military high ups agreed to allocate maximum amount for that purpose. Since then, Pakistan is allocating huge amount of capital to curtail the terrorist activities. Although the government of PTI after 2018 tried to mainstream the terrorist faction like TTP thorough negotiation but even this attempt also failed (Aslam 2022). The fact cannot be denied that with the purpose to curtail terrorism, Pakistan has always preferred to structure its relationship with those states which could help Pakistan in curtailing the insurgent groups in Pakistan. In fact, curtailing the phenomenon of terrorism has been the top priorities of Pakistan's foreign policy throughout its history.

### **3.3.6 Regional Organizations and Pakistan's Priority**

In fact, organizations are formed around different objectives and priorities. Looking to the formation of various organizations in the Western world, economic gain and development had been top priorities of member states particularly after the 2<sup>nd</sup> World War. Looking to the advantages of different regional and trans-national organizations, the member states have achieved economic capability and human development. However, contrary to the above facts, Pakistan has achieved very little from these regional organizations so far as the aspect of economic and human development is concerned. Looking to the history of Pakistan, the country had been part of different regional organizations. In this regard, Pakistan has been part of Organization of Islamic Countries (OIC), South Asian Association for Regional Cooperation (SAARC) and Shanghai Cooperation Organization (SCO) throughout its history. However, major concern of Pakistan during the meetings and summits of these organizations had been its security in the region (Rizvi 2015). In fact, Pakistan joined these organization due to increasing threat perception to its security in the regional

perspective. Pakistan joined different regional organizations while keeping at front the objective of increasing defence capability and securing its borders from the regional power players in form of India, Afghanistan, and Soviet Union during the cold war in particular.

According to independent observers, the summit of OIC that was held in Pakistan during Zulfikar Ali Bhutto regime had similar types of objectives. Although, Bhutto wanted to take advantage from the collective economy of Muslim world, the defence capability in terms of atomic bomb had been the priority. Pakistan wanted to curtail the growing influence of India in the region, therefore all efforts were made to achieve defence competence in form of developing atomic bomb (Sattar 2010). More importantly, the summits of OIC have been held throughout its history in different member countries. However, history of the OIC discussion shows that Pakistan has always showed concerns about the regional instability related to the rising influence and interference of India in Kashmir and Afghanistan. Resultantly, Pakistan has always showed concerns about the insecurity of its borders and making itself capable to counter any aggressive move from India and Afghanistan (M. R. Anwar 2020).

While commenting on the nature of Pakistan's role in the regional organizations, an expert of Pakistan's foreign policy argues that Pakistan has always remained dwindled between increasing economic capability and the enhancement of its security. Whenever, Pakistan had to choose between the two, it had opted for building and strengthening its internal and external security dynamics (Bukhari 2011). After the war against terrorism during Musharraf regime, the issue of insecurity due to Taliban has become more serious. Pakistan has also used the platforms of these regional organizations for raising voice against the growing terrorism in the region in general and in the territorial boundaries of Pakistan in particular. According to

different independent observers and expert of Pakistan's foreign policy, Pakistan has remained incapable of achieving the objectives of economic development from these regional organizations. No doubt, these organizations have played very important role in raising the voice against the illegal interference of India in Kashmir, but these regional organizations have played minimum role in building and developing the economic base of Pakistan in particular.

### **3.3.7 Regional Stability and Concerns of Pakistan**

Pakistan is in a region where different powerful states are located. In this regard, Soviet Union, China, and India have been of particular importance. Similarly, there had been rivalry between India and China on the one hand while Soviet Union was also trying to increase its influence to counter the capitalist block during the Cold War era. In this regard, the Soviet intervention in Afghanistan created direct threat for Pakistan in particular in for the region in general (Bukhari 2011). According to some foreign experts, the intervention of Soviet Union in Afghanistan created a complex situation for Pakistan. The situation opened direct chances of intervention to Soviet Union in the regional affairs of Pakistan. Many observers believe that being neighbour of Afghanistan, Pakistan's perceptions about its security from the side of Soviet Union were not baseless. Moreover, Pakistan had concerns about the larger regional insecurity as Soviet Union intervention in Afghanistan was considered and looked through the lens of wider imperial interests and design (Afridi 2022).

Similarly, the increasing influence of India in the internal affairs of Afghanistan had also created the intension of regional instability. Pakistan had been very much cautious about the close relationship between India and Soviet Union. The perceptions of Pakistan were not baseless as Pakistan had already experienced the Soviet Union support to India when the federal government of Pakistan used military force in its

Eastern province Bengal. The Indian government intervened in the internal affairs of Pakistan through the full backing of Soviet Union (N. Ahmed 2010). Therefore, looking to the experience, Pakistan had the reservations about the growing influence of India in the region and the close ties of India and Soviet Union. Similarly, it was also the era of Cold War in which Pakistan had already aligned itself with United States of America. In the process, Soviet Union had developed serious concerns about the close ties of US and Pakistan. In reaction, Soviet Union had openly supported the stance of India over Kashmir. Looking to these dynamics, Pakistan's foreign policy had been under the threat perception in the region (Afridi 2022).

### **3.3.8 Economic Security and Non-Alignment: Pak-China Relationship**

In spite of traditional security paradigm, Pakistan has also tried to make its foreign policy non-aligned and pro-China. The traditional security paradigm does not mean that Pakistan had totally ignored the aspect of national development in terms of economic development. In fact, time and again Pakistan had used the option of China open to itself. In the process, Pakistan has also successfully built strong economic ties with China. These ties remained firm particularly whenever Pakistan felt itself isolated by the Western block during the Cold War era and even after that (I. I. Hussain 2020). In this regard, Pakistan had initiated different developmental projects with China. The relationship between Pakistan and China touched new heights after the border war between India and China in early 1960s. Moreover, Pakistan has also tried to increase its trade relations with the countries included in the regional organizations. However, as already mentioned, the top priorities of Pakistan had been the security concerns of Pakistan in the region. The traditional dynamics surpassed the humanitarian dynamics throughout the foreign policy history of Pakistan.

## **Conclusion**

The history of foreign policy of Pakistan shows that throughout its history, Pakistan could not develop a type of foreign policy motivated and guided by the principles of economic and human development. Unfortunately, Pakistan faced a number of issues which posed serious and direct challenges to its internal and external security. The newly established state felt being under the dynamic of insecurity. The strategic location had far-reaching impacts on the foreign policy direction and priorities of Pakistan. Similarly, the growing influence of India and its unilateral intervention in the regional affairs like Kashmir and Afghanistan also created threat perception for Pakistan. The era of Cold War further accelerated the feelings of insecurity. It was the era when Soviet Union and India had developed strong connection. Soviet Union not only supported the stance of India over Kashmir it even supported the Indian intervention in Afghanistan.

Due to the above situation, Pakistan stood at the crossroad surrounding by insecurity and regional instability. The country had to choose either to develop its security vis a vis India or it had to focus the development of economy and common people. Unfortunately, Pakistan opted for the first one and throughout its history it remained focused on building ties with those nation which could make Pakistan militarily and in term of defense powerful. Thus, the country could not develop its economy due to traditional security concerns. The foreign policy of Pakistan therefore remained under the influence of security paradigm. Although, Pakistan had the option before itself. Many regional countries had developed their foreign policy along the geo-economic parameters like China, India, Malaysia, and Indonesia etc.



## CHAPTER 4

### SHIFTING STRATEGIC DYNAMICS FROM GEOPOLITICS TO GEO-ECONOMICS

#### 4.1. Introduction

The foreign policy of Pakistan has been under the influence of geo-politics throughout its history. The available literature shows that while formulating foreign policy, Pakistan has remained stuck in the quagmire of impending insecurity on the one hand and the ever-increasing insecurity related to the development of common people on the other hand. The problem of insecurity faced by Pakistan due to regional power imbalance, Pakistan had always been unable to adopt its foreign policy around the core objectives related to the human development. The fact cannot be denied that geo-strategic location, insecurity from the side of Afghanistan and India and the international confrontation between the Soviet Union and US during Cold War had far-reaching influence on the nature and direction of Pakistan's foreign policy. These threats had always compelled Pakistan to rely on those international powerful states which could help Pakistan in terms of defence and security capabilities.

However, as Gul (2021) argues that a new thinking in the foreign policy narratives started after the end of General Pervez Musharraf regime in Pakistan. The writers are of the opinion that Pakistan was facing serious challenges to its human development because of its irrelevant priorities of its foreign policy. In fact, those who represented the power structure pondered over the issue of humanitarian crisis due to traditional paradigm of foreign policy that Pakistan was following since its inception. Syed (2014) argues that Pakistan started serious thinking about its traditional approach in foreign policy during the democratic regime of Pakistan's Peoples Party after it assumed power in 2008. However, the process of thinking got momentum after 2013 general elections and during the tenure of Pakistan Tehreek-e- Insaaf (PTI). It was

during the tenure of PTI when Pakistan arranged a grand dialogue over its security and its related paradigms in the capital city, Islamabad.

However, many independent foreign policy observers believe that Pakistan faced some serious challenges which ultimately created a new thinking regarding the change in foreign policy directions. In this regard, it is believed that the growing poverty, frequently decreasing level of GDP growth, issues faced by the people in health and environmental hazards in twenty first century ultimately compelled the governments and foreign policy influencers to think about new avenues and dynamics of Pakistan foreign policy (Ghazanfar 2022). Similarly, the shift in the foreign policy of different regional players from geopolitics to geo-economics also led Pakistan to a new thinking regarding the traditional dynamics of foreign policy. The example of China, India, Malaysia, Indonesia, Singapore and Taiwan did have influence over changing dynamics of Pakistan's foreign policy. Therefore, Pakistan gradually started thinking to bring some sorts of modification in its traditional foreign policy surrounded by threat and insecurity perception in the regional and international context (Chapman 2018).

In fact, all the above factors played their role in bringing some sorts of changes in the traditional perception and priorities of Pakistan foreign policy. However, while giving reference to CPEC, Faisal (2018) argues that although Pakistan has tried to give attention to economic development but still the fact cannot be denied that it has failed to bring practical shift in its foreign policy from geo-politics to geo-economics. Thus, the change can only be observed at the level of perception and thinking among the foreign policy formulators. Similarly, the traditional security paradigm still influences the nature and direction of Pakistan's foreign policy. For the purpose to understand the change at the level of perception and thinking, it seems pertinent to discuss the

shift through analysing different dynamics. Ultimately, it seems very much important to highlight the factors which contributed to change in perception and also to analyse the major question that why the change could not be materialized at practical level? What are the dominant factors which still create hurdles in the way of complete foreign policy shift of Pakistan from geopolitics to geo-economics in 21 centuries? However, before going to dwell into the critical evaluation of strategic dynamics of Pakistan's foreign policy and shift in these dynamics, it seems pertinent to explain that what is meant by strategic dynamics in foreign policy at all?

#### **4.2. Strategic Dynamics of Foreign Policy**

Strategic dynamics in foreign policy basically refers to all those evolving patterns and interactions among the independent states to pursue their strategic interests at international front. So far as the components of strategic dynamics in foreign policy are concerned, national interests come at the top of these. A state strives to achieve economic development as the national interest. These also include safety of territorial integrity and safeguard of ideological foundations of the state (Martini 2012). Similarly, another important dimension of traditional strategic dynamics includes the formation of alliances and coalitions. In fact, coalitions and alliances are formed by a state with the purpose to increase and strengthen strategic competences. Having this objective at the forefront, another important element includes diplomacy and negotiations by the state. It is important to mention here that state prefer negotiation and diplomacy with the purpose to address conflicts at international front. Diplomacy is also preferred with the purpose of promoting cooperation. However, negotiations are always preferred to achieve the desired goals set out by the states (Hocking 2016). According to Redd (2013), national security dynamics also play an important role in formulating a foreign policy around traditional security paradigm. A state thinks over

perceived and exposed threats to its security. After analysing the impending threats, a state formulates its foreign policy with the objectives to secure its border from those threats. Similarly, important consideration for a state is thus to structure relationship with those states which could secure its borders by minimizing the proposed threat perceptions. According to Hocking (2016), economic interaction is also a very much vital consideration for a state while formulating its foreign policy around strategic dynamics. A state strives to build up relationship with other state with the objective to strengthen its economic ties with it. However, according to the author, core objective behind this economic tie is always building security capabilities. In this regard, a state pursues such efforts which could decrease economic dependency on international donors. It structures positive interaction with all those states which may prove helpful in achieving this important objective of economic development.

Joining international institutions with the purpose to enhance the pace of economic development forms another important ingredient of traditional approach to foreign policy. States join different international organizations with the purpose to enhance the pace of economic progress. Of course, states seek to enhance economic growth but the fact cannot be denied that in traditional security, building security has always been remained priority of the states behind their engagement at international front (Hocking 2016). Similarly, managing of crisis forms another important dimension of traditional foreign policy. Crisis can be in form of poverty, floods, unemployment, and it can be even in form of international crisis. In 21<sup>st</sup> century, many states have discarded the traditional approach to foreign policy. They have moved towards adopting new approaches like economic and humanitarian approaches. Under these approaches, they have achieved incredible growth in their economies and the lives of people at large (Faisal,2018). Moreover, in traditional approach, states have moved

towards analysing new global trends. After analysing new trends, states try to adopt those strategies which could fulfil their needs according to the global demands. Of course, the fundamental purpose behind adopting foreign policy according to international trend is to meet the emerging issues. These emerging issues include growing poverty, unemployment, health crisis and other humanitarian crisis (Chapman 2018).

### **4.3. Analysing Shift in Strategic Dynamics from Geo-Politics to Geo-Economics**

As the very name of the present chapter shows, it tries to evaluate the shift in Pakistan's foreign policy from geo-politics to geo-economics. Shifting strategic dynamics means the shift from military and defence concerns to finding economic opportunities. It tries to discuss and evaluate that whether Pakistan has shifted its foreign policy from geopolitics to geo-economics in its real sense? What types of fundamental factors and forces involved behind the traditional security paradigm of Pakistan's foreign policy have been changed yet? To investigate the real nature of Pakistan foreign policy and shift in it, the present chapter tries to discuss it in detail in the coming lines.

#### **4.3.1 Agreements of Trade and Finding Opportunities of Investment**

Pakistan's foreign policy has always been under the influence of security dynamics. To fulfil the objectives of building security, Pakistan has indeed joined various agreements at international and regional fronts. However, the core aim of these agreements had been the achievement of security capability (M. Syed 2014). However, as Mahmood (2018) argues that Pakistan has brought a remarkable change in its foreign policy priorities from geopolitics to geo-economics. The author gives the examples of China, Malaysia and Sri Lanka. Pakistan has free trade agreements with

these nations. Similarly, Pakistan has joined the South Asian Association for Regional Cooperation where Pakistan has tried to take a leading role for the development of mutual trade and investment among the member states. More importantly, Pakistan has also built mutual trade agreements with nations like Indonesia, Turkey, and Iran and most importantly with Mauritius (R.A. Khan,2019).

Similarly, Pakistan and United States of America started negotiations in 2004 and finalized agreement in 2012. Likewise, both the states have Trade and Investment Framework Agreement (TIFA) with the purpose to increase mutual investment. Along with it, Pakistan has constructed trade and mutual assistance relationship with Singapore, Czech Republic, South Korea, Denmark, Spain, Egypt, Sri Lanka, France, Sweden, Germany, Switzerland, Indonesia, Syria, Iran, Tajikistan, Italy, Tunisia, Japan, Turkey, Kazakhstan, Turkmenistan, Kuwait, U.A.E, Kyrgyz Republic, United Kingdom, Lebanon, Uzbekistan, Laos and Yemen (Mahmood 2018). Moreover, Pakistan has signed trade agreement with Tajikistan under the name of Pakistan-Tajikistan Transit Trade Agreement. The purpose of this agreement is to increase the level of economic investment between the two nations. Likewise, the trade agreement with the name of Pakistan-Uzbekistan Preferential Trade Agreement (PTA) is another example where Pakistan can be quoted as giving priority to economic development by developing international trade agreements. Even Pakistan has tried to construct fruitful trade relations with its neighbouring country Afghanistan. In this regard, it seems pertinent to mention that Pakistan and Afghanistan has signed Pak-Afghan Transit Trade Agreement (Paswan 2017).

Similarly, Pakistan has focused building its trade relationship with China as well. In this direction, both the countries have signed Pak-China Free Trade Agreement in Goods and Investment, Pak-China Free Trade Agreement in Services, Pak-China

Early Harvest Programme and Phase-II China Pakistan. The major focus of all these programmes is to improve mutual trade relationship and to improve mutual investment. Due to these efforts, investment has increased between the two states which is going to impact the lives of common people positively (R. A. Khan 2019). More importantly, Pakistan and Indonesia have entered into different trade agreements. Apart from Pak-Indonesia Preferential Trade Agreements, Indonesia has provided free access to Pakistan to its markets under mutual understanding. In fact, these various trade agreements have put positive impacts on the overall economic growth of Pakistan. According to various experts, the new approach and foreign policy shift of Pakistan from geopolitics to focusing economic development will have far-reaching impacts on the development of common people in Pakistan (R. A. Khan 2019).

#### **4.3.2 Regional Connectivity**

Regional connectivity plays an important role in the economic development of a nation. In fact, the process of regional connectivity has become globalized in modern age for economic prosperity and development of people. According to Jaspal (2023), Economic Cooperation Organization recently meeting in Tashkent has created the idea of linking landlocked countries of Central Asia to different states for the purpose to boost up their economic status. According to the author, Pakistan was given special attention and the idea to link Pakistan to different region of the world in general and with ECO countries in particular was highly thoroughly debated and highly appreciated. Unlike previous foreign policy priorities, Pakistan has brought about changes in its foreign policy outlook in 21<sup>st</sup> century. The available literature argues that Pakistan moved towards updating its foreign policy according to the emerging demands of 21<sup>st</sup> century and have focused upon regional connectivity (Faisal 2019).

The process began immediately after the end of Cold War and was speeded up in the beginning of 21<sup>st</sup> century. The signing of different transit trade agreements proved to be the first steps towards this direction of regional connectivity. Moreover, Pakistan took various steps towards regional connectivity. In this regard, National Logistic Cell (NLC) plays an important role in the process of connectivity of Pakistan to different states like Turkey and Azerbaijan.

As mentioned above, Pakistan had already joined the ECO but in recent years, Pakistan has developed deep interest in the overall development and activities of ECO. Pakistan has linked itself with different states of the region. The main slogan of ECO in 2023 is “Year of Strengthening Connectivity” where all the member states have pledged to boost up the process of connectivity and to focus the field of economic progress for the larger interests of the region. On January 24, 2023, Bilawal Bhutto Zardari, Foreign Minister of Pakistan, when he was addressing the 26th COM conference at Tashkent, pressed upon the fact that “regional connectivity by the expansion of road and rail schemes, introducing liberal reforms in visa regimes and making border procedures more and more simple, would definitely make the ECO countries enable to act as a bridge and create mutual inter-dependencies (Jaspal 2023). Similarly, the involvement of Pakistan in the process of construction of China Pakistan Economic Corridor is going to prove a good step towards this direction of regional connectivity. Apart from its direct advantages to Pakistan, CPEC will open new avenues of investment for other regional states. It will lead to deepening the process of regional connectivity. In fact, in modern age, Pakistan has linked with different Central Asian, South Asian and Southeast Asian nations through water, rail and roads which is playing an important role in the development of Pakistan (Nasim 2022).



The process of regional connectivity adopted by Pakistan will definitely prove productive for the overall progress of people. Pakistan has given preference to the process because of growing poverty in the country. In fact, apart from non-developmental budgetary burden, Pakistan is also perturbed due to increasing economic disparities. The number of poor people is increasing day by day resulting in many other related issues. According to a scholar, Pakistan has realized the fact that issues like clean drinking water shortage, health issues and many other social problems originated because of dismal economic situation of the country can only be addressed through boosting economic pace which is possible only through connecting with more and more regional and international states (Khetran 2016).

Looking forward, The China-Pakistan Economic Corridor (CPEC), which emphasizes regional connectivity and economic cooperation, is crucial to Pakistan's foreign policy shift from geopolitics to geo-economics (Wolf 2019). The goal of China-Pakistan Economic Corridor (CPEC), a flagship project of the Belt and Road Initiative (BRI), is to link Pakistan's Gwadar Port with China's western region through a network of energy, infrastructure, and economic development projects (Minhas Majeed Khan 2016). By connecting South Asia, Central Asia, and the Middle East, this ambitious initiative not only strengthens Pakistan's economic ties with China but also promotes regional connectivity. Pakistan may see economic growth, foreign investment, and job opportunities because of the China-Pakistan Economic Corridor (CPEC), which will improve trade, energy, and transportation infrastructure (Garlick 2023). Furthermore, increased regional integration, increased geopolitical stability, and the promotion of peace and prosperity in the region could all be facilitated by improved connectivity brought about by CPEC. To guarantee that the economic, social, and strategic advantages of CPEC are optimized for the state of Pakistan, obstacles like security

worries, environmental ramifications, and possible debt loads must be successfully tackled. All things considered, the China-Pakistan Economic Corridor (CPEC) offers Pakistan a major chance to take advantage of its geoeconomic edge and realign its foreign policy goals to promote economic growth and cooperation in the region (Minhas Majeed Khan 2016).

#### **4.3.3. Connectivity with Global Economic Institutions**

Connectivity with global economic institutions have become common practice for newly developing economies. So far as the developing nations like Pakistan are concerned, there is a huge criticism on the lending which Pakistan receives from the global economic institutions like International Monetary Fund (IMF) and World Bank (WB). However, many scholars argue that these global economic institutions play an important role in shaping the regional economic policies and priorities of developing nations like Pakistan. While giving example of Pakistan, a scholar argues that Pakistan has brought tremendous change in its foreign policy priorities. Earlier, the focus of Pakistan was on geopolitics which is gradually changing toward geoeconomics because of the pressure from these international economic institutions (M. Anwar 2006). While referring to IMF agreement with Pakistan in 2022, Mr. Nathan Porter, International Monetary Fund (IMF) Mission Chief for Pakistan, said that IMF had reached to final decision after meeting with Finance Minister Miftah Ismael. The government of Pakistan agreed in principles that it will bring reforms in its economic outlook and shall take conducive steps to make its economic bases broadened and inclusive (IMF 2022).

On the hand, the fact cannot be denied that apart from WB and IMF, there are different other global economic institutions where Pakistan is seeking to get economic benefits for the larger interests of the nations. Pakistan is seeking to meet its economic

needs by bringing drastic reforms in its internal and external economic outlook. In this regard, Pakistan has brought changes in its foreign policy outlook through engaging with different international monetary organizations like World Trade Organization, Economic Cooperation Organization, and Asian Development Bank. Pakistan is seeking economic help from these economic organizations which provide help in meeting the balance of payments on the one hand while on the other hand, Pakistan is bound to adopt its internal and external policy outlook according to the international standards (Husain 2004). No doubt, the process of frequent lending and borrowing money has become a burden on the poor section of the society but unlike in the past, Pakistan has been made strictly bound to follow the regulations imposed by these institutions which could lead to better prospects in the future if Pakistan learn to use the borrowed money on developmental projects.

#### **3.3.4. Resolving Conflicts through Economic Cooperation**

It is generally argued that economic stability for conflict resolution has always been one of the most reliable and durable tools. In fact, economic dependency creates an environment which is mostly conducive for mutual co-existence of nations. So far the case of Pakistan is concerned, the history of its foreign policy shows that it has always preferred force for the resolution of its conflicts in the region. In this regard, the example of wars with India and tussle with Afghanistan is evident from the history of Pakistan (Firdous 2015). This attitude of Pakistani state has proved destructive for its economic development at large. Although a vast body of literature has been produced surrounding around Pak-India resolution of disputes like Kashmir issue through building cooperation and mutual assistance. In his leading work, Harshe (2005) argued that India and Pakistan can resolve their issues of divergence like that of Kashmir through engaging in bilateral economic agreements. He gave examples of

European nations that how they adjusted their mutual differences which had led them to fight the two World Wars.

However, while giving example of CPEC, many scholars argue that Pakistan has brought shift in its traditional approach in its policy towards resolving conflicts through the use of force. Argue that Pakistan has realized the fact that issues of mutual divergence can be changed into convergence and agreements through engaging in mutual trade and economic assistance. Many scholars are of the opinion that the initiation of CPEC was first step towards this direction (Muhammad 2019). Similarly, while giving examples of China and Pakistan Economic Corridor, there are some scholars who argue that the project shall incentivize more and more regional actors which will ultimately lead to greater economic interdependence and cooperation in the region. These scholars are of the opinion that Pakistan knew the process of interconnectedness through CPEC (E. a. Hussain 2020). Nawaz Sharif, Prime Minister of Pakistan, addressed the meeting while he went on official visit to China and said that “CPEC is the strategic economic initiative of Pakistan. It will provide opportunities of interconnectedness to different regional countries. In fact, it will boost up our economy and the peace of the region. The Prime Minister wished and stated that no country of the region should be left behind. The region shall take advantage of the project through facilitating its successful completion” (Secretariat ,2016).

#### **4.3.5. Focusing Sustainability of Environment**

Environmental sustainability has become one of the dominant shifts in Pakistan’s foreign policy in 21<sup>st</sup> century. No doubt, Pakistan is exposed to diverse issues resulting in the degraded environmental conditions of the country. Pakistan is currently facing the scarcity of food, clean drinking water, hazardous floods,

deforestation, and desertification. These problems have generated economic woes for Pakistan which need to be tackled on immediate grounds. The Federal Minister for Climate Change Sherry Rehman while addressing the Conference of Parties (CoP) 27 argued that Pakistan is facing a serious humanitarian crisis because of climate change. She argued that Pakistan is facing issues due to climate change although the share of Pakistan in making the environment degraded is very minimum. She urged the developed nations to take measures for controlling or at least minimizing the side effects of climate change produced by the developed economies due to capitalist competition (Zahidi 2023). In fact, climate change has badly impacted the overall environment of Pakistan which is in return impacting the economic condition of the country.

There is a long debate of scholars about what Pakistan has done to control the damages produced because of climate change. In this regard, Pakistan has brought about a shift in its traditional thinking and is trying to address the problems through bringing innovations in its traditional approach in foreign policy. Kakakhel (2015) argues that Pakistan has seriously pondered over its first ever National Climate Change Policy which is working since 2012 in the country. Similarly, efforts are being under way to implement the policy according to its spirit. Along with it, Pakistan has focused to take help from Green Climate Fund with the purpose to control the negative impacts of climate change to the environment of the country. No doubt, according to the author, there are issues in the process of implementation of National Climate Policy because of the economic deficiency, but the change in outlook of Pakistan towards environmental degradation is going to prove a positive step towards this direction.

According to different scholars, being a less emitter of polluted gases to the air and due to the influential role of traditional dynamic on foreign policy, Pakistan has failed to address the environmental issues in the past. However, Pakistan is seeking to broaden the scope of its foreign policy and to include and address some of the pressing issues related to the environmental degradation and climate change (M. A. Khan 2016). In fact, Pakistan has been involved in different international forums with the purpose to address the challenging issues posed by the environmental changes across the world. Apart from internal policies to address the environmental challenges, Pakistan is also a member state of different international climatic changes forums from Pakistan is seeking to get maximum economic and environmental protection related benefits in the long run (Janjua 2021).

#### **4.3.6. Preference to Technology and Innovation**

Pakistan is among the countries which lacks far behind in the field of technology and innovation. On the other hand, the fact cannot be denied that technology has become a backbone for overall development of a nation. Contrary to the past attitude, different scholars argue that Pakistan is focusing introducing new policy preferences in the field of technology. In this regard, the country has already started developing relationship with those developed states which can enrich and facilitate Pakistan in the field of science and technology (Naz 2021). In fact, by introducing new dynamics in foreign policy, Pakistan is trying to join the supply chains focused upon introducing innovation in the field of Information Technology (IT) sector. According to a scholars, during the government of PTI, Abdul Razak Dawood, tried to introduce Pakistan into the global supply chain. In this regard, it is argued that there have been beginning and revolutions on two sides: Pakistan tried to assemble and then manufacture products made of electronic. In this regard, attention was made to

producing cell phones. Second, the government tried to mushroom successful start-ups, to grow the quantity of IT exports and last but not the least the focus on free lancing services (Nizamani 2022).

Pakistan is now engaged with US, China, Japan, Taiwan and France in the field of technological innovation. Imran Khan, the Prime Minister of Pakistan, said while addressing the E-Commerce Convention in Islamabad that future of Pakistan is lying in the development of Information Technology and its development. He reiterated that Pakistan would increase its technological exports to 50 billion dollars. Khan further said that Pakistan has the potential in form of young youth who can be utilized in the development of IT sector in Pakistan. On the same platform, Senator Aon Abbas said that development of IT sector is one of the top priorities of Pakistan and the government shall leave no stone unturned in this direction (Recorder 2022).

The above narrative clearly shows Pakistan's tilt towards introducing new technologies and its commitment to enhance its economic growth pace through information technology. In fact, the world is moving fast towards the attainment of humanitarian goals because of their preference to information technology. The solution of many problems of Pakistan also lies in the development of IT sector. While giving reference of IT sector in India, PM Khan said that exports of IT of India increased from 1 billion dollars to 10 billion dollars within the time period of ten years. He urged that if India can do that, we also have the potential to do that (Recorder 2022).

### **3.3.7. Islamabad Security Dialogue and Foreign Policy of Pakistan**

Pakistan held National Security Dialogue in Islamabad during the tenure of Imran Khan, PM of Pakistan. During the dialogue, an emphasis was made on national security but with different perspective, the perspective of geo-economics. In the

dialogue, the foreign policy framers from the side of government and other independent experts from Pakistan and international community raised questions over the traditional approach to national security. The government of PTI including Prime Minister Imran Khan agreed in principle to modify Pakistan's foreign policy and to make it more humanitarian and people friendly (Nasir 2021). During the Dialogue, Imran Khan questioned criticism of US over his visit to Russia. He said that India is trading with Russia and importing oil for its domestic needs but there is no pressure on it. While we are always under pressure. If India could pursue independent foreign policy than why not Pakistan? He said that we have the very right to construct relationship with international community according to our free choice, without foreign interference (Dawn,2022). Apart from government of PTI, the independent observers and foreign policy experts also preferred and suggested for Pakistan to take independent line of action in its foreign policy.

The government also reaffirmed here that Pakistan wants to build relationship of trust and mutual respect with its neighbours including India. The government preferred to solve the unresolved issues between India and Pakistan through mutual understanding, negotiation and dialogue. The foreign policy framers of Pakistan stressed upon pursuing independent foreign policy based on the principles of geo-economics and humanitarian perspectives. In this regard, the government confirmed and stressed that Pakistan shall try to make itself invincible in terms of security through making its economy developed. It was also reaffirmed that Pakistan shall try to focus economic development and progress of common people through constructing economic friendly relationship with regional as well as international economically developed states (B. S. Syed 2021).



### **3.3.8. Convergence of Geo-Economics vs Geopolitics in Pakistan's Foreign Policy**

Although, in its Security Dialogue held in Islamabad, Pakistan stressed upon pursuing independent foreign policy formulated under the objectives and paradigms of geo-economics. However, the shift of Pakistan's foreign policy from geopolitics to geo-economics is still limited only to the level of wish. The shift has not yet materialized due to different internal and external factors. So far external factors are concerned, the influence of United States of America on Pakistan's foreign policy cannot be minimized in short term. United States has deep strategic interests in Pakistan's foreign policy because of the growing influence of China and Russia in the region (M. Hussain 2016). Similarly, to counter Russia, USA has strategically important interests in the region of Central Asia, particularly Afghanistan. In fact, United States still needs the support of Pakistan to fulfil its objectives. Similarly, India is still a threat perception to Pakistan. The perception of threat from the side of India has further increased after it settled down the disputed status of Occupied Jammu and Kashmir. Apart from it, India is also trying to have influence in Afghanistan which is further increasing threat perception for Pakistan (Nasim 2022).

Similarly, Pakistan is still under various threats internally. Recently, it is going through and facing direct threat from Taliban. Particularly, Tehrek-e-Taliban Pakistan (TTP) is very much active in different parts of the country. This insurgent group is targeting security agencies particularly. Even the lives of common people are not spared. The phenomenon of Taliban is creating direct threat to the state of Pakistan. It impacts the economic performance of the country and even the political environment is also affected from the insurgent activities of these terrorists group. In fact, Pakistan is spending a large amount of capital on handling insurgent groups like TTP, Al-Qaeda and many other terrorist groups (Zakaria 2019). Although, Pakistan is trying

to adopt its foreign policy on the parameters and paradigms of geo-economics, it has still to cover a long journey to materialize this desire. Both, external and internal factors are still influencing the direction of Pakistan's foreign policy.

On the other hand, Pakistan has signed different international agreements and has been involved at international fronts with the purpose to achieve economic stability and to ameliorate the woes of the common people. Thus, there is a blend of geopolitics and geo-economics in the foreign policy orientation of Pakistan. In fact, Pakistan is recently seeking to ameliorate the economic problems of common people vis a vis to make itself invincible in front of growing external as well as internal threats.

### **Conclusion**

Pakistan's foreign policy has always been influenced by geopolitical considerations throughout its political history. Due to one factor or the other, Pakistan has failed to develop its foreign policy around geo-economics paradigms and objective. However, due to different humanitarian crisis faced by Pakistan in recent years, the country has tried for the first time to bring some sorts of modifications in its foreign policy objectives. The example of this modification can be highlighted in form of Security Dialogue held in Islamabad during the previous government of PTI in particular and from the policies taken by PML (N) and PPP government in previous regimes in form of launching projects like CPEC. Pakistan reaffirmed and committed to follow independent and economic based foreign policy to meet the emerging economic needs of the nation and of people.

However, in face of emerging external and internal threats, Pakistan is still unable to pursue independent and humanitarian based foreign policy. It is either under the influence of America or threat from its neighbour states like Afghanistan and India

have not allowed the country to make its foreign policy independent. Although, Pakistan tried to bring some sort of shifts in its foreign policy orientation, it has not yet done so. On the other hand, the fact cannot be denied that Pakistan is currently facing humanitarian crisis. There is a dire need to bring reforms in foreign policy orientation of Pakistan. However, internal and external factors need to be addressed for that purpose. In fact, all these problems can be addressed through concerted efforts particularly from the side of politicians which are unfortunately not united over the core objectives and direction of Pakistan's foreign policy.

## **CHAPTER:5**

### **FROM GEOPOLITICS TO GEO-ECONOMICS: PROSPECTS AND CHALLENGES**

#### **5.1 Introduction**

Pakistan's foreign policy has historically been strongly influenced by geopolitics, especially in the decades of Cold War. In order to survive the intense power confronts put on by the bipolar world order, the nation strategically aligned itself with global powers, particularly the United States (Scholvin, 2018). A security-centric strategy was further strengthened by the ongoing war with India, particularly over the disputed territory of Kashmir. Traditional geopolitical factors shaped alliances and strategic engagements (Cohen, 1984). Pakistan has strategically shifted from geopolitics to geo-economics in response to the intensifying geopolitical rivalry between superpowers, which has made diplomacy unpredictable and international peace vulnerable. The nation's first National Security Policy, which focused on geo-economics, indicated how substantially foreign policy had shifted (Hassan, 2020).

The shifting interests of regional and international powers had a significant impact on Pakistan's foreign policy, particularly with regard to its neighbours, India and Afghanistan. Pakistan's foreign policy decisions and actions are significantly impacted by the security and strategic dynamics of South Asia. However, Pakistan has shown recently that it has shifted toward geo-economics by substantially integrating economic considerations into its foreign policy. This shift is reflected in the country's first National Security Policy (NSP), which addresses several issues such as defence, domestic security, foreign policy, regional peace, and human security. The NSP highlights the significance of comprehensive security, which includes economic and human security in alongside military security and aims to prioritise economic and citizen-centric security, with a focus on most vulnerable segments of society. The

initiative highlights the need for financial resources to ensure both military security and civilian well-being by focusing on geo-economics. Pakistan is emerging as a noteworthy case study by considering states' strategic orientations undergoing a paradigm shift in the dynamic field of international relations (Aslam, 2016).

Looking to the dynamic nature of Pakistan's foreign policy, the present chapter attempts to evaluate the repercussions of Pakistan's foreign policy shift. An attempt has been made to analyse the supposed prospects and challenges if Pakistan practically takes some steps towards changing the direction of its foreign policy from geo-politics to geo-economics.

## **5.2. Prospects of Pakistan foreign policy based on Geo-Economics**

Foreign policy shift from geopolitics to geo-economics has led to great changes in the international socio-political, economic and infrastructural conditions of nations across the world. The foreign policy shift to geo-economics opens up new avenues which lead to progress and development. In fact, according to many foreign policy experts, the present world has shifted its attention from concentrating on traditional patterns of their foreign policy parameters. In fact, states have connected their security with economic development (Wigell, 2018). So far Pakistan is concerned, it is still struggling to bring some sorts of shifts in its foreign policy from geo-politics to geo-economics. It has always been like a sandwich between its security concerns and the growing woes of common people because of shrinking economy of the country. However, Pakistan can foresee the following prospects if it moves towards changes in its traditional foreign policy parameters and drivers.

### **5.2.1 Economic Diplomacy through Geo-Economics**

In fact, Pakistan's foreign policy is starting to prioritize economic diplomacy more and more. It is concentrated on reorganizing diplomatic initiatives and levels in order

to meet as many economic goals and targets as possible. Leading experts in the sector, however, contend that Pakistan still requires persistent efforts to participate in bilateral and multilateral agreements in order to open up more and more economic fronts for its collapsing economy. Scholars contend that Pakistan need to make complete use of regional organizations such as ECO, SAARC, and SCO, as well as global platforms such as the World Trade Organization (WTO) (Jaspal, 2019).

It is an undeniable reality that Pakistan may use these regional and international organizations to expand its commercial cooperation and involvement. More crucially, by adhering to this precise geo-economic diplomacy, the goal of attracting Foreign Direct Investment (FDI) can be increased. If the plan is implemented as intended, Pakistan can increase its involvement through economic cooperation (Tariq, 2020).

The process and strategy to facilitate trade, focus negotiations and creating an environment which remains friendly to international corporations and multi-national companies can lead to development in different sectors. It can bring positive impacts on the lives of common people. No doubt, the strategy can make the country more secure if it becomes economically at a better position. More importantly, the opening up of different diplomatic channels can expose Pakistan to international community and economically rich and diversified markets. This will automatically increase the prospects of economic progress for the country. It will furthermore increase the chances of economic competition in the country both among the regional and international investors.

### **5.2.2 Expansion and Diversification of Trade**

One of the main tactics in achieving the goals of geo-economic foreign policy is trade expansion and diversification. Its main goals are to increase the nation's economic participation in regional and global fora and lessen reliance on a small number of

trading partners. Experts say that this policy priorities and provides importance to expanded trade agreements and contacts with rising economies, especially those in the Middle East, Central Asia, and Africa. Likewise, the maintenance of relationships with established partners such as the United States and the European Union occurs parallel with the development of trade partnerships with emerging economies (Caselli, 2020).

Regarding Pakistan, implementing a geo-economic strategy in its foreign policy can offer chances to reduce reliance on a small number of trading partners and broaden its trading relationships with both established and developing nations. Pakistan's geographical proximity to Central Asia provides a natural opportunity. Pakistan will investigate trade prospects in various fields, including manufacturing, e-commerce, information technology, and agriculture, with these central Asian nations. In the same way, Pakistan will have the chance to establish balanced trade relationships with Middle Eastern nations owing to the geo-economics strategy. These nations are significant players in the development of infrastructure, oil, and gas.

Pakistan will thus take advantage of trade prospects with the Middle Eastern economy in energy-related projects, service construction, and most importantly, consumer goods. Africa is in a similar situation. Pakistan will strengthen its economic connections with African nations. Utilizing the potential for commerce with African economies can be achieved in all manners. Trade in textiles, agriculture, and other significant industrial goods can be carried out in the region. Pakistan will also concentrate on its trade ties with its long-standing allies, such as China, the United States, and the European Union. In terms of China, Pakistan will take advantage of the chances presented by the strategically significant China Pakistan Economic Corridor (CPEC). There will be an attempt to establish stable and realistic relations

with China. It will benefit Pakistan not just in trade but also in terms of strong ties in the fields of transfer of technology, infrastructure development, and even industry cooperation. Similar to this, Pakistan will have made use of its trade alliances with the United States of America, the European Union, and the World Trade Organization after embracing geo-economic principles in its foreign policy. Pakistani goods will make full use of these economies' huge and prosperous markets for export.

More significantly, these economies can support Pakistan's infrastructural development. In a broader sense, these economies can also be used for energy-related initiatives, personnel changes, and technological innovation. Likewise, Pakistan has the ability to customize its trade deals to developing nations, long-standing allies, and prominent regional economies. Along with pursuing agreements before happened, new trade deals with these economies must be negotiated. To strengthen trade and commerce cooperation, Pakistan will prioritise joining trade agreements with regional blocs. As a matter of fact, Pakistan will have chances because of these relationships to advance its technological infrastructure, improve its transportation and logistical infrastructure, and build its digital infrastructure. More and more new opportunities for economic advancement will become available as a result of the geo-economics shift in foreign policy. These new opportunities can be rightfully utilized through formulating timely policies and their follow up.

### **5.2.3. Energy security and investment Promotion**

Pakistan is currently experiencing a serious energy sector problem. It also struggles with poor foreign investment because of the deplorable state of law and order and the instability brought on by political upheaval and terrorism. Pakistan therefore requires a solution to its energy crisis as well as a surge in foreign direct investment. Pakistan must, however, build its own internal energy infrastructure in order to fulfil the



country's rising energy demands and get over the looming shortage. Pakistan may explore and produce oil and gas resources as a result of the new foreign policy strategy. By building and encouraging energy-related cooperation with nearby and regional nations, it can result in the expansion of renewable energy sources (Mirjat, 2017).

It is an undeniable reality that Pakistan has been subjected to load-shading for a considerable amount of time due to a persistent lack of energy, including gas and electricity. The country's industrial production and economic growth have been impacted by this phenomenon. Additionally, the problem has caused both domestic and foreign investors to lose faith in the situation.

In order to sustain the declining economy, Pakistan must prioritize addressing this issue in its geo-economics foreign policy. By doing so, the geo-economic policy can create new opportunities for the nation, including forging relationships with states that produce energy in a relatively durable manner and finding ways to reduce its fiscal deficit. Once Pakistan manages its trade imbalance and regains the trust of foreign investors, the nation can proceed towards economic development, minimizing and eventually controlling the shortfall in the energy sector (Adnan, 2023).

Above all, Pakistan can leverage the potential of its neighbours, including China, Russia, Afghanistan, and other Central Asian states, by adopting a geo-economic approach to foreign policy. These are wealthy countries in terms of energy output. By fostering close ties with these energy-rich nations, Pakistan can increase attention to the country's energy needs.

#### **5.2.4. Balancing the trade:**

Pakistan, as previously mentioned, is confronted with various issues. Trade imbalances have been a major issue in Pakistan since 1947, along with a host of other issues. Sadly, Pakistan has been unable to achieve a balance in its import and export trade because of traditional security paradigm in international relations. Throughout its economic history, the nation has experienced a continuous trade deficit. Pakistan has been predominantly dependent on imports in this aspect. The desired and necessary level of export growth has not been achieved. As such, the nation has progressively become heavily indebted to foreign countries (Baloch, 2009)

Unfortunately, Pakistan has been largely dependent on imports of goods like machinery, oil, and technological equipment. However, the nation's export history has always been extremely poor, which has led to problems with trade imbalance.

The country can maximize trade and minimize its trade imbalance by implementing a geo-economic foreign strategy. Pakistan must, however, make deliberate attempts to move in this direction by taking some tangible actions. Pakistan must, first and foremost, reduce its dependency on established trading partners. Geo-economics foreign policy can help achieve this goal. With this new strategy, Pakistan would naturally look for new international customers in recently growing economies such as those in Central Asia, the Middle East, and Africa in order to maximize its exports (Baloch, 2009). In the same way, Pakistan might boost export demand by being competitive in new international economic markets. The country will also consider reducing its cost of living, which will inevitably result in lessening the strain on its imports of goods. This will reduce the pressure on Pakistan's foreign exchange reserves. Furthermore, as per specialists in foreign policy and economics, economic

growth is closely linked to both state security and human security in any given nation, increasing trade will inevitably solve the security issue (Brown, 2007).

#### **5.2.5. Managing Terrorism and Extremism:**

Since the military dictatorship of Zia-ul-Haq, terrorism has been one of Pakistan's gravest problems, causing death and severe damage to the nation's economy and human resources. It has also led to a state of lawlessness and insecurity that has consistently deterred foreign and domestic investors. As a matter of fact, the government has always needed to address the question of terrorism. Nevertheless, Pakistan's governments have not been able to effectively combat the threat posed by terrorism and extremism. Though the issue of terrorism and extremism has drawn attention from around the world, especially from major economies like the United States, China, Germany, France, and many other European countries, there is still a need to find a long-term solution. However, it still appears to be a long way off, requiring coordinated efforts to control.

Terrorism has been a major factor in the formation and direction of Pakistan's foreign policy; the country has always preferred to forge relationships with those nations that can support and manage its efforts to combat the threat of terrorism (Abbas, 2021). Pakistan was unable to structure an independent and economic-based foreign policy due to the looming threat of terrorism. But Pakistan's foreign policy is expected to deliver stability to the nation amid growing waves of extremism and terrorism due to geo-economics factors. The geo-economics goals will give Pakistan the chance to expand and fortify its economic foundation. Long-term, it will result in economic growth. This development may be applied to counter internal threats such as extremism and terrorism. Above all, Pakistan must act to bring about the restoration of internal stability because economic activity depends on it. This will inevitably

result in the nation's favourable economic and commercial environment being restored. However, controlling and giving the issue of terrorism first priority will result in the confidence of both domestic and foreign investors being restored. Foreign direct investment will rise as a result. Additionally, Pakistan will look for new allies both domestically and abroad who can assist in combating terrorism. Pakistan's traditional friends, the United States and its allies, were unable to assist Pakistan in finding a solution. Rather, because of foreign interests in the area, terrorism has always spread throughout the region, not just in Pakistan (Ali, 2014).

Still, new perspectives in the area of foreign policy will result from this new economic-based approach. Pakistan must also look for new allies among the Middle East, China, and Central Asian states that are suffering now or may suffer in the future as a result of terrorism. Pakistan has to come up with and implement measures that could bring back the China Pakistan Economic Corridor's prosperity and smooth operation.

The above analysis shows that geo-economic foreign policy provides different prospects both in short as well as in the long run for Pakistan. However, to thoroughly utilize these prospects and to take durable advantages of it, Pakistan first needs to take full shift towards geo-economic foreign policy and to discard the traditional foreign policy parameters. Similarly, Pakistan needs to formulate policies in this regard and then to take serious steps towards fulfilling the objectives which are lying in the geo-economic model of foreign policy.

However, it is undeniable that the world order that has emerged in the 21st century, marked by multi-polarity—a system in which power is shared among numerous states—is controlled by geo-economics rather than geo-politics, given the magnitude

of current economies (Ziauddin, 2015). The concept of a national conflict has shifted from military to "expression of highly sophisticated geo-economic rivalry" (Ziauddin, 2015). A key factor in achieving strategic objectives and interests is the tactics of trade and commerce.

According to Blanke (2012), geo-economics will play a bigger role in imposing impact on various rivals globally in the twenty-first century, while it won't entirely replace geo-politics. In the nuclear and globalized period of today, a national war is not possible due to its catastrophic repercussions. States therefore favour using economic rather than military means to further their political objectives. The concept of geo-economics has begun to take prominence in the nation's foreign policy.

Unfortunately, Pakistan is not a developed country with the capacity to use geo-economics tools and strategies to achieve geostrategic goals. While some academics and policy makers in Pakistan believe that Pakistan has been shifting its policy architecture from geopolitics to geo-economics, especially since the CPEC project was launched, other scholars disagree, arguing that Pakistan has not changed its policy orientation from geopolitics to geo-economics and that "the country has failed to unlock its geo-economic potential due to several prevailing factors and hurdles both at internal and external levels" (Desk, 2017).

### **5.3 Domestic challenges:**

The following internal obstacles have impeded Pakistan's shift from geopolitics to geo-economics:

#### **5.3.1 Role of Military establishment:**

Pakistan's military has been influential in shaping and revising Pakistan's foreign and domestic policies since its inception in 1947. The "military rulers have directly or indirectly seized huge power on the pretext of turning things around and fixing

problems but they ended up leaving the country in the same mess, if not worse," over the past 70 years(Hussain,2018).After its inception, "the perceived or real security and economic threats to Pakistan's sovereignty and territorial integrity have increased the role of the military establishment and, gradually, it became a dominant political institution" (Ahmad). The military in Pakistan has therefore been in charge of formulating foreign policy and matters pertaining to both internal and external security, with the bureaucracy acting as a subordinate partner in this regard (Ahmad)."

The military establishment still controls foreign and national security policy in order to accomplish geostrategic and geopolitical goals (Hussain, 2018). Pakistan "is not in a position to completely replace geopolitics through geo-economics because there are multiple foreign policy challenges stemming from our skewed security-centric policy (Ahmad)" despite the fact that it is true that we live in a geo-economic age where connectivity and integration through economic means, such as trade and investment, are crucial. In the policy-making circles, there are more "security-oriented policy specialists and professionals which inhibit Pakistan's move from geopolitics to geo-economics during the researcher's interview (Dr. Zahid Shahab Ahmad).

The bulk of delegations that visit foreign countries are comprised up of people who are "more security-oriented than business-minded experts and policy makers during the researcher's interview(Dr. Zahid Shahab Ahmad) shared this opinion. Furthermore, "people in Pakistan's foreign policy circles keep emphasizing the country's geostrategic interest in the region, particularly Afghanistan, and the threats emerging from this big enemy India" (Saeed, 2018). Pakistan desperately needs to shift its policy orientation toward geo-economics in this century where countries prefer geopolitics over geo-economics, but unfortunately, "it seems to be hardly

possible because the security apparatus in Pakistan dominates the policy circles, and the military establishment is actually calling the shots."(Mahmood,2022)

### **5.3.2 Economic woes of Pakistan:**

According to experts, competition between states will primarily occur in the economic sphere as the global world order shifts from uni-polarity—where a single hegemonic power dominates the world—to multi-polarity—where multiple powers coexist with a relatively equal distribution of power. The future of international contests will be in the economic realm, where states will utilize their economic power and might to achieve their strategic objectives, as opposed to the past where these competitions took place in the military and conventional warfare domain (Burtlett).

Unfortunately, Pakistan's economy has been in grave danger for many years. It hasn't succeeded in achieving steady and sustained economic development and growth. According to Malik (2019), this economic crisis is characterized by "dwindling foreign exchange reserves, low exports, high inflation, fiscal (difference between expenditure and revenue), and current account deficits (difference between imports and exports)." Pakistan's shift from geopolitics to geo-economics has therefore been greatly impeded by this fragile and worsening economic position. (Saeed, 2018).

Furthermore, "this dire economic picture is seriously harming the country's geo-economic activities, from Pakistan's low contribution to world manufacturing exports to its declining levels of saving and investment and a lack of human development" (Saeed, 2018). Given that geo-economics focuses on a country's capability and strength to use economic pressure to compel other countries, Pakistan lacks the capacity to use these geo-economics instruments because of its fragile economy. Examples of these economic pressures include asset freezes, customs controls, sanctions, and aid suspension.

### **5.3.3 Crisis of Governance**

It goes without saying that a nation's governance problems and policymaking are closely related. "Political stability, good governance, rigorous policy formulation and implementation, and internal security situation: all these factors constantly impact a country's domestic and foreign policy orientation" (Dawn, 2019). (Governance is the use of authority based upon certain laws in order to run the affairs of the states and to work for the welfare of the people).

Pakistan has faced problems with governance ever since gaining its independence. These obstacles, which range from interprovincial rivalry to political instability, governance crises, as well as poor law and order, have not only impeded the country's economic growth but also had a significant impact on its foreign and domestic policy strategies.

Even the CPEC project, which is viewed as Pakistan's most important chance to follow the geo-economics route and attain sustained economic growth, is impeded by a number of domestic issues. The project was labelled as Punjab's, the province with the greatest population, by some political parties and interest groups from Khyber Pakhtunkhwa (KPK), citing ethnic prejudices (Hussain D. E., 2018). According to Hussain D. E. (2018), some nationalist elements in Baluchistan have referred to the China-Pakistan Economic Corridor (CPEC) as Punjab's project, with the intention of exploiting the natural riches of the province.

In addition, the nation has been forced "towards an abysmal state of bad governance" by a poor institutional framework, widespread corrupt practices, and a law and order situation that has scared off and discouraged investors from making investments in Pakistan, harming the economy of the country (Ahmad S. H., 2017). Foreign direct investment is unquestionably necessary for Pakistan's weak and unstable economy,



and although investors from around the globe are willing to make investments there, they are unwilling to take a chance because of the country's unstable political and social environment as well as its inconsistent and short-term policies (Today, 2017).

An alternative perspective on how Pakistan's transition to geo-economics is hampered by the governance problem is one based on efficacy and efficiency. According to Richard Benmessaoud, "the manner in which the state functions, specifically its ability to mobilize its resources and revenue to maximize end results," is what is meant by efficiency and effectiveness in governance. Unfortunately, Pakistan has not been able to effectively and efficiently use its natural resources and geostrategic location to further its national interests (Burki, 2014). Therefore, Pakistan's governance instability is keeping the country from achieving its full geo-economics potential.

#### **5.4 External Challenges:**

To its transition from geopolitics to geo-economics, Pakistan is also facing certain hurdles at external level.

##### **5.4.1 India**

India's apparent attempt to aggravate the challenges facing Pakistan and push it out of South Asia is one of the nation's greatest geopolitical obstacles (Rana, 2019)". Modi's claim that Pakistan is economically crippled and ostracized is absurd (Hussain Z., Geopolitical issues, 2019). Since decades, India has made every effort to undermine Pakistan in some way. According to Hussain Z. (2019), the country's economy and standing in the international community have suffered greatly as a result of the serious foreign and security issues India has caused.

Regarding this, the so-called "The Bay of Bengal Initiative for Multi-Sectoral Technical and Economic Cooperation (BIMSTEC)" (the Bay of Bengal Initiative for

Multi-Sectoral Technical and Economic Cooperation is an organization of seven South and East Asian nations, comprising India, Bangladesh, Nepal, Bhutan, Myanmar, Sri Lanka, and Thailand.) is presented as an alternative to the "South Asian Association for Regional Cooperation" (the South Asian Association for Regional Cooperation is a regional inter-governmental organization in South Asia, which was established in 1985 and has a total of eight countries, comprising Afghanistan, Pakistan, Bangladesh, India, Nepal, and Maldives)" (SAARC) is an attempt by India to exclude Pakistan from South Asian geo-economic and geopolitics (Rana, 2019)".

Being a nuclear power, Pakistan has already advanced to the point where it is not feasible for it to engage in direct military conflict with other countries, particularly with India, its close neighbour. Therefore, scholars in Pakistan believe that India and Pakistan were facing fight in the future on the economic front. However, there is a "huge difference" between Pakistan and India, the two rival countries. The former is much ahead that the latter economically and militarily. Since India has already been unable to defeat Pakistan militarily, it is now using geo-economics influence to exert stress placed on the country as a whole. India is creating new trade routes to Afghanistan and Iran and making different conspiracies against China Pakistan Economic Corridor (CPEC) (Jaspal, 2019).”

India is holding Pakistan accountable for terrorism in "Afghanistan and Kashmir and is trying its level best to put it in the Financial Action Task Force (FATF)" (Times, 2018). The FATF is an intergovernmental body that was created in 1989 to combat money laundering and terror financing. Additionally, India wants to harm Pakistan economically by subjecting it to FATF economic sanctions. "India is lobbying to get Pakistan blacklisted by FATF and was asking other members to put our country (Pakistan) in the blacklist," stated the Federal Minister of Pakistan. India has used the

FATF procedure for political ends, such as forcing Pakistan into bankruptcy (Haidar, 2019). It is also important to note that, despite Pakistan's "ability to thwart India's geostrategic objectives," the country's geo-economics standing is too precarious (Jaspal,

Similar to Pakistan, India has been supporting insurgent organizations in Baluchistan province in order to thwart the CPEC project. "New Delhi has encouraged insurgency in Baluchistan to undermine this project (CPEC), including destroying the gas pipeline and murdering and enslaving workers from China and Pakistan" (Rasheed, 2020). The Indian spy agency, Research and Analysis Wing (RAW) is making no secret of the fact that it is doing all within its power to "interrupt connectivity and investment to destabilize Pakistan economically" (Rasheed, 2020).

In 2016, Kulbhushan Jadhav, who was an Indian Navy officer, has confessed his "involvement of making plans and training militant groups to disrupt CPEC project in Baluchistan (Dawn, 2017)." So, India can pose serious security and economic challenges for Pakistan's geo-economic policies.

#### **5.4.2 Afghanistan:**

Afghanistan is another geopolitical obstacle Pakistan has in using its geostrategic position for geo-economics gains. Afghanistan's ravaged by war and conflict, has been a source of "continuing to bring not only security but geopolitical and geo-economics problems for Pakistan" for decades, most likely since the Soviet Union invaded the country in 1979. As a result, attention will continue to be diverted from Afghanistan's western border. (Naveed, 2015)

Pakistan-Afghan strained relations have always been the biggest obstacle for Pakistan to exploit the geo-economic potential of the region through economic connectivity

(Khan)." According to available data, the total volume of trade with Afghanistan "in 2009 was \$1.4 billion which inched up to \$1.8 billion in 2019; but its share in total trade dipped two percentage points from 7.8% to 5.7% (Afshan Subohi, 2010)." Pak-Afghan relations have been largely characterized by mutual mistrust and security prism (Report, 2014)."

Moreover, Scholars are of the view that instability in Afghanistan is another serious impediment for regional trade and integration, and "without improved in the security situation of the country, robust economic activities is not possible for Pakistan (Shahid Ilyas, 2018)." Even the project of CPEC can only be "materialized if there is an end to the political turmoil and war in Afghanistan (CPEC success linked to stability in Afghanistan: ex-foreign secretary, 2018)." The 'landlocked (Landlocked country is the one that is surrounded by land and have no part of its territory )'Afghanistan is "considered as a natural and most important partner to the CPEC's connectivity, often termed as 'CPEC-plus and can act as a bridge to link Pakistan with Central Asian Republics (Masood, 2019)" But "including it (Afghanistan) in the CPEC project will come at cost because it is a conflict and war-torn country and managing geo-economics dimensions of the relations would be a complicated task (Saeed, 2018)."

Similar to this, Afghanistan's relationship with India presents a significant obstacle to regional integration and economic growth. The two countries' friendship has always been significant and has the ability to affect even the CPEC, a project aimed at regional integration. The president of Afghanistan, Ashraf Ghani, along with other officials have repeatedly declared that "their country will not allow provide Pakistan access to Central Asia, resource-rich region, unless Islamabad allows free flow of trade between Afghanistan and India through its territory" (Ilyas, 2018). Reports also

assert that "India's intelligence agency, RAW, has established its bases in Afghanistan." the China-Pakistan Economic Corridor: Security Challenges and Sequence of Process of Domestic Resistance (2020) by training the Afghan army with the goal of undermining Pakistan and destroying the CPEC via Afghanistan.

Therefore, under the evolving multipolar global order, "India's only strategy in Afghanistan, particularly after the launching of CPEC project, is to hurt Pakistan either economically or strategically" (Rana, 2019).

#### **5.4.3 Saudi-Iran Proxy Wars:**

It is no secret that for many decades, the two oil-rich Middle Eastern nations, Saudi Arabia and Iran, have been involved in proxy conflicts in the area. Because they both exalt their former greatness, they make an effort to control and dominate Middle Eastern theatre. According to Muhammad Muzaffir (2017), the rivalry between these two nations is "tearing the Middle East apart and divided the Islamic world into two groups (Shiite and Sunni group) on sectarian basis." Iran takes pride in being the last vestige of the ancient, greatest Persian civilization, while Saudi Arabia regards itself as the custodian of Makkah and Medina.

In spite of this intense hostility, Pakistan is one of the very few nations that both Saudi Arabia and Iran have mutual friends. These nations are "gripped in extremely difficult dilemma: as any gesture of friendship towards one is seen with suspicious eye by the other one" (Muhammad Muzaffir, 2017). Indeed, Pakistan has made every effort to maintain amicable relations with all parties and has pursued a reasonable and well-rounded strategy; yet, the bumpy trip has not been without its setbacks. "Keeping relationships with both partners on equal footing turns out to be a tightrope walk," says Aslan. (Aslan)

The largest source of remittances to Pakistan is Saudi Arabia, which has been instrumental in stabilizing the country's fragile economy. According to Hussain (2020), the kingdom received approximately \$5 billion in remittances during 2018–2019, accounting for nearly 25% of the \$21.8 billion in remittances that Pakistan received worldwide. Additionally, Saudi Arabia is one of Pakistan's largest trading partners; bilateral trade between Islamabad and Riyadh totalled 3.3 billion US dollars in 2018–20

But scholars believe that Saudi Arabia's aid and investment in Pakistan fulfil geostrategic goals rather than geo-economics ones. It appears, however, that "no strings attached to the aid and investment; it is very rare that such assistance comes without conditions" (Hussain Z. 2020).

China is now more concerned about the \$10 billion Saudi intention to build a refinery in Pakistan's Gwadar region in addition to Iran. According to the latter, the investment may escalate the proxy conflict between Saudi Arabia and Iran in Baluchistan, which could ultimately jeopardize the China-Pakistan Economic Corridor (CPEC) (Siddiq, 2019). Furthermore, "Baloch in Gwadar also see the refinery in the context of the rivalry between Saudi Arabia and Iran." They believe that because Saudi Arabia and the United States share a strategic objective of opposing Iran, it will increase American influence. (Rana, 2019; The Geo-Economy of CPEC)"

Furthermore, Iran objects to the refinery's building in Baluchistan. Tehran's interests are seen to be harmed by Saudi Arabia's investment, according to the Pak-Saudi nexus. Around 27 Iranian Revolutionary Guards and 13 other people died in an attack that took place in Baluchistan in February 2019 and was "claimed by Jaish al-Adl, a Sunni terrorist group based in Baluchistan" (Erdbrink, 2019). This attack was

"pointed out by Iran as evidence of a nexus between Pakistan and Saudi Arabia, with the former potentially acceding to the use of its territory by Saudi Arabia to support Baloch militants against Iran (Editorial, 2019)." Soleimani, a Major General in the Islamic Revolutionary Guards of Iran who was assassinated by the United States in Iraq in January 2020, warned Pakistan about the Saudi proxy war in Baluchistan.

He said, "Pakistan must fully realize that terrorists who are sponsored by Saudi Arabia and operating on its soil are causing trouble for all of the country's neighbours" (TV, 2019).

Even in 2015, Saudi Arabia expressed concerns about Iran being included in the China-Pakistan Economic Corridor (CPEC), stating that "Iranian participation in CPEC may threaten Saudi investment in Pakistan (New ties between the CPEC and Iran)." Saudi Arabia has announced to invest \$20 billion, which is the largest third-party investment in the construction of CPEC (Editorial, 2019).

Pakistan had also refused to send troops to Yemen to support Saudi Arabia's armed operation. Moreover, Saudi Arabia's allies in the Gulf region accused Pakistan of siding with Iran (Jamal U., 2019). Therefore, one may claim that the competition between Saudi Arabia and Iran has grave consequences for Pakistan's geo-economics operations in addition to having a negative impact on the country's security.

### **Conclusions**

To sum up the chapter, Pakistan has made a significant strategic shift towards geo-economics, indicating a clear vision for the country's future that revolves around energy security, increased trade, economic diplomacy, and active investment promotion. This paradigm shift positions Pakistan as a major actor on the

international scene and creates the conditions for a more strategically poised and economically dynamic Pakistan.

Pakistan's shift towards geo-economics offers a compelling future vision with its foundation in the encouragement of investment, increased commerce, energy security, and economic diplomacy. Nonetheless, the path is paved with obstacles arising from the combination of dynamics inside the military system, problems with governance, economic hardships, and external geopolitical complexity. The effectiveness of Pakistan's geo-economic foreign policy and its capacity to capitalise on opportunities and overcome obstacles along the way to becoming a more economically dynamic and strategically positioned country will depend on how well this delicate balance is managed.

Pakistan's geo-economic foreign policy is largely successful because of the careful balance it makes between its goals and the obstacles that lie ahead. The success of this strategy change will depend on how well it can handle the interaction of military dynamics, governance issues, economic obstacles, and external geopolitical complexity. While Pakistan has many obstacles on its path to become a more strategically sound and economically dynamic country, it also has the opportunity to play a significant and influential role in the world economy by overcoming these obstacles.

### **Recommendations**

Looking to the present change in foreign policy parameters of different countries on the one hand and to the growing needs and problems of Pakistan on the other hand, the fact cannot be denied that Pakistan needs immediate considerations and changes in its foreign policy priorities. After going through detailed study and various



dimensions of Pakistan foreign policy, the present study suggests the following recommendations.

### **1. Connecting Geopolitics with Geo-Economics**

No doubt, Pakistan has been under the perception of threat and insecurity in the region. This threat even still continues in different forms and degrees. However, this traditional foreign policy has left the aspect of humanitarian development far behind. What is the need of the hour is that Pakistan needs to create balance and connection between the security threats and the emerging needs of the people which can only be fulfilled by establishing a workable connections between geopolitics and geo-economics between in foreign policy priorities and objectives.

### **2. Regional Balance**

Pakistan has always been under the perception of threat from its neighbours. This threat perception still remains as one of the major drivers of Pakistan's foreign policy. In this regard, Pakistan needs to balance its relationship in the region. In this regard, Pakistan needs to give special attention to India, Afghanistan and China. No doubt, Pakistan needs to strengthen its ties with China. It needs to create a relationship of trust and confidence with India and Afghanistan as well. This approach on the part of engaging countries shall result in bringing stability in the region.

### **3. Pursuing Economic Diplomacy**

Pakistan needs economic security in short run. The people are facing multi-faceted issues because of degrading economic conditions of the country. In this regard, Pakistan needs to pursue economic diplomacy. It shall give focus to prioritizing economic diplomacy in form of inviting direct foreign

investment. Similarly, concerted efforts are required to include and connect economic diplomacy with national security. In this regard, the objectives of National Security Policy (NSP) need to be revisited.

#### **4. Engaging with Multilateral International Forums**

Currently, emphasis has been made by many international countries to be engaged with internationally economically well-off countries. The purpose has always been the attainment of economic development through various economic oriented projects. Pakistan needs to have close engagement with international community which are economically well off. The process can invite foreign direct investment. Pakistan can take direct facilitation in the field of health, education and even minimizing its growing poverty through engaging with different international organizations. Similarly, Pakistan shall focus its engagement with regional organizations like SAARC, SCO and OIC which can lead to introducing many developmental projects in Pakistan.

#### **5. Focusing Collaboration Regarding Climate Change**

As the present study has proved, the present climate change has exposed Pakistan to different issues related to humanitarian crisis. Although, Pakistan is one of the countries emitting the most minimum toxic gases to the atmosphere, it is one the countries effecting the most due to global climatic changes. Pakistan needs to keep itself engaged with international community. It needs to collaborate with international community through engaging with different agreements, talks, organizations and policies. It needs to focus the issue of climatic change and to lessen the side effects of climatic change on the people and economy at large.

## **6. Engagement of Diaspora**

The fact cannot be denied that diaspora can play an important role in highlighting the issues and minimizing the core problems of any country. Diaspora has the capability to project and to bring into the attention of international community any issue which they want to. In this regard, Pakistan needs to develop a sort of strong ties and connections with Pakistani diaspora living abroad. However, the focus should be building relationship with countries where Pakistani diaspora has strong presence and the power to project and highlight the core issues faced by Pakistan. It can help even in creating a soft image of Pakistan in the eyes of globally powerful countries. In it can help in inviting foreign investment through representing soft image of Pakistan. It can be used to highlight the humanitarian violation in the Indian occupied Kashmir as well. It can be utilized for highlighting the climatic challenges and its impacts on Pakistan. Thus, diaspora can be utilized for achieving different objectives by Pakistan.

## **7. Focusing Democracy and Human Right**

Democracy can lead to better prospects and different walks of life. In fact, different nations have achieved the principles of impartiality and non-alignment in foreign policy by following the principles of democracy. As the political system Pakistan reveals that democracy has always been fragile here. It has not been allowed to function freely according to its nature. In this regard, Pakistan needs to allow democracy as a form of government and political system. Similarly, Pakistan is one of the countries where human rights violation has become a matter of routine. This violation has perturbed

the availability of rule of law in the country. Pakistan is required to ensure the applicability of human rights according to the constitution of 1973.

### **8. Rethinking the Policy of Counter Terrorism**

Pakistan is one of the countries which has badly suffered because of terrorism in the region. Although, Pakistan has many times cooperated with western countries in the process of countering terrorism, the issue of terrorism still continues in the neighbouring states as well as in Pakistan. Pakistan has suffered both in terms of economic as well as human loss because of terrorism. In this regard, Pakistan needs to support the international process of countering terrorism. However, Pakistan also needs to have rethinking over its constant influence on countering terrorism while ignoring humanitarian aspects at large. Pakistan need to highlight the danger of terrorism to its economy and people because of frequent support of Pakistan in the process of countering terrorism. It also shall merge the objective of human development in its counter terrorism policy. In fact, in the process, too much emphasis on countering terrorism by Pakistan has relegated many other important issues of Pakistan far behind.

## CONCLUSION

Pakistan's transition in foreign policy from geopolitics to geo-economics signifies a noteworthy change in the nation's strategic perspective and objectives. The present study has investigated the diverse facets of this shift, scrutinizing the historical background, motivators, consequences, and obstacles linked to this transformative movement. It is clear from a thorough examination of many variables that Pakistan's shift to geo-economics is a practical reaction to the changing dynamics of the world political economy and the regional security environment. In addition to summarizing the main conclusions, this conclusion offers insights into the future direction and implications of Pakistan's geoeconomic orientation.

**Historical Context:** Security concerns, territorial disputes, and strategic alliances have historically shaped Pakistan's foreign policy, which is dictated by geopolitical imperatives. However, a new era has arrived where states' foreign policy decisions are increasingly influenced by economic factors, thanks to the end of the Cold War, globalization, and economic interdependence. Pakistan's shift towards geo-economics began in the early years of the twenty-first century, with initiatives for regional economic integration, the promotion of trade and investment, and the pursuit of economic diplomacy.

**Drivers of the Shift:** Pakistan's foreign policy has shifted in favor of geoeconomics due to a number of factors. Pakistan's national agenda now largely revolves around economic imperatives like the need for sustainable development, job creation, and poverty alleviation. Furthermore, Pakistan's geo-economic orientation has been significantly shaped by China's rise as a global economic powerhouse and the country's strengthening economic ties with Beijing as a result of projects like the

China-Pakistan Economic Corridor (CPEC). In addition, the significance of economic diplomacy in accomplishing national goals has been highlighted by globalization, technological advancements, and the shifting dynamics of global trade.

Implications: Pakistan's position on the local, regional, and international stages will be significantly impacted by the shift from geopolitics to geo-economics. Prioritizing economic development at home can promote inclusive growth, lessen socioeconomic gaps, and increase the nation's ability to withstand shocks from the outside world. Initiatives such as the China-Pakistan Economic Corridor (CPEC) hold the potential to establish Pakistan as a hub for trade and investment in the region, supporting infrastructure development, connectivity, and energy security throughout Central and South Asia, the Middle East, and South Asia. Moreover, a geo-economic strategy can improve Pakistan's diplomatic clout, soft power, and appeal as an investment destination worldwide.

Opportunities and Challenges: Although a geoeconomic orientation has bright futures, Pakistan still faces numerous obstacles that need to be overcome in order for it to reach its full potential. Initiatives for regional connectivity and economic development are severely hampered by internal and external security concerns. Moreover, the successful execution of infrastructure projects and economic reforms is hampered by deficiencies in governance, bureaucratic inefficiencies, corruption, and institutional capacity. Furthermore, Pakistan's geoeconomic goals face significant obstacles from geopolitical rivalries, especially with India, a neighbor, and regional instability, like the state of affairs in Afghanistan. But these difficulties also offer Pakistan the chance to take advantage of its natural resources, human capital, and geostrategic location to build alliances, diversify its economy, and become more competitive in the world market.

Future Course: Pakistan's foreign policy shift towards geo-economics will be determined by its capacity to manage the intricacies of the world political economy, deal with domestic issues, and seize new opportunities. Laying the groundwork for long-term prosperity and stability will require institutional reforms, sustainable economic development, and investments in human capital. Realizing Pakistan's goal of becoming a major player in the developing geoeconomic order will require bolstering regional cooperation, improving connectivity infrastructure, and creating an atmosphere that is favorable to trade and investment. Furthermore, Pakistan's national security interests must be protected while its economic potential is maximized on the international arena by striking a careful balance between geopolitics and geoeconomics.

The transition of Pakistan's foreign policy from geopolitics to geo-economics is a calculated reassessment of its priorities in light of the evolving dynamics of the world political economy. Although there are many obstacles to overcome, this shift has enormous potential to lead Pakistan to sustainable growth, increased influence on the international stage, and regional integration. Accepting a geo-economic orientation will help Pakistan realize its goals of peace, development, and prosperity in the twenty-first century by pointing the country in the direction of a more prosperous, stable, and connected future.

Moreover, the foreign policy of Pakistan was set according to the desired principles and objectives immediately after independence. Unfortunately, the newly independent state of Pakistan faced different issues which compelled the foreign policy framers to address those issues on emergency grounds. The core issues which influenced the course and direction of foreign policy of Pakistan included the perception of threat from India and Afghanistan. Moreover, the geostrategic location of Pakistan

compelled the country on thinking around the perception of threat. The geostrategic location of Pakistan became a major source of threat particularly during the Cold War era. Both, Soviet Union and USA took particular interests in Pakistan because of its nearness to the water on its South, proximity to Afghanistan, India, Iran and China and its access to Middles East, Central Asia and Southeast Asia. All these factors played a dominant role in shaping the foreign policy of Pakistan immediately after independence.

During the Cold War era, Pakistan faced two serious challenges to its foreign policy. On the one hand, Pakistan needed security in front of Indian and Afghani threat. It needed weapons and other defence related equipment. While on the other hand, US promised to facilitate Pakistan in making the country equipped in terms of security. Pakistan unfortunately took the side of US and entered into different defence related treaties and agreements. This step of Pakistan put the country on the path of alignment. For almost two decades, Pakistan's foreign policy remained under two dominant factors. One was traditional security dynamics while the other one was its pro-West tendencies. Although, Pakistan tried to bring changes in its foreign policy only at the level of engagement from pro-West to pro-Soviet, but it also could not work properly. In fact, the dominant factor driving Pakistan's foreign policy remained geo-strategic and geo-politics during the socialist regime of Zulfikar Ali Bhutto. The regime of PPP then faced sever hurdles from the side of capitalist block led by the United States of America.

During the military regime of Zia-ul-Haq and Pervez Musharraf, the foreign policy remained under geostrategic and geopolitical considerations. The war of 1965, 1971 and 1999 further exacerbated the existing threat perceptions. The military regime could not bring any sorts of changes and tilt towards humanitarian consideration in



foreign policy of Pakistan. In both the military regimes of Zia-ul-Haq and Musharraf, Pakistan provided full support to USA and played an important role in curtailing terrorism side by side with USA and its western allies. Throughout its political and foreign policy history, Pakistan has remained stick to developing its security capability in the region Vis a Vis India and Afghanistan. In the process, Pakistan could not give due attention to humanitarians needs in its foreign policy. In reality, major issues related to development of common people remained far behind and it would not be useless to say that these issues remained secondary during the process of formulating foreign policy.

However, as the current literature and its evaluation has proved, Pakistan has, for the first time, brought under consideration some of the humanitarian aspects in its foreign policy. As the traditional foreign policy has gradually created humanitarian crisis, the new thinking focused some of the serious issues related to human development. In this regard, Pakistan has been perturbed due to growing poverty, health issues, environmental issues and other issues related to the lives of common people. To address these problems, Pakistan thought about building its relationship with countries who could equipped it with its most emergent need related to the above issues. The initiation of Islamabad Security Dialogue and its focus on building relationship with China have been taken as reference by many experts of the field. No doubt, Pakistan is still struggling to meld its foreign policy on some types of humanitarian needs, however, it is still under various internal and external threats. These threats are still creating problems and hurdles in the way of progressive and independent foreign policy.

Furthermore, Pakistan has started seriously thinking about bringing some sort of modification to its traditional security-dominated approach to foreign policy based on

Geopolitics. In this regard, Pakistan has provided space for geo-economic dynamics in its foreign policy based on humanitarian dimensions. However, after investigation, the present thesis finds that a complete shift has not occurred, and still traditional security paradigm based on Geopolitics still dominates the foreign policy of Pakistan.

## REFERENCES

- Abbas, Syed Ali, and Shabib Haider Syed. 2021. "Sectarian terrorism in Pakistan: causes, impact and remedies." *Journal of Policy Modeling* 43 (2): 350-361. doi:<https://www.sciencedirect.com/science/article/pii/S0161893820300946>.
- Afridi, M. K., M. Haroon, and A. Syed. 2022. "Examining the Implication of the Afghan-Soviet War on Pakistan." *Global Foreign Policies Review* 19-26.
- Ahmed. 2010. "Military and the foreign policy of Pakistan." *South Asian Survey* 17 (2): 313-330. doi: <https://doi.org/10.1177/097152311201700208>.
- Ahmed, Naseem. 2010. "Military and the foreign policy of Pakistan." *South Asian Survey* 17 (2): 313-330. doi:[abs/10.1177/097152311201700208](https://doi.org/10.1177/097152311201700208).
- Ahmed, Naseem. 2010. "Military and the foreign policy of Pakistan." *South Asian Survey* (17) 2: 313-330. doi:<https://journals.sagepub.com/doi/abs/10.1177/097152311201700208>.
- Ahmed, Naseem. 2010. "Military and the foreign policy of Pakistan." *South Asian Survey* 17 (2): 313-330.
- Ahn, Byung Joon. 2010. "The rise of china and the future of east Asian integration." *Asia-Pacific Review* 11 (2): 18-35. doi: <https://doi.org/10.1080/1343900042000292524>.
- Ali, Sharafat. 2014. "Foreign capital flows and economic growth in Pakistan: an empirical analysis." *World Applied Sciences Journal* 29 (2): 193-201. [https://papers.ssrn.com/sol3/papers.cfm?abstract\\_id=2418056](https://papers.ssrn.com/sol3/papers.cfm?abstract_id=2418056).
- AMIGHINI, Alessia. 2016. *Trade and economic relations with Asia*. Strasbourg: European Parliament.
- Amin, Muhammad. 2021. "Foreign policy of Pakistan: "Zulfiqar Ali Bhutto's era." *Research Mosaic* 1 (1): 36-49. <https://researchmosaic.com/index.php/rm/article/view/1>.
- Anderson, David L. 2006. "The Vietnam War." *A Companion to American Foreign Relations* 309-329. doi:[doi/pdf/10.1002/9780470999042#page=322](https://doi.org/10.1002/9780470999042#page=322).
- Ang, James B. 2010. "Research, technological change and financial liberalization in South Korea." *Journal of Macroeconomics* 32: 457-468. doi:<https://www.sciencedirect.com/science/article/pii/S0164070409000445>.
- Anser, Muhammad Khalid. 2022. "The dynamic impact of renewable energy sources on environmental economic growth: evidence from selected Asian economies." *Environmental Science and Pollution Research* 29 (3): 3323-3335. doi:[article/10.1007/s11356-021-17136-8](https://doi.org/10.1007/s11356-021-17136-8).

- Anwar, Maryam Raashed & Rida. 2020. "Pakistan's foreign policy in transition: driving factors and emerging trends." *Perspectives* (17): 1-9.
- Anwar, Mumtaz. 2006. "THE POLITICAL ECONOMY OF INTERNATIONAL FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS' LENDING TO PAKISTAN." *Pakistan Economic and Social Review* 155-180. <https://www.jstor.org/stable/25825292>.
- Anwar, Zahid. 2022. "The non-aligned movement and Pakistan in historical perspective ." *Pakistan Journal of Social Research* 335-340.
- Askari-Rizvi, 3 Hasan. 1983. "Pakistan: Ideology and foreign policy." *Asian Affairs: An American Review* 10 (1): 48-59.
- Aslam, Muhammad, Zakir Hussain, and Fakhra Mujahid. 2022. "Pakistan's Foreign Policy from 2018 to 2022: The PTI Government's Contribution to the Development of Foreign Relations with Major Powers." *Pakistan Languages and Humanities Review* 6 (3): 768-782.  
doi:<https://ojs.plhr.org.pk/journal/article/view/502>.
- Athukorala, Prema-Chandra. 2009. "Trends and patterns of foreign direct investments in Asia: A comparative perspective." *The Journal of Applied Economic Research* 3 (4): 365-408.  
doi:<https://journals.sagepub.com/doi/abs/10.1177/097380100900300403>.
- Barnds, William J. 1975. "China's Relations with Pakistan: Durability amidst Discontinuity." *The China Quarterly* 463.
- Baxter, Shahid Javed Burki and Craig. 1991. *Pakistan under the military: eleven years of Zia ul-Haq*. Boulder : Westview Press.
- Beeson, Mark. 2009. "Geopolitics and the making of regions: The fall and rise of East Asia." *Political Studies* 57 (3): 498-516.  
doi:<https://journals.sagepub.com/doi/abs/10.1111/j.1467-9248.2008.00744.x>.
- Bhattacharyay, Biswa Nath. 2016. *Infrastructure for Asian connectivity*. UK : Edward Elgar.
- Bhutto, Zulfikar Ali. 1964. *Foreign policy of Pakistan*. Karachi : Pakistan Institute of International Affairs.
- Bogatyreva, O. 2023. "Humanitarian diplomacy: modern concepts and approaches." *Her Russ Acad Sci* 1349–1366. doi: 10.1134/S1019331622200047.
- Brown, Rajeswary Ampalavanar. 2007. . *The rise of the corporate economy in Southeast Asia*. London: Routledge.  
doi:<https://books.google.com/books?hl=en&lr=&id=3mmuttCrCesC&oi=fnd&pg=PP1&dq=economic+rise+of+asia+&ots=c9G8iz8vxT&sig=Pbuw3rNE8I saVRIY0XHf6CBmHtY>.

- Bukhari, Syed Shahid Hussain. 2011. "India-United States strategic partnership: implications for Pakistan ." *Berkeley Journal of Social Sciences* 1-28.
- Burki, S. J. 2018. "The China-Pakistan Economic Corridor: A Conceptual Framework." *Asia & the Pacific Policy Studies* 5 (2): 194-203.
- Chang, Yuan-Chieh. 2016. "Managing academic innovation in Taiwan: Towards a 'scientific-economic' framework." *Technological Forecasting and Social Change* 73 (2): 199-213.  
<https://www.sciencedirect.com/science/article/pii/S0040162505001216>.
- Chapman, G. 2018. *The Geopolitics of South Asia: From Early Empires to India, Pakistan and Bangladesh: From Early Empires to India, Pakistan and Bangladesh*. Routledge.
- Chou, Bill, and Xuejie Ding. 2015. "A comparative analysis of Shenzhen and Kashgar in development as special economic zones." *East Asia* 32 : 117-136.  
 doi:<https://link.springer.com/article/10.1007/s12140-015-9235-5>.
- Chughtai, Muhammad Waqas, Muhammad Waqas Malik, and Rashid Aftab. 2015. "Impact of Major Economic Variables on Economic Growth of Pakistan." *Acta Universitatis Danubius: Oeconomica* 11 (2): 94-106.  
 doi:<https://www.cceol.com/search/article-detail?id=521218>.
- Cleland, Jennifer Anne. 2017. "The qualitative orientation in medical education research." *Korean J Med Educ* 29 (2): 61–71. doi:10.3946/kjme.2017.53.
- Crespo Cuaresma, J., Lutz, W., & Sanderson, W. 2014. "Is the demographic dividend an education dividend?" *Demography* 51 (1): 99-315.
- Dawn. 2011. *Pakistan resents Nehru remarks*. Karachi, Karachi, 26 September.  
<https://www.dawn.com/news/661923/pakistan-resents-nehru-remarks>.
- Dawn. 2022. *'Powerful' country angered by recent visit to Russia: PM Imran*. Karachi, Pakistan, 1 April. <https://www.dawn.com/news/1682888/powerful-country-angered-by-recent-visit-to-russia-pm-imran>.
- Dinh, Trang Thi-Huyen. 2019. "Foreign direct investment and economic growth in the short run and long run: Empirical evidence from developing countries." *Journal of Risk and Financial Management* 12 (4): 176.  
<https://www.mdpi.com/1911-8074/12/4/176>.
- Faisal, Muhammad. 2019. "CPEC and Regional Connectivity." *Strategic Studies* ( 39) 2: 1-17. <https://www.jstor.org/stable/48544296>.
- Faisal, Muhammad. 2018. "Impact of geo-economics on Pak-China strategic relations." *Strategic Studies* 38 (1): 66-84.  
<https://www.jstor.org/stable/48539123>.

- Fingleton, Bernard. 2004. "Some alternative geo-economics for Europe's regions." *Journal of Economic Geography* 4 (4): 389-420.  
<https://academic.oup.com/joeg/article-abstract/4/4/389/1005130>.
- Firdous, Tabasum, Tajalley Nazir, and Ashfaq M. Ali. 2015. "INDIA'S AFGHAN POLICY: PAKISTAN PERSPECTIVE AND CHINA FACTOR." *Journal of Central Asian Studies* 22. <https://ccas.uok.edu.in/Files/93269b6c-7f53-4439-ae9a-3bdf55a4c649/Journal/4b506859-395b-48e8-9aa1-8a0c9f33919a.pdf>.
- Garlick, Jeremy. 2023. *Reconfiguring the China-Pakistan Economic Corridor Geo-Economic Pipe Dreams Versus Geopolitical Realities*. London: Routledge.
- Ghazanfar, Bilal. 2022. "Paradigm Shifts in Strategic Culture of Pakistan: An Assessment of Traditional versus Non-traditional Threat Perceptions." *Annals of Human and Social Sciences* 3 (2): 148-58.  
[doi:https://doi.org/10.35484/ahss.2022\(3-II\)14](https://doi.org/10.35484/ahss.2022(3-II)14).
- Harshe, Rajen. 2005. "India-Pakistan conflict over Kashmir: peace through development cooperation." *South Asian Survey* (12) 1: 47-60.  
<https://journals.sagepub.com/doi/abs/10.1177/097152310501200104>.
- Hicken, Allen. 2014. *The politics of economic reform in Thailand: crisis and compromise*. USA: THE UNIVERSITY OF MICHIGAN BUSINESS SCHOOL.
- Hocking, Brian. 2016. *Diplomacy and foreign policy*. The Sage handbook of diplomacy.
- Hong, Jong-Wha Lee and Kiseok. 2010. *Economic growth in Asia: determinants and prospects*. Philippines: Asian Development Bank .
- Hong, Song. 2012. *New challenges to the export oriented growth model*. Baijing: Chinese Academy of Social Sciences (CASS).  
[doi:https://www.eria.org/RPR\\_FY2011\\_No.10\\_Chapter\\_2.pdf](https://www.eria.org/RPR_FY2011_No.10_Chapter_2.pdf).
- Huh, Hyeon-Seung, and Cyn-Young Park. 2018. "Asia-Pacific regional integration index: construction, interpretation, and comparison." *Journal of Asian Economics* 54: 22-38.  
<https://www.sciencedirect.com/science/article/pii/S1049007817301719>.
- Huntington, Samuel P. 1981. *American Politics: The Promise of Disharmony*. Belknap Press: An Imprint of Harvard University Press.
- Husain, Ishrat. 2004. "Economy of Pakistan: Past, present and future." *IBA Karachi*.
- Hussain, Ejaz, and Muhammad Furqan Rao. 2020. "China–Pakistan economic cooperation: The case of special economic zones (SEZs)." *Fudan Journal of*

*the Humanities and Social Sciences* 13 (4): 453-472.  
<https://link.springer.com/article/10.1007/s40647-020-00292-5>.

Hussain, Iqtidar, Israr Hussain, and Iqrar Hussain Qambari. 2020. "History of Pakistan–China relations: the complex interdependence theory." *The Chinese Historical Review* 27 (2): 146-164.  
doi:<https://www.tandfonline.com/doi/abs/10.1080/1547402X.2020.1831176>.

Hussain, Munawar. 2016. "Pak-US Relations: An Historical Overview." *Pakistan Journal of History & Culture* 37 (2).  
<https://search.ebscohost.com/login.aspx?direct=true&profile=ehost&scope=sit e&authtype=crawler&jrnl=10127682&AN=124549121&h=IH7hKbE97yLEu UdSKwDN2HrrT4kVjljtZntds1kjHBvLmjTfcBYQDzk9TOfPPi1xnSTUL%2 BE912jwJOesmVy%2Bww%3D%3D&crl=c>.

Hussain, Z., Rahman, M., & Mahmood, T. 2018. "China-Pakistan Economic Corridor: A Review of Strategic and Economic Implications." *Journal of Contemporary China* 27 (111): 655-670.

IMF. 2022. *IMF Statement on Pakistan*. Washington DC: International Monetary Fund. <https://www.imf.org/en/Home>.

Intarakumnerd, Patarapong, and Akira Goto. 2016. *Technology and innovation policies for small and medium-sized enterprises in East Asia*. University of Tokyo, Japan: National Graduate Institute for Policy Studies.  
doi:[https://papers.ssrn.com/sol3/papers.cfm?abstract\\_id=2812432](https://papers.ssrn.com/sol3/papers.cfm?abstract_id=2812432).

Ishaq, Muhammad, Ruan Jian Ping, and Bilal Ahmed. 2017. "Pakistan-China economic corridor (CPEC): opportunities, threats and challenges." *International Affairs and Global Strategy* 52 (9): 9-16.  
<https://core.ac.uk/download/pdf/234670959.pdf>.

Ismail, Normaz wana. 2013. "Innovation and high-tech trade in Asian Countries." *International Conference on Recent Developments in Asian Trade Policy and Integration*. Malaysia: Kuala Lumpur Teaching Centre, the University of Nottingham Malaysia Campus. 1-19.

Jabeen, Mussarat, and Muhammad Saleem Mazhar. 2011. "Security game: SEATO and CENTO as instrument of economic and military assistance to encircle Pakistan." *Pakistan Economic and Social Review* 109-132.

Jafri, Mubashar Hasan, and Dr Sabir Ijaz Summer Sultana. 2021. "Muhammad Ali Jinnah's Views on Palestine and Question of Recognizing Israel." *Pakistan Journal of International Affairs* (4) 1: np.  
<http://pjia.com.pk/index.php/pjia/article/view/164>.

- Janjua, Laeeq, Atteeq Razzak, and Azeem Razzak. 2021. "Lack of environmental policy and water governance: an alarming situation in Pakistan." *International Journal of Circular Economy and Waste Management (IJCEWM)* 1 (2): 29-40. <https://www.igi-global.com/article/lack-of-environmental-policy-and-water-governance/281611>.
- Jaspal, Zafar Nawaz. 2023. *Regional connectivity is key for Pakistan's economic vision to become reality*. Arab News , 31 January. <https://www.arabnews.pk/>.
- Javaid, Prof. 2020. "Analyzing the dynamics of Pakistan-Afghanistan relations: Past and present." *South Asian Studies* 31 (1).
- Jawaid, Syed Tehseen, and Shaikh Muhammad Saleem. 2017. "Foreign capital inflows and economic growth of Pakistan." *Journal of Transnational management* 22 (2): 121-149. doi:doi/abs/10.1080/15475778.2017.1302784.
- Jespal, Amir Ullah Khan and Zafar Nawaz. 2013. "The philosophical foundation of the realist security paradigm." *The Dialogue* VIII (4). doi:[https://www.academia.edu/download/76700917/Dialogue\\_October\\_December2013\\_398-409.pdf](https://www.academia.edu/download/76700917/Dialogue_October_December2013_398-409.pdf).
- Jorgenson, Dale W. 2011. "The rise of developing Asia and the new economic order." *Journal of Policy Modeling* 33 (5): 698-716. doi:<https://www.sciencedirect.com/science/article/pii/S0161893811000585>.
- Kakakhel, Kashmala. 2015. *How can Pakistan adapt to climate change?* China: The Third Pole , 19 November. <https://www.thethirdpole.net/en/?amp>.
- Khadim, Zunaira, Irem Batool, and Muhammad Bilal Lodhi. 2021. "China–Pakistan economic corridor, logistics developments and economic growth in Pakistan." *Logistics* 5 (2): 35. <https://www.mdpi.com/2305-6290/5/2/35>.
- Khakee, Anna. 2018. *Humanitarian action in international relations: power and politics*. University of Malta, Msida, Malta: Springer International Publishing.
- Khan, Mohammad Aslam. 2016. "The challenge of climate change and policy response in Pakistan." *Environmental Earth Sciences* 75: 1-16. doi:<https://link.springer.com/article/10.1007/s12665-015-5127-7>.
- Khan, Rafia, Abdul Samad Shaikh, and Haris Masood. 2019. "Impact of Pak-China free trade agreement (FTA) on trade and industry of Pakistan." *Electronic Research Journal of Social Sciences and Humanities* (1) 4: 1-33. [https://www.academia.edu/download/60799283/1.\\_FTA20191004-69069-2hqozj.pdf](https://www.academia.edu/download/60799283/1._FTA20191004-69069-2hqozj.pdf).
- Khan, Rafia, Abdul Samad Shaikh, and Haris Masood. 2019. "Impact of Pak-China free trade agreement (FTA) on trade and industry of Pakistan." *Electronic Research Journal of Social Sciences and Humanities* (1) 4: 1-33.



- [https://www.academia.edu/download/60799283/1.\\_FTA20191004-69069-2hqozj.pdf](https://www.academia.edu/download/60799283/1._FTA20191004-69069-2hqozj.pdf).
- Khetran, Mir Sherbaz. 2016. "Economic Connectivity." *Strategic Studies* (36) 4: 61-76. <https://www.jstor.org/stable/48535974>.
- Kien, N., and Yoshizo Hashimoto. 2005. *Economic analysis of ASEAN free trade area-by a country panel data*. Japan : Osaka University , 1-23.  
[https://www.researchgate.net/profile/Kien-Nguyen-67/publication/5206750\\_ECONOMIC\\_ANALYSIS\\_OF\\_ASEAN\\_FREE\\_TRADE\\_AREA\\_BY\\_A\\_COUNTRY\\_PANEL\\_DATA/links/53ec17220cf24f241f155d13/ECONOMIC-ANALYSIS-OF-ASEAN-FREE-TRADE-AREA-BY-A-COUNTRY-PANEL-DATA.pdf](https://www.researchgate.net/profile/Kien-Nguyen-67/publication/5206750_ECONOMIC_ANALYSIS_OF_ASEAN_FREE_TRADE_AREA_BY_A_COUNTRY_PANEL_DATA/links/53ec17220cf24f241f155d13/ECONOMIC-ANALYSIS-OF-ASEAN-FREE-TRADE-AREA-BY-A-COUNTRY-PANEL-DATA.pdf).
- Kis-Katos, Krisztina, and Robert Sparrow. 2015. "Poverty, labor markets and trade liberalization in Indonesia." *Journal of development Economics* 117 (3): 94-106.  
doi:<https://www.sciencedirect.com/science/article/pii/S030438781500084X>.
- Kulnazarov, Rustem. 2015. "New geopolitical role of central asia within foreign policy interests of world powers." *Asian Social Science* (11) 12: 125.  
<https://pdfs.semanticscholar.org/30cd/e7a26ed855d457ec795e978b7358f48ae442.pdf>.
- Lavarello, Pablo. 2023. "Creative imitation in late industrializing countries: the case of biopharmaceuticals in South Korea and India." *Innovation and Development* 13 (1): 133-152.  
<https://www.tandfonline.com/doi/abs/10.1080/2157930X.2021.1934259>.
- Lodhi, Maleeha. 2022. *Echoes of the Cold War*. Karachi, Sindh, 14 February.  
<https://www.dawn.com/news/1675009/echoes-of-the-cold-war>.
- Lu, Sheng. 2019. "Regional Comprehensive Economic Partnership (RCEP): Impact on the integration of textile and apparel supply chain in the Asia-Pacific region." *Fashion Supply Chain Management in Asia: Concepts, Models, and Cases* 21-41.
- Luis, Simón. 2015. "Europe, the rise of Asia and the future of the transatlantic relationship." *International Affairs* 91 (5): 969-989.  
doi:<https://academic.oup.com/ia/article-abstract/91/5/969/2326887>.
- Luttwak, Edward. 2003. *Strategy: the logic of war and peace*. London : Cambridge.
- MACK, NATASHA. 2005. *Qualitative Research Methods*. Research Triangle Park, North Carolina: Family Health International (FHI).

- Mahmood, Farhat. 2018. "Export-enhancing effects of free trade agreements in South Asia: Evidence from Pakistan." *Journal of South Asian Development* (13) 1: 24-53. doi:<https://journals.sagepub.com/doi/abs/10.1177/0973174118764925>.
- Malik, H. 2019. "China-Pakistan Economic Corridor: Socio-Economic and Geopolitical Implications." *Asia Europe Journal* 17 (4): 363-375.
- Martini, Nicholas Fred. 2012. "The role of ideology in foreign policy attitude formation." *Dessertation*. The University of Iowa.
- Mason, Andrew, and Ronald Lee. 2016. "Reform and support systems for the elderly in developing countries: capturing the second demographic dividend." *Genus* 11-35. <https://www.jstor.org/stable/29789308>.
- Mason, Andrew, and Tomoko Kinugasa. 2008. "East Asian economic development: two demographic dividends." *Journal of Asian economics* 19 (5-6): 389-399. doi:<https://www.sciencedirect.com/science/article/pii/S1049007808000833>.
- Minhas Majeed Khan, Ahmad Rashid Malik, Saira Ijaz , and Ume Farwa. 2016. *China Pakistan Economic Corridor A Game Changer*. Islamabad: The Institute of Stratigic Studies Islamabad.
- Moberg, Lotta. 2015. "The political economy of special economic zones." *Journal of institutional economics* 11 (1): 167-190. doi:<https://www.cambridge.org/core/journals/journal-of-institutional-economics/article/political-economy-of-special-economic-zones/CE09F95681408037426D2F4D210BEEA5>.
- Morrison, Wayne M. 2014. *China's economic rise: history, trends, challenges and implications for United States*. Uninted States of America : Congressional Research Service .
- Muhammad, Imraz, Arif Khan, and Saif ul Islam. 2019. "China Pakistan Economic Corridor: Peace, Prosperity and Conflict Resolution in the Region." *Sir Syed Journal of Education & Social Research (SJESR)* 2 (1): 128-139. <https://sjesr.org.pk/articles/02-v2-2019/issue-01/09-Vol-02-Issue-01-Jan-June-2019-P-128-139.pdf>.
- Nasim, Ameena. 2022. "Pak-China geostrategic interdependence: impact on rising Economies of Asia." *South Asian Studies* 37 (1): 1-16. <http://111.68.103.26/journals/index.php/IJSAS/article/view/6024>.
- Nasir, Abbas. 2021. *Imperatives for security*. Karachi, Pakistan: Dawn , 21 March. <https://www.dawn.com/news/1613745/imperatives-for-security>.
- Naz, Imtiaz Hussain. ". 2021. "Foreign policy in hybrid warfare environment–way forward for Pakistan." *Margalla Papers* 25 (1): 1-11. <https://jcs.ndu.edu.pk/site/article/view/74>.

- Neilson, Jeffrey. 2014. "Global value chains and global production networks in the changing international political economy: an introduction." *Review of International Political Economy* 21 (1): 1-8.  
doi:doi/full/10.1080/09692290.2013.873369.
- Newman, Edward. 2010. "Critical human security studies." *Review of International Studies* 36 (1): 77-94. doi:https://doi.org/10.1017/S0260210509990519.
- Nguyen, V. C. 2020. "Trade liberalization, economic reforms and foreign direct investment—a critical analysis of the political transformation in Vietnam." *International Journal of Advanced Science and Technology* 29 (3): 6837 - 6850. doi:https://papers.ssrn.com/sol3/papers.cfm?abstract\_id=3566751.
- Niaz, Ilhan. 2016. "Jinnah on governance: The unheeded advice of Pakistan's Quaid-i-Azam." *Asian Affairs* 47 (3): 406-427.  
doi:doi/abs/10.1080/03068374.2016.1225902.
- Nizamani, Usama. 2022. *Pakistan's New Strategy: Technology-Based Cooperation*. Washington, USA, 11 October. <https://southasianvoices.org/>.
- Odagiri, Hiroyuki. 2006. "Advance of science-based industries and the changing innovation system of Japan." *Asia's innovation systems in transition* 200-226.
- Owens, Patricia. 2012. "Human security and the rise of the social." *Review of International Studies* 38 (3): 547-67.  
doi:https://doi.org/10.1017/S0260210511000490.
- Pangestu, Mari, and Lili Yan Ing. 2016. "ASEAN: regional integration and reforms." *Asian Economic Papers* 15 (2): 44-60. doi:https://direct.mit.edu/asep/article-abstract/15/2/44/17039.
- Paswan, Nawal K. 2017. "AFGHAN-PAK TRANSIT TRADE AGREEMENT: MAPPING IMPLICATIONS FOR SOUTH AND CENTRAL ASIA." *Himalayan and Central Asian Studies* 50.  
<https://search.proquest.com/openview/f5b6231175cbfb61a18914c86861f02b/1?pq-origsite=gscholar&cbl=1036373>.
- Pattanaik, Smruti S. 2003. "Pakistan's nuclear strategy." *Strategic Analysis* 27 (1): 94-114. doi:https://www.tandfonline.com/doi/abs/10.1080/09700160308450076.
- Pool, Ian. 2007. "Demographic dividends: determinants of development or merely windows of opportunity." *Ageing Horizons* 7: 28-35.
- Qamruzzaman, Md. 2021. "Financial innovation, human capital development, and economic growth of selected South Asian countries: An application of ARDL approach." *International Journal of Finance & Economics* 26 (3): 4032-4053.  
doi:doi/abs/10.1002/ijfe.2003.

- Rabbi, Fazal. 2012. "War against Terrorism and its Repercussions for Pakistan." *Pakistan Journal of History and Culture* 33 (2): 71-90.  
doi:[https://www.researchgate.net/profile/Fazal-Rabbi-3/publication/274071141\\_War\\_against\\_Terrorism\\_and\\_its\\_Repercussions\\_for\\_Pakistan/links/55141c3c0cf2eda0df30417a/War-against-Terrorism-and-its-Repercussions-for-Pakistan.pdf](https://www.researchgate.net/profile/Fazal-Rabbi-3/publication/274071141_War_against_Terrorism_and_its_Repercussions_for_Pakistan/links/55141c3c0cf2eda0df30417a/War-against-Terrorism-and-its-Repercussions-for-Pakistan.pdf).
- Ratnawati, Kusuma. 2020. "The impact of financial inclusion on economic growth, poverty, income inequality, and financial stability in Asia." *The Journal of Asian Finance, Economics and Business* 7 (10): 73-85.  
doi:<https://pdfs.semanticscholar.org/c0f1/620f8fa572393d6f4acf564f500d4b532ed2.pdf>.
- Recorder, Business. 2022. *PM Imran bets on IT sector to generate employment, dollar inflow*. Islamabad, Pakistan: Business Recorder , 21 February.  
<https://www.brecorder.com/news/40155976/pm-imran-bets-on-it-sector-to-generate-employment-dollar-inflow>.
- Redd, Steven B., and Alex Mintz. 2013. "Policy perspectives on national security and foreign policy decision making." *Policy Studies Journal* (41): 511-537.  
doi:<https://onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/abs/10.1111/psj.12010>.
- Rehman, Atika. 2019. *Military will continue to shape security, foreign policy: Report*. Islamabad, 8 November. <https://www.dawn.com/news/1515569>.
- Rizvi, Hasan-Askari. 2015. *South Asia's Nuclear Security Dilemma: India, Pakistan and China* . Routledge.
- Saez, Lawrence. 2012. *The South Asian association for regional cooperation (SAARC): an emerging collaboration architecture*. London : Routledge .
- Sattar, Abdul. 2010. *Pakistan's Foreign Policy 1947-2009: a concise history*. Islamabad: Sani Panhwar.  
<http://sanipanhwar.com/Pakistans%20Foreign%20Policy%201947%202009.pdf>.
- Sayer, Andrew. 1992. *Methods in social science: a realist approach*. London : Routledge .
- Scott, Allen J. 2006. "A perspective of economic geography." *Economic Geography* 56-79.
- Secretariat, CPEC. ,2016. *Prime Minister Muhammad Nawaz Sharif Chairing Meeting To Review Progress On CPEC At PM House*. Islamabad, 30 November. <http://cpec.gov.pk/>.

- Sen, Kunal. 2016. *The determinants of structural transformation in Asia: a review of the literature*. Philippines : Asian Development Bank Economics Working Paper Series 478 .
- Shabbir, Ghulam, Khizar Jawad, and Muhammad Kashif Ashraf. 2022. "The Political Leadership of Quaid-i-Azam Muhammad Ali Jinnah: His Approach Towards the National and International Affairs of the Muslims." *Journal of Development and Social Sciences* 3 (2): 1289-1297.  
<https://www.ojs.jdss.org.pk/journal/article/view/555>.
- Shabbir, Ghulam, Khizar Jawad, and Muhammad Kashif Ashraf. 2022. "The Political Leadership of Quaid-i-Azam Muhammad Ali Jinnah: His Approach Towards the National and International Affairs of the Muslims." *Journal of Development and Social Sciences* 3 (2): 1289-1297.  
<https://www.ojs.jdss.org.pk/journal/article/view/555>.
- Shabnam Gul, Muhammad Faizan Asghar, Munib Khalid. 2021. "Shifting national security paradigm of Pakistan from geo politics to a geo economics era." *Global Economics Review* VI (I): 81-94. doi:: 10.31703/ger.2021(VI-I).07.
- Shaffer, Gregory. 2015. "The new legal realist approach to international law." *Leiden Journal of International Law* 28 (2): 189-210.  
doi:<https://doi.org/10.1017/S0922156515000035>.
- Shah, Aqil. 2008. "Pakistan after Musharraf: praetorianism and terrorism." *Journal of Democracy* 19 (4): 16-25. <https://muse.jhu.edu/pub/1/article/252221/summary>.
- Siddiqui, Azhar Javed, and Dr Khalid Manzoor Butt. 2020. "Afghanistan-Soviet relations during the Cold War: a threat for South Asian peace." *South Asian Studies* 29 (2).  
doi:<http://journals.pu.edu.pk/journals/index.php/IJSAS/article/view/2968>.
- Siddiqui, Naveed. 2017. *Afghanistan will never recognise the Durand Line: Hamid Karzai*. Karachi, Sindh, 5 March.  
<https://www.dawn.com/news/1318594/afghanistan-will-never-recognise-the-durand-line-hamid-karzai>.
- Soherwordi, Syed Hussain Shaheed. 2020. "US foreign policy shift towards Pakistan between 1965 & 1971 Pak-India wars." *South Asian Studies* 25 (1).
- Söilen, Klaus Solberg. 2010. "The shift from Geopolitics to Geoeconomics and the Failure of our Modern Social Sciences." *TELOS Conference - From Lifeworld to Biopolitics: Empire in the Age of Obama*. New York : Electronic Research Archive of Blekinge Institute of Technology. 1-13.
- Stephen, Elizabeth Hervey. 2019. *South Korea's demographic dividend: echoes of the past Or prologue to the future?* London : Rowman & Littlefield.

- Strydom, Herman. 2013. "An evaluation of the purpose of research in social work." *Social Work Journal* 49 (2): 149-58. doi:<http://dx.doi.org/10.15270/49-2-58>.
- Syed, Baqir Sajjad. 2021. *India must make first move to normalise ties: PM*. Karachi, Pakistan: Dawn , 18 March. <https://www.dawn.com/news/1613120/india-must-make-first-move-to-normalise-ties-pm>.
- Syed, Maria. 2014. "Need for a paradigm shift in security: Adopting human security in Pakistan." *IPRI Journal* 14 (2): 79-97. doi:<https://www.ipripak.org/wp-content/uploads/2014/10/5-article-s14.pdf>.
- Tarin, Shaukat. 2022. *Economy: PTI govt versus PML-N govt*. Islamabad: Business Recorder, 2 May.
- TARIQ, Rameez, Muhammad Arshad KHAN, and Abdul RAHMAN. 2020. "How does financial development impact economic growth in Pakistan?: new evidence from threshold model." *The Journal of Asian Finance, Economics and Business (JAFEB)* 7 (8): 161-173. [https://www.researchgate.net/profile/Rameez-Tariq-4/publication/343510128\\_How\\_Does\\_Financial\\_Development\\_Impact\\_Economic\\_Growth\\_in\\_Pakistan\\_New\\_Evidence\\_from\\_Threshold\\_Model/links/5fcb31be45851568d13f10b7/How-Does-Financial-Development-Impact-Economic-Gro](https://www.researchgate.net/profile/Rameez-Tariq-4/publication/343510128_How_Does_Financial_Development_Impact_Economic_Growth_in_Pakistan_New_Evidence_from_Threshold_Model/links/5fcb31be45851568d13f10b7/How-Does-Financial-Development-Impact-Economic-Gro).
- Terada, Takashi. 2012. *ASEAN Plus Three: becoming more like a normal regionalism?* London : Routledge .
- Thorbecke, Willem, and Nimesh Salike. 2013. *Foreign direct investment in East Asia*. Tokyo: -Liverpool University. doi:<https://www.rieti.go.jp/jp/publications/pdp/13p003.pdf>.
- Wahyuni, Sari, Esther Sri Astuti, and Karina Miaprajna Utari. 2013. "Critical outlook at special economic zone in Asia: a comparison between Indonesia, Malaysia, Thailand and China." *Journal of Indonesian Economy and Business* 28 (3): 336-346. <http://download.garuda.kemdikbud.go.id/article.php?article=613436&val=7317&title=CRITICAL%20OUTLOOK%20AT%20SPECIAL%20ECONOMIC%20ZONE%20IN%20ASIA%20A%20COMPARISON%20BETWEEN%20INDONESIA%20MALAYSIA%20THAILAND%20AND%20CHINA>.
- Wignaraja, Ganeshan. 2011. *Economic reforms, regionalism and exports: comparing China and India*. USA: East West Center. doi:<https://scholarspace.manoa.hawaii.edu/handle/10125/22291>.
- Williamson, Jeffrey G. 2013. "Demographic dividends revisited." *Asian Development Review* 30 (2): 1-25. doi:<https://direct.mit.edu/adev/article-abstract/30/2/1/9861>.

- Wolf, Siegfried O. 2019. *The China-Pakistan Economic Corridor of the Belt and Road Initiative*. Geographic South Asian Studies.
- Wong, Chan-Yuan. 2018. "Knowledge structures of city innovation systems: Singapore and Hong Kong." *Journal of Urban Technology* 25 (1): 47-73. doi:doi/abs/10.1080/10630732.2017.1348882.
- Yaseen, Zahid, and Muhammad Muzaffar. 2018. "Extremism in Pakistan: Issues and challenges." *Journal of Politics and International Studies* 4 (1): 31-42. [https://www.researchgate.net/profile/Muhammad-Muzaffar-2/publication/342411485\\_Extremism\\_in\\_Pakistan\\_Issues\\_and\\_Challenges/links/5f96b22d92851c14bce7a060/Extremism-in-Pakistan-Issues-and-Challenges.pdf](https://www.researchgate.net/profile/Muhammad-Muzaffar-2/publication/342411485_Extremism_in_Pakistan_Issues_and_Challenges/links/5f96b22d92851c14bce7a060/Extremism-in-Pakistan-Issues-and-Challenges.pdf).
- Yasmeen, Rizwana, and Sadia Tufail. 2015. "Impact of internet technology on economic growth in south Asia with special reference to Pakistan." *Pakistan Journal of Social Sciences* 35 (2): 777-784. <http://pjss.bzu.edu.pk/index.php/pjss/article/view/352>.
- Yeung, Henry Wai-chung. 2016. *Strategic coupling: East Asian industrial transformation in the new global economy*. London : Cornell University Press.
- Yusufzai, Rahimullah. 2019. *Foreign policy predicaments*. Islamabad , ICT : The News, 29 December .
- Zahidi, Farahnaz. 2023. *Sherry Rehman: "It is high time Pakistan learns from its climate-induced challenges"*. China: The Third Pole , 19 September. <https://www.thethirdpole.net/en/>.
- Zakaria, Muhammad, Wen Jun, and Haseeb Ahmed. 2019. "Effect of terrorism on economic growth in Pakistan: an empirical analysis." *Economic research-Ekonomska istraživanja* 32 (1): 1794-1812. <https://hrcak.srce.hr/228852>.
- Zeng, Douglas Zhihua. 2017. *Building a competitive city through innovation and global knowledge: the case of Sino-Singapore Suzhou Industrial Park*. USA: World Bank Policy Research Working Paper 7570.

# Turnitin Originality Report

Processed on: 08-Jan-2024 10:47 PKT

ID: 2267778327

Word Count: 37198

Submitted: 1

Pakistan Foreign Policy Shift from Geo-Politi... By Sharif Ullah Khan

Similarity Index <b>11%</b>	<b>Similarity by Source</b> Internet Sources: 9% Publications: 3% Student Papers: 3%
--------------------------------	---

exclude quoted  
  include bibliography  
  exclude small matches  
 mode:

quickview (classic) report  
 print  
 refresh  
 download

1% match (student papers from 30-Aug-2023)  
 Submitted to University of Bradford on 2023-08-30

<1% match (Internet from 30-Oct-2022)  
<http://pr.hec.gov.pk>

<1% match (Internet from 31-Oct-2022)  
<http://pr.hec.gov.pk>

<1% match (Internet from 31-Oct-2022)  
<http://pr.hec.gov.pk>

<1% match (Internet from 31-Oct-2022)  
<http://pr.hec.gov.pk>

<1% match (Internet from 31-Oct-2022)  
<http://pr.hec.gov.pk>

<1% match (Internet from 05-Jul-2023)  
<http://pr.hec.gov.pk>

<1% match (Internet from 05-Jan-2023)  
<http://pr.hec.gov.pk>

<1% match (Internet from 05-Jan-2023)  
<http://pr.hec.gov.pk>

<1% match (Internet from 05-Jan-2023)  
<http://pr.hec.gov.pk>

<1% match (Internet from 15-Oct-2022)  
<http://pr.hec.gov.pk>